

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 10, 2025 REPORT NO. HRB-25-046

HEARING DATE: September 25, 2025

SUBJECT: ITEM #8- GEORGE CARTER SPEC HOUSE #1

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Krista L Stellmacher Trust 12-05-18 represented by Ginger Weatherford

LOCATION: 3556-3560 32<sup>nd</sup> Street, North Park Community, Council District 3

APN 453-431-20-000

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the George Carter Spec House #1 at 3560 32<sup>nd</sup>

Street as a historical resource.

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the George Carter Spec House #1 located at 3560 32<sup>nd</sup> Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the accessory dwelling unit built outside the period of significance, and the garage, which was substantially altered outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding, varied roof forms with tile roofing and little eave overhang, stucco chimney, arched porch wall design, and fenestration consisting mainly of wood windows in various lite patterns and operations.

# **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was located within the boundary of the <u>2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey</u>, but was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the George Carter Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of builder George Carter who constructed the house as a speculation house.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u> provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

#### **ANALYSIS**

The property located at 3560 32<sup>nd</sup> Street is a single-story, Spanish Eclectic style, single-family residential building constructed in 1927 in the North Park Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on site include a 592-square foot accessory dwelling unit, addressed as 3556 32<sup>nd</sup> street, located to the rear of the lot, with access from the backyard and alley. A two-car tandem garage is also present on the southwest corner of the property. The property is located on the west side of 32<sup>nd</sup> Street generally northeast of Balboa Park in the North Park community. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1927 the property has been modified as follows: in 1953, an accessory dwelling unit was permitted and constructed in the northwest corner of the property. Based on aerial imagery and Sanborn maps, the garage was expanded west prior to 1953. Both garage doors have been replaced with steel paneled doors at an unknown date. On the main dwelling, the chimney was capped with a metal spark arrestor between 2004-2008. A vertical wood gate and fence were added across the driveway and front yard between 2009-2011. The top half of the chimney was removed between 2011-2014. Between 2015-2016, an opening was created on the north corner of the half wall on the front porch, and two steps were added in front of the opening. A curved flagstone path from the sidewalk to the new steps was created. A bathroom window on the north façade was replaced with a horizontal vinyl sliding window in a smaller opening prior to 2016. In 2023, a combination building permit was issued for restoration work of the resource. The project permitted a non-operational chimney, removal of existing porch stairs, addition of a new porch wall, and new stucco. The project was determined to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards by Heritage Preservation staff and restored the front façade and chimney to their original design. Solar panels were permitted in 2023 and are not visible from the street.

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Ginger Weatherford, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The property was constructed in the Spanish Eclectic architectural style in 1927 and features an asymmetrical façade, medium sand stucco, a combination flat and shed roof with mission barrel tiles, and a mixture of double-hung and tripartite wood windows.

The main, east, façade faces 32nd Street and is defined by a recessed front porch with stucco piers, curved "ogee" brackets, and a half wall. A Chicago-style window arrangement, featuring a large fixed center window flanked by double-hung sash and topped with a transom, appears on both the porch wall and the recessed north wall. The scored concrete porch floor, stucco ceiling with a light fixture, and wood entry door with large rectangular window and metal security bars are present on the main facade. The south façade faces the driveway and is anchored by a wide, tapered stucco chimney with a small red-tiled gable roof. Fenestration consists of multiple groupings of one-overone, double-hung wood windows, arranged singly or in pairs, with round tile vents set between the roofline and windows. The porch entry at the east end is framed by curved brackets and concrete steps with an iron handrail. The rear façade opens to the backyard and features a small concrete stoop with iron railings leading to a wood back door containing a full-length window, sheltered by a red-tiled shed roof supported by brackets. Fenestration includes paired and single one-over-one, double-hung wood windows, each with round tile vents above. The north façade faces the side yard and contains a mix of windows and utility features. It includes a single wood sash window at the west end, a small shed-roofed hot water heater enclosure with a vinyl slider, and two sets of paired one-over-one, double-hung wood windows with round tile vents above.

The detached, stucco-clad, two-car tandem garage is located at the southwest corner of the lot. It has a flat roof with parapets and a tiled shed roof projection, garage doors on both the east and west elevations, and a pedestrian door and vent on the north wall.

The accessory dwelling unit is a stucco-clad, one-story structure with a hipped roof of composition shingles. The south façade has a small porch with a shed roof and iron railings, while fenestration throughout consists primarily of horizontal sliding vinyl windows in single, paired, or tripartite groupings.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped, and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings, and accented entries.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains overall integrity of location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling and association.

The removal of the chimney and changes to the front porch degraded integrity of materials, workmanship, and design but was restored in 2023. Therefore, there is no impact to integrity based on those elements. The vertical gate, fence, and flagstone path are not character-defining features and only minorly impact feeling and setting. The vinyl sliding window on the north façade is an impact to materials and design but does not degrade either to the point of not retaining significant integrity to convey significance. The solar panels are not visible from the street and does not impact integrity. The accessory dwelling is constructed outside of the period of significance, does not significantly impact the resource or spatial relationships, and is excluded from the designation. The replacement of the garage doors and westward expansion into a tandem garage does impact the integrity of materials, and design of the garage to the extent that it no longer retains integrity and is excluded from the designation; however, the modifications to the garage do not significantly impair the overall integrity of the resource as a good example of Spanish Eclectic residential architecture. Overall, the resource retains its integrity to its 1927 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including an asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding, varied roof forms with tile roofing and little eave overhang, stucco chimney, arched porch wall design, and fenestration consisting mainly of wood windows in various lite patterns and operations. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

#### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the George Carter Spec House #1 located at 3560 32<sup>nd</sup> Street be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic Style. The designation excludes the accessory dwelling unit built outside the period of significance and the garage, substantially altered outside of the period of significance.

Kelsey Kaline

Associate Planner

City Planning Department

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison City Planning Department

KK/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on , to consider the historical designation of the **George Carter Spec House #1** (owned by Krista L Stellmacher Trust 12-05-18, 3556 32nd Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3560 32nd Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **453-431-2000**, further described as BLK 39 LOTS 33 & 34 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as  $\bf Site$   $\bf No. 0$ , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

# NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the George Carter Spec House #1 on the following finding:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features an asymmetrical façade, stucco cladding, varied roof forms with tile roofing and little eave overhang, stucco chimney, arched porch wall design, and fenestration consisting mainly of wood windows in various lite patterns and operations. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

vote:		
	BY:	
	KF	RISTI BYERS, Chair
	Hi	istorical Resources Board
APPROVED: HEATHER FERBERT,	ı	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:	
	LII	NDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	De	eputy City Attorney