

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: August 14, 2025 REPORT NO. HRB-25-036

HEARING DATE: August 28, 2025

SUBJECT: ITEM #3 - ELMO AND ANGELINE CRABTREE SPEC HOUSE #2

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Justin and Lauren Wallace

LOCATION: 1625 Robinson Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3

APN 452-213-04-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Elmo and Angeline Crabtree Spec House #2

House located at 1625 Robinson Avenue as a historical resource.

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Designate the Elmo and Angeline Crabtree Spec House #2 House located at 1625 Robinson Avenue as a historical Resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 1957 rear bedroom addition and east elevation laundry room additions constructed outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched roof, wide unenclosed eaves, exposed rafter tails, extended beams, double front-facing gables, a partial-width front porch, decorative cross-braced beams, square wood columns and piers, wood shingle siding, one-over-one single-hung wood windows with extended sills, and a stucco chimney.

#### **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was identified in the <u>2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey</u> and given a status code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Elmo and Angeline Crabtree Spec House #2 has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Elmo and Angeline Crabtree, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u> provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

#### **ANALYSIS**

The property located at 1625 Robinson Avenue is a one-story, Craftsman style single-family residential building constructed in 1913 in the Uptown Community Planning Area. It is located on a canyon lot on the south side of Robinson Avenue in a residentially zoned neighborhood. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1913, the property has been modified as follows: in 1957, two bedrooms were constructed on the rear elevation and a laundry room on the east elevation, resulting in a total of 297 sq ft added. In 2011, three-foot retaining walls were added at the rear elevation and c. 2018, an additional step, wood trim and brick tile were added to the front porch. Since 2022, solar panels were installed on the roof, and a deck was added to the rear elevation.

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Lauren Wallace, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1913 in the Craftsman style. It features double front-facing gables and partial-width front porch supported by two square wood columns. The roof is low pitched and features wide unenclosed eaves, exposed rafter tails, decorative vertical slat attic vents, and extended wood beams. The resource is primarily clad in wood shingle siding and features stucco and wood siding on the additions. Fenestration consists primarily of single-hung wood windows in singles and different groupings.

The property's primary elevation faces north on Robinson Avenue. The front porch is located on the east side of the front elevation and features decorative cross-braced beams, exposed rafters, a glass door with nine panels, and a one-over one single-hung wood window with an extended sill. A pair of one-over one single-hung wood windows with extended sills is located to the west of the porch. Other features include a stucco chimney on the west elevation.

The laundry room addition is located on the east elevation under an extended portion of the roof and is clad in stucco. The rear elevation features two bedrooms clad in horizontal wood siding and a new wood deck.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The modifications, which include the addition of two bedrooms on the rear elevation, a laundry room on the east elevation, retaining walls on the rear elevation, solar panels to the roof, and a deck on the rear elevation do not impact significant character defining features, the property's integrity of design, materials and workmanship, or its ability to convey significance under Criterion C. Modifications were made to the porch, including the addition of a step, wood trim and brick tile, but these do not significantly impair the resource's ability to convey significance under Criterion C. Therefore, the property retains integrity to its 1913 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style, including a low-pitched roof, wide unenclosed eaves, exposed rafter tails, extended beams, double front-facing gables, a partial-width front porch, decorative cross-braced beams, square wood columns, wood shingle siding, one-over-one single-hung wood windows with extended sills, and a stucco chimney. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

## **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

#### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Elmo and Angeline Crabtree Spec House #2 located at 1625 Robinson Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the 1957 rear bedroom and east elevation laundry room additions constructed outside the period of significance.

Audrey Rains Assistant Planner Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison City Planning Department

AR/sa/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on , to consider the historical designation of the **ELMO AND ANGELINE CRABTREE SPEC HOUSE #2** (owned by Justin & Lauren Wallace, 1625 Robinson Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1625 Robinson Avenue**, **San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-213-0400**, further described as BLK 241 LOT 39 LOT 38 & E 16FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as  $\bf Site$   $\bf No. 0$ , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the ELMO AND ANGELINE CRABTREE SPEC HOUSE #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains integrity to its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched roof, wide unenclosed eaves, exposed rafter tails, extended beams, double front-facing gables, a partial-width front porch, decorative cross-braced beams, square wood columns and piers, wood shingle siding, one-over-one single-hung wood windows with extended sills, and a stucco chimney. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 1957 rear bedroom addition and east elevation laundry room additions constructed outside of the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	BY:
	KRISTI BYERS, Chair Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: HEATHER FERBERT,	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	Deputy City Attorney