The City of **SAN DIEGO**

Climate Action Plan 2023 Annual Report Appendix

Table of Contents

INTRODUCTION	1
SECTION A: OVERVIEW OF 2019 – 2022 GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS	1
GREENHOUSE GAS (GHG) EMISSIONS INVENTORY	
PER CAPITA GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS	3
SECTION B: 2022 CLIMATE ACTION PLAN STRATEGY UPDATES	4
STRATEGY 1: DECARBONIZATION OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT	
STRATEGY 2: ACCESS TO CLEAN AND RENEWABLE ENERGY	
STRATEGY 3: MOBILITY AND LAND USE	
STRATEGY 4: CIRCULAR ECONOMY AND CLEAN COMMUNITIES	
STRATEGY 5: RESILIENT INFRASTRUCTURE AND HEALTHY ECOSYSTEMS	
STRATEGY 6: EMERGING CLIMATE ACTION	25
SECTION C: METHODOLOGY DIFFERENCES AND DATA REFINEMENT	26

Table of Figures

FIGURE 1: CITY OF SAN DIEGO GHG EMISSIONS COMPARISON TO 2019 BASELINE
FIGURE 2: CHANGES IN SAN DIEGO GDP, POPULATION, AND GHG EMISSIONS SINCE 20194
FIGURE 3: GRID-SUPPLIED ELECTRICITY CONSUMPTION CHANGES FROM 2019 BASELINE
FIGURE 4: GRID-SUPPLIED ELECTRICITY USE BY CUSTOMER CLASS IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019-2022]6
FIGURE 5: NATURAL GAS CONSUMPTION CHANGES FROM 2019 BASELINE
FIGURE 6: NATURAL GAS USE BY CUSTOMER CLASS IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019–2022]7
FIGURE 7: TOTAL ENERGY USE IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019–2022]8
FIGURE 8: MUNICIPAL ENERGY USE [2015–2022]9
FIGURE 9: ELECTRICITY CONSUMPTION AND EMISSIONS IN THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019–2022]10
FIGURE 10: BEHIND-THE-METER PV IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [1999–2022]11
FIGURE 11: CITYWIDE ENERGY CONSUMPTION FROM SDG&E, SDCP, BEHIND METER PV [2019–2022]12
FIGURE 12: VEHICLE TYPES IN MUNICIPAL FLEET [2016–2022]13
FIGURE 13: MUNICIPAL FLEET COMPRESSED NATURAL GAS AND DIESEL FUEL USE BY TYPE [2016–2022] .13
FIGURE 14: PERCENT OF HYBRID AND ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN SAN DIEGO COUNTY [2019–2022]15
FIGURE 15: CHANGES IN VMT, PER CAPITA VMT, AND ON-ROAD EMISSIONS FROM 2019 BASELINE
FIGURE 16: ON ROAD EMISSIONS VS. VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED IN THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019–2022] 17
FIGURE 17: REGIONAL TRANSIT BOARDINGS AND PASSENGER MILES [2016–2022]18
FIGURE 18: TONS TO LANDFILL AND LANDFILL DIVERSION RATE IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2016-2022]21
FIGURE 19: WATER SALES BY SECTOR [2010–2022]22
FIGURE 20: ACRE-FEET OF WATER DELIVERED TO CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2015–2022]24
FIGURE 21: PER CAPITA WATER USE [2010–2022]

List of Tables

TABLE 1: CITY OF SAN DIEGO GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS2
TABLE 2: 2019-2022 PER CAPITA GHG EMISSIONS
TABLE 3: TOTAL GRID-SUPPLIED ELECTRICITY USE IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO
TABLE 4: TOTAL NATURAL GAS DELIVERED BY SDG&E IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO6
TABLE 5: TOTAL ELECTRICITY AND NATURAL GAS DELIVERED BY SDG&E IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO8
TABLE 6: ENERGY USE IN MUNICIPAL BUILDINGS9
TABLE 7: PERCENTAGE OF RENEWABLES IN GRID ELECTRICITY SUPPLY
TABLE 8: MUNICIPAL ON-SITE GENERATION [2021–2022]12
TABLE 9: PERCENT OF ZEVS IN MUNICIPAL VEHICLE FLEET [2016–2022]12
TABLE 10: CITY FLEET GASOLINE CONSUMPTION14
TABLE 11: NUMBER OF REGISTERED ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN SAN DIEGO COUNTY
TABLE 12: ESTIMATED NUMBER OF ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS
TABLE 13: VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED (VMT) IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO16
TABLE 14: PERCENT OF MODE SHARE FOR EMPLOYEE COMMUTE
TABLE 15: BICYCLE FACILITIES IMPROVEMENTS SINCE 2013
TABLE 16: REGIONAL REMOTE WORK SURVEY19
TABLE 17: ROUNDABOUTS INSTALLED AND TRAFFIC SIGNALS RETIMED19
TABLE 18: WASTE DIVERSION RATE AND DISPOSED TONNAGE 20
TABLE 19: WASTEWATER FLOW AND EMISSIONS [2016-2022]20
TABLE 20: ACRES OF RIPARIAN AND WETLAND RESTORATION IN PROGRESS
TABLE 21: TREE PLANTING AND MAINTENANCE
TABLE 22: METERED RECYCLED AND IRRIGATION WATER USE
TABLE 23: METHODOLOGY DIFFERENCES AND DATA REFINEMENTS OF GHG INVENTORY

Introduction

The City of San Diego (City) adopted an updated Climate Action Plan (CAP) in 2022 with new sets of targets, measures, and actions.1 This is the first annual report monitoring the 2022 CAP. The City of San Diego's 2023 Climate Action Plan Annual Report (this report) provides additional information and data in the following three sections:

- Section A: Overview of 2019 2022 Greenhouse Gas Emissions
- Section B: 2022 Climate Action Plan Strategy Updates
- Section C: Methodology Differences and Data Refinement

Estimated total greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions in the City in 2022 were 8.6 million metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent (MMT CO_2e), approximately 19% lower than the 2019 GHG emissions estimate of 10.6 MMT CO_2e . The five strategies in the 2015 CAP are: (1) decarbonization of the built environment; (2) access to clean and renewable energy; (3) mobility and land use; (4) circular economy and clean communities; (5) resilient infrastructure and healthy ecosystems; and (6) emerging climate actions. Under each strategy, the current state in 2019–2022 is presented first followed by updates of each action. Comparisons of the 2020, 2021, and 2022 status and the baseline estimates from 2019 are provided where possible.

In preparation for this report and the 2019–2022 GHG emissions inventory, revisions and refinements were made to the baseline 2019 GHG emissions estimates from previous Annual Reports and the 2022 CAP to reflect updated data as it became available. This updating approach follows the approach used by the California Air Resources Board (CARB) when updating the California statewide GHG inventory, and is based on the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) recommendations to maintain a consistent time-series when developing GHG inventories.² Revisions to previous estimates are explained in *Section C: Methodology Differences and Data Refinement* of this report. The updates to the CAP strategies performance metrics are described in *Section B: 2022 Climate Action Plan Strategy Updates*.

Section A: Overview of 2019 – 2022 Greenhouse Gas Emissions

GREENHOUSE GAS (GHG) EMISSIONS INVENTORY

The categories of emissions sources included in this update are consistent with the previous 2015 CAP Annual Reports, with the addition of off-road vehicle and equipment from construction. Categories include: on-road transportation, electricity, natural gas, water, wastewater, solid waste, and off-road construction. As in the previous years, these reflect the emission categories that are recommended in the U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions (U.S.

¹ City of San Diego: 2022 Climate Action Plan.

² California Air Resources Board (CARB): California Greenhouse Gas Emissions for 2000 to 2020. Trends of Emissions and Other Indicators, p. 28 Additional Information (2020).

Community Protocol)³ developed by ICLEI. These emission categories are routinely included in citywide inventories to ensure comparability across jurisdictions. GHG emissions from sources such as air travel, shipping, or other high global warming potential gases used in the City are not included. The 2019–2022 GHG emissions inventory results are shown in Table 1.

	TABLE 1: CITY OF SAN DIEGO GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS									
Emissions Category	2019 Emissions [MT CO ₂ e] (Reported in 2022 CAP)	2019 Emissions Revised* [MT CO ₂ e] (per 2022 Annual Report)	2020 Emissions [MTCO2e]	2021 Emissions [MTCO₂e]	2022 Emissions [MTCO2e]	% Change 2021- 2022	% Change 2019- 2022			
On-Road Transportation	5,805,000	5,854,000	4,650,000	4,683,000	4,628,000	-1%	-21%			
Electricity	2,375,000	2,398,000	2,368,000	1,725,000	1,661,000	-4%	-31%			
Natural Gas	1,911,000	1,912,000	1,827,000	1,918,000	1,837,000	-4%	-4%			
Off-Road Transportation (Construction Equipment Only)	70,000	69,000	57,000	57,000	57,000	0%	-17%			
Wastewater & Solid Waste	277,000	303,000	296,000	312,000	295,000	-5%	-3%			
Water	68,000	61,000	70,000	70,000	74,000	6%	21%			
Total Emissions	10,532,000	10,597,000	9,268,000	8,765,000	8,552,000	-2%	-19%			

*This report will reference the 2019 Revised Emissions for the remainder of this report.

GHG emissions for each category and the totals are rounded to the nearest thousands. Sums may not add up to totals due to rounding. MT CO2e = metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent.

Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

This report will reference the 2019 revised emissions for the remainder of the report, and will refer to them as the '2019 emissions.' More information on the methods, data availability, and sources used to calculate GHG emissions are provided in Section C: Methodology Differences and Data Refinement.

³ ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.0 (2012).

Figure 1 shows how emissions in each category have changed relative to 2019.



In 2022, total emissions were 8.6 MMTCO₂e, a 19% reduction from the 2019 baseline and a 2% decrease from 2021. This decrease was mainly due to an increase of renewable electricity supplied to the City and increased on-road vehicle efficiency and adoption of electric and hybrid vehicles added. Although COVID-19 temporarily reduced on-road transportation emissions by lowering vehicle miles traveled, these miles are now returning to pre-pandemic levels. Despite this, emissions remain lower because the adoption of electric and hybrid vehicles has reduced the carbon intensity of on-road vehicles.

Furthermore, SDG&E has expanded its renewable electricity portfolio, and San Diego Community Power, the city's Community Choice Energy provider, now supplies electricity to commercial, industrial and residential sectors. This shift has decreased the carbon intensity of the city's electricity consumption, further reducing overall emissions.

For more information on sector-specific activities and GHG emissions, refer to Section B: 2022 Climate Action Plan Strategy Updates.

PER CAPITA GREENHOUSE GAS EMISSIONS

The 2019–2022 per capita GHG emissions in the City of San Diego are given in Table 2. This represents emissions from the six emissions categories analyzed.

TABLE 2: 2019-2022 PER CAPITA GHG EMISSIONS

Year	2019 Emissions	2020 Emissions	2021 Emissions	2022 Emissions
Total Emissions (MMTCO ₂ e)	10.60	9.27	8.77	8.55
Total Population	1,420,571	1,380,448	1,371,832	1,374,790
Per Capita GHG Emissions (MTCO ₂ e per capita)	7.46	6.71	6.39	6.22

2019 population and housing estimates are based on the 2010 census benchmark, and 2020 and 2021 population and housing estimates are based on the 2020 census benchmark.

MT CO2e = metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent

Per capita emissions based on six emission categories only and cannot be compared with California statewide per capita emissions or per capita emissions targets.

2019 population is based on 2010 census benchmark. 2020, 2021 and 2022 population and housing estimates are based on 2020 census benchmark. Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

As mentioned previously, the GHG emissions categories and inventory methodology for the City of San Diego are based on the U.S. Communities Protocol, which requires five basic emissionsgenerating activities to be included in a Community GHG inventory. These categories are generally recognized as being under the collective control and management of the community whereas other emissions-generating activities such as air travel, shipping, off-road vehicles and equipment, or high global warming potential gases are not considered as such. Therefore, allocating emissions from such categories to cities is either not possible due to lack of data or lack of proxy data, is challenging, or is better handled at a higher level of aggregation. In contrast, the California statewide GHG emissions inventory includes all economic sectors of the state. Therefore, the estimated City per capita emissions cannot be compared directly with the California statewide per capita emissions or per capita emissions targets calculated using the CARB statewide inventory or statewide emissions targets, which include all economic sectors and additional emissions categories.

Figure 2 shows countywide GDP growth compared to City of San Diego population and GHG emissions changes since 2019. From 2019 to 2022, the per capita GHG emissions dropped by 17%, while the population remained largely stable.



FIGURE 2: CHANGES IN SAN DIEGO GDP, POPULATION, AND GHG EMISSIONS SINCE 2019

GDP listed is for San Diego County

CA Dept of Finance, U.S. Bureau of Economic Analysis, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

Section B: 2022 Climate Action Plan Strategy Updates

This section summarizes activity related to measures outlined in the 2022 Climate Action Plan. The <u>City of San Diego's CAP Dashboard</u> has up-to-date information and additional metrics tracking.

STRATEGY 1: DECARBONIZATION OF THE BUILT ENVIRONMENT

Baseline & Current State of Building Energy Use in the City of San Diego:

Building energy-related emissions (fossil-fuel based electricity and natural gas consumption) accounted for 41% of total city-wide emissions, though the sector had a 19% reduction from the 2019 baseline (31% reduction in emissions from electricity and 4% from natural gas) and a 4% reduction from 2021.

Electricity Consumption & Emissions:

The 2019-2022 grid supplied electricity is provided in Table 3. For electricity users with on-site electric generation, only the net electricity from the grid has been included.

TABLE 3: TOTAL GRID-SUPPLIED ELECTRICITY USE IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO									
	2019	2019 2020 2021 2022 % Change % Change 2019 2021 2022 2021-2022 2019-202							
Electricity Consumption (MWh)	7,312,722	7,198,617	6,957,279	7,137,087	3%	-2%			
Emissions from Electricity (MTCO ₂ e)	2,398,000	2,368,000	1,725,000	1,661,000	-4%	-31%			

MWh = megawatt hour, MT CO2e = metric tons of carbon dioxide equivalent

The MWhs do not include transmission and distribution losses, or self-serve behind-the-meter electricity generation (i.e., rooftop PV systems). The electricity sales data do not include the electricity sales to San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District and military. The emissions calculation includes the electricity transmission and distribution losses.

GHG emissions are rounded to the nearest thousands. The emissions from electricity were calculated based on City of San Diego's grid supply and power mix specifically, which may differ from other jurisdictions in San Diego region. The GHG emissions include emissions from transmission and distribution losses.

SDG&E 2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

Electricity use changes compared to a 2019 baseline is shown in Figure 3.

FIGURE 3: GRID-SUPPLIED ELECTRICITY CONSUMPTION CHANGES FROM 2019 BASELINE



A comparison of the grid-supplied electricity use by customer class in 2019–2022 is shown in Figure 4.





SDG&E's electricity sales in City of San Diego. Sales do not include transmission and distribution losses, and exclude sales to San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District, and the military.

Percentages may not sum up to totals due to rounding. SDG&E 2019-2022

Natural Gas Consumption & Emissions:

Table 4 provides natural gas end use in 2019–2022. City-wide natural gas end use is 4% lower since both the baseline and 2021, showing a fluctuating energy use.

TABLE 4: TOTAL NATURAL GAS DELIVERED BY SDG&E IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO								
Year	2019	2020	2021	2022	% Change 2021-2022	% Change 2019-2022		
Natural Gas Use (million Therms)	351	335	352	337	-4%	-4%		
Emissions from Natural Gas (MTCO ₂ e)	1,912,000	1,827,000	1,918,000	1,837,000	-4%	-4%		
The natural gas sales data do not include the sales to San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District and military.								
SDG&E 2022, Energy Policy Initiativ	es Center, Universi	ty of San Diego 20	24					

Natural gas use changes compared to a 2019 baseline is shown in

Figure 5.



FIGURE 5: NATURAL GAS CONSUMPTION CHANGES FROM 2019 BASELINE

A comparison of the natural gas use by customer class in 2019–2022 is shown in Figure 6.

FIGURE 6: NATURAL GAS USE BY CUSTOMER CLASS IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019-2022]



Target Progress: Reduce Natural Gas Use in New & Existing Buildings

Measure 1.1: Decarbonize Existing Buildings

- 2030 Target: Phase out 45% of natural gas usage from existing buildings
- 2035 Target: Phase out 90% of natural gas usage from existing buildings

Measure 1.2: Decarbonize New Building Development

- 2030 Target: All-electric reach code starting 2023 at new residential and commercial development
- 2035 Target: Ongoing implementation of all-electric new residential and commercial development

Table 5 provides the electricity and natural gas end-use in million British Thermal Units (MMBtu). MMBtu is a common unit of energy used to enable comparison of the energy content of different fuel types. In this case electricity in kilowatt-hours (kWh) and natural gas in units of therms are converted to the same MMBTU unit. Total 2022 citywide energy consumption is 3% lower than 2019 levels.

TABLE 5: TOTAL ELECTRICITY AND NATURAL GAS DELIVERED BY SDG&E IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO									
Year	2019	2020	2021	2022	% Change 2021-2022	% Change 2019-2022			
Electricity (MMBtu)	24,951,000	24,562,000	23,738,000	24,352,000	3%	-2%			
Natural Gas (MMBtu)	35,057,000	33,483,000	35,159,000	33,673,000	-4%	-4%			
Total Energy (MMBtu)	60,008,000	58,045,000	58,897,000	58,025,000	-1%	-3%			
Emissions from Energy Use (MMTCO ₂ e) 4.3 4.2 3.6 3.5 -4% -19%									
MMBtu = million British Thermal Units									

Conversion factors are 293 kWh/MMBtu and 10 therms/MMBtu

MMTCO2e = million metric tons carbon dioxide equivalent

SDG&E 2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024



A comparison of the total energy use for 2019–2022 is shown in Figure 7.

Target Progress: Decarbonize City Facilities

Measure 1.3: Decarbonize City Facilities

- 2030 Target: Phase out 50% of natural gas usage in municipal facilities
- 2035 Target: Phase out 100% natural gas usage in municipal facilities

Total energy use for municipal operations in 2022 was 9% lower than in 2021 and 13% lower than the baseline year of 2019. Table 6 shows both electricity and natural gas use by municipal operations. This data includes energy use for facilities other than buildings (streetlights, traffic lights, etc.), but does not include natural gas use for City vehicles. In future years, this data will be disaggregated for clarity on progress toward Measure 1.3.

TABLE 6: ENERGY USE IN MUNICIPAL BUILDINGS									
Energy Use	2019	2020	2021	2022	% Change 2021-2022	% Change 2019-2022			
Grid Electricity (MWh)	210,794	203,900	190,152	191,155	1%	-9%			
Grid Electricity									
(MMBtu)	718,704	695,198	648,326	651,744	1%	-9%			
Natural Gas (million									
therms)	3.8	3.3	3.9	3.0	-24%	-21%			
Natural Gas (MMBtu)	381,302	330,976	394,156	300,436	-24%	-21%			
Total Energy Use									
(MMBtu)	1,100,006	1,026,174	1,042,482	952,180	-9%	-13%			
Natural Gas Emissions does not in	iclude natural gas ι	use for vehicles.							

City of San Diego Sustainability & Mobility Department

The trend in energy use for municipal operations from 2015 to 2022 is given in

Figure 8.



SDG&E grid purchases only. Does not include on-site electricity generation. Does not include natural gas purchases for CNG vehicles. City of San Diego Sustainability & Mobility Department

STRATEGY 2: ACCESS TO CLEAN AND RENEWABLE ENERGY

Baseline and Current State of Renewable Energy Access in the City of San Diego:

While electricity consumption remained relatively stable from 2019–2022, emissions from energy consumption decreased by 31% from 2019 baseline as shown previously in Table 3 above and in Figure 9. This is due to a reduction in the carbon intensity of energy provided to City customers.

San Diego Gas & Electric (SDG&E)'s renewable electricity supply increased from 31% in 2019 to 45% in 2022, as shown in Table 7. In March 2021, SDCP started serving jurisdictions in the San Diego region, including the City of San Diego. By the end of 2021, eligible SDG&E bundled commercial and industrial customers were enrolled in SDCP automatically with the option to opt-out (return to SDG&E) or opt-up to a SDCP product with 100% renewable electricity. In early 2022, eligible SDG&E bundled residential customers were then enrolled in SDCP automatically with the same option to opt-out or opt-up. Emissions are based on a weighted average of SDG&E bundled, SDCP Power On, SDCP Power 100, and Direct Access consumption and their associated emission factors.

FIGURE 9: ELECTRICITY CONSUMPTION AND EMISSIONS IN THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019-2022]



SDG&E 2019 - 2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

Target Progress: Increase Access to Grid Renewables

Measure 2.1: Citywide Renewable Energy Generation

- 2030 Target: 100% renewable or GHG-free power for all SDCP customers in the City of San Diego
- 2035 Target: 100% renewable or GHG-free power for all SDCP customers in the City of San Diego

Percent of renewables in grid-provided electricity through both SDG&E and SDCP from 2019–2022 is outlined in Table 7.

TABLE 7: PERCENTAGE OF RENEWABLES IN GRID ELECTRICITY SUPPLY					
Year	Renewables in Grid Electricity Supply				
2019	31% (SDG&E)				
2020 ¹	31% (SDG&E)				
2021 ²	44.5% (SDG&E)				
2021	54.9% (San Diego Community Power)				
	44.8% (SDG&E)				
2022	54.2% (San Diego Community Power "Power On" Mix)				
	100% (San Diego Community Power "Power 100" Mix)				
	DG&E supplied to its bundled customers; it does not represent the renewable content of ess customers and does not account for behind-the-meter renewable supply.				
¹ The California Energy Commission has updated the method to report renewable content in the Power Source Disclosure Program. The percentage starting 2022 does not reflect the supplier's Renewables Portfolio Standard compliance, and does not include unbundled renewable energy credits.					
² San Diego Community Power started serving jurisdictions in the San Diego region, including the City of San Diego, in March 2021.					
California Energy Commission 2024					

In 2022, solar projects for residential customers accounted for 88% of new solar capacity (approximately 76 out of 87 MW) and 99% of projects. The cumulative capacity of interconnected PV systems installed between 1999 and the end of 2022 was 611 MW in the City. Figure 10 shows the new capacity added each year and prior year's cumulative capacity.

FIGURE 10: BEHIND-THE-METER PV IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [1999-2022]



California Distributed Generation Statistics database, net energy metering (NEM) SDG&E Interconnected Project Sites Database Energy Policy Initiatives Center University of San Diego, 2024

The City also has numerous facilities with on-site renewable generation, including: (1) combined heat and power generation using landfill gas or digester gas at Metropolitan Biosolids Center and Point Loma Wastewater Treatment Plant; (2) hydroelectric generation at Point Loma Wastewater Treatment Plant ocean outfall; and (3) PV systems at water treatment facilities, libraries, recreation centers and fire stations. Total municipal on-site generation for 2021 and 2022 is shown in Table 8.

TABLE 8: MUNICIPAL ON-SITE GENERATION [2021–2022]							
Municipal On-Site Generation	Estimated Annual Output 2021 (kWh)	Estimated Annual Output 2022 (kWh)					
Solar	4,370,772	4,511,145					
Hydroelectric	Not estimated	Not estimated					
Co-gen with Biogas	28,156,816	23,200,496					
Power Plant with Landfill Gas	25,107,338	6,084,753					
Co-gen with Landfill Gas	43,463,260	43,462,998					

Total energy consumption and generation source is shown in Figure 11, including grid-supplied electricity from SDCP and SDG&E bundled, Direct Access, and behind-the-meter PV.

FIGURE 11: CITYWIDE ENERGY CONSUMPTION FROM SDG&E, SDCP, BEHIND METER PV [2019–2022]



SDG&E Interconnected Project Sites Database

Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego, 2024

Target Progress: Increase Municipal Zero Emission Vehicles

Measure 2.2: Increase Municipal Zero Emission Vehicles

- 2030 Target: Percent of all municipal fleet vehicles to be ZEVs: Cars 75%, LDV 50%, MDV 50%, HDV 50%
- 2035 Target: Percent of all municipal fleet vehicles to be ZEVs: Cars and LDV 100%, MDV 75%, HDV 75%

As of 2022, 5% of the City's vehicle fleet of 4,344 vehicles were zero emission vehicles (ZEVs), including 127 battery electric vehicles (BEVs) and 119 plug-in hybrid electric vehicles (PHEVs). Table 9 shows the percentage of ZEVs in the Municipal fleet from 2016–2022.

TABLE 9: PERCENT OF ZEVS IN MUNICIPAL VEHICLE FLEET [2016–2022]								
Calendar Year 2016 2017 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022								
Percent of ZEVs	2.1%	2.0%	2.0%	2.2%	4.5%	5.2%	5.4%	
in Municipal Fleet	2.1%	2.0%	2.0%	2.290	4.5%	5.2%	5.4%	
City of San Diego Sustainab	City of San Diego Sustainability and Mobility Department							

The City also had 302 gasoline-electric hybrids and 99 CNG waste trucks. Figure 12 shows the breakdown of Municipal vehicles from 2016 to 2022.

FIGURE 12: VEHICLE TYPES IN MUNICIPAL FLEET [2016-2022]



Supporting Action Progress: Convert All Diesel Consumption to Renewable Diesel and Waste Collection Trucks to Low-Emissions Fuel

In 2016, the City municipal fleet started the transition to 100% renewable diesel to help meet the CAP supporting action of reducing municipal fuel GHG emissions during the transition to ZEVs. The percentage of renewable diesel in the overall fuel used increased from 16% in 2016 to 78% in 2022 as shown in Figure 13. Additionally, in 2022, the number of compressed natural gas (CNG) waste collection trucks in service has increased steadily in recent years from 68 in 2019, and 91 in 2020, to 102 in 2022. CNG vehicles represents more than 70% of the waste collection truck fleet. CNG, a low emission fuel compared with diesel, has displaced diesel fuel use as shown in Figure 13.



FIGURE 13: MUNICIPAL FLEET COMPRESSED NATURAL GAS AND DIESEL FUEL USE BY TYPE [2016-2022]

City of San Diego Sustainability and Mobility Department

Consistent with the CARB statewide GHG Inventory and the IPCC Guidelines, the CO_2 emissions from biofuel (e.g., ethanol, biodiesel, and renewable diesel) are classified as "biogenic CO_2 " and not included in the GHG inventory. Only the CH_4 and N_2O emissions from biofuel are accounted for in the GHG inventory. For regular diesel, all CO_2 CH_4 and N_2O emissions are accounted for in the GHG inventory.

TABLE 10: CITY FLEET GASOLINE CONSUMPTION						
Year Total Gasoline (gallons)						
2019	2,047,504					
2020	2,154,536					
2021	2,090,527					
2022	2,060,978					
UD22 Updates to 2020 and 2021 data reflects up City of San Diego Sustainability and Mobili	odated primary data from the City					

The 2010 to 2022 City fleet gasoline consumption is given in Table 10.

Target Progress: Increase Citywide Zero Emission Vehicles

Measure 2.3: Increase Electric Vehicle Adoption

- 2030 Target: 16% e-VMT out of all Light-duty VMT
- 2035 Target: 25% e-VMT out of all Light-duty VMT

The emissions impact of zero-emission vehicles (ZEVs) policies and programs is included in GHG reduction from State polices and actions, not as a result of a particular CAP strategy. However, the impact is reflected at the local level. While data for registered ZEVs is not available at the city level, the total number of registered ZEVs in San Diego County, including battery electric vehicles (BEVs) and plug-in hybrid electric vehicles (PHEVs) shown in Table 11.

TABLE 11: NUMBER OF REGISTERED ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN SAN DIEGO COUNTY										
Number of Vehicles	2019	2020	2021	2022	% Change 2021-2022	% Change 2019-2022				
Number of Battery Electric Vehicles (BEVs)	25,673	32,057	45,979	67,444	47%	163%				
Number of Plug-in Hybrid Electric Vehicles (PHEVs)	18,309	19,559	23,785	27,165	14%	48%				
Total Number of Electric Vehicles (BEVs + PHEVs)	43,982	51,616	69,764	94,609	36%	115%				
Total Number of Registered Vehicles	2,453,257	2,425,831	2,514,519	2,446,883	-3%	0%				
Percent of Electric Vehicles to All Registered Vehicles	1.8%	2.1%	2.8%	3.9%	39%	116%				
California Energy Commission 2019 – 2024				•	•					

The number of ZEVs has more than doubled from 2019 to 2022. In 2022, approximately 4% of all registered vehicles in the County were ZEVs. Gasoline hybrids and ZEVs as a percentage of total registered vehicles in San Diego County is shown in Figure 14. The percentages shown do not represent ZEV market share (the percentage of new ZEVs sold out of all new vehicles sales). ZEVs accounted for approximately 8% of market share in the state in 2020, and 20% in 2022.



FIGURE 14: PERCENT OF HYBRID AND ELECTRIC VEHICLES IN SAN DIEGO COUNTY [2019–2022]

California Energy Commission 2019 – 2024

The increasing number of EVs leads to increasing demand for EV charging. Table 12 shows the number of public electric vehicle charging stations (EVCSs) and the number of EVCSs offered through SDG&E's Power Your Drive program at multi-family buildings and workplaces within the City.

TABLE 12: ESTIMATED NUMBER OF ELECTRIC VEHICLE CHARGING STATIONS								
Number of Charging Sites or Chargers	2019	2022						
Number of EVCSs	300	719						
Number of Public Level 2 EVCSs at all Sites	932	1557						
Number of Public DC Fast EVCSs at all Sites	230	325						
Number of SDG&E Power Your Drive EVCSs	1,755	Program expired						
EVCS = electric vehicle charging station	÷	*						

Number of EVCSs are the number of nozzles or plugs. One site may have more than one nozzle or plug. EVCSs installed through SDG&E's Power Your Drive program are not considered public chargers as they are installed primarily at workplaces (including municipal facilities) and multi-family buildings

(apartments and/or condo buildings).

Data do not include other private workplace or in-home (e.g. single-family homes) charging stations. SDG&E 2019, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

SDG&E 2019, Energy Poncy mitiatives center, oniversity of San Diego 2024

STRATEGY 3: MOBILITY AND LAND USE

Baseline and Current State of Transportation in the City of San Diego

Transportation accounted for 54% of all GHG emissions within the City of San Diego in 2022. Strategy 3 aims to reduce vehicle miles traveled (VMT) by increasing the use of mass transit, bicycling, and walking throughout the city.

The 2019–2022 VMT and on-road transportation emissions in the City of San Diego are shown in Table 13. The impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on VMT in 2020 and 2021 was estimated from 2016 VMT using the 2016–2021 regional public road VMT monitoring data, which showed that the decrease was mostly likely from light-duty vehicles after shelter-in-place orders were enacted in 2020. However, emissions from on-road transportation have been increasing since 2020. This is evidence that the full impact of the COVID-19 pandemic on driving may not be sustained long term. The data sources and method to calculate on-road transportation emissions are provided in the supplemental inventory documentation to this report.

TABLE 13: VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED (VMT) IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO									
Year	2019	2020	2021	2022					
Total VMT (million miles/year)	13,666	10,891	11,228	11,416					
San Diego Regional Average Vehicle Emission Rate (g CO ₂ e/mile)	428	427	415	405					
GHG Emissions (MT CO ₂ e)	5,854,000	4,650,000	4,683,000	4,628,000					
The 2019 VMT are estimates based on the 2016 City of San Diego VMT estimates from SANDAG's Activity Based Mode I (ABM2+) and Final 2021 Regional Plan, multiplied by the 2016-2022 San Diego regional VMT annual rates of growth. Annual rates of growth are estimated from the annual California Department of Transportation (CalTrans) Highway Performance Monitoring System public road data and Performance Measure System freeway data.									
SANDAG 2021, CalTrans, CARB2021, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, Univers	ity of San Diego 20)24							

Figure 15 shows the changes to total VMT, per capita VMT, and on-road emissions in relation to the 2019 baseline.



FIGURE 15: CHANGES IN VMT, PER CAPITA VMT, AND ON-ROAD EMISSIONS FROM 2019 BASELINE

SANDAG 2021, CalTrans, CARB2021, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

Similar to the electricity sector, due to reduction in carbon intensity per mile, emissions from on-road transportation are lower in 2022 despite the increase in VMT since 2020, as shown in

Figure 16.



FIGURE 16: ON ROAD EMISSIONS VS. VEHICLE MILES TRAVELED IN THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2019-2022]

SANDAG 2021, CalTrans, CARB2021, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

Target Progress: Reducing Vehicle Miles Traveled

Measure 3.1: Safe and Enjoyable Routes for Pedestrians and Cyclists

- 2030 Target: 19% walking and 7% cycling mode share of all San Diego resident trips
- 2035 Target: 25% walking and 10% cycling mode share of all San Diego resident trips

While mode share data for all City of San Diego resident trips is not available at this time, data is available for trips related to work commuting. Resident commute trips by transportation mode are shown in Table 14.

TABLE 14: PERCENT OF MODE SHARE FOR EMPLOYEE COMMUTE							
Mode	2019	2023					
Drive Alone	78	75					
Carpool	12	13					
Transit	6	7					
Walk	2	3					
Bike or E-Bike	2	3					
TNC or Taxi	0	<1%					
SANDAG Employment Centers 1.0 and 2.0	•						

Bicycle facility improvements from 2013 to 2022 are shown in Table 15. Class I bike lanes are paved right-of-way for exclusive use by bicyclists, pedestrians and other non-motorized modes of travel. Class II bike lanes are defined by pavement striping and signage used to allocate a portion of a roadway for exclusive or preferential bicycle travel. Class IV bike lanes are referred to as "protected bike lanes" and are lanes specifically separated from motor traffic and distinct from the sidewalk.

TABLE 15: BICYCLE FACILITIES IMPROVEMENTS SINCE 2013											
Year	2013	2014	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022	Total Since 2013
New Class l Bike Lane Miles Added	-		-	-	2.1	-	-	-	-	-	2.1
New Class II Bike Lane Miles Added	6.9	10.5	14.6	12.7	7.9	11.5	10.8	2.2	17.4	52.4	185.1
New Class IV Bike Lane Miles Added	-	-	-	-	-	-	2	3.7	34.2	34.9	103.5
Existing Bike Lane Miles Improved	35.7	51.7	42.2	43.6	21.4	2.3	34.6	81.6	65.3	15.2	393.6
Existing Bike Lane Miles Replaced	1.3	1.6	-	-	-	27.9	-	-	-	-	30.8
Total Added or Improved Miles	43.9	63.8	56.8	56.8	31.4	41.7	47.4	87.5	103. 6	102.4	702.3
Data provided for bicycle progress. City of San Diego Transpo	5 1				orogress. Tl	ne remaind	er of the re	port uses c	alendar yea	ars to track e	missions and

Measure 3.2: Increase Safe, Convenient and Enjoyable Transit Use

- 2030 Target: 10% transit mode share of all San Diego resident trips
- 2035 Target: 15% transit mode share of all San Diego resident trips

Ridership data specific to the City of San Diego is currently not available, so regional data is used as a proxy. While regional transit ridership is increasing between 2020 and 2022, as shown in

Figure 17, regional ridership is still below pre-pandemic levels.



FIGURE 17: REGIONAL TRANSIT BOARDINGS AND PASSENGER MILES [2016-2022]

SANDAG Weekday Transit Ridership

Measure 3.3: Work from Anywhere

- 2030 Target: Achieve 4% citywide VMT reduction through telecommute
- 2035 Target: Achieve 6% citywide VMT reduction through telecommute

While data specific to the City of San Diego is currently unavailable, SANDAG's regional Survey of Businesses and Employees estimated the percentage of employees able to work from home along with average number of days those employees are able to work from home. Results of this survey, summarized in Table 16, show that the percentage of employees able to partially work from home dropped after the pandemic but are still higher than pre-pandemic levels. Similarly, the number of days nearly worked fully from home doubled from pre-pandemic levels.

TABLE 16: REGIONAL REMOTE WORK SURVEY									
Time Era Pre-Pandemic During Pandemic Post-Panden									
Percentage of SD County Employees Able to Partially Work from Home	25%	54%	44%						
Average Number of Days per Week Worked Fully from Home	0.6	1.9	1.2						
SANDAG Survey of Businesses and Employees									

Measure 3.4: Reduce Traffic Congestion to Improve Air Quality

- 2030 Target: Install 13 new roundabouts
- 2035 Target: Install 20 new roundabouts

The City installed seven roundabouts in 2022, improving vehicle flow and reducing emissions from idling. Additionally, the City retimed 404 traffic signals in 2022 and 60 traffic signals in 2021 that led to traffic flow improvements and subsequent fuel reductions, as shown in Table 17.

TABLE 17: ROUNDABOUTS INSTALLED AND TRAFFIC SIGNALS RETIMED								
Year 2016 2017 2018 2019 2020 2021 2022								
Roundabouts Installed	2	0	0	0	0	0	7	
Traffic Signals Retimed	60	70	52	64	75	60	404	

City of San Diego Transportation and Storm Water Department

Measure 3.5: Climate-Focused Land Use

- 2030 Target: 8% VMT (commuter and non-commuter) reduction per capita
- 2035 Target: 15% VMT (commuter and non-commuter) reduction per capita

Measure 3.6: Vehicle Management

• No associated targets

The goals of measures 3.5 and 3.6 are to reduce VMT through land use and parking reform policies. While VMT reductions associated with these specific policies are difficult to track, citywide VMT changes are shown in Table 13 above.

STRATEGY 4: CIRCULAR ECONOMY AND CLEAN COMMUNITIES

Baseline and Current State of Waste and Wastewater in the City of San Diego

The 2015–2022 waste disposed and diversion rates in the City are shown in Table 18. The waste disposed and diversion rates in recent year has remained relatively consistent.

TABLE 18: WASTE DIVERSION RATE AND DISPOSED TONNAGE										
Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022		
Waste Disposed in Landfills (tons)	1,583,833	1,521,363	1,576,105	1,639,817	1,569,447	1,543,627	1,543,627	1,543,627		
Waste Diversion Rate	64%	66%	66%	65%	66%	67%	67%	67%		

Tonnages were adjusted or corrected from tonnages reported in the CalRecycle database based on City information City of San Diego Environmental Service Department

The 2015–2022 wastewater flow and associated emissions are shown in Table 19. In 2022, there was a sharp decrease in emissions associated with wastewater treatment. This is because the on-site generation facilities, power plants using landfill gas, at the North City Water Reclamation Plant were decommissioned that year.

TABLE 19: WASTEWATER FLOW AND EMISSIONS [2016-2022]										
Year	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021	2022			
Wastewater (million gallons)	36,719	37,632	36,391	38,241	38,192	37,591	36,865			
GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	21,257	20,888	20,096	25,612	23,018	23,689	12,585			
% Emissions Reduction from Baseline	-	-2%	-5%	20%	8%	11%	-41%			
City of San Diego Public U	tilities Departmei	nt								

City of San Diego Public Otinities Department

Target Progress: Waste and Wastewater

Measure 4.1: Changes to the Waste Stream

- 2030 Target: 82% Waste Diversion Rate and 85% Landfill Gas Capture
- 2035 Target: 90% Waste Diversion Rate and 90% Landfill Gas Capture

The city's current waste diversion rate has been steady around 67%, as shown in Table 18. The Environmental Services Department completed landfill gas system improvements in 2018 that included additional extraction wells and a new blower system. Additional extraction wells were installed in the West Miramar landfill in 2021. Total quantity of landfill gas collected has increased since 2019 when ownership of the landfill gas rights reverted to the City. Given the complexity in estimating an accurate landfill gas capture rate, an industry-standard landfill gas capture rate of 75% is assumed and improvements to estimating emissions are being considered for future Annual Reports.



FIGURE 18: TONS TO LANDFILL AND LANDFILL DIVERSION RATE IN CITY OF SAN DIEGO [2016-2022]

Measure 4.2: Municipal Waste Reduction

• No defined targets

While waste from city facilities has not been tracked in previous years, progress toward this goal will be tracked in future Annual Reports.

Measure 4.3: Local Food Systems and Food Recovery

• No defined targets

While improving local food systems and food recovery will have impacts on waste and organics sent to landfill, data is currently not available to track such efforts.

Measure 4.4: Zero Waste to Landfill

No defined targets

As shown in **Error! Reference source not found.** below, the tons sent to landfill by the City of San Diego and waste diversion rate has remained relatively steady from 2016–2022.

Measure 4.5: Capture Methane from Wastewater Treatment Facilities

- 2030 Target: 95% Methane Capture
- 2035 Target: 95% Methane Capture

The City of San Diego's Point Loma Wastewater Treatment Plant (Point Loma WWTP) is energy selfsufficient with on-site renewable electricity production using biogas (captured methane from wastewater treatment) and hydropower. The excess renewable electricity generated at the Point Loma WWTP is exported to the grid. The digester capture rate at Point Loma WWTP is now 99.9%.

STRATEGY 5: RESILIENT INFRASTRUCTURE AND HEALTHY ECOSYSTEMS

Baseline and Current State of Water Use in the City of San Diego

Emissions from water consumption are currently 4% of the City of San Diego's total emissions (including water and wastewater). The breakdown of the City of San Diego's water sales by sector including recycled water is given in Figure 19. While overall water use has fluctuated over time, it has been steadily increasing since 2019.



Target Progress: Trees and Water Systems

Measure 5.1: Sequestration

- 2030 Target: Restore 350 acres of salt marsh land and other associated tidal wetland and riparian habitats
- 2035 Target: Restore 700 acres of salt marsh land and other associated tidal wetland and riparian habitats

The City has restored 56 acres of wetland prior to 2022. Table 21 shows new projects that are currently underway along with the phase of the project they are in. In future Annual Reports, this table will be updated with acres of completed projects.

TABLE 20: ACRES OF RIPARIAN AND WETLAND RESTORATION IN PROGRESS									
Ecosystem Type	Design, Permitting, Contracting	Restoration Implementation	Long Term Maintenance						
Fresh and Saltwater									
Marsh	4.1	0.0	0.0						
Riparian	0.0	0.0	96.1						
Other / Unspecified	78.3	1.2	17.0						
Fresh and Saltwater									
Marsh	4.1	0.0	0.0						
City of San Diego Public Utilities Dep	artment								

Measure 5.2: Tree Canopy

- 2030 Target: 28% urban canopy cover
- 2035 Target: 35% urban canopy cover

The City of San Diego has established a target to increase urban tree canopy from the 2019 baseline⁴ of 13% total coverage to 28% by 2030 and 35% by 2035. Increasing urban tree canopy contributes to the capture and storage of carbon, as well as other benefits including storm water management, improved air quality and increased property values. Table 21 shows tree planting and maintenance trends from 2020 to 2022. Progress on maintaining existing trees has shown a sharp increase from 2021 to 2022.

TABLE 21: TREE PLANTING AND MAINTENANCE									
Tree Planting and Maintenance Year	2020	2021	2022						
Trees Planted ¹	1,863	1,707	1,649						
Trees Trimmed ²	33,254	35,206	61,665						
Trees Removed ¹	1,824	2,151	2,004						
Trees Evaluated ³	5,316	6,372	5,569						

1.Planted or removed by the Transportation Street Division and Parks and Recreation Department

2.Includes shade trees and palms trees

3. Trees are evaluated for species type, tree condition, diameter, and defects to determine the amount of corrective tree work that may be needed for the health of the tree and/or to address public safety adjacent to the tree.

City of San Diego Transportation and Storm Water Department

Measure 5.3: Local Water Supply

- 2030 Target Provide 33,000 acre-feet local water supply from PureWater
- 2035 Target Provide 93,000 acre-feet local water supply from PureWater

The PureWater project is still under construction, therefore no data is available to report at this time. However, other local water supply versus total water supply has been fluctuating in recent years as shown in

Figure 20. The current availability of local water generally depends on rainfall and runoff in the City reservoirs in the year. In 2019, 17% of total water supply was from local surface and groundwater; while in 2022 8% was from local supply. A higher percentage of local water supply reduces the need to import water from San Diego County Water Authority and the energy and GHG emissions associated

^{4.} The updated urban tree canopy coverage for the 2015-2019 period was 13% in the City of San Diego, based on the Urban Tree Canopy Assessment preliminary results developed by the University of Vermont and the USDA Forest Service, funded by California Department of Forestry and the Fire Protection (CalFire) for the City of San Diego.

with imported water. The total acre-feet of water delivered to the City of San Diego according to source (local, imported and recycled) is shown in

Figure 20 below.



Supporting Actions: Reduce Daily per Capita Water Consumption

Per capita water use, measured in gallons per capita per day (GPCD), decreased from 2010 to 2022 (

Figure 21). Gov. Jerry Brown issued Executive Order B-29-2015 imposing a 25% statewide potable water reduction in April 2015. This drought emergency declaration was lifted by the Governor in April 2017, while retaining a prohibition on wasteful practice. The per capita water use in the City of San Diego has been increasing since the 2015 Executive Order.

The GPCD calculation method (volume of water entering City of San Diego's distribution system divided by distribution system population) is consistent with the GPCD definition in SB X7-7 (the Water Conservation Act of 2009) and the City of San Diego 2015 Urban Water Management Plan (June 2016 final version). However, to be consistent with the CAP, the GPCD is reported by calendar year in this CAP Annual Report, while the GPCD in the Urban Water Management Plan and SB X7-7 are by fiscal year. Therefore, the GPCD reported here cannot be directly compared with the SB X7-7 GPCD target for 2020.

FIGURE 21: PER CAPITA WATER USE [2010-2022]



City of San Diego Public Utilities Department, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

The amount of recycled water and water used for irrigation from 2019 to 2022 is provided in Table 22. Both recycled and metered irrigation water have been steadily increasing since 2019.

TABLE 22: METERED RECYCLED AND IRRIGATION WATER USE		
Year	Recycled Water Sales (million gallons)	Metered Irrigation Water Use (million gallons)
2019	2,606	5,631
2020	2,881	5,988
2021	3,688	6,298
2022	3,263	6,217
Metered irrigation water, including agricultural and landscape water use.		
2021 data updated from previous Annual Report to reflect most up-to-date primary data.		
City of San Diego Public Utilities Department		

STRATEGY 6: EMERGING CLIMATE ACTION

- 2030 Target: Residual Emissions 391,000 additional reduction needed to reach fair-share target
- 2035 Target: Residual Emissions 2,262,000 additional reduction/removal needed to reach carbon neutrality

Measure 6.1: Explore Further Opportunities to Achieve Net Zero GHG Emissions

As the City of San Diego assesses and plans future climate action, updates will be provided in future reports and on the City's online CAP Dashboard.

Section C: Methodology Differences and Data Refinement

The method differences and data refinements between the previous and current GHG inventory calculations are given in Table 23. The differences are primarily from updated and more accurate data sources. "No change" means no method differences or data refinements since the 2020 Annual Report, or the 2022 CAP.

Table 23: METHODOLOGY DIFFERENCES AND DATA REFINEMENTS OF GHG INVENTORY			
Category	Category Detail	2019 Inventory (Used for 2022 CAP)	2019–2022 Inventory (This Annual Report)
Electricity	Activity (kWh)	Requested data from SDG&E by customer class, service provider, and rate schedule for customers with City of San Diego town code	<u>2019–2020:</u> No change
			2021: Data requested from SDG&E by customer class within City of San Diego town code. No service provider of rate schedule available. Direct access and San Diego Community Power customer electricity use were estimate
			2022: Data requested from SDG&E by customer clas within City of San Diego town code. No service provide rate schedule available. Direct access customer electri use was estimated based on previous year's data. SD consumption data provided.

Table 23: METHODOLOGY DIFFERENCES AND DATA REFINEMENTS OF GHG INVENTORY			
Category	Category Detail	2019 Inventory (Used for 2022 CAP)	2019–2022 Inventory (This Annual Report)
	Emission Factor (lbs CO2e/MWh)	Created a weighted average emission factor based on a) SDG&E kWh procured from each fuel type at each facility/power plant and the emission factor of electricity generation at each facility/power plant (<u>EPA eGRID2019</u> database specific plant level emission factor) for SDG&E's purchased power.	<u>2020-2022:</u> Used the SDG&E and San Diego Community Power emission factors reported under CEC's power source disclosure program.
Natural Gas	Activity (Therms)	Requested data from SDG&E by customer class, service provider, and rate schedule for customers with City of San Diego town code	<u>2020:</u> No change <u>2021:</u> Data requested from SDG&E by customer class within City of San Diego town code. No service provider or rate schedule available.
	Emission Factor (MT CO2e / Therm)	Natural gas emission factor in California based on California Air Resources Board statewide inventory	No change
Transportation	Activity (VMT)	Applied annual average VMT rate of increase from 2016-2019 HPMS data to 2016 VMT estimates. 2016 VMT estimates were provided by SANDAG using Series 14 Forecast and ABM2+ from the Draft 2021 Regional Plan	2020: Applied annual average VMT rate of increase from 2016–2019 HPMS data to 2016 VMT estimates provided by SANDAG using Series 14 Forecast and ABM2+ from the Final 2021 Regional Plan 2021: Applied the VMT 2019 to 2021 percent increase from PeMS data to 2019 VMT estimates, due to a delay in HPMS data

Table 23: METHODOLOGY DIFFERENCES AND DATA REFINEMENTS OF GHG INVENTORY			
Category	Category Detail	2019 Inventory (Used for 2022 CAP)	2019–2022 Inventory (This Annual Report)
			2022: Applied HPMS data to 2016 VMT estimates to years 2021 and 2022
	Emission Factor (g CO2e/mile)	San Diego region emission rate per vehicle class from <u>EMFAC2021</u> with model default assumptions on vehicle mix, travel activities, etc.	No change
Water	Activity (acre-feet)	Potable and recycled water supplied to City of San Diego (water production) separated into wholesale water (from San Diego County Water Authority) and local water (surface and groundwater) Removed water purchased by Del Mar and CalAm service area not in the City	No change
	Emission Factor (energy intensity - kWh/acre-foot)	Local energy intensity based on water treatment plants and lake pump stations electricity consumption, all other water pump stations and facilities electricity consumption Upstream supply energy intensity calculated based on Metropolitan Water District and SDCWA 2015 Urban Water Management Plan	No change

Table 23: METHODOLOGY DIFFERENCES AND DATA REFINEMENTS OF GHG INVENTORY			
Category	Category Detail	2019 Inventory (Used for 2022 CAP)	2019–2022 Inventory (This Annual Report)
	Electricity Emission Factor (lbs CO2e/MWh)	Upstream: eGRID 2016	<u>2019:</u> eGRID2019 <u>2020:</u> eGRID2020 <u>2021:</u> eGRID2021 <u>2022:</u> eGRID2022
Wastewater	Activity (gallons)	City of San Diego's annual average flow (MGD) entering into Metropolitan Sewerage System (include Point Loma WWTP, South Bay WRP and North City WRP)	No change
	Emission Factor (MT CO ₂ /gallon)	Calculated by dividing Point Loma WWTP and North City WRP GHG Emission reported in CARB Mandatory GHG Reporting by 2015 Point Loma WWTP and North City WRP total flow	No change
Solid Waste	Activity (tons)	Annual waste disposed tonnage provided by City of San Diego Environmental Services Department	<u>2019–2020:</u> No change <u>2021:</u> Used 2020 waste tonnage due to a delay in reported data <u>2022:</u> Updated 2021 waste tonnage with City's primary data. No other change
	Emission Factor (MT CH4/tons)	Emission factor for each waste component from EPA WARM Model Version 15 (2019 version) and waste components from City of San Diego waste characterization study 2012–2013	No change

City of San Diego Greenhouse Gas Emissions Inventory Methodology and Updates

Supplement to 2023 Climate Action Plan Annual Report

June 2024

Prepared for the City of San Diego



Prepared by the Energy Policy Initiatives Center



© 2024 University of San Diego. All rights reserved.
About EPIC

The Energy Policy Initiatives Center (EPIC) is a non-profit research center of the University of San Diego School of Law that studies energy policy issues affecting California and the San Diego region. EPIC's mission is to increase awareness and understanding of energy- and climate-related policy issues by conducting research and analysis to inform decision makers and educate law students.

For more information, please visit the EPIC website at <u>www.sandiego.edu/epic</u>.

Disclaimer

The Energy Policy Initiatives Center (EPIC) prepared this report for the City of San Diego. This report represents EPIC's professional judgment based on the data and information available at the time EPIC prepared this report. EPIC relies on data and information from third parties who provide it with no guarantees such as of completeness, accuracy or timeliness. EPIC makes no representations or warranties, whether expressed or implied, and assumes no legal liability for the use of the information in this report; nor does any party represent that the uses of this information will not infringe upon privately owned rights. Readers of the report are advised that EPIC may periodically update this report or data, information, findings, and opinions and that they assume all liabilities incurred by them, or third parties, as a result of their reliance on the report, data, information, findings and opinions contained in the report.

Table of Contents

1	Ove	erview1
	Bac 2.1 2.2	kground
3	Sun	nmary of 2019–2021 GHG Emissions Inventory 2
4	Me	thod to Calculate GHG Emissions Inventory4
	4.1	On-Road Transportation
	4.1	
	4.1	
	4.1	
	4.2	Electricity7
	4.2	.1 Electricity Use7
	4.2	.2 City-Specific Electricity Emission Factor
	4.2	
	4.3	
	4.3	
	4.3	
	4.3	
	4.4	Off-Road Transportation (Construction Equipment Only)11
	4.5	Solid Waste 12
	4.5	
	4.5	
	4.5	
	4.5	
	4.6	
	4.6	
	4.6	
	4.6	
	4.7	
	4.7	
	4.7	
	4.7	.3 Total Emissions from Wastewater

Tables

Table 1 Global Warming Potentials Used in San Diego GHG Emission Inventory & Projections2
Table 2 Population, Housing, and Jobs Estimates (San Diego, 2019–2022)
Table 3 GHG Emissions by Category from City of San Diego (2019–2021)
Table 4 2016 O-D VMT Estimates by Trip Types and Total VMT provided by SANDAG (San Diego, 2016)6
Table 5 San Diego Region Daily VMT Derived from the Caltrans Highway Performance Monitoring System 6
Table 6 Net Energy for Load, Emission Factor, and GHG Emissions from Electricity Category (San Diego,
2019–2021)
Table 7 Natural Gas End-Use and GHG Emissions from Natural Gas Category (San Diego, 2019-2021)11
Table 8 GHG Emissions from Off-Road Transportation (Construction Equipment Only) Category (San Diego,
2019 - 2022)
Table 9 Mixed Solid Waste Emission Factor 13
Table 10 Solid Waste Disposal into Landfills and Associated GHG Emissions (San Diego, 2019–2021)14
Table 11 Emissions from In-boundary Landfills (Information Only, Not Reported in GHG Inventory)15
Table 12 Water Supplied and Supply Source (San Diego, 2019–2021)17
Table 13 Components of Average Upstream Energy Intensity for SDCWA Member Agencies
Table 14 Local Water Conveyance and Treatment Energy Intensity (San Diego, 2019–2022)
Table 15 Local Water Distribution Energy Intensity (San Diego, 2019–2021) 2021
Table 16 Electricity Emission Factors for Water-Energy Intensities (2019–2021) 2021
Table 17 Water Supplied and GHG Emissions from the Water Category (San Diego, 2019–2021)22
Table 18 City of San Diego Wastewater Generation (San Diego, 2019–2021)
Table 19 Emission Factors at Wastewater Treatment Plant (San Diego, 2019–2021)
Table 20 Wastewater Generated and GHG Emissions from Wastewater Category (San Diego, 2019–2021)

Figures

Figure 1 Components of O-D Method for VMT Calculation	5
Figure 2 SDG&E Electricity Sales to City of San Diego by Customer Class (2019–2022)	8
Figure 3 SDG&E Natural Gas Sales to City of San Diego by Customer Class (2019–2021)	10
Figure 4 Segments of the Water Cycle	15

1 OVERVIEW

This document presents a summary of the greenhouse gas (GHG) emissions estimates for the City of San Diego (referred to as San Diego or the City) for calendar years 2019–2022 and the methods used. This is a supplement to the City's Final 2022 Climate Action Plan (CAP) Annual Report and its appendix.

In preparation for this Annual Report and the 2022 GHG emissions inventory, revisions and refinements were made to the 2019 GHG emissions estimates in the previous 2021 Annual Report to reflect updated data supplied by agencies not managed by the City, and to ensure consistency with the 2019–2021 GHG emissions estimates.¹ This follows the approach used by the California Air Resources Board (CARB) when it updates the California statewide inventory, and is based on the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) recommendations to maintain a consistent time-series when developing GHG inventories.²

This document includes the following sections:

- Section 2 describes the background sources and common assumptions used for the GHG emissions inventory;
- Section 3 provides the 2019–2021 GHG emissions inventory results summary; and
- Section 4 provides the methods used to prepare each category of the inventory.

Rounding is used for the final GHG values within the tables and figures throughout the document. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in any calculation. Because of rounding, some totals may not equal the values summed in any table or figure.

2 BACKGROUND

2.1 Greenhouse Gases

The primary GHGs included in the emissions estimates presented here are carbon dioxide (CO_2), methane (CH_4), and nitrous oxide (N_2O). Each GHG has a different capacity to trap heat in the atmosphere, known as its global warming potential (GWP), which is normalized relative to CO_2 and expressed in carbon dioxide equivalents (CO_2e). In general, the 100-year GWPs reported by the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) are used to estimate GHG emissions. The GWPs used in this inventory are from the IPCC Fourth Assessment Report (AR4),³ provided in Table 1. The GWPs used in this inventory are consistent with the California statewide GHG inventories and the national GHG inventories.⁴

¹ City of San Diego: <u>2022 Climate Action Plan</u>, <u>Climate Action Plan 2020 Annual Report</u> and <u>Appendix</u>.

² California Air Resources Board (CARB): <u>California Greenhouse Gas Emissions for 2000 to 2020. Trends of Emissions and Other Indicators</u>, p. 28 Additional Information (2020).

³ IPCC Fourth Assessment Report: Climate Change 2007: Direct Global Warming Potentials (2013).

⁴ Some CARB programs, other than the statewide GHG inventory, may use different GWPs. For example, the short-lived climate pollutants (SLCP) strategy uses the 20-year GWP because the SLCP has greater climate impacts in the near-term compared to the long-lived GHGs.

Greenhouse Gas	Global Warming Potential
Carbon dioxide (CO ₂)	1
Methane (CH ₄)	25
Nitrous oxide (N ₂ O)	298
IPCC 2013.	

Table 1 Global Warming Potentials Used in San Diego GHG Emission Inventory & Projections

2.2 Demographics

California Department of Finance develops population and housing estimates for cities and counties in the State. The population and housing estimates used in the inventory are provided in Table 2.⁵

	. , .		•			
Year	Population Estimates	Housing Estimates (Units)				
		Total	Occupied			
2019	1,420,571	545,645	514,548			
2020	1,380,448	548,934	515,676			
2021	1,371,832	552,410	514,964			
2022	1,374,790	571,542	536,856			
2019 population and housing estimates are based on the 2010 census benchmark, and 2020 and 2021						

Table 2 Population, Housing, and Jobs Estimates (San Diego, 2019–2022)

2019 population and housing estimates are based on the 2010 census benchmark, and 2020 and 2021 population and housing estimates are based on the 2020 census benchmark. Housing unit types include single detached units, single attached units, two to four units, five plus, or apartment units, and mobile homes.

California Department of Finance 2021, 2022.

3 SUMMARY OF 2019–2021 GHG EMISSIONS INVENTORY

	2019 Inventory		2020 Invent	2020 Inventory		ry	2022 Inventory	
Emissions Category	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	(%)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	(%)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	(%)	GHG Emissions (MT CO ₂ e)	(%)
On-Road								
Transportation*	5,854,000	55%	4,650,000	50%	4,683,000	53%	4,628,000	54%
Electricity	2,398,000	23%	2,368,000	26%	1,725,000	20%	1,661,000	19%
Natural Gas	1,912,000	18%	1,827,000	20%	1,918,000	22%	1,837,000	21%
Solid Waste**	277,000	3%	273,000	3%	288,000	3%	282,000	3%
Offroad Transportation (Construction Equipment Only)	69,000	1%	57,000	1%	57,000	1%	57,000	1%
Water	61,000	1%	70,000	1%	70,000	1%	74,000	1%
Wastewater	26,000	0%	23,000	0%	24,000	0%	13,000	0%
Total	10,597,000	100%	9,268,000	100%	8,765,000	100%	8,552,000	100%

GHG emissions by category from San Diego in 2019–2022 are shown in

Sums may not add up to totals due to rounding. GHG emissions for each category are rounded to the nearest thousand. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation.

*Emissions are based on SANDAG's Series 14 modeled vehicle miles traveled (VMT) estimates, and 2019 and 2020 VMT are based on 2016 VMT adjusted to account for regional VMT growth, as reflected in the California Highway Performance Monitoring System

⁵ California Department of Finance: <u>E-4 Population Estimates for Cities, Counties, and the State, 2021-2022 with 2020 Census Benchmark</u> (May 2022), accessed January 6, 2023. <u>E-4 Population Estimates for Cities, Counties, and the State, 2011-2020 with 2010 Census Benchmark</u> (May 2021), accessed January 6, 2023.

(HPMS) from 2016 to 2019 and to 2020. 2021 VMT are based on 2019 VMT adjusted to account for regional freeway VMT difference between 2019 and 2020 in the California Performance Measurement System (PeMS), due to a delay in HPMS data. 2016 VMT is the output from SANDAG's Final 2021 Regional Plan and activity-based model (ABM2+).

**2020 waste tonnage was used to calculate 2021 emissions from waste due to a delay in reported waste data Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

	2019 Inventory ⁶		2020 Inventory		2021 Inventory		2022 Inventory	
Emissions Category	GHG Emissions (MT CO₂e)	(%)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	(%)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	(%)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	(%)
On-Road								
Transportation*	5,854,000	55%	4,650,000	50%	4,683,000	53%	4,628,000	54%
Electricity	2,398,000	23%	2,368,000	26%	1,725,000	20%	1,661,000	19%
Natural Gas	1,912,000	18%	1,827,000	20%	1,918,000	22%	1,837,000	21%
Solid Waste**	277,000	3%	273,000	3%	288,000	3%	282,000	3%
Offroad Transportation (Construction Equipment Only)	69,000	1%	57,000	1%	57,000	1%	57,000	1%
Water	61,000	1%	70,000	1%	70,000	1%	74,000	1%
Wastewater	26,000	0%	23,000	0%	24,000	0%	13,000	0%
Total	10,597,000	100%	9,268,000	100%	8,765,000	100%	8,552,000	100%

Table 3 GHG Emissions by Category from City of San Diego (2019–2021)

Sums may not add up to totals due to rounding. GHG emissions for each category are rounded to the nearest thousand. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation.

*Emissions are based on SANDAG's Series 14 modeled vehicle miles traveled (VMT) estimates, and 2019 and 2020 VMT are based on 2016 VMT adjusted to account for regional VMT growth, as reflected in the California Highway Performance Monitoring System (HPMS) from 2016 to 2019 and to 2020. 2021 VMT are based on 2019 VMT adjusted to account for regional freeway VMT difference between 2019 and 2020 in the California Performance Measurement System (PeMS), due to a delay in HPMS data. 2016 VMT is the output from SANDAG's Final 2021 Regional Plan and activity-based model (ABM2+).

**2020 waste tonnage was used to calculate 2021 emissions from waste due to a delay in reported waste data Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

In 2022, total emissions were 8.6 MMTCO₂e, a 19% reduction from the 2019 baseline and 2% reduction from 2021. This decrease was mainly due to improvements in the carbon intensity of electricity supplied to the City and increased on-road vehicle efficiency and adoption of electric and hybrid vehicles. Although COVID-19 temporarily reduced on-road transportation emissions by lowering vehicle miles traveled, these miles are now returning to pre-pandemic levels. Despite this, emissions remain lower because the adoption of electric and hybrid vehicles has reduced the carbon intensity of on-road vehicles.

Furthermore, SDG&E has expanded its renewable energy portfolio, and San Diego Community Power, the City's Community Choice Energy provider, now supplies electricity to commercial, industrial, and residential sectors. This shift has decreased the carbon intensity of the City's electricity consumption, further reducing overall emissions.

⁶ The 2019 GHG emissions inventory in this document updated from the 2019 inventory in the <u>CAP Annual Report 2020</u>, due to updated data sources after the Annual Report release: (1) 2019 electricity emissions factor became available in December 2020; and (2) new mobile sources emissions inventory (EMFAC2021) became available in 2021; (3) new solid waste data became available in 2022;

4 METHOD TO CALCULATE GHG EMISSIONS INVENTORY

The CAP inventory follows the U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions (U.S. Community Protocol),⁷ developed by ICLEI USA. It requires a minimum of five basic emissions-generating activities to be included in a Protocol-compliant community-scale GHG inventory. These categories are: electricity, natural gas, on-road transportation, water and wastewater, and solid waste. GHG emissions are calculated by multiplying activity data (e.g., kilowatt-hours of electricity, tons of solid waste) by an emission factor (e.g., pounds of CO₂e per unit of electricity). Off-road emissions from construction equipment were added to the 2022 CAP and subsequent Annual Reports as an optional category. For these categories, methods based on the U.S. Community Protocol were modified with regional- or City-specific data when available.

The U.S. Community Protocol provides guidance for developing community-scale inventories. Protocols and guidance for reporting GHG emissions for individual entities, such as corporations and public agencies, are different from those for communities. The Local Government Operations Protocol, developed by ICLEI, CARB, and the Climate Registry (TCR), and the General Reporting Protocol, developed by TCR, are widely used to develop GHG inventories for local governments and public agencies.⁸ The method to determine boundaries in the U.S. Community Protocol is different from the method in the Local Government Operations Protocol or the General Reporting Protocol, which depends on the entity's financial or operational control. This inventory accounts for the emission generating activities in the City of San Diego, not based on City's financial or operational control. All activity data and GHG emissions reported in this document are annual average values, unless stated otherwise.

4.1 On-Road Transportation

The emissions associated with on-road transportation are calculated by multiplying the estimated City of San Diego VMT and the average vehicle emission rate in the San Diego region from 2019 to 2022, from the statewide mobile source emissions model.

4.1.1 Vehicle Miles Traveled (VMT)

SANDAG uses an activity-based model (ABM) to support development of Regional Transportation Plans and generate outputs related to the transportation system performance, including VMT. Every three to five years, SANDAG produces the Regional Growth Forecast, a long-range forecast of population, housing employment growth, and produces VMT for the San Diego region, and by jurisdiction. As of the Annual Report development, the most recent forecast is the Series 14 Growth Forecast with a base year of 2016. This Forecast was used in SANDAG's Final 2021 Regional Plan with the most recent version of the ABM model, ABM2+.

SANDAG provided VMT estimates for the City of San Diego for year 2016.⁹ However, 2017–2022 VMT data from Series 14 are not available at the jurisdictional level. Therefore, for the City of San Diego, post-2016 VMT data were estimated using the Series 14 2016 VMT adjusted using VMT monitoring data for 2017–2022 from other sources. The two sources available are public road and freeway data in the San

⁷ ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019).

⁸ CARB, ICLEI, and The Climate Registry: Local Government Operations Protocol; the Climate Registry: General Reporting Protocol Version 3.0.

⁹ 2016 VMT was provided by SANDAG to City of San Diego (January 2022). SANDAG Activity Based Model 2+ Release v14.2.2, Final 2021 Regional Plan Networks, Policies, and Assumptions, Year 2016, Reference Scenario 458. The forecast in the Final 2021 Regional Plan was based on the Sustainable Communities Strategy land use pattern, which may be different from jurisdictions' general plan land use pattern.

Diego region derived from the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) Highway Performance Monitoring System (HPMS) and Performance Measurement System (PeMS).¹⁰

SANDAG allocates the VMT derived from ABM2+ to a jurisdiction using the Origin-Destination (O-D) method.¹¹ The O-D VMT method is the preferred method proposed by the U.S Community Protocol in *"TR.1 Emissions from Passenger Vehicles"* and *"TR.2 Emissions from Freight and Service Trucks"* that estimates miles traveled based on where a trip originates and where it ends to attribute on-road emissions to cities and regions (Figure 1).¹²



Figure 1 Components of O-D Method for VMT Calculation

O-D VMT allocated to San Diego includes all miles traveled for trips that originate and end within San Diego city limits (referred to as Internal-Internal), and half of the miles traveled for trips that either begin within San Diego and end outside the City (referred to as Internal-External), or vice versa (referred to as External-Internal). In accordance with the methodology, VMT from trips that begin and end outside San Diego that only pass through the City limits (referred to as External-External) are not included in the total City VMT. The total average weekday VMT were multiplied by 347 to adjust from average weekday VMT to average annual VMT, which includes weekends.¹³

The average weekday Series 14 O-D VMT estimates for each trip type in 2016 provided by SANDAG and the total VMT allocated to the City based on the ICLEI methodology described above are given in Table 4.¹⁴

¹⁰ California Department of Transportation: <u>Highway Performance Monitoring System (HPMS) Data</u>.

¹¹ SANDAG (2013): <u>Vehicle Miles Traveled Calculation Using the SANDAG Regional Travel Demand Model.</u> Technical White Paper.

¹² ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019), Appendix D: Transportation and Other Mobile Emission Activities and Sources.

¹³ The conversion of 347 weekdays to 365 days per year as used by CARB. <u>CARB: California's 2000–2014 Greenhouse Gas Emission Inventory</u> <u>Technical Support Document (2016 Edition)</u>, p. 41 (September 2016).

¹⁴ The 2016 data used here are different from (1-3% lower) the 2016 data used in the San Diego Climate Action Plan update 2022, which were from SANDAG ABM2+ Release v14.2.1, Draft 2021 Regional plan (October 2020).

		VMT by Trip Type (Miles/Weekday)		Total City VMT (100% * I-I +		
Year	Internal- Internal (I-I) Trips	External- Internal/Internal- External (I-E/E-I) Trips	External-External Trips (Information only, excluded from City VMT)*	(100% I-F 50% * I-E/E-I) (Miles per Weekday)	Total City VMT (Miles per Year)	
2016	22,264,735	28,279,389	32,824,891	36,404,429	12,632,336,902	
*Though excluded from this analysis, miles from External-External trips (pass-through trips) shown here are the portion only within the						

Table 4 2016 O-D VMT Estimates by Trip Types and Total VMT provided by SANDAG (San Diego, 2016)

City boundary, not from the entire trip.

Based on SANDAG Series 14 (Final 2021 Regional Plan) and ABM2+ VMT estimates. The conversion factor from miles per weekday to miles per year is 347.

SANDAG 2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

Historical year data from other than the 2016 base year are not available under SANDAG ABM2+. Therefore, to estimate 2020 O-D VMT, the 2016 O-D VMT was adjusted by the annual rates of increase from 2016 to 2020, as indicated by the State public road VMT monitoring system (Caltrans HPMS). Annual Caltrans HPMS VMT was used to estimate annual VMT growth rates for the San Diego region. These growth rates were applied to the City of San Diego's 2016 O-D VMT data (Table 4) as an approximation of VMT growth since 2016. The Caltrans HPMS VMT estimate for the San Diego region is based on daily monitoring on all public roads, including city streets, county roads, state highways, roads maintained by state and federal agencies, freeways, etc. The estimated daily VMT and annual rate of increase or decrease from 2016 to 2022 with Caltrans HPMS data are given in Table 5.¹⁵

Table 5 San Diego Region Daily VMT Derived from the Caltrans Highway Performance Monitoring System

Year	San Diego Region Daily VMT	Annual Rate of Increase					
	(thousand miles/day)	(%)					
2016	79,622	-					
2017	81,253	2.0%					
2018	82,618	1.7%					
2019	86,136	4.3%					
2020	68,650	-20.3%					
2021*	71,151	3.6%					
2022	71,954	1.1%					
	*Updated to use 2021 Caltrans HPMS data Caltrans 2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024						

The 2020 San Diego regional daily VMT was 20% lower than in 2019, which reflects the travel pattern change due to the COVID-19 pandemic. Statewide, 2020 VMT showed an average decline of 15% compared with 2019.¹⁶

¹⁵ Caltrans: <u>HPMS Data</u>, accessed January 18, 2023.

¹⁶ Caltrans: <u>California Public Road Data 2022</u>. Statistical Information Derived from the Highway Performance Monitoring System (Released November 2023).

2021 HPMS data were not available for the previous Annual Report, therefore, annual San Diego regional freeway VMT from Caltrans freeway monitoring system (Caltrans PeMS) was used to estimate the VMT growth rate for calendar year 2021. To maintain methodological continuity, the 2021 VMT value has been updated in this 2023 Annual Report to use the published HPMS data to estimate growth rate instead of PeMS data.

4.1.2 Average Annual Vehicle Emission Rate

The average annual vehicle emission rate expressed in grams of CO_2e per mile driven (g CO_2e /mile) is derived from the statewide mobile source emissions model EMFAC2021 developed by CARB.¹⁷

EMFAC2021 was run in the default activity mode to generate the total VMT and total vehicle GHG emissions for the San Diego region, including all vehicle model years, classes, and fuel types.¹⁸ This document assumes that the City of San Diego has the same distribution of vehicle types as the San Diego region.

4.1.3 Total Emissions from On-Road Transportation

Total estimated VMT, average vehicle emission rates, and corresponding GHG emissions from on-road transportation from 2019–2022 are given in Table 6.

Year	Total VMT (Million Miles/year)	Average Vehicle Emission Rate (g CO2e/mile)	GHG Emissions (MMT CO ₂ e)				
2019	13,666	428	5.85				
2020	10,892	427	4.65				
2021*	11,288	415	4.68				
2022	11,416	405	4.63				
GHG emissions for each category are rounded. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation. *2021 VMT estimate updated for methodological continuity.							
Energy Policy	Initiatives Center, Unive	rsity of San Diego 202	4				

Table 6 VMT, Emission Rate, and GHG Emissions from On-Road Transportation (San Diego, 2019–2022)

4.2 Electricity

Emissions from electricity in the City of San Diego were estimated using the Built Environment (BE.2) method from the U.S. Community Protocol, by multiplying electricity use by the City-specific electricity emission factor in a given year.¹⁹

4.2.1 Electricity Use

Annual metered electricity sales data within the City were provided by the local utility, San Diego Gas & Electric (SDG&E).²⁰ The electricity sales data do not include the electricity sales to San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District, and the military. The electricity sales from 2019 to 2022 by customer class are shown in Figure 2.

¹⁷ CARB: EMission FACtors model, <u>EMFAC2021 v1.0.1</u>, released on April 30, 2021, downloaded on August 30, 2021. CARB published an updated version, <u>EMFAC2021 v1.0.2</u>, on May 2, 2022. The updates fixed bugs that were not related to GHG emissions. ¹⁸ *Id*.

¹⁹ ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019), Appendix C: Built Environment Emission Activities and Sources.

²⁰ 2020 and 2021 metered electricity sales were provided to EPIC by SDG&E (March 16, 2021, and October 31, 2022).



Figure 2 SDG&E Electricity Sales to City of San Diego by Customer Class (2019–2022)



SDG&E 2019-2022

The percentage of electricity use from each customer class (residential, commercial, and industrial) was similar in each of the three years. In 2020, a higher percentage of electricity use, 33%, was from residential customers, potentially due to the COVID stay-at-home order in 2020.

In 2019 and 2020, the electricity sales included the sales to SDG&E bundled customers²¹ and Direct Access (DA) customers.²² In March 2021, San Diego Community Power (SDCP), a community choice energy provider, started serving jurisdictions in the San Diego region, including the City of San Diego. By the end of 2021, eligible SDG&E bundled commercial and industrial customers were enrolled in SDCP automatically with the option to opt-out (return to SDG&E) or opt-up to a SDCP product with higher renewable electricity. In early 2022, residential accounts were automatically enrolled in SDCP with the same options to opt-out or opt-up.

The 2019 and 2020 electricity use per customer class provided by SDG&E have the same format, with bundled and DA customers' electricity use identified separately. However, for 2021 and 2022, only total electricity use per customer class was provided by SDG&E. To estimate the 2021 electricity use by DA customers in each customer class, the ratio of 2020 DA customers to total electricity use was applied to the total 2021 electricity use in each customer class. Based on the SDCP participation rate, 98% of the remaining 2021 commercial and industrial electricity use was assumed to be from SDCP commercial and industrial electricity use, and residential use, were assumed to be from SDG&E customers. Additionally, in 2022, SDCP provided the energy consumption in kWh for commercial/industrial customers and residential customers. In 2022 instead of using participation rates as used in 2021, the actual kWh consumption was attributed to SDG&E (Direct & Bundled) and SDCP. Direct and bundled electricity was then disaggregated using the proportion from the last data year received (2020).

²¹ SDG&E bundled power includes the electricity from SDG&E-owned power plants and the electricity from its net procurements.

²² Direct Access refers to electricity that customers purchase from non-SDG&E electric service providers (ESPs), but SDG&E still provides transmission and distribution services. See <u>SDG&E Direct Access Program</u>.

²³ The participation rate is the rate by number of accounts, not by electricity use. Due to lack of data, the number of accounts is used as a proxy to estimate the SDCP commercial and industrial electricity use.

The electricity sales were then adjusted by 1) a loss factor²⁴ of 1.082²⁵ to account for transmission and distribution losses; and 2) subtracting electricity use associated with moving water within the City limits, which is allocated to the water category emissions.

The adjusted net energy for load (electricity sales + losses) is provided in Table 6.

4.2.2 City-Specific Electricity Emission Factor

For a given year, the City-specific electricity emission factor, expressed in pounds of CO_2e per Megawatthour (lbs CO_2e/MWh), is estimated based on the specific mix of bundled power, DA power, and SDCP power, if any, in the City and their respective emission factors.

The 2019 SDG&E bundled emission factors are calculated using Federal Energy Regulatory Commission (FERC) Form 1²⁶ data, the California Energy Commission (CEC) Power Source Disclosure (PSD) Program²⁷ data on SDG&E-owned and purchased power, and U.S. EPA Emissions and Generating Resource Integrated Database (eGRID) 2019 Edition²⁸ on specific power plant emissions. The 2019 SDG&E bundled emission factor calculated using the sources above is 633 lbs CO₂e/MWh, with 31% eligible renewable.

The CEC PSD Program, under the requirements of Assembly Bill (AB) 1110 (Ting, Chapter 656, Statutes of 2016), requires retail electric providers to disclose GHG emissions intensity (i.e., electricity emission factor) separately from unbundled renewable energy credits, starting in 2021 for 2020 procurements. So the SDG&E bundled emission factors, are provided directly in the power content labels reported under the CEC PSD Program and listed below in Table 6.

The DA emission factor, 836 lbs CO₂e/MWh, is based on California Public Utilities Commission (CPUC) Decision D.14-12-037.²⁹ The City-specific electricity emission factors are provided in Table 6.

4.2.3 Total Emissions from Electricity

Emissions are calculated by multiplying the adjusted net energy for load (electricity sales + losses) and the corresponding City-specific electricity emission factor. The net energy for San Diego's load (electricity sales + losses), electricity emission factors, and corresponding GHG emissions from the electricity category for 2019-2022 are shown in Table 6.

²⁴ The transmission and distribution loss factor is used to scale end-use demand or retail sales to produce net energy for load. L. Wong, <u>A</u> <u>Review of Transmission Losses In Planning Studies</u>, CEC Staff Paper (August 2011).

²⁵ California Energy Commission (CEC): <u>California Energy Demand 2015–2025 Final Forecast Mid-Case Final Baseline Demand Forecast Forms</u>, SDG&E Mid. The transmission and distribution loss factor is calculated based on the ratio of net energy for load (total sales + net losses) and total sales from SDG&E Form 1.2 Mid.

²⁶ FERC: <u>Form 1 – Electric Utility Annual Report</u>.

²⁷ CEC: <u>Power Source Disclosure Program</u> under Senate Bill 1305. The SDG&E annual power source disclosure reports in 2019 were provided to EPIC by CEC staff. SDG&E <u>2019 Power Content Label</u>, version October 2020. The CEC PSD Program, under the requirements of Assembly Bill (AB) 1110 (Ting, Chapter 656, Statutes of 2016), requires retail electric providers to disclose GHG emissions intensity (i.e., electricity emission factor) and unbundled renewable energy credits, starting in 2021 for 2020 procurements. Starting in 2021, the GHG emissions intensity reported by retail electric providers for the PSD Program will be used directly to calculate GHG emissions from the electricity category.
²⁸ U.S. EPA. <u>eGRID 2019 Edition</u>, released on February 23, 2021.

²⁹ CPUC: <u>Decision 14-12-037</u>, December 18, 2014 in Rulemaking 11-03-012 (filed March 24, 2011). The recommended emission factor is 0.379 MT CO₂e/MWh (836 lbs CO₂e/MWh). The recommended emission factor has not changed since 2014. However, all electric service suppliers must meet the Renewables Portfolio Standards in the target years.

			•		
Year	SDG&E Bundled Emission Factor (lbs CO ₂ e/ MWh)	SDCP 'Power On' Emission Factor (lbs CO₂e/MWh)	Net Energy for Load (electricity sales + losses) ¹ (MWh)	City-Specific Emission Factor (Ibs CO2e/MWh) ²	GHG Emissions (MT CO₂e)
2019	633	-	7,912,365	668	2,398,000
2020	636	-	7,788,903	670	2,368,000
2021	504	378	7,527,776	505	1,725,000
2022	508	375	7,722,329	474	1,661,000

Table 6 Net Energy for Load, Emission Factor, and GHG Emissions from Electricity Category (San Diego, 2019–2022)

¹The net energy for load does not include the net energy for load from San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District, and the military.

²City-Specific emission factors are for City of San Diego only and do not represent the emission factors of SDG&E bundled electricity or of other jurisdictions in the San Diego region.

GHG emissions for each category are rounded. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation. **Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024**

4.3 Natural Gas

Emissions from natural gas use in San Diego were estimated using method Built Environment (BE.1) from the U.S. Community Protocol, by multiplying the natural gas use (the activity) and the natural gas emission factor each year.³⁰

4.3.1 Natural Gas Use

Annual natural gas sales were provided by SDG&E, broken down by residential, commercial and industrial customer class.³¹ The natural gas sales data do not include the sales to San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District, and the military. The natural gas sales from 2019 to 2022 by customer class are show in Figure 3.



Figure 3 SDG&E Natural Gas Sales to City of San Diego by Customer Class (2019–2022)

SDG&E'S natural gas sales in City of San Diego do not include transmission and distribution losses, and exclude sales to Sa Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District, and the military. Percentages may not sum up to totals due to rounding.

³⁰ ICLEI– Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019), Appendix C: Built Environment Emission Activities and Sources.

³¹ 2020 and 2021 metered electricity sales were provided to EPIC by SDG&E (March 16, 2021, and October 31, 2022).

SDG&E 2019-2022

The natural gas end-use in 2020 was approximately 4% lower than the end-use in 2019 but has fluctuated in recent years.

4.3.2 Natural Gas Emission Factor

The natural gas emission factor is based on the heat content of the fuel and the fuel's CO₂, CH₄, and N₂O emissions. The heat content of fuel and the emissions from CO₂, CH₄, and N₂O were based on the CARB statewide inventory.³² The natural gas emission factor is given in Table 7.

4.3.3 Total Emissions from Natural Gas

To estimate emissions from the combustion of natural gas, end-use sales were multiplied by the emission factor. The total natural gas end-use and corresponding GHG emissions from the natural gas category for 2019-2022 are given in Table 7.

Year	Natural Gas End-Use (Million Therms)	Natural Gas Emission Factor (Million MT CO₂e/Million Therms)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)				
2019	351	0.00545	1,912,000				
2020	335	0.00545	1,827,000				
2021	352	0.00545	1,918,000				
2022	337	0.00545	1,837,000				
The natural gas sales do not include the sales to San Diego County Regional Airport Authority, San Diego Unified Port District, and the military. GHG emissions for each category are rounded to the nearest thousand. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation. SDG&E 2020-2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024							

Table 7 Natural Gas End-Use and GHG Emissions from Natural Gas Category (San Diego, 2019-2022)

4.4 Off-Road Transportation (Construction Equipment Only)

The emissions from off-road transportation in the City, such as gasoline and diesel fuel use for off-road vehicles and equipment, were estimated based on CARB off-road models. The CARB models include many off-road equipment types, only construction related equipment and its emissions are covered here. Common equipment types are excavators, off-highway tractors, paving equipment. OFFROAD2021 is the main model for estimating off-road transportation emissions.³³

Due to the lack of jurisdiction-specific data from CARB models, the construction emissions from CARB model outputs for the San Diego region were scaled to the City based on the ratio of regional and citywide construction jobs. The ratio and the corresponding GHG emissions from the off-road transportation category for 2019-2022 are given in Table 8.

³² CARB: <u>GHG Current California Emission Inventory Data.</u>

³³ CARB: OFFROAD2021 (v1.0.6) Emissions Inventory, all adopted rules -exhaust. Downloaded on May 20, 2024.

Year	GHG Emissions from Construction Equipment in San Diego Region (MMT CO2e)	Construction Jobs Ratio (City of San Diego/San Diego Region)	GHG Emissions from Construction Equipment in City of San Diego (MT CO2e)			
2019*	177	39%	69,000			
2020	145	39%	57,000			
2021	145	39%	57,000			
2022	145	39%	57,000			
*Emissions from 2019 have been updated since the 2022 CAP to reflect updates to the underlying CARB model. CARB OFFROAD2021 (v1.0.6), Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024						

Table 8 GHG Emissions from Off-Road Transportation (Construction Equipment Only) Category (San Diego, 2019 - 2022)

4.5 Solid Waste

Emissions from the decomposition of organic material in waste disposed at landfills were estimated using method Solid Waste (SW.4) from the U.S. Community Protocol, by multiplying the amount of waste disposed by the City in 2019 and an emission factor for mixed solid waste.³⁴ This represents the immediate and all future emissions from decay of this waste.

4.5.1 Solid Waste Disposal

Solid waste disposal is the waste disposed by the City in landfills, regardless of whether the landfills accepting the waste are located inside or outside of the City boundary. The majority of the waste from the City is disposed at West Miramar Sanitary Landfill, Otay Landfill, and Sycamore Landfill.³⁵

The total waste disposal from the City was 1,597,546 short tons (1,449,270 metric tons) in 2022, 2% lower than the waste disposal in 2019. The total waste disposal from the City in 2021 was not available for the previously published Annual Report, so the 2021 waste disposal figure has been updated in this report now that data is available. The total and per-capita solid waste disposal are given in Table 10 below.³⁶

4.5.2 Mixed Solid Waste Emission Factor

The emission factor of mixed solid waste depends on the percentage of each waste type within the waste stream disposed in a landfill. The City of San Diego's 2012–2013 Waste Characterization Study, conducted at Miramar Landfill, is the most recent waste characterization study done by the City and was used as a proxy for San Diego's solid waste composition.³⁷ Only the CH₄ emissions from waste degradation are considered non-biogenic and included in this category. The CO₂ emissions from waste degradation are considered biogenic and not included in this category.

The EPA Waste Reduction Model (WARM) is used to determine the emission factor of each waste type. WARM is a life-cycle GHG model to assess and compare waste management options (e.g., landfilling, recycling, source reduction, composting), through the life-cycle of waste materials (from material extraction to disposal). However, under the U.S Community Protocol, only emissions from the disposal

³⁴ ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019), Appendix E: Solid Waste Emission Activities and Sources.

³⁵ CalRecycle: <u>Disposal Reporting System (DRS)</u>: Jurisdiction Disposal and Alternative Daily Cover (ADC) Tons by Facility.

³⁶ 2021 & 2022 waste disposal was provided by City of San Diego to EPIC in January 2023.

³⁷ City of San Diego: <u>Waste Characterization Study 2012–2013 Final Report</u> (2014), accessed November 4, 2019.

and associated degradation of waste are included. Therefore, only the landfill emission factors in EPA WARM are used in the calculation. WARM reports the landfill CH₄ emission factor of each waste material in MT CO₂e/short ton, with and without Landfill Gas (LFG) recovery.

The mixed solid waste emission factor is given in Table 9. The landfill emission factors without LFG recovery are identified here; the LFG recovery is applied later.

		Landfill Gas E	mission Factors				
Waste Component	Waste Distribution (%) ¹	CH₄ without Landfill Gas Recovery (MT CO₂e/short ton disposed)	Source ²				
Paper	16.8%						
Corrugated Containers/Cardboard	5.0%	2.36	Exhibit 3-27, WARM v15 Containers /Packaging				
Newspaper	0.8%	0.94	Exhibit 3-27, WARM v15 Containers /Packaging				
Magazine	0.6%	1.08	Exhibit 3-27, WARM v15 Containers /Packaging				
Mixed Paper (general)	10.4%	2.14	Exhibit 3-27, WARM v15 Containers /Packaging				
Plastic	8.9%	0	-				
Glass	1.7%	0	-				
Metal	3.5%	0	-				
Organics	38.9%						
Food	15%	1.62	Exhibit 1-49, WARM V15 Organic Materials				
Tree (Branches)	5.3%	1.3	Exhibit 2-13 WARM V15 Organic Materials				
Leaves and Grass	6.8%	0.59 (leaves)	Exhibit 2-13 WARM V15 Organic Materials				
Trimmings	3.5%	0.73	Exhibit 2-13 WARM V15 Organic Materials				
Mixed Organics	8.3%	0.53	Exhibit 1-48 WARM V15 Organic Materials				
Electronics	0.6%	0	-				
Construction & Demolition	24.6%	0	-				
Household Hazardous Waste	0.2%	0	-				
Special Waste	3.1%	0	-				
Mixed Residue	1.6%	0.53					
Mixed Waste Emission Fa	actor	0.785					
¹ <u>City of San Diego 2014</u> . ² EPA <u>Waste Reduction Model (WARM)</u> Version 15 (May 2019)							

Table 9 Mixed Solid Waste Emission Factor

4.5.3 Total Emissions from Solid Waste Disposed in Landfills

The mixed waste emission factor given in Table 9 is the emission factor without landfill gas collection. The 75% default capture rate of CH₄ emissions from landfills, from the U.S. Community Protocol, is applied in the emissions calculation. The total and per-capita solid waste disposal and the corresponding GHG emissions for 2019 are given in Table 10.

	Sc	olid Waste Disp	osed	GHG			Default CH₄ Capture Rate	
Year	Citywide (Short Tons/Yea r)	Citywide (MT/Year)	Per Capita Solid Waste Disposal (kg/person/ day) ¹	Emission Factor (MT CO₂e/Short Ton)	Oxidation Rate ²	Total GHG Emissions (MT CO₂e)		Remaining Emissions (MT CO2e)
2019	1,569,447	1,423,779	2.7	0.785	10%	1,108,249	75%	277,000
2020	1,543,627	1,400,355	2.8	0.785	10%	1,090,017	75%	273,000
2021*	1,631,802	1,400,355	3.0	0.785	10%	1,152,281	75%	288,000
2022	1,596,546	1,449,270	2.9	0.785	10%	1,128,091	75%	282,000

Table 10 Solid Waste Disposal into Landfills and Associated GHG Emissions (San Diego, 2019–2022)

GHG emissions for each category are rounded. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation.

¹ Informational, based on total waste disposal and population estimates. 2019 population is based on 2010 census benchmark, and 2020, 2021, & 2022 population are based on 2020 census benchmark.

² The oxidation rate is a default estimate of methane that is oxidized and not emitted, therefore only 90% of total methane emissions are produced per the ICLEI Community Protocol.

*The total waste disposal from the City in 2021 was not available for the previous Annual Report, so this figure has been updated to reflect the corrected data once available.

Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

4.5.4 Estimating Emissions from Previously Disposed Solid Waste (Not Reported in Inventory)

The Community Protocol recognizes that there are emissions from waste previously disposed in landfills located within the City boundary. The emissions from waste-in-place can be reported optionally in additional to waste disposal. The Protocol provides a separate method to estimate emissions from past disposal. The City of San Diego has two active landfills and four closed landfills within its boundary. Emissions from waste already in place in City landfills are tracked separately here and are not included in the reported value for solid waste emissions in the City GHG emissions total.

For landfills that are required to report GHG emissions through the Environmental Protection Agency's Mandatory Greenhouse Gas Reporting Program (EPA MRR), the reported values are used directly.³⁸ For the landfills not subject to EPA MRR, emissions were calculated based on the Landfill Emissions Tool developed by CARB using the first order decay model recommended by the IPCC.³⁹

Emissions from in-boundary landfills cannot be directly added to emissions from solid waste disposed in the current year. This is because emissions from solid waste disposal (method provided in Section 4.5.3) are calculated to include the projected future GHG emissions from the waste disposed in the current year, regardless of disposal location, while emissions from in-boundary landfills are emissions in the current year from waste that has already been in place at the landfills, regardless of where the waste was generated.

³⁸ EPA: <u>2019 Greenhouse Gas Emissions from Large Facilities</u>, accessed November 10, 2020.

³⁹ CARB: Landfill gas tool, released September 24, 2021, download date: January 9, 2023. Results may differ from the previous v1.3 tool released in 2011. tool reports CO_2e of CH_4 using 21 as CH_4 GWP, recalculated using 25 as CH_4 GWP.

The emissions from San Diego landfills are given in Table 11.

Table 11 Emissions from In-boundary Landfills (Information	ion Only, Not Reported in GHG Inventory)
--	--

Landfill	Status	2019 Landfill Emissions (MT CO₂e)	2020 Landfill Emissions (MT CO₂e)	2021 Landfill Emissions (MT CO₂e)	2022 Landfill Emissions (MT CO₂e)	Source
West Miramar Sanitary Landfill	Active	154,932	198,685	152,566	141,544	EPA MRR
Sycamore Landfill	Active	86,057	87,168	107,175	155,748	EPA MRR
North Miramar Sanitary Landfill	Closed in 1983	2,974	2,211	3,420	3,210	EPA MRR
South Chollas Sanitary Landfill	Closed in 1981	n/a	n/a	n/a	n/a	Discontinued reporting to EPA MRR in 2015
Arizona Street Landfill	Closed in 1974	9,598	9,408	9,222	9,039	CARB Landfill Emission Tool (CARB LET) result using waste received before closing
Mission Bay Landfill #1	Closed in 1959	5,530	5,420	5,313	5,104	CARB LET result using operational period 1952-1959 and waste-in- place at the end of 1990
Total		259,091	302,892	277,696	314,645	-
n/a = not available						

Landfill emissions reported in EPA MRR were estimated from methane recovery, destruction and other factors. The emissions may differ from modeled methane generation and from previous versions.

CARB 2024, EPA 2024, Energy Policy Initiatives Center 2024

4.6 Water

Emissions from water use in a jurisdiction result from the energy required to move water from origin sources to end-use customers, including upstream supply and conveyance, water treatment, and water distribution, as circled in Figure 4. The energy required to move water is primarily electricity but may include natural gas or other fuels.



Figure 4 Segments of the Water Cycle

Emissions from water were estimated using the method Wastewater and Water (WW.14) from the U.S. Community Protocol.⁴⁰ Emissions associated with water end-use, such as water heating and cooling, are included in the electricity and natural gas categories, not in this water category, as data are not available to separate out those values.

Water agencies developing their own GHG inventories would not follow the U.S. Community Protocol because the U.S. Community Protocol is specifically for community-wide inventories, not for other types of entities. Therefore, the scope and boundary of emissions included in this sector are different from those of a water agency's GHG inventory. For example, the water agencies may account only the emission generating activities within their operational or financial control in their GHG inventories.

4.6.1 Water Use

The City of San Diego is a member agency of the water wholesaler in the San Diego region, the San Diego County Water Authority (SDCWA). The City of San Diego delivers potable and recycled water within the City boundary, and also sells water to or treats water for neighboring water agencies and cities, such as the City of Del Mar, South Bay Irrigation Water District, and the California American Water Company (CalAm).⁴¹

The potable water supply sources for the City of San Diego include: 1) imported untreated water from SDCWA; 2) imported treated water from SDCWA; 3) surface water from local reservoirs; and 4) groundwater from the Santee-El Monte Basin.⁴² Recycled water is produced at the City's North City Water Reclamation Plant (North City WRP) and South Bay Water Reclamation Plant (South Bay WRP) and is used for non-potable use, such as landscape irrigation.

The potable water supplied within City of San Diego (excluding sales to other water agencies) and the percentage of water from each source, and the recycled water are given in Table 12.⁴³

⁴⁰ ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019), Appendix F: Wastewater and Water Emission Activities and Sources.

⁴¹ California American Water Company (CalAm)'s service area in San Diego region includes Cities of Imperial Beach and Coronado, and portions of the City of Chula Vista. California American Water: <u>2015 Urban Water Management Plan</u>, Southern Division – San Diego County District (2016).

⁴² City of San Diego, <u>2015 Urban Water Management Plan</u>, Section 6 System Water Supplies (2016).

⁴³ Recycled water sales, water production at each of City's water treatment plants (WTPs) from each water source and sales to other agencies (City of Del Mar and CalAm) were provided by City of San Diego from 2017 to 2019. Water sale to City of Del Mar is from the imported raw water treated in City of San Diego's WTPs. The water sale to CalAm (excluding CalAm's service area in City of San Diego's South Bay area) is from local water treated in WTPs. Starting in 2021, water sales to South Bay Irrigation District is from a mixture of local supply and imported water treated in Otay WTP. Recycled water was produced at the City's North City Water Reclamation Plant and provided to City customers only.

		Recycled Water					
Year	Imported SDCWAImported SDCWALocal SurfaceLocal GroundwaterPotable Water Supplied (Acre-Feet)		Supply (Acre-Feet)				
2019	10%	77%	14%	0.1%	161,472	7,999	
2020	12%	73%	14%	0.1%	166,742	8,842	
2021	8%	84%	7%	0.3%	161,995	8,586	
2022	6%	86%	8%	0.3%	179,695	10.012	
Percentages may not add up to totals due to rounding. Potable water supplied (acre-feet) is the City of San Diego's water production excluding sales to other water agencies.							

City of San Diego 2024, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

4.6.2 Energy Intensity of Water

The energy used to produce and distribute water from each source is different due to the different raw source type and its location. The energy intensity of water, or the energy needed to move one unit of water through each segment of the water-use cycle (water supply and conveyance, water treatment, and water distribution) individually, expressed in kWh per acre foot (kWh/Acre-foot), are described below.

<u>Upstream Supply and Conveyance</u> – This is defined as supply and conveyance of water from the raw sources to the local service area. The upstream supply and conveyance energy use for SDCWA untreated water consists of conveyance of water from the State Water Project and the Colorado River through Metropolitan Water District's (MWD) and SDCWA's service area. The energy use associated with upstream supply and conveyance for SDCWA treated water consists of that associated with SDCWA untreated water and water treatment before the water is delivered to City of San Diego's service area. The water may be treated at MWD or SDCWA's water treatment plants (WTPs).⁴⁴ The City does not have operational control over the upstream supply and conveyance.

Water suppliers have begun to voluntarily report the energy intensity in their service areas in Urban Water Management Plans (UWMPs). SDCWA's and MWD's reported 2015 UWMP energy intensities are used to calculate the upstream supply energy intensity for SDCWA's member agencies. The energy intensity is based on the average of fiscal years 2013 and 2014 is shown in Table 13.

⁴⁴ SDCWA 2016: <u>Urban Water Management Plan 2015</u>, Metropolitan Water District of Southern California, <u>Urban Water Management Plan 2015</u>.

Water System Segment	FY 2013 and 2014 Average Energy Intensity (kWh/Acre-Foot)	Data Source	
MWD delivered untreated*	1,817	MWD UWMP 2015 Appendix 9	
SDCWA conveyance**	-62 SDCWA UWMP 2015 App		
SDCWA Untreated Subtotal	1,755		
SDCWA treatment	60	SDCWA UWMP 2015 Appendix K	
SDCWA distribution***	1.1	SDCWA UWMP 2015 Appendix K	
SDCWA Treated Total	1,816		

MWD - Metropolitan Water District, SDCWA – San Diego County Water Authority, UWMP - Urban Water Management Plan.

*Includes conveyance from the State Water Project & Colorado River water to MWD's distribution system, and distribution from MWD to MWD's member agencies.

**Conveyance of raw water supplies to the water treatment plants or to member agency connections (negative value means hydro-electric generation by SDCWA).

*** Distribution of treated water from SDCWA's Twin Oaks Water Treatment Plant to SDCWA's member agencies.

"Upstream" refers to moving water from the original source to SDCWA's member agency's service area or first connection point

MWD 2016, SDCWA 2016, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2018

<u>Local Supply and Conveyance</u> – This is defined as supply and conveyance of local surface and groundwater within the water agency service area to water treatment plants, such as pumping water from local surface water reservoirs to nearby water treatment plants. Due to the way data is provided, the local supply and conveyance energy intensity is combined with local water treatment energy intensity.

<u>Local Potable Water Treatment</u> – This is the energy used for water treatment plant operations. The energy intensity depends on the source water quality, the treatment level, and capacity and efficiency of the associated WTP. The City of San Diego owns three WTPs: Alvarado, Miramar, and Otay WTP that treat raw water to potable levels. The WTPs treat both imported untreated SDCWA water and local water. Both Alvarado and Otay WTP have on-site behind-the-meter PV systems. The PV systems are connected to the raw water pump stations at Alvarado and Otay WTP that pump water to and from the WTPs to the nearby reservoirs. Because the water conveyance and treatment operations are connected, the local water conveyance and treatment energy intensity are combined and given in Table 14.

Combined Miramar, Otay and Alvarado WTPs	2019	2020	2021	2022	Description		
Water Treated (Acre-Feet)	152,586	153,389	No data	169,185	Total water treated at three WTPs		
Total Treatment + Conveyance Energy Use (kWh)	11,519,163	7,747,558	No data	15,297,562	Total electricity consumption including treatment plant operation, lake pump stations and electricity generated at Alvarado and Otay on-site PV systems		
Total Treatment + Conveyance Energy Intensity (kWh/Acre-Foot)	75	51	No data	90	Total Energy Intensity (total electricity divided by water treated)		
Solar Production (kWh)	2,272,785	2,172,498	No data	2,138,351	Annual electricity generated Alvarado and Otay on-site PV systems		
Net Treatment + Conveyance Energy Use (kWh)	9,255,955	9,279,866	No data	13,159,211	Net electricity purchase from the grid (SDG&E). Total electricity consumption minus solar production.		
Net Treatment + Conveyance Energy Intensity (kWh/Acre-Foot)	61	60	No data	78	Net Energy Intensity (net energy divided by water treated)		
City of San Diego 2024, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024							

Starting in March 2019, not all the solar generated at Otay Lake Pump Station (OLPS) is used solely by the pump station anymore. The excess solar generation goes to the grid and is shared with other Otay accounts. The solar generation share allocated to the OLPS was available for 2020 but not for 2021, therefore, the 2020 energy intensity was used as a proxy for 2021.

Local Potable Water Distribution – This is defined as the energy required to move treated water from water treatment plants to end-use customers. Distribution energy use includes energy use for water pump stations and/or pressure reduction stations, water storage tanks, etc. Local distribution energy intensity depends on the service area's geological conditions, such as the elevation the water is pumped to/from, the pump station's energy efficiency, and whether a pump station is offline for maintenance or repair, which would cause water to be pumped to other pressure zones and rerouted back. The City of San Diego's water service area has some areas with gravity-fed system (no energy needed) and some areas that need water pumping. The citywide water distribution energy intensity is given in Table 15.

Citywide Water Distribution	2019	2020	2021	2022	Description	
Total Water Moved (Acre-Feet)	168,014	173,787	174,952	179,695	Total City of San Diego water production from all water sources (including sales to other water agencies)	
Distribution Pump Stations Energy Use (kWh)	25,340,506	26,614,233	27,273,076	27,185,368	Electricity use at water pump stations excluding lake pump stations	
Water DistributionCitywide waterEnergy Intensity151153156151(kWh/Acre-Foot)intensityintensity						
The energy intensities are the citywide water distribution system energy intensities, do not represent the energy intensity of a specific area or pressure zone within the City. City of San Diego 2024, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024						

Table 15 Local Water Distribution Energy Intensity (San Diego, 2019–2022)

<u>Local Recycled Treatment and Distribution</u> – This is energy required to treat recycled water (tertiary treatment, in addition to conventional wastewater treatment) and deliver it to end-use customers. In the City, the recycled water is delivered to customers in purple pipes, separated from the potable water distribution system. The recycled water energy intensity from the City's 2015 UWMP voluntary reporting, 38 kWh/Acre-Foot, is used for all years.⁴⁵ The intensity includes energy use for tertiary treatment at WTPs and for recycled water distribution.

4.6.3 Total Emissions from Water

To convert the energy intensity of water to GHG emissions per unit of water, the electricity emission factor associated with the energy use is applied. For upstream energy use, a California-wide average emission factor from EPA eGRID is applied.⁴⁶ For local energy use, including potable water conveyance and treatment, distribution, and recycled water treatment and distribution, SDG&E's bundled electricity emission factor is applied for 2019 and 2020 because SDG&E was the electricity supplier. SDCP's default electricity emission factor is applied for 2021 and 2022 because the municipal accounts were switched to SDCP. The electricity emission factors are given in Table 16.

Year	Electricity Emission Factors for Water-Energy Intensities (lbs CO ₂ e/MWh)			
	Upstream (WECC-California from eGRID)	Local (SDG&E or SDCP)*		
2019	455	633 (SDG&E bundled)		
2020	515	636 (SDG&E bundled)		
2021	534	378 (SDCP)		

⁴⁵ City of San Diego, <u>2015 Urban Water Management Plan</u>, Table 10-4 Energy Intensity for Wastewater and Recycled Water.

⁴⁶ The Western Electricity Coordinating Council (WECC) CAMX (eGRID Subregion) emission rates from eGRID were used as representative of the average California electricity emission rate for upstream electricity. U.S. EPA. <u>eGRID2019</u>, released February 23, 2021; <u>eGRID2020</u>, re-released January 30, 2023; <u>eGRID2021</u>, released January 30, 2023; <u>eGRID2021</u>, released Feb 26, 2024.

2022	499	375 (SDCP)					
*SDG&E bundled	*SDG&E bundled emission factor is different from City-specific electricity emission						
factor, which is based on percentages of electricity sales to SDG&E bundled and DA							
customers, SDG&E and DA emission factors. SDCP							
EPA 2024, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024							

For upstream supply and conveyance emissions, the volume of water from SDCWA (treated and untreated) was multiplied by the upstream energy intensities (Table 13) and the upstream electricity emission factor (Table 16). Because the electricity use and GHG emissions associated with upstream supply and conveyance are outside the City boundary and would not be included in the electricity category, they are accounted for in the water category.

For local conveyance and treatment emissions, the volume of water treated at three WTPs and delivered within the City (excluding sales to other agencies) was multiplied by the net water treatment energy intensity (Table 14) and local grid electricity emission factor (Table 16). Because WTPs are located within San Diego, the electricity use associated with water treatment is included in the electricity category for San Diego. Therefore, electricity and GHG emissions associated with water treatment occur within the City boundary and have been subtracted from the electricity category, as they are accounted for in the water category.

For local water distribution emissions, total water within the City (excluding sales to other agencies) was multiplied by the water distribution energy intensity (Table 15) and local grid electricity emission factor (Table 16). Electricity and GHG emissions associated with water distribution occur within the City boundary and have been subtracted from the electricity category, as they are accounted for in the water category.

For recycled water treatment and distribution emissions, total recycled water supplied was multiplied by the recycled water energy intensity (38 kWh/Acre-Foot, Table 15) and local grid electricity emission factor (Table 16). Electricity and GHG emissions associated with recycled water treatment and distribution occur within the City boundary and have been subtracted from the electricity category, as they are accounted for in the water category.

The total potable and recycled water supplied and the corresponding GHG emissions from the water category in 2019 are given in Table 17.

Year	Potable Water Supplied (Acre-Feet)	Recycled Water Supplied (Acre-Feet)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)		
2019	161,472	7,999	61,000		
2020	166,742	8,842	70,000		
2021	161,995	8,586	70,000		
2022	179,695	10,012	74,000		
GHG emissions for each category are rounded to the nearest thousands. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation. Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024					

Table 17 Water Supplied and GHG Emissions from the Water Category (San Diego, 2019–202	221
Table 17 Water Supplied and Orio Emissions nom the Water Category (San Diego, 2015-202	-21

4.7 Wastewater

The emissions from wastewater generated by San Diego were estimated by multiplying the total amount of wastewater generated in 2019 and the emission factor of the wastewater treatment processes. Unlike the water category, in which the GHG emissions result from the energy used to move and treat water, wastewater-related GHG emissions include only "process, stationary and fugitive GHG emissions," as described in U.S Community Protocol "WW.1 – WW.14."⁴⁷

4.7.1 Wastewater Generation

Wastewater generated in the City of San Diego is conveyed to the City of San Diego Metropolitan Sewerage System (Metro System). The Metro System collects and treats wastewater from 12 partner agencies. Wastewater collected by the Metro System is treated at one of the three wastewater treatment plants (WWTPs): Point Loma WWTP, North City WRP, and South Bay WRP.⁴⁸

It is assumed the percentage of City of San Diego's wastewater treated at each WWTP is the same as that of the entire Metro System. The City's wastewater generation and the percentage treated at each WWTP are given in Table 18.

	% of Wastewat	er Treated a	t Each WWTP	Wastewater Flow to Metro System	
Year	Point Loma WWTP	South Bay WRP	North City WRP	Average Million Gallons per Day (MGD)	Million Gallons per Year
2019	86%	4%	10%	105	38,241
2020	86%	4%	10%	105	38,192
2021	87%	4%	9%	103	37,591
2022	88%	4%	8%	101	36,865
Sum may not add up to totals due to rounding. WWTP – wastewater treatment plant; WRP – water reclamation plant. City of San Diego 2024, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024					

Table 18 City of San Diego Wastewater Generation (San Diego, 2019–2022)

⁴⁷ ICLEI – Local Governments for Sustainability USA: U.S. Community Protocol for Accounting and Reporting of Greenhouse Gas

Emissions, Version 1.2 (2019), Appendix F: Wastewater and Water Emission Activities and Sources.

⁴⁸ City of San Diego, <u>2015 Urban Water Management Plan</u>, Section 3 Description of Existing Water System. Some of the North City WRP's flow (non-tertiary flow) is conveyed to Point Loma WWTP for discharge.

4.7.2 Wastewater Emission Factor

Point Loma WWTP and North City WRP both report plant operation GHG emissions to CARB under the Mandatory GHG Reporting Regulation (MRR) program.⁴⁹ The reported GHG emissions include three components: (1) direct CO₂ from combustion of anaerobic digester gas; (2) CH₄ and N₂O emissions from digester gas combustion; and (3) operational fossil fuel emissions assuming complete combustion. The direct CO₂ from combustion of anaerobic digester gas is considered biogenic, while the other two components of CO₂ emissions are considered non-biogenic emissions.

The wastewater treatment emission factor (MT CO₂e/million gallons) at Point Loma WWTP and North City WRP are calculated by dividing the reported GHG emissions by the plants' wastewater flows, as shown in Table 19.50

Point Loma WWTP			P	North City WRP			
Year	Annual Flow (million gallons)	GHG Emissions (MT CO₂e)	Wastewater Emission Factor (MT CO₂e/million gallon)	Annual Flow (million gallons)	GHG Emissions (MT CO2e)	Wastewater Emission Factor (MT CO ₂ e/million gallon)	
2019	52,571	15,955	0.30	5,905	17,733	3.0	
2020	52,122	17,403	0.33	5,858	13,503	2.3	
2021	51,556	17,289	0.34	5,074	13,503	2.7	
2022	53,546	15,072	0.28	4,873	3,815	0.8	
WWTP – wastewater treatment plant: WRP – water reclamation plant							

Table 19 Emission Factors at Wastewater Treatment Plant (San Diego, 2019–2022)

wastewater treatment plant; WRP – water reclamation plant.

On average 99% of the emissions from Point Loma WWTP and 98% of emissions from North City WRP are biogenic. City of San Diego 2022, Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024

4.7.3 Total Emissions from Wastewater

For the GHG emissions calculation, the wastewater emission factor derived from Point Loma WWTP was applied to the wastewater flow into Point Loma WWTP and the emission factor derived from North City WRP was applied to the flow into both North City WRP and South Bay WRP. The total wastewater flow, the citywide weighted average wastewater emission factors, as well as the corresponding GHG emissions are given in Table 20. In 2022, there was a sharp decrease in emissions associated with wastewater treatment. This is because the on-site generation facilities, power plants using landfill gas, at the North City Water Reclamation Plant were decommissioned that year.

⁴⁹ CARB: Mandatory GHG Reporting – Reported Emissions. 2020 and 2021 GHG emissions data, current as of November 4, 2022. CARB MRR uses 21 as the CH₄ GWP, therefore the CO₂e for CH₄ in this report is recalculated using 25 as the CH₄ GWP to be consistent with other categories in the inventory.

⁵⁰ Point Loma WWTP and North City WRP GHG Reports are from CARB Mandatory GHG Reporting. Wastewater flow into each facility was provided by City of San Diego to EPIC in November 2022.

Year	Total Wastewater Generated (Million Gallons/year)	Wastewater Emission Factor ¹ (MT CO ₂ e/ Million Gallon)	GHG Emissions (MT CO₂e)		
2019	38,241	0.67	26,000		
2020	38,192	0.60	23,000		
2021	37,591	0.63	24,000		
2022	38,865	0.34	13,000		
¹ Weighted average emission factor of wastewater treated at three wastewater treatment plants in City of San Diego.					

Table 20 Wastewater Generated and GHG Emissions from Wastewater Category (San Diego, 2019–2022)

GHG emissions for each category are rounded to the nearest thousand. Values are not rounded in the intermediary steps in the calculation.

Energy Policy Initiatives Center, University of San Diego 2024