

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 10, 2025 REPORT NO. HRB-25-018

HEARING DATE: April 24, 2025

SUBJECT: ITEM #5 - Albert and Alice Roberts House

RESOURCE INFO: <u>California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link</u>

APPLICANT: Robert & Lisa Maye; represented by Scott Moomjian

LOCATION: 4353 Trias Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

APN 443-061-7200

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Albert and Alice Roberts House located at

4353 Trias Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Albert and Alice Roberts House located at 4353 Trias Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style with Mediterranean Revival influences and retains integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical front elevation, a combination of parapeted flat and medium-pitched side-gabled roofs with mission barrel tile and shallow eaves, stucco cladding, a central courtyard, recessed arched wood windows, a stucco chimney, and wrought iron ornamentation.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was identified in the <u>2016 University Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey</u> and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Albert and Alice Roberts House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Albert and Alice Roberts, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u> provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property located at 4353 Trias Street is a one-story with basement, single-family building constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Eclectic style with Mediterranean Revival influence. The property is located on a corner lot in the Mission Hills neighborhood of the Uptown Community Planning Area. The surrounding area contains single family residences in different architectural styles. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1925, the property has been modified as follows: On the north elevation a wood casement window was replaced with a metal sliding window in its original opening and a wood door was replaced with a wood door with jalousie windows in its original opening. Modifications to the south elevation include the removal of two wood windows above the garage, one of which was infilled and the other was expanded and replaced with four recessed wood casement windows with diamond panes. The original wood garage door was replaced with a modern garage door. All modifications have occurred at unknown dates.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story with basement, single-family home constructed in 1925 in the Spanish Eclectic style with Mediterranean Revival influences. It features an asymmetric front elevation, a

combination of flat and medium-pitched side-gabled roofs with mission barrel tile and shallow eaves, decorative undulating stucco, and an attached garage. Fenestration primarily consists of multi-lite wood casement windows. The entryway is located slightly off-center in a vertical, flat roof section that protrudes outward from the side-gabled section of the building. It is deeply recessed and features a shouldered arch with stucco ornamentation, an iron gate, and an arched wood front door with a security window and metal grille. The entryway is accessed by brick steps with metal railings.

The north half of the front elevation is the tallest section of the building. It features a flat roof, a wing wall with a metal gate leading to the north elevation, three wood casement windows with a 10-lite pattern, decorative attic vents, and ornamented stucco detailing. The southern half of the elevation features a side gable roof with mission barrel tile, recessed arched wood windows with an arched sidelite pattern and ornamented stucco detailing, and a small casement window in a six-lite pattern with a two-lite transom and a wrought iron grille.

The residence also features a central courtyard on the south elevation with French doors, casement and fixed wood windows, decorative attic vents, and ornamented stucco detailing.

A site wall extends along the south elevation of the property on Hickory Street and encloses the property. It is clad in a matching stucco to the home and connects to an arched wing wall and the property's garage. The south elevation also features four recessed wood casement windows with diamond panes and a stucco-clad chimney.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Originating in California in the first two decades of the twentieth century with the Mission and Spanish revival styles, the Mediterranean style expresses California's Hispanic heritage using stucco exterior, red tile roofs, enclosed courtyards, arcades, and an emphasis on handicrafts through the use of ornate ceramic tile, rough finished wood, and wrought iron and ornate brass fixtures.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of Spanish Eclectic style with Mediterranean Revival influences. The modifications, which include the replacement of a wood casement window with a metal sliding window and a wood door on the north elevation in the original openings, the removal of the original garage door and replacement with a modern garage door, and the removal of two wood windows and alteration of the openings on the south elevation, do not impact significant character defining features, the property's integrity of design, materials and workmanship, or its ability to convey

significance under Criterion C. The property retains integrity to its 1925 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style with Mediterranean Revival influences by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical front elevation, a combination of parapeted flat and medium-pitched side gabled roofs with mission barrel tile and shallow eaves, stucco cladding, a central courtyard, recessed arched wood windows, a stucco chimney, and wrought iron ornamentation. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Albert and Alice Roberts House located at 4353 Trias Street be designated with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C an example of the Spanish Eclectic architectural style with Mediterranean Revival influences.

Audrey Rains

Assistant Planner

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison City Planning Department

AR/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on , to consider the historical designation of the **ALBERT AND ALICE ROBERTS HOUSE** (owned by Robert J and Lisa H Maye, 86 Old Beach Road, Rye, NH, CA 3870) located at **4353 Trias Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **443-061-7200**, further described as LOT O in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the ALBERT AND ALICE ROBERTS HOUSE on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style with Mediterranean Revival influences and retains integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical front elevation, a combination of parapeted flat and medium-pitched side gabled roofs with mission barrel tile and shallow eaves, stucco cladding, a central courtyard, recessed arched wood windows, a stucco chimney, and wrought iron ornamentation. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	
	BY:
	TIM HUTTER, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: HEATHER FERBERT,	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	Deputy City Attorney