

#### COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES AGENDA Wednesday, February 7, 2024 4:30pm-7:30pm

#### REGULAR MEETING (Hybrid) Balboa Park Santa Fe Room 2144 Pan American W. Road San Diego, CA 92101

**Commissioners:** Octavio Aguilar, Laila Aziz, Bonnie Benitez, Alec Beyer, Dennis W. Brown, Cheryl Canson, Doug Case, Christina Griffin-Jones, Dwayne Harvey, Brandon Hilpert, Darlanne Mulmat, Clovis Honoré, James Justus, Dennis Larkin, Lupe Diaz, Mark Maddox, Yvania Rubio, Jaylene Sanchez, Gloria Tran, and Dalia Sherlyn Villa De La Cruz

**Staff:** Interim Executive Director Danell Scarborough, Outside Counsel Duane Bennett, Chief Investigator Olga Golub, Community Engagement Coordinator Yasmeen Obeid, Executive Assistant Alina Conde, Administrative Assistant Jon'Nae McFarland

The Commission on Police Practices (Commission) meetings will be conducted pursuant to the provisions of California Government Code Section 54953 (a), as amended by Assembly Bill 2249.

The Commission business meetings will be in person and the meeting will be open for in-person testimony. Additionally, we are continuing to provide alternatives to in-person attendance for participating in our meetings.

In lieu of in-person attendance, members of the public may also participate via telephone/Zoom. Please see instructions below to provide public comment.

#### The link to join the meeting by computer, tablet, or smartphone at 4:30pm is: https://sandiego.zoomgov.com/webinar/register/WN\_LoKZzY\_vQPWPmv2aOahufQ Meeting ID: 161 700 4342

**In-Person Public Comment on an Agenda Item:** If you wish to address the Commission on an item on today's agenda, please complete and submit a speaker slip before the Commission hears the agenda item. You will be called at the time the item is heard. Each speaker must file a speaker slip with the Executive Director at the meeting at which the speaker wishes to speak indicating which item they wish to speak on. Speaker slips may not be turned in prior to the day of the meeting or after completion of in-person testimony. In-person public comment

will conclude before virtual testimony begins. Each speaker who wishes to address the Commission must state who they are representing if they represent an organization or another person.

For discussion and information items each speaker may speak up to three (3) minutes, subject to the Chair's determination of the time available for meeting management purposes, in addition to any time ceded by other members of the public who are present at the meeting and have submitted a speaker slip ceding their time. These speaker slips should be submitted together at one time to the Executive Director. The Chair may also limit organized group presentations of five or more people to 15 minutes or less.

**In-Person Public Comment on Matters Not on the Agenda:** You may address the Commission on any matter not listed on today's agenda. Please complete and submit a speaker slip. However, California's open meeting laws do not permit the Commission to discuss or take any action on the matter at today's meeting. At its discretion, the Commission may add the item to a future meeting agenda or refer the matter to staff or committee. Public comments are limited to three minutes per speaker. At the discretion of the Chair, if a large number of people wish to speak on the same item, comments may be limited to a set period of time per item to appropriately manage the meeting and ensure the Commission has time to consider all the agenda items. A member of the public may only provide one comment per agenda item. In-person public comment on items not on the agenda will conclude before virtual testimony begins.

**Virtual Platform Public Comment to a Particular Item or Matters Not on the Agenda:** When the Chair introduces the item you would like to comment on (or indicates it is time for Non-Agenda Public Comment), raise your hand by either tapping the "Raise Your Hand" button on your computer, tablet, or Smartphone, or by dialing \*9 on your phone. You will be taken in the order in which you raised your hand. You may only speak once on a particular item. When the Chair indicates it is your turn to speak, click the unmute prompt that will appear on your computer, tablet or Smartphone, or dial \*6 on your phone. The virtual queue will close when the last virtual speaker finishes speaking or 5 minutes after in-person testimony ends, whichever happens first.

**Written Comment through Webform:** Comment on agenda items and non-agenda public comment may also be submitted using the <u>webform</u>. If using the webform, indicate the agenda item number you wish to submit a comment for. All webform comments are limited to 200 words. On the <u>webform</u>, members of the public should select Commission on Police Practices (even if the public comment is for a Commission on Police Practices Committee meeting).

The public may attend a meeting when scheduled by following the attendee meeting link provided above. To view a meeting archive video, click <u>here</u>. Video footage of each Commission meeting is posted online <u>here</u> within 24–48 hours of the conclusion of the meeting.

Comments received no later than 11am the day of the meeting will be distributed to the Commission on Police Practices and posted online with the meeting materials. Comments received after the deadlines described above but before the item is called will be submitted into the written record for the relevant item. Please contact the Privacy Advisory Board website for further instructions.

**Written Materials:** Instead of submitting written materials as an attachment to the webform, you may submit via U.S. Mail to Attn: Office of the Commission on Police Practices, 1200 Third Avenue, San Diego, CA 92101. Materials submitted via U.S. Mail must be received the business day prior to the meeting to be distributed to the Commission on Police Practices.

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME (Chair Gloria Tran)
- II. ROLL CALL (Executive Assistant Alina Conde)
- III. PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES

The purpose of the Commission on Police Practices (CPP or Commission) is to provide independent community oversight of SDPD, directed at increasing community trust in SDPD & increasing safety for community and officers. The purpose of the Commission is also to perform independent investigations of officer-involved shootings, in-custody deaths and other significant incidents, and an unbiased evaluation of all complaints against members of SDPD and its personnel in a process that will be transparent and accountable to the community. Lastly, the Commission also evaluates the review of all SDPD policies, practices, trainings, and protocols and represents the community in making recommendations for changes.

- IV. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES (Chair Tran) A. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of January 17, 2024
- V. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT Please see instructions at the beginning of this agenda.
- VI. CABINET REPORT
  - A. Chair Report
    - 1. CPP and Mayor Todd Gloria Meeting Report
    - 2. CPP and Police Chief Nisleit Meeting Report
    - 3. CPP and Councilmember Meeting Report
    - 4. CPP Planning Retreat to be rescheduled
    - 5. Update on appointment of new commissioners
    - 6. Thank you to Jon'nae McFarland for 10 years of City service
    - 7. Invitation to proclamation and reception for Sharmaine Moseley
- VII. AD HOC COMMITTEE REPORTS (Chair Tran)
  - A. Ad Hoc Bylaws Committee (Chair Maddox)
    - 1. Update

- B. Ad Hoc Training Committee (Co-Chair Hilpert)
  - 1. DRAFT Training Academy for Case Review
  - 2. Public Comment
  - 3. Discussion
  - 4. Action
- C. Ad Hoc Operating Procedures Committee (Co-Chair Case)
  - 1. Update
- D. Ad Hoc Personnel Committee (Chair Brown)
  - 1. Update on Executive Director Hiring Process
- VIII. NEW BUSINESS (Chair Tran)
  - A. Commissioner Emails (CPP Staff)
    - 1. Presentation of best practices for use of Commissioner's City email
    - 2. Public Comment
    - 3. Discussion
    - 4. Action Approve Procedures
  - B. Removal of Commissioners with Excessive Unexcused Absences
    - 1. Review of Outreach Attempted Contact
    - 2. Public Comment
    - 3. Discussion
    - 4. Action Vote to Forward Decision to City Council
  - C. Review of Expired Cases (2020 2022) (Chief Investigator Golub)
    - 1. Themes to be reviewed by Outside Investigator
    - 2. Public Comment
    - 3. Discussion
  - IX. CLOSED SESSION
    - A. Public comment
    - B. Outside Counsel Mr. Duane Bennett Lead CPP into Closed Session

#### (Not Open to the Public)

- C. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE
  - Discussion & Consideration of Complaints & Reports: Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 to discuss complaints, charges, investigations, and discipline (unless the employee requests an open public session) involving San Diego Police Department employees, and information deemed confidential under Penal Code Sections 832.5-832.8 and Evidence Code Section 1040. Reportable actions for the Closed Session items on the agenda will be announced and posted on the Commission's website at <u>www.sandiego.gov/cpp</u>.

- I. San Diego Police Department Feedback on Case Specific Matters
- II. Officer Involved Shooting (1)
- III. Category II Case Audit Reports (1)
- IV. Discipline Reports (0)
- V. Category I Case Review Report (1)
- VI. Case-Specific Recommendations to the Mayor/Chief (0)
- VII. Referrals to other governmental agencies authorized to investigate activities of a law enforcement agency (0)
- VIII. Legal Opinion(s) Request & Response (0)
- X. REPORT FROM CLOSED SESSION (Counsel Bennett)
- XI. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS
- XII. ADJOURNMENT

#### **Materials Provided:**

- DRAFT Minutes from Regular Meeting on January 17, 2024
- DRAFT Training Academy for Case Review
- Presentation slides regarding Commissioner's City email

Access for People with Disabilities: As required by the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), requests for agenda information to be made available in alternative formats, and any requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for alternatives to observing meetings and offering public comment as noted above, may be made by contacting the Commission at (619) 236–6296 or commissionpolicepractices@sandiego.gov.

Requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for auxiliary aids, services, or interpreters, require different lead times, ranging from five business days to two weeks. Please keep this in mind and provide as much advance notice as possible in order to ensure availability. The city is committed to resolving accessibility requests swiftly in order to maximize accessibility.



#### **Office of the Commission on Police Practices**

COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES REGULAR MEETING MINUTES Wednesday, January 17, 2024

> 4:30pm-7:30pm Balboa Park Santa Fe Room 2144 Pan American W. Road San Diego, CA 92101

Click <u>https://youtu.be/dgdKq0qwq0I</u> to view this meeting on YouTube.

#### **Commissioners Present:**

Chair Gloria Tran 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chair Doug Case Octavio Aguilar Laila Aziz (Arrived at 5:57pm) Bonnie Benitez Alec Beyer Cheryl Canson (Arrived at 5:58pm) Lupe Diaz

#### Absent:

Dennis Larkin Yvania Rubio Jaylene Sanchez Dalia Sherlyn Villa De La Cruz

#### **Staff Present:**

Dwayne Harvey Brandon Hilpert James Justus Mark Maddox (Left at 5:50pm) Darlanne Mulmat

#### Excused:

1<sup>st</sup> Vice Chair Dennis W. Brown Christina Griffin-Jones Clovis Honoré

Danell Scarborough, Interim Executive Director Duane Bennett, CPP Outside Counsel Olga Golub, Chief Investigator Alina Conde, Executive Assistant Jon'Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement Coordinator

#### I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Gloria Tran called the meeting to order at 4:43pm.

II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call.

#### III. CABINET REPORT

- A. Cabinet Statement Chair Tran
  - Retreat and Meeting Protocol The Commission on Police Practices is tentatively holding a team building and planning retreat on January

27th. We will develop a Community Agreement.

- B. Chair Report Chair Tran
  - Commissioner Nicole Murray–Ramirez has resigned from the Commission on Police Practices, which now has 20 Commissioners. The deadline for applicants to fill that seat is February 2<sup>nd</sup>.
  - January 13th was the deadline for candidates who passed the original screening to confirm their interest in the 4 previous open seats. Their appointment will be in February during a City Council meeting.
  - The future goal is to have a pool of candidates who can be appointed if there are CPP openings.
  - The Cabinet and Dr. Scarborough will meet with the Mayor on January 24.
  - The Cabinet and Dr. Scarborough will meet with the Police Chief on January 30th. They will mention the Commissioner comment from the January 3<sup>rd</sup> meeting.
  - Internal Affairs Captain Anthony Dupree is leaving Internal Affairs effective January 20th. The Commission wants to thank Captain Dupree for his work with the CPP. The new IA Captain is Jeffrey Peterson. We will invite him to a future CPP meeting to introduce himself to us.
  - CPP and IA Meeting Report 2nd Vice Chair Doug Case reported that the most recent meeting was to discuss quality and issues regarding cases. The Cabinet, Chief Investigator Golub, and IA spoke about the ongoing issue of accessing recordings. Chief Investigator Golub also had the opportunity to ask questions regarding access to officer involved shooting scenes.
- IV. PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES: The purpose of the Commission on Police Practices (CPP or Commission) is to provide independent community oversight of SDPD, directed at increasing community trust in SDPD & increasing safety for community and officers. The purpose of the Commission is also to perform independent investigations of officer-involved shootings, in-custody deaths and other significant incidents, and an unbiased evaluation of all complaints against members of SDPD and its personnel in a process that will be transparent and accountable to the community. Lastly, the Commission also evaluates the review of all SDPD policies, practices, trainings, and protocols and represents the community in making recommendations for changes.
- V. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES

A. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of January 3, 2024
Motion: Commissioner James Justus moved to approve the CPP Regular Business
Meeting Minutes for January 3, 2024, with one amendment regarding the
Training Committee Update. Commissioner Alec Beyer seconded the motion.
The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-0.
Yays: Chair Tran, 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chair Case, Benitez, Aguilar, Beyer, Diaz, Harvey,

Yays: Chair Tran, 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice Chair Case, Benitez, Aguilar, Beyer, Diaz, Harvey, Hilpert, Justus, Maddox, and Mulmat.

Nays: None.

Abstained: None.

Absent: 1st Vice Chair Brown, Aziz, Canson, Honoré, Griffin-Jones, Larkin, Rubio, Sanchez, and Villa De La Cruz.

- VI. CLOSED SESSION (NOT OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)
  - A. Public Comment None
  - B. Outside Counsel Mr. Duane Bennett Lead CPP into Closed Session
  - C. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE

Discussion & Consideration of Complaints & Reports: Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 to discuss complaints, charges, investigations, and discipline (unless the employee requests an open public session) involving San Diego Police Department employees, and information deemed confidential under Penal Code Sections 832.5-832.8 and Evidence Code Section 1040. Reportable actions for the Closed Session items on the agenda will be posted on the Commission's website at www.sandiego.gov/cpp or stated at the beginning of the Open Session meeting if the meeting is held on the same day.

- I. San Diego Police Department Feedback on Case Specific Matters
- II. Shooting Review Board Reports (0)
- III. Category II Case Audit Reports (1)
- IV. Discipline Reports (1)
- V. Case Review Team Reports (2)
- VI. Case-Specific Recommendations to the Mayor/Chief (0)
- VII. Referrals to other governmental agencies authorized to investigate activities of a law enforcement agency (0)
- VIII. Legal Opinion(s) Request & Response (0)
- VII. REPORT OUT FROM CLOSED SESSION (5:34pm): Outside Counsel Duane Bennett reported that there was no reportable action.

#### VIII. NEW BUSINESS

- A. Body Worn Camera Policy (CPP Outside Counsel Duane Bennett)
  - Public Comment: None
  - Discussion (*Timestamp* 13:43)
  - Recommendations Commissioners will review the policy and email the cabinet with any comments and recommendation ideas. Once the Cabinet has compiled a list of recommendations, they will be forwarded to Outside Counsel Duane Bennett to come up with recommendations based on Commissioner suggestions.
- B. Role of Commissioners in Complaint Process (CPP Outside Counsel Duane Bennett)
  - Public Comment None
  - Discussion (*Timestamp* 31:01)
  - Action: OCPP Staff will prioritize looking into Code of Ethics/Codes of Conduct for NACOLE and other oversight agencies across the country. They will be shared with the Commissioners to see what works for the Commission.
- C. CPP Meeting Calendar
  - Public Comment None
  - Discussion (*Timestamp* 27:11)
  - Motion: Commissioner Bonnie Benitez moved for the approval of the CPP Meeting calendar with the exclusion of the meeting scheduled for

Tuesday, February 6<sup>th</sup>, 2024. Commissioner Lupe Diaz seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-0. Yays: Chair Tran, 2nd Vice Chair Case, Benitez, Aguilar, Beyer, Diaz, Harvey, Hilpert, Justus, Maddox, and Mulmat. Nays: None. Abstained: None. Abstained: None. Absent: 1st Vice Chair Brown, Aziz, Canson, Honoré, Griffin-Jones, Larkin, Rubio, Sanchez, and Villa De La Cruz.

- IX. AD HOC COMMITTEE REPORTS
  - A. Training Committee
    - DRAFT On-Boarding Training (*Timestamp* 1:02:38)
    - Public Comment None
    - Motion: Commissioner Laila Aziz moved to accept the onboarding training as a guideline and living document which is open to change. Commissioner Benitez seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 12-0-0.

Yays: Chair Tran, 2nd Vice Chair Case, Aziz, Canson, Benitez, Aguilar, Beyer, Diaz, Harvey, Hilpert, Justus, and Mulmat. Navs: None.

Abstained: None.

Absent: 1st Vice Chair Brown, Honoré, Griffin-Jones, Larkin, Maddox, Rubio, Sanchez, and Villa De La Cruz.

- B. Operating Procedures Committee Update
  - DRAFT Disciplinary Review Operating Procedures (*Timestamp* 1:16:14)
  - Public Comment None
  - Motion: Commissioner Laila Aziz moved to accept the DRAFT Disciplinary Review Operating Procedures with the change of "may" to "shall" on page 3. Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 12-0-0. Yays: Chair Tran, 2nd Vice Chair Case, Aziz, Canson, Benitez, Aguilar, Beyer, Diaz, Harvey, Hilpert, Justus, and Mulmat. Nays: None. Abstained: None. Abstained: None. Absent: 1st Vice Chair Brown, Honoré, Griffin-Jones, Larkin, Maddox, Rubio, Sanchez, and Villa De La Cruz.
- C. Ad Hoc Personnel Committee
  - Update on the Executive Director Hiring Process Commissioner James Justus reported that the shared characteristics (*Timestamp 1:39:58*) are appropriate to add to the list. Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat reported that the Executive Director characteristics list is a working document and the hope is that Community Forums will help craft them even further. Regarding the timeline, the Committee hopes the Executive Director will be chosen by the end of March 2024. The Committee is currently waiting on City Council to move forward with the process.
- X. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT: None

XI. COMISSIONER COMMENTS:

(Timestamp 1:46:44) Commissioner Laila Aziz made a comment regarding various complaints that were submitted to the CPP regarding the SDPD bike team. Commissioner Aziz also went over a court case regarding vehicle pat downs. Commissioner Aziz stated that this has been a growing concern of the public. Timestamp 1:50:43) Commissioner Dwayne Harvey announced that there is an expungement clinic (SB 731) for individuals who can get their felonies expunged (under certain circumstances and within limits). These are held on Fridays at 138 28<sup>th</sup> Street from 1-5pm.

(**Timestamp 1:51:50**) Commissioner James Justus informed the Commission that Captain Peterson held community forums each month when he was Captain at Central Division.

XII. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:23pm.



-		
Component	Торіс	Presenter(s)
1a	SDPD overview	SDPD representative
•		is structured, how it is operating, currently training
		n effect (e.g., rules of conduct for officers), and how
•	ved historically and responded to la	-
Purpose: To ensure commissioners know how SDPD currently operates so they can appropriately		
review compla	ints that come before the Commiss	ion and provide policy recommendations.
1b	SDPD ride along	SDPD officers
Objective: For	Commissioners to get a better und	erstanding of the situations officers encounter while
on patrol.		
Purpose: To pr	ovide perspective, consistent with l	aw enforcement oversight best practices
recommended	by NACOLE, in the experiences of la	aw enforcement officers.
2a	Use of Force Best Practices,	Understanding Use of Force NACOLE - Spencer
	the Law and How it is	Fomby
	Changing	
		Academic or Policy Analyst and/or Sharon Fairley or Civilian Office of Police Accountability (COPA)-
		Chicago (third week of COPA Fall 2023 Academy) or
		other potential experts or staff develop something
		customized for us
Objective: For	commissioners to be exposed to us	e of force laws and standards of practice across the
country, and h	ow they are changing, including nor	n-law enforcement perspectives.
Purpose: To er	nsure commissioners know national	use of force standards of practice so they can
appropriately e	examine local policies and practices	
2b	Introduction to Officer-	Civilian Office of Police Accountability (COPA)-
	Involved Shooting/In-	Chicago (second week of COPA Fall 2023 Academy)
	Custody Death	or get an expert that can tailor it to our
	Investigations and Major	circumstance
	Incident Investigations &	
	Response	
<b>Ohio ations</b> Fam		a sting a super the second super state of the state of the second second

**Objective**: For commissioners to be exposed to practices across the country related to officer-involved shooting/in-custody death investigations and major incident investigation.

**Purpose**: To ensure commissioners know investigative practices across the country related to major incidents and officer-involved shootings/in-custody deaths so they can appropriately examine local policies.



Cbjective: For Co Purpose: To unde force, detention a 2d L Cbjective: For co ncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	rstand how SDPD is training offic and arrest procedures, work to im regal Perspective of SDPD Officers: Use of Force Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	SDPD Academy (Question: Is exposure to simulators important? If so, can it be public?) how SDPD trains officers in relation to use of force. ers to make better recommendations on use of aplement better community/police relationships. CPP Legal Counsel PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately CPP Legal Counsel
Dbjective: For Co Purpose: To unde force, detention a 2d L Dbjective: For co ncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	lethal and less-lethal), imulators ommissioners to gain insight into irstand how SDPD is training offic and arrest procedures, work to im legal Perspective of SDPD officers: Use of Force procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	how SDPD trains officers in relation to use of force. ers to make better recommendations on use of aplement better community/police relationships. CPP Legal Counsel PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
Subjective: For Co Purpose: To under force, detention a 2d L Subjective: For con ncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	imulators ommissioners to gain insight into instand how SDPD is training offic and arrest procedures, work to im egal Perspective of SDPD officers: Use of Force procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	ers to make better recommendations on use of pplement better community/police relationships. CPP Legal Counsel PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
<b>Objective</b> : For Co <b>Purpose</b> : To underforce, detention at     2d   L     2d   L <b>Objective</b> : For con     ncluding physical <b>Purpose</b> : To ensu     examine local pol	ommissioners to gain insight into erstand how SDPD is training offic and arrest procedures, work to im regal Perspective of SDPD Officers: Use of Force Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	ers to make better recommendations on use of oplement better community/police relationships. CPP Legal Counsel PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
Purpose: To unde force, detention a 2d L Dbjective: For conncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	rstand how SDPD is training offic and arrest procedures, work to im regal Perspective of SDPD Officers: Use of Force Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	ers to make better recommendations on use of oplement better community/police relationships. CPP Legal Counsel PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
orce, detention a 2d L Dbjective: For conncluding physical Purpose: To ensu	and arrest procedures, work to im egal Perspective of SDPD Officers: Use of Force Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
2d L C Dbjective: For co ncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	egal Perspective of SDPD Officers: Use of Force Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	CPP Legal Counsel PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
O P Dbjective: For con ncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	Officers: Use of Force Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	PD's legal perspective regarding use of force, e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
<u>P</u> Dbjective: For conncluding physical Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	Procedures mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
<b>Objective</b> : For con ncluding physical <b>Purpose</b> : To ensu examine local pol	mmissioners to be exposed to SD strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
ncluding physical <b>Purpose</b> : To ensu examine local pol	strength, OC spray, tasers, K9 us re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	e and firearms. perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
Purpose: To ensu examine local pol	re commissioners know the legal icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	perspective of SDPD so they can appropriately
examine local pol	icies and practices. earch and Seizure Part I:	
•	earch and Seizure Part I:	CPP Legal Counsel
3a S		CPP Legal Counsel
C	ase law concerning stops &	
d	etentions, search, seizure	
8	arrest, rights of arrested	
_p	ersons	
		elated to individuals going through the process of
	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	l pending their cases being heard in Courts, including
	nt and what constitutes an impro	•
		the law regarding these concepts so they can
	iew complaints that come before	
3b S	earch and Seizure Part II:	CPP Legal Counsel
C	ase law concerning vehicle	
S	tops	
<b>Objective</b> : For Co	mmissioners to learn case laws r	elated to vehicle stops.
•urpose: To gain	greater insight into the status of t	the law regarding these concepts.
3c S	earch and Seizure Part III:	CPP Legal Counsel
C	ase law concerning entries	
	f property	
		elated to police officers entering dwellings.



Component	Topic	Presenter(s)
3d	Search and Seizure Part IV:	CPP Legal Counsel
	SDPD Procedures	
	concerning stops,	
	detentions, pat downs, and –	
	handcuffing	
•		edures regarding pat downs and handcuffing.
•		e current policies and procedures are so they can
· · · · · ·	review complaints that come before	
4	Steps in the criminal justice	CPP Chief Investigator or CPP Legal Counsel
	process: arrest, booking	
	(where SDPD control stops)	
		s citizens go through when being stopped, detained,
	ed into jail pending their cases bein	-
		n is processed through the criminal justice system. Coleen Cusak or mental health
5a	Best practices regarding	
	resources/procedures for	professional/licensed therapist or San Diego County
	dealing with mentally	Mental Health Services representative or PERT
	disturbed individuals and	representative or National Alliance on Mental
	persons under the influence	Illness (NAMI)
•		policing practices regarding dealing with mentally
	viduals and persons under the influe	
• •	-	und information on policing best practices to assess
potential areas	s for improvement at SDPD.	
5b	Training provided to SDPD	SDPD Training Division
	officers regarding	
	resources/procedures for	
	dealing with mentally	
	disturbed individuals and	
	_persons under the influence	
•		raining received by SDPD officers regarding how to
handle mental	ly disturbed individuals and persons	s under the influence.

**Purpose**: To provide Commissioners with background information on training SDPD officers receive in comparison to best practices.



Component	Topic	Presenter(s)
6a	Best practices regarding	Muslim ARC, Anti-Defamation League (ADL), San
	community/ cultural	Diego Office of Race and Equity
	awareness, understanding	
	the history, culture, and	
	concerns of communities	
	served	
Objective: For	Commissioners to learn about best	policing practices regarding cultural awareness.
• •	-	und information on policing best practices to assess
potential areas	s for improvement at SDPD.	
6b	SDPD officer training	SDPD Training Division
	regarding community/	
	cultural awareness,	
	understanding the history,	
	culture, and concerns of	
	communities served	
-	Commissioners to learn about the	training received by SDPD officers regarding cultural
awareness.		
-		und information on training SDPD officers receive in
	best practices.	ACLU San Diego
7a	Racial Profiling & Law	Acto Sali Diego
	Enforcement in San Diego	
	Requirement Related to	
	Complaints	
•		history of racial profiling in local law enforcement, as
	acial and Identity Profiling Act) req	
Purpose: To pr	ovide Commissioners with backgro	und on racial profiling in local policing.
7b	Impacts of Racial and	Community members (e.g., people erroneously in
	Identity Profiling	gang database), ACLU Coalition for Police
		Accountability and Transparency (CPAT)
Objective: For	Commissioners to understand the	impact of racial and identity profiling
Purpose: To pr	ovide Commissioners with backgro	und on racial and identity profiling.
7c	SDPD officer training	SDPD Training Division
	regarding biased based	
	policing /racial profiling	
Objective: For	Commissioners to learn about the	training received by SDPD officers regarding bias in
policing.		
		und information on training SDPD officers receive in
comparison to	best practices.	



Component	Topic	Presenter(s)		
8	Overview of Internal Affairs	Internal Affairs Captain or Lt.		
_	(investigation & review of			
	shootings & in-custody			
	deaths; complaint,			
investigative & disciplinary processes; mediation of				
complaints; evaluating credibility and reaching				
	findings; procedures and			
	practices for misconduct			
	investigations)			
-		complaints process, how a complaint is filed,		
	•	of SDPD disciplining officers should disciplinary		
action be appr	-			
•		ernal Affairs operates so they can appropriately		
•		me before the Commission and provide policy		
	recommendations.			
9	Additional SDPD Policies &	CPP Chief Investigator or CPP Legal Counsel, and		
	Procedures: De-escalation -	SDPD (to answer questions regarding procedures)		
	Duty to Intervene BWC -			
	Personal Conduct			
		police procedures related to de-escalation, duty to		
	y worn cameras, and personal cond			
•	eview complaints that come before	e current policies and procedures are so they can		
· · · · · · · · ·	•	CPP Chief Investigator or CPP Legal Counsel		
10a	Overview of CPP Case	CFF Ciller investigator of CFF Legal Coursei		
Ohiostive, Def	Review Process	astablished		
	ine when operating procedures are e when operating procedures are e			
		CPP Chief Investigator		
10b	Report Write-up of a Case,			
	and Case Presentation			
•	ine when operating procedures are			
Purpose: Refine when operating procedures are established				



Component	Topic	Presenter(s)
11	Witness Reliability – Standards of Proof, Legal Concepts Overview & Case	How to Listen for, Recognize, and Break Down Assumptions and Conclusory Language - Jennifer Jarett
	Studies	Civilian Office of Police Accountability (COPA)- Chicago (fifth week of COPA Fall 2023 Academy)
<b>Objective</b> : For commissioners to understand the variability in witness accounts of incidents and standards of proof.		

Purpose: To ensure commissioners consider standards of proof when conducting case reviews.

12 Process of Decision Making Sharon Fairley

**Objective**: Teach commissioners that cases are not black and white, the importance of weighing evidence, how to compare an officer's narrative against other evidence and reach a conclusion to figure out what most likely happened and then determine if there is a violation of policy/procedure. **Purpose**: To ensure that commissioners understand all factors to consider when reviewing complaints that come before the Commission.

# **CPP** Commissioner Emails



# **SD** Commission on Police Practices

### **Presentation Outline**

- Purpose and Background
- Commission on Police Practices
- San Diego City Council
- Other Oversight Agencies:
  - Oakland Police Commission
  - New York Civilian Complaint Review Board
  - Los Angeles Sheriff Civilian Oversight Commission
  - St. Louis Civilian Oversight Board
- Staff Recommendations
- Questions

### **Purpose & Background**

### The purpose of this presentation is to answer the following question:

• What should the Commission on Police Practices do about *Commissioner emails in regards to displaying them on the website* and responding to emails from the public?

### **Current CPP Commissioner Page**



<u>Gloria Tran</u> Chair At Large Representative



Dennis W. Brown First Vice Chair, Personnel Ad-Hoc Committee Chair District 7 Representative



Douglas N. Case Second Vice Chair, Operating Procedures Ad-Hoc Committee Co-Chair Low & Moderate Income Area Representative



Brandon Hilpert Training Ad-Hoc Committee Co-Chair District 3 Representative



<u>Mark Maddox</u> Bylaws Ad-Hoc Committee Chair Low & Moderate Income Area Representative



Yvania Rubio Operating Procedures Ad-Hoc Committee Co-Chair At Large Representative

### The current CPP Commissioner Page includes:

# 1.Headshots2. Names2. Titles4. Positions5.Biographies

### San Diego City Council





Councilmember Marni von Wilpert District 5 MarnivonWilpert@sandiego.gov

Council President Sean Elo-Rivera

#### District 9

SeanEloRivera@sandiego.gov

https://www.sandiego.gov/citycouncil

### San Diego City Council include:

1.Name
2. Title
3. District
4. Email

### **Oakland Police Commission**





Oct 17, 2020 - Oct 16, 2023



#### Karely Ordaz

**Commission Vice Chair** 

Email Oct 17, 2023 – Oct 16, 2026



#### Jesse Hsieh

Email

Commissioner

Email Oct 17, 2022 - Oct 16, 2025



#### Wilson Riles Jr.

Commissioner

Email Oct 17, 2023 – Oct 16, 2026

https://www.oaklandca.gov/teams/police-commission

### **Oakland Police Commission includes:**

1.Headshot 2.Title 3.Email 4.Term 5.Position

**Oakland does not** include biographies

### **Oakland Police Commission**



#### **Police Commission** Team:

### Marsha Peterson

**Commission Chair** 

Marsha Peterson is a Mayoral Appointee. Her term ends on October 16, 2023.

Email Address: MPeterson@oaklandcommission.org

Term Start Date: Oct 17, 2020

Term End Date: Oct 16, 2023



https://www.oaklandca.gov/volunteers/karely-ordaz

Oakland includes their Commissioner email directly

### New York Civilian Complaint Review Board



### Public Advocate Designee

Esmeralda Simmons, Esq.

https://www.nyc.gov/site/ccrb/about/board/members.page

### **New York Civilian Complaint Review Board** includes:

1.Title 2.Name **3.**Position 4.Biography

### New York does not include terms and emails

### New York Civilian Complaint Review Board

### **Arva Rice**

Arva Rice has more than 15 years experience in the non-profit arena, ranging from working with New York City entrepreneurs in a micro lending program to working with young people as a counselor, mentor and tutor. She has extensive experience in collaboration building, strategic planning, fundraising and marketing. Arva is President & CEO of the New York Urban League (NYUL), an organization that has a rich history and long legacy of service to New Yorkers. Today, the mission of the NYUL is to enable African Americans and other underserved communities to secure a first class education, economic self-reliance and equal respect of their civil rights through programs, services and advocacy.

Prior to joining the League she served as the Executive Director of Project Enterprise, an organization that provides business loans, technical assistance and peer support to New York City entrepreneurs who lack adequate access to business financing.

Arva is a member of the Women's Forum and Greater New York Chapter of The Links Incorporated. She is on the Board of Trustees of First Corinthians Baptist

Church. In the past she has served on the Board of Directors of the Central Brooklyn Partnership(CBP) a non-profit dedicated to financial literacy and education in Bedford-Stuyvesant.

Arva graduated from the Northwestern University in Evanston, IL. She currently lives in Harlem.

#### https://www.nyc.gov/site/ccrb/about/board/arva-rice.page



### Los Angeles Sheriff Civilian Oversight Commission



https://coc.lacounty.gov/commissioners

Los Angeles Sheriff Civilian Oversight Commission includes: 1.Headshots 2.Titles

Los Angeles does not include: 1.Biographies 2.Emails 3.Terms 4.Positions

### St. Louis Civilian Oversight Board (COB)

### **Board Members**

Showing 6 active board members (maximum 7)

Name 🔺	Role	End Date 🔺
Bradley Arteaga	Member	12/31/2023 Serving Beyond
<u>Ciera Simril</u>	Member	12/31/2023 Serving Beyond
<u>David Bell</u>	Member	12/31/2023 Serving Beyond
<u>Frank Copanas</u>	Member	12/31/2021 Serving Beyond
<u>Jane Abbott-Morris</u>	Member	12/31/2021 Serving Beyond

https://www.stlouis-mo.gov/government/departments/public-safety/civilianoversight/civilian-oversight-board/index.cfm

### **St. Louis Civilian Oversight Board includes:**

1.Names 2.Position 3.Terms

St. Louis does not include: 1.Photos 2. Bios 3.Titles 4. Districts 5.Emails

### St. Louis Civilian Oversight Board (COB)

### **Bradley Arteaga**

Learn about board member Bradley Arteaga

#### **Current Membership**

Bradley Arteaga is serving on the following:

<u>Civilian Oversight Board</u> 2019 - 2023 (Serving Beyond Term), Appointed by Lyda Krewson (Mayor - City of St. Louis)

#### **Past Membership**

Bradley Arteaga served prior terms on the following:

<u>Civilian Oversight Board</u> 2015 - 2019 , Appointed by Francis Slay (Mayor - City of St. Louis)

https://www.stlouis-mo.gov/government/boards/members/member.cfm?memberId=1263752234

### **Staff Recommendation**

### The CPP Community Engagement Coordinator recommends:

- 1. Add the word "Email" under every Commissioner's name
- 2. Link "Email" to the Commissioner's CPP email and CC CPP general email.

### **Concerns addressed in this approach:**

- 1. Capacity
- 2. Privacy
- 3. Spamming



#### **Gloria** Tran Chair At Large Representative Email

### **Staff Recommendation**

- CPP staff recommends that the Commissioners reply to emails directly sent to them if the email is specific to the Commissioner's role and experience.
- Commissioners will reply "all" when initially responding to emails received to keep CPP staff informed.
- If the Commissioner does not reply within five business days, staff will reply to emails.

### **Staff Recommendation**

The following are exception for when Commissioners should <u>not</u> reply:

- Media Inquiries:
  - Staff will direct to Chair
- Official CPP Representation/Invitation:
  - Staff will direct to Chair, CC Community Engagement Coordinator
- Presentation and Training Requests:
  - Staff will direct to Community Engagement Coordinator
- OCPP Business:
  - Staff will directly respond

<u>Note</u>: Staff will always CC IED and the Commissioner who received the original email in all responses

## Questions?

