

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF FEBRUARY 22, 2024
HYBRID HEARING**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

Chairperson Tim Hutter called the meeting to order at 1:08 p.m. Chairperson Tim Hutter adjourned the meeting at 2:39 p.m.

ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Tim Hutter – present
Vice-Chairperson Kristi Byers – absent
2nd Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
Boardmember Ann Woods – present
Boardmember Carla Farley – present
Boardmember Courtney Ann Coyle – present
Boardmember David McCullough – absent
Boardmember Dr. Li-Rong Lilly Cheng – present
Boardmember Mathew Winter – present
Boardmember Rammy Cortez – present

City Staff

Lindsey Sebastian, Deputy City Attorney – present
Kelley Stanco, City Planning Department – present
Bernie Turgeon, City Planning Department – present
Suzanne Segur, City Planning Department – present
Shannon Anthony, City Planning Department – present
Alvin Lin, City Planning Department – present
Megan Walker, City Planning Department – present
Kelsey Kaline, City Planning Department – present
Arielle Truong, City Planning Department – present
Caroline Garcia, Legislative Recorder – present

Note: All decision makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT

Laura Henson, President of Talmadge Historical Society, wanted to inform the Board that Talmadge Park Estate Historic District was unanimously approved by the State Historical Resource Commission to be listed in the National Register of Historic Places.

Debbie Sanders shared her experience of the architecture review process for the Talmadge Park Estate Historic District. She also wanted to thank the Board for its recognition of the historical architectural value of the district and for their support in providing a recommendation that the Talmadge Park Estate Historic District be listed on the National Register of Historic Places.

Geoffrey Hueter commented on thinking about how to put historical preservation in a context that's compatible with development instead of being in opposition to development.

Donna Smith Alexander shared that she was ecstatic to hear that historical resource 4505 Long Branch (formerly her family home) to find out it was designated. She shared concerns about code enforcement on the property.

Barry Hager wants to remind the Board that from last November's meeting, the Board approved a motion directing staff to place on the next policy Committee agenda the review and consideration of amendments to HRB policy 4.1 and the HRB procedures as proposed by Mission Hills Heritage related to local designation of National Register historic districts. The Policy Subcommittee meeting scheduled for January was canceled, and the subcommittee meeting in February addressed two other items but not the amendments. Requesting a nudge from the Board to the staff would be greatly appreciated.

Kristin Harms President of the University Heights Historical Society respectfully urges immediate attention to the proposal submitted by the Neighborhood Historic Preservation Coalition asking for a comprehensive study in preparation for the planned historical ordinance reform.

Bruce Coons wanted to answer a couple of questions Chair Hutter had at the last meeting regarding National Register nominations

BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT

Boardmember Cortez wanted to request policy subcommittee vacancy from Bruce Abrams to be on the next agenda to be filled.

Chair Hutter wanted to recognize for the record that Clint Daniels has submitted a non-agenda public comment specific to the municipal code section under which recommendations are made for State or National Historical designations. Advised staff to be prepared to address that at the next meeting to ensure the Board is following all appropriate procedures and understands the procedures that should be followed.

CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

NONE

EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

NONE

FAILURE TO

VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

NONE

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN

NONE

REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

NONE

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR JANUARY 25, 2025

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES WITH CORRECTIONS. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 6-0-2 with Boardmembers Woods, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Winters, and Chair Hutter voting yea, with Boardmembers Cortez and Cheng abstaining, and with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.

STAFF REPORT

Kelley Stanco, Deputy Director from the Planning Department, just wanted to announce that Historic Preservation Awards will be returning this year. The window to submit a nomination has opened and will close on April 5th. Winners will be chosen at the April policy subcommittee meeting. Then, the awards will be presented in Mays HRB meeting. For more information, visit www.sandiego.gov/historic-planning.

Suzanne Segur, Senior Planner from the Planning Department wanted to note that the appeals of the historic designations of HRB sites #1507 and #1399 were scheduled to be heard on February 26, 2024 but it is being postponed and working on scheduling at a later date. Suzanne also reported that a meeting of the Policy Subcommittee was held on February 12th. Boardmembers and the public discussed an amendment to the Historical Resources Board procedures and the proposal to the historic district. The next Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, March 11th at 3:00 p.m.

More information regarding the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee can be found on the City's website.

Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner from the Planning Department reported that the next Design Assistant Subcommittee will be held on Wednesday, March 6th, at 4:00pm.

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

Item 5 – PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES

Item 1 – HARRY AND EDNA PAYNE/ CARL B. HAYS HOUSE, located at 4952 Marlborough Drive *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

Item 2 – ROBERT AND ADDIE LANE HOUSE located at 3640 Utah Street *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

Item 3 – ERNEST AND MARY WAIDMANN HOUSE located at 3795 Goldfinch Street *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

Item 4 – RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC. HOUSE #5 located at 3560-3562 Utah Street *pulled from the Consent Agenda due to public comment*

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO HEAR ITEMS 5, THEN 1 THROUGH 4 IN ORDER. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Cortez, Woods, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Cheng, Winter, and Chair Hutter voting yea and with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM-1 *Trailed from January 25, 2024*

HARRY AND EDNA PAYNE/ CARL B. HAYS HOUSE

Note: This item was heard as the second discussion item.

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Harry and Edna Payne/ Carl B. Hays House located at 4952 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear 2021 addition constructed outside of the period of significance. The designation includes the original detached garage.

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Correspondence Received

In Opposition: Clint Daniels.

Testimony Received

In Favor: Kiley Wallace and Ronen Erlich.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO DESIGNATE THE HARRY AND EDNA PAYNE/ CARL B. HAYS HOUSE LOCATED AT 4952 MARLBOROUGH DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1928 UNDER HRB CRITERIA C AND D PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE REAR 2021 ADDITION CONSTRUCTED OUTSIDE OF THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. THE BOARD'S MOTION ALSO EXCLUDES THE DETACHED GARAGE. Seconded by Boardmember Cortez. The motion passed by a vote of 7-1-0 with Boardmembers Cortez, Woods, Taylor, Farley, Cheng, Winter, and Chair Hutter voting yea; and with Boardmember Coyle voting no; and with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.

ITEM-2 *Trailed from January 25, 2024*

ROBERT AND ADDIE LANE HOUSE

Note: This item was heard as the third discussion item.

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Addie Lane House located at 3640 Utah Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the pre-1962 rear addition, 1999 addition, and 1999 detached garage.

Staff Report by Alvin Lin

Correspondence Received

In Opposition: Clint Daniels

Testimony Received

In Favor: Ginger Weatherford.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO DESIGNATE THE ROBERT AND ADDIE LANE HOUSE LOCATED AT 3640 UTAH STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1912 UNDER HRB CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE PRE-1962 REAR ADDITION, 1999 ADDITION, AND 1999 DETACHED GARAGE. Seconded by Boardmember Cheng. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cheng, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Woods, Cortez, and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.

ITEM-3***Trailed from January 25, 2024*****ERNEST AND MARY WAIDMANN HOUSE**

Note: This item was heard as the fourth discussion item.

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ernest and Mary Waidmann House located at 3795 Goldfinch Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1925 residential structure at 825 Bush Street and a detached shed, both located on the eastern portion of the parcel.

Staff Report by Alvin Lin**Correspondence Received**

In Opposition: Clint Daniels.

Testimony Received

In Favor: Kiley Wallace.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE ERNEST AND MARY HOUSE LOCATED AT 3795 GOLDFINCH STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1913-1925 UNDER HRB CRITERION C PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. THE BOARD'S MOTION INCLUDES DESIGNATION OF THE 1925 RESIDENTIAL STRUCTURE AT 825 BUSH STREET. THE 825 BUSH STREET RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE CRAFTSMAN STYLE AND RETAINS ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE FEATURES ONE-STORY MASSING, LOW PITCHED GABLE ROOF, WIDE OVERHANGING EAVES, EXPOSED ROOF RAFTERS, WOOD CLAPBOARD SIDING, ORIGINAL COVERED PORCH, FRONT DOOR, MATCHING WOODEN WINDOWS, AND CRAFTSMAN FEATURES THAT MATCH THE 3795 GOLDFINCH STREET RESOURCE SUCH AS RECTANGULAR ATTIC VENT AND HORIZONTAL DENTIL CORNICE. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE DETACHED SHED ON THE EASTERN PORTION OF THE PARCEL. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 6-2-0 with Boardmembers Woods, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, and Cheng, and Winter voting yea; and with Boardmember Cortez and Chair Hutter voting no; and with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.

ITEM-4**RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC. HOUSE #5**

Note: This item was heard as the fifth discussion item.

Proposed Action: Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec. House #5 located at 3560-3562 Utah Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1919 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear detached two-story ADU with an attached laundry room at 3560 Utah Street constructed outside the period of significance.

Staff Report by Shannon Anthony

Correspondence Received

In Favor: Jennifer Stropes.

In Opposition: Clint Daniels.

Testimony Received

In Favor: Jennifer Stropes.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER TAYLOR TO DESIGNATE THE RALPH HURLBURT/ALEXANDER SCHREIBER SPEC. HOUSE #5 LOCATED AT 3560-3562 UTAH STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE UNDER HRB CRITERION C AND D PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE REAR DETACHED TWO-STORY ADU WITH ATTACHED LAUNDRY ROOM. Seconded by Boardmember Cheng. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Cortez, Woods, Taylor, Farley, Coyle, Cheng, Winter, and Chair Hutter voting yea with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.

ITEM-5

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES

Note: This item was heard as the first discussion item.

Proposed Action: Adopt or do not adopt the proposed amendments to the Historical Resources Board Procedures regarding establishment and management of the consent portion of the agenda.

Staff Recommendation: Adopt the proposed amendments to the Historical Resources Board Procedures regarding establishment and management of the consent portion of the agenda.

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Correspondence Received

In Favor: Ginger Weatherford, Clint Daniels, and Geoffrey Hueter.

Testimony Received

In Favor: Geoffrey Hueter

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR HUTTER TO ADOPT STAFF RECOMMENDATION WITH MODIFICATIONS NOTED BY STAFF AT THE MEETING AND ADOPT THE PROPOSED AMENDMENTS TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD PROCEDURES REGARDING ESTABLISHMENT AND MANAGEMENT OF THE CONSENT PORTION OF THE AGENDA WITH UPDATES. Seconded by 2nd Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 8-0-0 with Boardmembers Winter, Cheng, Coyle, Farley, Taylor, Woods, Cortez, and Chair Hutter voting yea; and with Boardmembers Byers and McCullough absent.