# **City Auditor's Quarterly Fraud Hotline Report**

JANUARY 2025

Fiscal Year 2025

Quarter 2



Andy Hanau, City Auditor Matthew Helm, Assistant City Auditor Andy Horita, Senior Fraud Investigator Gina Rouza, Fraud Investigator



# About the Fraud Hotline:

The Office of the City Auditor administers the City's Fraud Hotline program. The primary objective of the Fraud Hotline is to provide a means for a City employee or resident to confidentially report any activity or conduct—related to or involving City personnel, resources, or operations—for which he or she suspects instances of fraud, waste, or abuse.

The City's Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline is operated pursuant to California Government Code §53087.6. The Statute defines fraud, waste, or abuse as "any activity by a local agency or employee that is undertaken in the performance of the employee's official duties, including activities deemed to be outside the scope of his or her employment, that is in violation of any local, state, or federal law or regulation relating to corruption, malfeasance, bribery, theft of government property, fraudulent claims, fraud, coercion, conversion, malicious prosecution, misuse of government property, or willful omission to perform duty, is economically wasteful, or involves gross misconduct."

The statute also requires that investigations conducted pursuant to its authority be confidential except to issue any report of an investigation that has been substantiated, or to release any findings resulting from a completed investigation that are deemed necessary to serve the interests of the public. In any event, the identity of the individual or individuals reporting the improper government activity, and the subject employee or employees, shall be kept confidential.

An independent third-party provider accepts Hotline allegations from City employees and the public at **(866) 809-3500** or online at <u>www.sandiego.gov/fraudhotline</u>. Fraud Hotline reporters can choose to remain anonymous, and all information provided via the Hotline will remain confidential.

City policy strongly encourages employees to report fraud, waste, or abuse, and prohibits employees from interfering with Fraud Hotline reporters through intimidation, threats, coercion, commands, or improper influence (Administrative Regulation 95.60).

The City's independent Ethics Commission may investigate allegations of interference with Fraud Hotline reporters, or retaliation by City officials (San Diego Municipal Code section <u>27.3573</u>). Retaliation complaints to the Ethics Commission may be filed online at <u>www.sandiego.gov/ethics/complaint</u>.



DATE: January 28, 2025

- TO: Honorable Members of the Audit Committee City of San Diego, California
- FROM: Andy Hanau, City Auditor
- SUBJECT: City Auditor's Quarterly Fraud Hotline Report Fiscal Year 2025 Quarter 2

# **Reports Received in the Second Quarter of Fiscal Year 2025**

During the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025 (October – December 2024), we received 58 Fraud Hotline reports. Of these reports, 7 were assigned to be investigated by the Office of the City Auditor and 16 were presented to the Intake and Review Committee to be referred to City departments for investigation and resolution. We also found that 35 reports were not in the purview of the Fraud Hotline and were closed. **Table 1** on the following page summarizes the types of reports received during Fiscal Year 2025.

#### Table 1:

# **Reports Received in Fiscal Year 2025**

City Auditor Investigations	Qtr 1	Qtr 2
Abuse	6	7
Fraud	0	0
Waste	0	0
Subtotal OCA Investigations	6	7
City Department Investigations		
Abuse	12	9
Accounting/Audit Irregularities	0	0
Customer Relations	0	0
Discrimination	0	0
Employee Relations	0	0
Fraud	0	0
Policy Issues	0	0
Safety and Sanitation	0	5
Substance Abuse	1	0
Theft of Goods/Services	0	0
Theft of Time	1	0
Waste	0	2
Subtotal Department Investigations	14	16
Total Reports Received in Purview of Fraud Hotline	20	23
Direct Referrals, Non-City Reports or	38	35
Reports Not in Purview of Fraud Hotline		
Total Reports Received in FY2025	58	58

Page 3 City Auditor's Quarterly Fraud Hotline Report – Fiscal Year 2025 Quarter 2 January 28, 2025

#### **Status of Hotline Reports**

**58** 

reports filed with the Fraud, Waste, and Abuse Hotline between October 1, 2024 and December 31, 2024

- 35 reports not in purview of OCA Fraud Hotline
- 23 new reports added to inventory in Q2 of FY2025:
  - 7 reports assigned to be investigated by OCA
  - 16 reports referred to City departments

In addition to the receipt of 23 new reports requiring investigation, 33 City-related reports remained open and unresolved at the end of the previous quarter, resulting in an active inventory of 56 reports during the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025.<sup>1</sup> **Table 2** below, summarizes the Fraud Hotline activity for the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025.

**56** active reports in OCA inventory during Q2 of FY2025

- 30 reports remain open and unresolved
- 26 reports closed in Q2 of FY2025:
  - 2 OCA reports closed as substantiated
  - OCA reports closed based on corrective actions taken by City Management
  - 7 OCA reports closed as unsubstantiated or resolved with no further action necessary
  - 2 Department-investigated reports closed as substantiated
  - 2 Department-investigated reports closed based on corrective actions taken by City Management
  - 13 Department-investigated reports closed as unsubstantiated or resolved with no further action necessary

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Two reports, 249250156937 and 222592096635, were previously listed as potential departmentreferred investigations. During the quarter, we determined that the allegations were outside the purview of the Fraud Hotline. Per our procedures, each report was referred to the appropriate agency for review and possible investigation and closed with no further action necessary.

#### Table 2:

# Status of Fraud Hotline Reports

Report Status:	City Auditor Investigations	Referred to Dept.	Total City- Related	Not in Hotline's Purview	Total
Unresolved on 10/1/24	8	25	33	2	35
Received in 2 <sup>nd</sup> Quarter	7	16	23	35	58
Subtotal – Active Inventory	15	41	56	37	93
Reports Closed Substantiated Corrective Action Unsubstantiated/Other	<b>-9</b> -2 -0 -7	- <b>17</b> -2 -2 -13	- <b>26</b> -4 -2 -20	- <b>37</b> -0 -0 -37	- <b>63</b> -4 -2 -57
Unresolved on 12/31/24	6	24	30	0	30

#### **City Auditor Investigations Summary**

**Table 3** summarizes the status of the 15 active City Auditor Fraud Hotline investigations during the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025, including the incident type, report number, date the report was received, a general description of the report, case status, and the final resolution date.

#### Table 3:

# Status of City Auditor Hotline Investigations

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Outc	ome				
1	determined to be	e substantiated. Th	e departmei	ht took corre	Substantiated as investigated and ective action to refur with additional train	
2	Abuse132174759491Received10/16/23Substantiated11/13/24An allegation regarding the mismanagement of permits issued by the City for the long- term storage of small boats on the sand at Mission Bay was investigated and determined to be substantiated. A public report was issued and is available on our website. We made 10 recommendations to improve the City's boat storage permit administration, facilities, fee recovery, and compliance operations. Management agreed with all 10 recommendations.					
3	•	528704199707 abuse of discretion e unsubstantiated.	Received by a City de	3/19/24 partment w	Unsubstantiated as investigated and	12/23/24
4	Policy Issues An allegation of a be unsubstantiat	, ,	Received City departm	6/10/24 ent was invo	Unsubstantiated estigated and detern	12/30/24 nined to
5	•	786489317532 abuse of discretion e unsubstantiated.	Received by City Man	7/10/24 agement wa	Unsubstantiated as investigated and	12/3/24

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Outc	ome				
6	Abuse	972480545138	Received	8/13/24	Unsubstantiated	10/25/24
	-	abuse of discretion determined to be		-	ovement district was	;
7	Abuse	497234416610	Received	8/17/24	Unsubstantiated	12/24/24
	An allegation of a to be unsubstant		by City emp	loyees was	investigated and det	ermined
8	Abuse	961922402104	Received	11/1/24	Unsubstantiated	12/24/24
	An allegation of a to be unsubstant		by City emp	loyees was	investigated and det	ermined
9	Abuse	165178220266	Received	10/7/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/30/24
		aud hotline and clo			determined to be or on necessary, and th	
10	Abuse	899097618750	Received	7/11/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	se of discretion by	the City.			
11	Abuse	391757789939	Received	7/19/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	se of discretion re	garding a lea	se violation		
12	Abuse	340211562137	Received	10/9/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	se of discretion by	a City busin	ess improve	ement district.	
13	Abuse	715307892194	Received	10/30/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	se of discretion by	City employ	ees.		
14	Abuse	902675377999	Received	10/31/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	se of discretion by	a City emplo	oyee.		
15	Abuse	955734991143	Received	11/12/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	se of discretion in	a City depart	tment.		

#### **City Department Investigations Summary**

The City Auditor, through the Intake and Review Committee, reviews the final resolution of reports investigated by the departments to ensure that the department has taken the proper actions to resolve the report. A report whose allegations cannot be substantiated can still result in the department taking corrective, proactive, or preventative measures to reinforce a policy or procedure, improve internal controls, or to improve City operations.

**Table 4** summarizes the status of the 41 active Fraud Hotline investigations conducted by the departments during the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025, including the incident type, a general description of the report, and the case status.

Table 4:

## **Status of Department-Investigated Fraud Hotline Reports**

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Out	come				
1	Safety and Sanitation	901878935993	Received	6/26/24	Substantiated	10/9/24
	-	he department took			gated and determin ction with respect to	
2	Abuse	591397931573	Received	8/20/24	Substantiated	10/23/24
	to be substantia	ted. The departmer	it took correc	tive action to	investigated and de prefund an overchar aining and supervisio	ge that
3	Safety and Sanitation	416411307772	Received	10/11/24	Corrective Action	11/6/24
	•	to remove the viola	2		stigated and resulted f the violation was se	
4	Safety and Sanitation	725698643299	Received	10/14/24	Corrective Action	11/20/24
	An allegation of unsafe driving by a City employee was investigated and could not be substantiated. However, the department took proactive corrective action by discussing the importance of driving safely with staff.					

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date	
	Allegation/Out	come					
5	Fraud	111612255554	Received	7/17/23	Unsubstantiated	10/24/24	
	0	workers' compensa e unsubstantiated.	tion fraud by	a City emplo	yee was investigated	d and	
6	Fraud	409631192465	Received	8/16/23	Unsubstantiated	10/10/24	
	•	workers' compensa e unsubstantiated.	tion fraud by	a City emplo	yee was investigated	d and	
7	Fraud	851850568455	Received	4/17/24	Unsubstantiated	10/24/24	
	An allegation of be unsubstantia		d to a City wa	ter bill was ir	nvestigated and dete	ermined to	
8	Theft of Time	495666341491	Received	5/10/24	Unsubstantiated	10/9/24	
	An allegation of unsubstantiated		y employee w	as investigat	ed and determined	to be	
9	Falsification of City Records	170712571440	Received	6/6/24	Unsubstantiated	10/24/24	
	An allegation of unsubstantiated		sifying timeca	rds was inve	stigated and determ	ined to be	
10	Substance Abuse	355750587129	Received	6/19/24	Unsubstantiated	11/7/24	
	An allegation of unsubstantiated		a City emplo	yee was inve	estigated and determ	nined to be	
11	Abuse	856592295594	Received	7/8/24	Unsubstantiated	10/23/24	
	0	abuse of discretion to be unsubstantia	, ,	ent in a City	department was inv	estigated	
12	Theft of Time	610054967076	Received	8/26/24	Unsubstantiated	11/7/24	
	•	An allegation of theft of time by a City employee was investigated and determined to be unsubstantiated.					

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Out	come				
13	Abuse	548900062425	Received	9/3/24	Unsubstantiated	10/10/24
	•	building permit abı e unsubstantiated.	-	City contract	or was investigated a	and
14	Abuse	481901934075	Received	9/25/24	Unsubstantiated	11/7/24
	An allegation of be unsubstantia		n by a City emp	oloyee was i	nvestigated and dete	rmined to
15	Abuse	189249422951	Received	10/8/24	Unsubstantiated	10/24/24
	•	abuse of discretion to be unsubstantia		ime by a Cit	y employee was inve	stigated
16	Abuse	554114504781	Received	11/3/24	Unsubstantiated	12/5/24
	to be unsubstan	tiated.			s investigated and de	
17	Waste	813187794753	Received	11/7/24	Unsubstantiated	12/5/24
	An allegation of unsubstantiated		artment was i	nvestigated	and determined to b	e
18	Abuse	543747035655	Received	11/21/23	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of tim	ecard abuse.				
19	Safety and Sanitation	476507025730	Received	1/7/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of a s	ecurity issue at a Ci	ity departmen	t.		
20	Abuse	605515381918	Received	3/27/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of time by a Cit	y employee.			
21	Abuse	695721608191	Received	5/3/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of ove	ertime abuse by Cit	y employees.			
22	Abuse	655853543918	Received	5/5/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City employ	/ee.		

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Out	come				
23	Customer Relations	428287226450	Received	6/24/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of a c	ustomer service iss	ue in a City de	epartment.		
24	Abuse	338792296489	Received	6/24/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of FMLA leave b	y a City emplo	oyee.		
25	Abuse	306896642493	Received	7/18/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	management	t in a City de	partment.	
26	Abuse	990380336765	Received	7/31/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City depart	ment.		
27	Abuse	540295351020	Received	8/9/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion reg	garding unfair	r promotion:	s by a City departme	nt.
28	Abuse	705430512684	Received	8/29/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City depart	ment.		
29	Abuse	400165232040	Received	9/9/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	City Manager	nent.		
30	Abuse	831294730393	Received	9/13/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City employ	/ee.		
31	Abuse	395440003949	Received	10/23/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City employ	/ee.		
32	Abuse	619537297238	Received	10/24/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of industrial lea	ve by a City e	mployee.		
33	Abuse	860856106238	Received	11/2/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City depart	ment.		

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Out	come				
34	Safety and Sanitation	306401100193	Received	11/6/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of a s	anitation issue in a	City departme	ent.		
35	Safety and Sanitation	308700256709	Received	11/18/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of uns	safe driving by a City	y employee.			
36	Waste	128336911762	Received	11/19/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of wa	ste in a City departr	nent.			
37	Abuse	715757412388	Received	11/25/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of an	unlicensed busines	s in San Diego	).		
38	Abuse	163180960396	Received	12/3/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	a City depart	ment.		
39	Abuse	648969203465	Received	12/5/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion reg	garding a City	employee's	workers compensati	ion claim.
40	Safety and Sanitation	777658275916	Received	12/5/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of a s	afety issue in a City	department.			
41	Abuse	271578215872	Received	12/20/24	Open/Unresolved	
	Allegation of abu	use of discretion by	department i	managemen	t.	

#### Not in Purview Reports Summary

**Table 5** summarizes the results of the 37 Fraud Hotline reports that were received during the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025, or previously, but were determined to be not within the purview of the Fraud Hotline and were closed.

#### Table 5:

## Status of Not in Purview Fraud Hotline Reports

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date		
	Allegation/Out	come						
1	Abuse	249250156937	Received	8/9/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/22/24		
	An allegation of abuse of discretion in a City department was reviewed and determined to be outside the purview of the City's Fraud Hotline. The case was referred to the appropriate agency for review and possible investigation.							
2	Abuse	222592096635	Received	8/19/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/22/24		
	outside the purv		ud Hotline. T		eviewed and determi referred to the appro			
3	Fraud	626972612291	Received	10/1/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/1/24		
	A partial report v	was abandoned.						
4	Fraud	467213381320	Received	10/6/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/7/24		
	-			-	the City of San Diego and the case was cl			
5	Safety and Sanitation	957818555077	Received	10/7/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/9/24		
	committee and c	SanitationNecessaryAn allegation of a sanitation issue was reviewed by the Fraud Hotline Intake and Reviewcommittee and determined to be outside the purview of the Fraud Hotline because the Cityhas already taken corrective action to address the concern.						

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date
	Allegation/Out	come				
6	Miscellaneous	765566493319	Received	10/9/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/9/24
	A partial report v	was abandoned.				
7	Miscellaneous	149581660810	Received	10/15/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/15/24
					e City of San Diego. T he case was closed.	he Fraud
8	Safety and Sanitation	270617095127	Received	10/15/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/15/24
	-	ase was referred to		-	ot in the purview of t lent agency for revie	-
9	Abuse	530862244437	Received	10/19/24	no Further Action Necessary	12/4/24
	-	tional information v		-	l details. No respons s. Per our procedure	
10	Abuse	511465920309	Received	10/21/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/23/24
	be outside the p		Fraud Hotline	e. The Fraud	reviewed and deter Hotline reporter was	
11	Miscellaneous	106535192949	Received	10/21/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/21/24
	A partial report v	was abandoned.			,	
12	Miscellaneous	343892931417	Received	10/23/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/24/24
				-	Fraud Hotline. The F he case was closed.	raud

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date		
	Allegation/Out	come						
13	Miscellaneous	311214273574	Received	10/27/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/27/24		
	A partial report	was abandoned.	·	I				
14	Abuse	812934118380	Received	10/31/24	No Further Action Necessary	10/31/24		
	be outside the p		Fraud Hotline	e. The Fraud	s reviewed and deter Hotline reporter was			
15	Fraud	561586320919	Received	11/2/24	No Further Action Necessary	11/4/24		
	-	ine. The Fraud Hotl			o be outside the pur of the appropriate ag			
16	Abuse	625039891017	Received	11/5/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/5/24		
	from the reporte		our request fo	or additional	information was req information was reco			
17	Miscellaneous	426799778585	Received	11/11/24	No Further Action Necessary	11/11/24		
	A partial report	was abandoned.			, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,			
18	Miscellaneous	497344733979	Received	11/12/24	No Further Action Necessary	11/12/24		
	A partial report	was abandoned.			,			
19	Fraud	734023981626	Received	11/16/24	No Further Action Necessary	11/18/24		
	determined to b	An allegation of workers compensation fraud in a private business was reviewed and determined to be outside the purview of the City's Fraud Hotline. The Fraud Hotline reporter was notified of the appropriate agency and the case was closed.						

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date		
	Allegation/Outcome							
20	Miscellaneous	171722291559	Received	11/19/24	No Further Action Necessary	11/19/24		
	A question regarding a City project was referred to the appropriate resource.							
21	Abuse	144049438632	Received	11/27/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/2/24		
	Duplicate of 902675377999							
22	Fraud	894602334945	Received	11/27/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/2/24		
	An allegation of fraud by a non-City agency was reviewed and determined to be outside the purview of the City's Fraud Hotline. The Fraud Hotline reporter was notified and the case was closed.							
23	Miscellaneous	426904460123	Received	12/3/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/3/24		
	A partial report was abandoned.							
24	Abuse	197391041056	Received	12/11/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/11/24		
	An allegation of abuse by a non-City agency was reviewed and determined to be outside the purview of the City's Fraud Hotline. The Fraud Hotline reporter was notified and the case was closed.							
25	Miscellaneous	898440215402	Received	12/11/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/11/24		
	A partial report was abandoned.							
26	Miscellaneous	349142809560	Received	12/12/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/12/24		
	A partial report	A partial report was abandoned.						
27	Abuse	217321565481	Received	12/12/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/16/24		
	Duplicate of 251042115312							

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date		
	Allegation/Outcome							
28	Fraud	542286883216	Received	12/13/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/16/24		
	An allegation of a non-City issue was reviewed and determined to be outside the purview of the City's Fraud Hotline. The Fraud Hotline reporter was notified of the appropriate agency and the case was closed.							
29	Miscellaneous	960048903200	Received	12/13/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/13/24		
	A partial report was abandoned.							
30	Miscellaneous	369345962176	Received	12/18/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/19/24		
	A non-City issue was reported and reviewed. Per our procedures, the report was closed with no further action necessary.							
31	Miscellaneous	116252819997	Received	12/18/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/18/24		
	A partial report was abandoned.							
32	Fraud	442885032613	Received	12/23/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/23/24		
	A non-City issue was reported and reviewed. Per our procedures, the report was closed with no further action necessary.							
33	Miscellaneous	836531711156	Received	12/23/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/23/24		
	A partial report was abandoned.							
34	Miscellaneous	721159389413	Received	12/24/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/24/24		
	A non-City issue was reported and reviewed. Per our procedures, the report was closed with no further action necessary.							

No.	Incident Type	Report #	Received	Date	Status/Outcome	Date		
	Allegation/Outcome							
35	Fraud	639238156246	Received	12/26/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/30/24		
	An allegation of a non-City issue was not in the purview of the City of San Diego. The Fraud Hotline reporter was notified of the appropriate agency and the case was closed.							
36	Miscellaneous	398004985906	Received	12/27/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/30/24		
	A partial report was abandoned.							
37	Abuse	175254342839	Received	12/28/24	No Further Action Necessary	12/30/24		
	A non-City issue was reported and reviewed. Per our procedures, the report was closed with no further action necessary.							

Page 18 City Auditor's Quarterly Fraud Hotline Report – Fiscal Year 2025 Quarter 2 January 28, 2025

#### Conclusion

The Office of the City Auditor is dedicated to ensuring that all reported claims of fraud, waste, and abuse related to City operations are investigated and properly resolved.

As of the second quarter of Fiscal Year 2025, we applied approximately 1,824 hours administering the Fraud Hotline, coordinating Intake and Review Committee activities, and investigating Fraud Hotline reports. A total of 2,960 hours was budgeted for the year.

I will be prepared to discuss this report at the next available Audit Committee meeting.

Respectfully submitted,

Andy Hanau City Auditor

cc: Honorable Mayor Todd Gloria Honorable Members of the City Council Honorable Heather Ferbert, City Attorney Eric Dargan, Chief Operating Officer Charles Modica, Independent Budget Analyst