

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	March 14, 2024	REPORT NO. HRB-24-010
HEARING DATE:	March 28, 2024	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #4 – JOHN S. GRAVES SPEC. HOUSE #2	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Richard A. Berglas and Karen L. Berglas; repre Preservation	esented by Landmark Historic
LOCATION:	4227 Jackdaw Street, Uptown Community, Co APN 444-264-03-00	uncil District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the John S. Grave 4227 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource.	es Spec. House #2 located at

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the John S. Graves Spec. House #2 located at 4227 Jackdaw Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1985 and 2019-2020 additions and attached ADU constructed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of the Craftsman style architecture and retains integrity from its 1921 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched, cross-gable roof with unenclosed overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails, decorative attic vents, decorative beams, narrow horizontal wood siding, a partial-width, half-walled front porch with front gable roof supported by stucco-clad tapered round columns over brick piers, brick chimney, and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was identified in the <u>2016 Uptown Community Plan Update Historic Resources Survey</u> and, given a Status Code of 5D3, "appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the John S. Graves Spec. House #2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of John S. Graves, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria* provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

The property located at 4227 Jackdaw Street is a one-story, Craftsman style single-family residential building constructed in 1921 in the Uptown Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on site include an attached single-story ADU. The property is surrounded by similarly scaled residences in the Mission Hills neighborhood. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1921, the property at 4227 Jackdaw Street has been modified as follows: in 1985 the roof was replaced and a bedroom and bathroom was added at the rear and side, the original detached garage was demolished and rebuilt in 1996, and in 2019-2020 the garage was converted into an ADU and an addition to the main residence was constructed which connected the house with the former detached garage/ADU. The front entry door was replaced with a 10-lite French door as part of the 2019-2020 permit. The 2019-2020 project was reviewed by Heritage Preservation staff and determined to be consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation, which allows for additions to historic resources. Front yard concrete retaining walls were added at an unknown date.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board</u> <u>Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1921 in the Craftsman style. The house features low-pitched, cross-gable and hip roof forms with asphalt shingles, unenclosed overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails, decorative attic vents, exposed beams, narrow horizontal wood siding, and a red brick chimney. The partial-width front porch has a front gable roof and is supported by stucco-clad tapered round columns over brick piers and matching capped brick half wall. The front façade features two large, 5:1 fixed wood windows and a 10-lite French entry door. Other fenestration consists primarily of double-hung and fixed single-lite wood windows.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains overall integrity of design, materials, and workmanship despite the modifications. The modifications are designed in a manner that is consistent with the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The 1985 and 2019-2020 additions extend from the rear of the original residence connecting it to the non-original garage/ADU and do not impact the resource's character defining features. The additions are designed in a similar massing, scale and proportion as the original structure and feature compatible materials that do not significantly impair the resource's significance as a Craftsman style residence. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1921 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

<u>Significance Statement:</u> The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and architecture integrity to its 1921 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched, cross-gable roof with unenclosed overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails, decorative attic vents, decorative beams, narrow horizontal wood siding, a partial-width front porch with front gable roof supported by stucco-clad tapered round columns over brick piers, brick chimney, and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the John S. Graves Spec. House #2 located at 4227 Jackdaw Street be designated with a period of significance of 1921 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the 1985 and 2019-2020 additions and attached ADU constructed outside the period of significance.

Arielle Truong Management Intern City Planning Department

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison City Planning Department

AT/sa/bt/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 3/28/2024

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/28/2024, to consider the historical designation of the **John S. Graves Spec. House #2** (owned by Richard A and Karen L Berglas, 4227 Jackdaw Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **4227 Jackdaw Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **444-264-03-00**, further described as BLK 17 LOTS 5 & 6 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the John S. Graves Spec. House #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Craftsman style architecture and retains integrity from its 1921 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched, cross-gable roof with unenclosed overhanging eaves, exposed rafter tails, decorative attic vents, decorative beams, narrow horizontal wood siding, a partial-width, half-walled front porch with front gable roof supported by stucco-clad tapered round columns over brick piers, brick chimney, and fenestration consisting of wood double hung and fixed windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1985 and 2019-2020 additions and attached ADU constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

TIM HUTTER, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY:

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

4227 Jackdaw Street, San Diego, CA 92103

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 444-264-03-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)