

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 8, 2025 REPORT NO. HRB-25-023

HEARING DATE: May 22, 2025

SUBJECT: ITEM #6 - Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich House

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Shoemaker 2004 Family Trust 06-18-04; represented by IS Architecture

LOCATION: 6714 Muirlands Drive, La Jolla Community, Council District 1

APN 352-353-05-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich

House located at 6714 Muirlands Drive as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich House located at 6714 Muirlands Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1984 additions constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character
 defining features of the Tudor Revival style and retains integrity from its 1933 period of
 significance. Specifically, the resource features high-pitched cross-gabled roofs, gabled wall
 dormers, cantilevering second-story, stucco and wood siding, half timbering details, a round
 turret, porte cochere accentuated with Tudor arch details, brick chimneys, and tall narrow
 divided-lite wood windows in groups.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Edgar Ullrich and retains integrity as it relates to its 1933 period of significance. Specifically, the house is significant for its custom high-style Tudor Revival design, as one of many large, luxury residences designed during Ullrich's early career in La Jolla. The residence exhibits a variety of architectural features, such as a sprawling floor plan, multiple bay windows, bands of divided-lite windows, and restrained use of half-timbering, all of which are associated with Ullrich's historically significant residential design. Prominent features such as a corner turret and porte cochere further underscores the property's high style.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Wilber P. Larrabee and Dorothy J. Larrabee, who constructed the house as their personal residence, and the name of Edgar V. Ullrich, a Master Architect.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u> provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property at 6714 Muirlands Drive is a two-story Tudor Revival style single-family residence with an attic constructed in 1933 in the La Jolla Community Planning Area. Other structures present on site include a rear yard pool, pool deck, and built-in BBQ. The property is located in the Muirlands tract among similarly scaled residences. It is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1933, the property has been modified as follows: pre-1984 replacement of the front (east) elevation staircase window with a larger stained-glass window; pre-1984 modification of the rooftop vent stack cap; 1984 construction of the rear yard pool and spa; 1984 addition and remodel project which added three dormers to the rear elevation, converted the attic to dwelling space, added a gable-end window atop the garage at the south elevation, constructed a northwest corner two-story addition, added a second floor door next to the turret, enclosed the rear (west) elevation ground floor patio, converted a rear elevation window set to doors, and rebuilt the south elevation exterior stairs; 2020 construction of a pool deck and built-in BBQ; and a 2022 gutter replacement. In 2022, Heritage Preservation staff reviewed and approved a permit for a roof replacement with synthetic shakes, matching closely to the original design, as consistent with the

Secretary of the Interior's Standards. In 2025, the owners applied for a pool deck permit to legalize the 2020 pool deck work.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a two-story, single-family residence with an attic constructed in 1933 in the Tudor Revival style. The property is L-shaped, featuring a two-story attached wing with a porte cochere and a garage. The roof is high-pitched, cross-gabled, and features slightly projecting eaves. Gable ends are accentuated with rusticated horizontal wood siding. Most of the building is clad in stucco, with vertical wood siding accents at portions of the second floor exterior. Windows are typically tall, narrow, wood divided-lite casements. Some windows are recessed, and others have decorative lintels above the openings. Doors are typically divided-lite French doors, except for the front door, which is wooden with a stained-glass lite.

The east elevation contains the primary facade, consisting of three gable wall dormers, a slightly cantilevering second floor with bracket details, a bay window, a recessed window set with quoined window surround, and a prominent corner turret. The turret is further accentuated with a cupola, dovecote, and a curved base. The south elevation features an oriel window and an original brick chimney. The north elevation contains the 1984 addition with multiple roofs. The west, rear, elevation features three gabled dormers, ribbon sets of casement windows, a second floor balcony with wood columns, brackets, and railing. The ground level contains the enclosed patio, a ribbon set of doors, and a bay window.

The two-story attached wing projects from the east facade. This wing contains a set of south-facing wooden stairs leading to two doors. Its south elevation also features half-timbering details. Its north elevation contains two original tilt-up garage doors and an original boxed-window feature. Its east elevation mimics the design of the primary elevation, with a wall gable dormer and a cantilevering detail supported by brackets. The porte cochere is located next to the garage. It is accentuated with Tudor arch detailing.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on various late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character-defining features include decorative half-timbering, tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with multipane glazing, massive chimneys, sometimes with decorative chimney pots, entry porches with round or Tudor arches, and gable dormers. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and stone veneers of their English prototypes. Tudor Revival style houses usually include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Tudor Revival style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, has not been modified to the extent that it is no longer able to convey its historic significance as a Tudor Revival style residence. The resource retains a majority of original character-defining features, such as steeply pitched roofs, gable dormers, stucco and wood siding, ribbon sets of divided-lite windows and doors, and a turret. The 1984 addition is positioned at a secondary façade and did not remove significant architectural features. The enclosure of the ground floor patio is limited to the rear façade, which is minimally visible; it also retained the original wooden porch posts. Site modifications, including the pool, deck, and BBQ, do not significantly impact the architectural features of the residence. Highly visible modifications such as the addition of a French door on the south elevation of the one-story wing and the replacement of the front elevation stairway window are more impactful modifications, but they do not impair the integrity to the point that the property no longer embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Tudor Revival style. Therefore, the property retains its integrity to the 1933 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Tudor Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style. Specifically, the resource features high-pitched cross-gabled roofs, gabled wall dormers, a cantilevering second-story, stucco and wood siding, half-timbering details, a round turret, a porte cochere accentuated with Tudor arch details, brick chimneys, and tall narrow divided-lite wood windows in groups. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Edgar Vaughn Ullrich was born in Colorado Springs, Colorado, in 1893 and attended Colorado College. By 1923, he was a practicing architect. He relocated to San Diego in 1924 to take a commission from Isabel Hopkins to design the Casa de Manana resort hotel (HRB #213), which won an AIA award.

After this project, Ullrich became the tract architect for the La Jolla Hermosa subdivision, designing its earliest houses, landscaping much of the tract, and reviewing proposed house designs. He ultimately designed more than 15 houses in the tract. His style for this subdivision emphasized color coordination, random tile roofing with noticeable mortar, distinctive chimneys, window grilles, and wood shutters with pegs.

Ullrich primarily worked in the Spanish Eclectic and Monterey styles, but also used the Tudor Revival and French Norman styles. Over the course of his career, Ullrich designed more than 25 major buildings in La Jolla, including public buildings, churches and academic buildings. He also designed buildings for the University of San Diego, such as the Immaculate Heart Seminary and More Hall. Ullrich was established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect in 1987 with the designation of the Casa de Manana. Since that time, 13 of Ullrich's buildings have been designated by the HRB.

HRB #212 - Casa de Manana - Casa Madre (849 Coast Boulevard), 1924

HRB #213 - Casa de Manana (722, 809 & 825 Coast Boulevard), 1924 (809 & 825 demolished)

HRB #226 - Morgan-Larkins-Marrone Residence (7148-7150 Monte Vista Avenue), 1935

HRB #693 - George and Ruth Glendon/Edgar Ullrich House (1006 Muirlands Drive), 1928

HRB #740 - Edgar Ullrich House (1745 Kearsarge Road), 1925

HRB #827 - Harold and Charlotte Muir House (1205 Muirlands Drive), 1928

HRB #882 - James J. Podesta House (6123 Avenida Cresta), 1927

HRB #956 - Edward and Eleanor Mastin House (1891 Viking Way), 1930

HRB #965 - Norman Kennedy House (716 La Canada Street), 1928

HRB #1140 - George and Virginia Hayes/Edgar Ullrich House (5905 Camino De La Costa), 1934

HRB #1170 - William and Wilma Garth/Edgar Ullrich House (1825 Castellana Road), 1928

HRB #1440 - Edgar V. Ullrich House #2 (6001 Bellevue Street), 1928

HRB #1544 - Edgar and Hazel Ullrich House (7231 Monte Vista Avenue), 1925

Besides the Spanish Colonial Revival style, Ullrich often designed in the Tudor Revival style and the level of detail demonstrated in the design of the subject property; including a sprawling floor plan, bay and oriel windows, bands of divided-lite windows, Tudor arch motifs, restrained use of half timbering, and bracket details; The subject resource is on par with his other high style Tudor Revival designs such as 7231 Monte Vista Avenue (HRB #1544). The property is significant within Ullrich's overall body of work for the quality of its Tudor Revival design generally associated with Ullrich.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion D as a resource that represents the notable work of Master Architect Edgar Ullrich. The property, which has been modified as detailed at the beginning of the analysis section of this report, continues to retain integrity as it relates to its significance under Criterion D. Site modification of the pool, deck, and BBQ does not impact the architectural features of the residence. The 1984 remodel and addition are compatible with Ullrich's original design and do not significantly impact any of the character-defining features of the building. The 1984 two-story addition is located at a minimally visible, secondary elevation; its construction did not impact prominent architectural features, removing only a small shed roof projection. Original custom design features attributed to Ullrich, such as a prominent turret, port cochere, and multiple bay windows, oriel windows, boxed window, and inset window with quoined surround, are intact. New dormers are readily distinguished from original Ullrich gabled wall dormers due to their differentiated design. Original chimneys remain. The enclosed west elevation ground floor patio retains its original wood post and bracket details, and the space can be readily interpreted as a former patio. Highly visible modifications such as the addition of a French door on the south elevation of the one-story wing and the replacement of the front elevation stairway window are more significant modifications, but the majority of original architectural features remain. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1933 period of significance under HRB Criterion D.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource retains good integrity and continues to reflect Ullrich's original 1933 design, intent, and aesthetic. The house is significant for its custom high-style Tudor Revival design, as one of many large, luxury residences designed during his early career in La Jolla. The residence exhibits a variety of architectural features, such as a sprawling floor plan, multiple bay windows, bands of divided-lite windows, and restrained use of half-timbering, all of which are associated with Ullrich's historically significant residential design. Prominent features such as a

corner turret and porte cochere further underscore the property's high style. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich House located at 6714 Muirlands Drive be designated as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1984 additions.

Alvin Lin

Associate Planner

City Planning Department

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/HRB Liaison City Planning Department

AL/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/22/2025, to consider the historical designation of the **Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich House** (owned by Shoemaker 2004 Family Trust 06-18-04, 6714 Muirlands Drive, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **6714 Muirlands Drive**, **San Diego**, **CA 92037**, APN: **352-353-0500**, further described as BLK 17 LOT 5 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Wilber and Dorothy Larrabee/Edgar Ullrich House on the following findings:

- (1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Tudor Revival style and retains integrity from its 1933 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features high-pitched cross-gabled roofs, gabled wall dormers, cantilevering second-story, stucco and wood siding, half timbering details, a round turret, porte cochere accentuated with Tudor arch details, brick chimneys, and tall narrow divided-lite wood windows in groups. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.
- (2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect Edgar Ullrich and retains integrity as it relates to the 1933 period of significance. Specifically, the house is significant for its custom high-style Tudor Revival design, as one of many large, luxury residences designed during Ullrich's early career in La Jolla. The residence exhibits a variety of architectural features, such as a sprawling floor plan, multiple bay windows, bands of divided-lite windows, and restrained use of half-timbering, all of which are associated with Ullrich's historically significant residential design. Prominent features such as a corner turret and porte cochere further underscores the property's high style. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1984 additions constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	
	BY:
	KRISTI BYERS, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: HEATHER FERBERT,	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	Deputy City Attorney