

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 25, 2024
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:19 p.m. Chairperson Tim Hutter adjourned the meeting at 3:59 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – present
2nd Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present
Boardmember Carla Farley – present
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember David McCullough – present
Boardmember Dr. Li-Rong Lilly Cheng – absent
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – absent

City Staff

Jeanne MacKinnon, Deputy City Attorney – present
Kelley Stanco, City Planning Department – present
Bernie Turgeon, Planning Department – present
Suzanne Segur, City Planning Department – present
Shannon Anthony, City Planning Department – present
Alvin Lin, City Planning Department – present
Megan Walker, City Planning Department – present
Kelsey Kaline, City Planning Department – present
Arielle Truong, City Planning Department – present
Caroline Garcia, Legislative Recorder – present

Note: All decision makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Charles Kaminski inquired on how the Development Services and City Planning Departments track and monitor mitigation associated with projects that have an adverse impact to historical resources. He emphasized that there should be a master list available for the public that indicates the resource and the mitigation measures required and if implemented, on any demolished or substantially altered designated resource that is on the City's register.

Charles Kaminski also commented on the comprehensive Heritage Preservation program website. He was disappointed that it wasn't presented to the HRB, Policy Subcommittee, and the public as it was being developed.

James Walters supports the National Register Nomination for Talmadge Park Estate Historic District.

Katherine Rhoades offered her Historical Resources Research Report template to anyone who would like to write their own.

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

Chair Hutter shared that Boardmember Abrams discontinued his services with the HRB in December of 2023. Mr. Abrams is very involved in the community we appreciate his involvement and service. Thank you, Bruce.

Boardmember Coyle took time to recognize the annual Governors Preservation Award that she and SOHO will be receiving in recognition of their long-standing service to the community. The project; in which she was a team member along with Rachel Rustin of SDG&E, Brian Williams, and Nick Doose of ASM and Carmen Lucas of the Laguna Indian Tribe; was to do an evaluation on top of Mount Laguna, east of Julian, to be a tribal cultural resource landscape eligible for the National Register of Historic Places. The nomination centered on the Tribal voice, but also used geology, springs, and archaeology as other lines of evidence. It's awarded because the state hopes this can be a model for other tribal communities state-wide who want to put their sacred places on the National Register. Boardmember Coyle is very happy and honored to receive this award on February 27th around 1-3 pm in Sacramento, you can also watch from home.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department, reported that Boardmember Bruce Abrams was appointed in the Spring of 2022, also served on the Policy Subcommittee, and served until December 2023. He will now be spending his newly found free time with his family.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

NONE

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

NONE

FAILURE TO

VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

NONE

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

NONE

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

NONE

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR NOVEMBER 16, 2023

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 6-0-2 with Boardmembers Winter, Coyle, McCullough, Taylor, Woods, and Chair Hutter voting yea, with Boardmembers Byers and Farley abstaining, and with Boardmembers Cheng and Cortez absent.

STAFF REPORT

Kelley Stanco, Deputy Director from the Planning Department, just wanted to address Mr. Kaminski's non-agenda public comment portion: our preservation and progress initiative has launched. For more information visit www.sandiego.gov/planning/work/historic-preservation-planning/preservation-and-progress.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that the appeals of the historical designation of the Lucile Hamilton/Robert Mosher House (HRB Site #1507) located at 485 San Geronimo Street and the Frank and Rosa Woodford House (HRB Site #1399) located at 741 11th Avenue are tentatively scheduled to be heard by City Council on February 26th. Boardmembers are encouraged to attend the appeal hearings to speak on behalf of the Board's action. The appeals of the historical designation of the Donald and Gladys Clitsome/Lloyd Ruocco House (HRB Site #1491) located at 2228 33rd Street and the Velma Prichard Spec House #1 (HRB Site #1503) located at 4321 Alder Drive were heard by City Council on December 5th. Both designations were upheld. The Botanical Building restoration project in Balboa Park hit a milestone last week when the refurbished cupola was returned to the top of the building's dome. Planning has begun for Phase 2 of the project which includes the restoration of exterior fountains and the reconstruction of a historic pergola.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that a meeting of the Policy Subcommittee was held on December 11th. Boardmembers and the public discussed a possible response to the IBA report and the historic district policy for National Register Historic Districts. The January 8th meeting was cancelled. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, February 12th at 3:00 p.m. Staff will be sending out further information within the coming weeks.

More information regarding the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee can be found on the City's website.

Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that the next Design Assistant Subcommittee will be held on Wednesday, February 7th, at 4:00pm.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 1 – HARRY AND EDNA PAYNE/ CARL B. HAYS HOUSE, located at 4952 Marlborough Drive *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

Item 2 – ROBERT AND ADDIE LANE HOUSE located at 3640 Utah Street *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

Item 3 – ERNEST AND MARY WAIDMANN HOUSE located at 3795 Goldfinch Street *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

Item 4 – Talmadge Park Estates Historic District National Register Nomination

Item 5 – Standardized Report of the City Boards and Commissions 2023 *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO HEAR ITEMS 4, 5, THEN 1 THROUGH 3 IN ORDER. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 7-0-1 with Boardmembers Farley, Woods, Taylor, Byers, McCullough, Winter, and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmember Coyle abstaining and Boardmembers Cheng and Cortez absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1 HARRY AND EDNA PAYNE/ CARL B. HAYS HOUSE

Note: This item was scheduled to be heard as the third discussion item.

Applicant/Owner: Ronen B & Jesslyn E Erlich represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4952 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, District 9 as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-001

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Harry and Edna Payne/ Carl B. Hays House located at 4952 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear 2021 addition constructed outside of the period of significance. The designation includes the original detached garage.

ITEM WAS TRAILED TO FEBRUARY 22, 2024

ITEM-2 ROBERT AND ADDIE LANE HOUSE

Note: This item was scheduled to be heard as the fourth discussion item.

Applicant/Owner: Warnick-Housh Trust 11-07-19 represented by Ginger Weatherford

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3640 Utah Street, 92104, North Park, Council District 3 as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-003

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Addie Lane House located at 3640 Utah Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the pre-1962 rear addition, 1999 addition, and 1999 detached garage.

ITEM WAS TRAILED TO FEBRUARY 22, 2024

ITEM-3 ERNEST AND MARY WAIDMANN HOUSE

Note: This item was scheduled to be heard as the fifth discussion item.

Applicant/Owner: Post Lance & Lanny Trust 11-14-20 represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3795 Goldfinch Street and 825 Bush Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-24-004

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ernest and Mary Waidmann House located at 3795 Goldfinch Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1925 residential structure at 825 Bush Street and a detached shed, both located on the eastern portion of the parcel.

ITEM WAS TRAILED TO FEBRUARY 22, 2024

ITEM-4 TALMADGE PARK ESTATES HISTORIC DISTRICT NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATION

Note: This item was heard as the first discussion item.

Applicant: Talmadge Historical Society represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

Owner: Various

Description: Consider the National Register of Historic Places Nomination of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District located in the Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9. Report Number: HRB-24-005

Proposed Action: Review and make a recommendation to the California State Office of Historic Preservation on the National Register Nomination of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District located in the Kensington-Talmadge Community.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the California State Office of Historic Preservation the listing of the Talmadge Park Estates Historic District with a period of significance of 1926-1951 at a local level of significance under National Register Criteria A and C, with proposed amendments to the discussion of the district boundary as specified in the Analysis section of the staff report, and a caveat that the proposed classifications of contributing and non-contributing resources has not been confirmed due to the limited time allotted for City review and the limited property-specific information and documentation required for National Register nominations.

Staff Report by Bernie Turgeon

Correspondence Received

In Favor: Diana Meier, Jaclyn Hermann, Charles Kaminski, David Wagner, Jeffrey Oliver, Mark Gusmann, Jan Taylor, Jan Taylor, Ashley Herrin, Ramona Najimy, David Roth, Cameron Lindsay-Hewett, Richard Burritt, David Swarens, Allen Hazard, Annalisa Berta, Katy Rose, Zoraida McLeod, Dean Glass, Michael Tristani, Sylvia Wister, Ronald Telkes, Ronald Anderson, Lisa Stone, Robert Gehrke, Kurt Stolle, Kurt Stolle, Katy Rose, Bjorn Palenius, Alina Talbott, Amie Hayes, Terrence Hancock, Michael Talbott, Thomas Adam, William Adair, Deborah Quillin, Adriana Sanchez-Aldana, Debbie Sanders, ESTHER LEEFLANG, Kristin Harms, Priscilla Ann Berge, Steve Gilmore, David Goldberg, Erin Bauer, Bruce Coons, Rebecca Grossenbacher, Joanne Loehr, Eileen Magno, Joan Telkes, Allen Troub, Zoraida Payne, Gary Payne, John Hileman, Cecelia Conover, Susan Dean, Louise Rehling, LOIS DRAPER, Sandi McInnes, James McInnes, Dixie Blake, Betsy Burkey, Lynn Bloom, JAMES BLOOM, John Blake, Susan Hector, Megan Kalmoe, Michael Lubin, Michael Sampson, Geoffrey Hueter, Christina Lim, Henry Wong, Annina Lukiini-Johnson, Ellen Pirie, David Bell, Binda Patel-Bell, Andrea Lynn, William Johnson, Patricia Johnson, Lisa Torres, Ken Gammon, Michelle Desjardins, Bonnie New, Kristie Gipe, Dirk Sutro, Darryl White, Doris Corrado, Sheri Paringer, Alfred Mazur, LAURA HENSON, Pamela Robinson, Geno Bruno, Joseph Abedi, Teresa Mathes, Lucinda Parsons, Daniel Soderberg, Gretchen Biggs, Andrew Helgerson, Lucy Hernandez, Erica Helgerson, Pam Sanderson, Gregory Aarons, Susan Baldwin, Rama Vine, Joanna Richard, Jill Olson, Joseph Abedi, William Bamberger, Tim wilder, Pamela Bernasconi, SUSAN LYERLY, Gayle Goldman, Leith DuVall, Cynthia Hillman, Lorraine Iverson, Margaret Moore, Misha Moore, Katherine Yaarborough, Cassandra Gomez, Charles Whitt, Michelle Kochishan, Cassandra Storey, Garry Williams. Judy Harrington, and Clay Fisher.

In Opposition: Clint Daniels, Wesley Morgan, Gail Friedt, Ian Crano, Paul Jamason, YIMBY Democrats of San Diego County, Dylan Wilson, Jay Robinson-Duff, Ricardo Antonio Flores, Saad Asad, Sharon Gehl, Nicole Lillie, and Amy Wood.

Testimony Received

In Favor: Laura L Henson and Eileen Magno (both were ceded time to them from Bradley Kirschbaum, Paul Krueger, Margaret Moore, Misha Moore, Randy Potter, John Neves, Maria Arteaga, Debbie Sanders, Terry Hoskins, Ron Anderson, Daron Anderson, Charles Kaminski, Diana Carnahan, Carole Crawford, Jan Taylor, Stephen Locatelli), and Katheryn Rhodes, Geoffrey Heuter (with ceded time to him from William Adair), Ryan Meher, Cameron Lindsay-Hewett, Lott Hill, Ben Trovaten, David Moty, Fernando Garcia, Charles Kaminski, Ben Segabartt, Sharon Messey, Diane Kane, Bruce Coons, Allen Hazard, and Priscilla Anne Berge.

In Opposition: Wesley Morgan (with ceded time to him from Sharon Gehl), Abubakar Jalloh, Nicole Lillie, Aidan Lin, Ricardo Flores, Zach Thompson, Isaac Moronor, and Sparky Mitra.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO MOVE STAFF RECOMMENDATION TO THE CALIFORNIA STATE OFFICE OF HISTORIC PRESERVATION THE LISTING OF THE TALMADGE PARK ESTATES HISTORIC DISTRICT WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1926-1951 AT A LOCAL LEVEL OF SIGNIFICANCE UNDER NATIONAL REGISTER CRITERIA A AND C, WITH PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE DISCUSSION OF THE DISTRICT BOUNDARY AS SPECIFIED IN THE ANALYSIS SECTION OF THE STAFF REPORT, AND A CAVEAT THAT THE PROPOSED CLASSIFICATIONS OF CONTRIBUTING AND NON-CONTRIBUTING RESOURCES HAS NOT BEEN CONFIRMED DUE TO THE LIMITED TIME ALLOTTED FOR CITY REVIEW AND THE LIMITED PROPERTY-SPECIFIC INFORMATION AND DOCUMENTATION REQUIRED FOR NATIONAL REGISTER NOMINATIONS. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 6-2-0 with Boardmembers Farley, Woods, Taylor, Byers, Coyle, and Winter voting yea, and Boardmember McCullough and Chair Hutter voting no, and Boardmembers Cheng and Cortez absent.

BREAK: 3:42 p.m. – 3:47 p.m.

ITEM-5 STANDARDIZED REPORT OF THE CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS 2023

Note: This item was heard as the second discussion item.

Proposed Action: Consider the Draft Standardized Report for transmittal to the Office of Board and Commissions.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Standardized Report of City Boards and Commissions to the Office of Boards and Commissions or revise the Standardized Report and forward as appropriate.

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO DIRECT STAFF TO FORWARD THE STANDARDIZED REPORT OF CITY BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS TO THE OFFICE OF BOARDS AND COMMISSIONS WITH REVISIONS. Seconded by Vice-Chair Byers. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Coyle, McCullough, Byers, Taylor, Woods, Farley, and Chair Hutter voting yea; and with Boardmember Cheng and Cortez absent.