



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

M E M O R A N D U M

DATE: October 9, 2025

TO: Historical Resources Board and Interested Parties

FROM: Shannon Anthony, Senior Planner, Heritage Preservation, City Planning Department

SUBJECT: **ITEM 1 – 4128 IBIS STREET**

The property located at 4128 Ibis Street was previously docketed for review by the Historical Resources Board on September 25, 2025, at which time staff was not recommending designation under any adopted HRB Criteria. At the hearing, the applicant's consultant requested a 30-day continuance to provide additional information in response to the Staff Report dated September 12, 2025. The Board approved the continuance and the item was scheduled for the October 23, 2025, hearing. Since September 25, 2025, the applicant has not submitted any new information.

Staff wanted to provide additional information regarding the 2025 project to remove the non-original horizontal wood siding and restore the stucco on the primary (east) elevation. The applicant submitted a project application to remove the non-original horizontal wood siding and restore the stucco on the primary elevation and the project was reviewed by Heritage Preservation staff because the property is within the boundary of the Arnold and Choate's Addition-North Florence Heights National Register Historic District and is a contributing resource to the district. The work was not required as a result of National Register District designation, and there was no indication in the permit submittal that the restoration work was being undertaken for the purpose of having the property individually designated. The permit application and associated work was reviewed by Heritage Preservation staff for its impact to the property as a contributing resource to the National Register historic district and was approved as consistent with the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.

With that clarification, staff continues to not recommend the designation of the property at 4128 Ibis Street as a historical resource under any HRB Criteria, consistent with the analysis and recommendations in the Report to the Historical Resources Board.


Shannon Anthony
Senior Planner

SA/ks

Attachments: 1. Staff Report HRB-25-042 dated September 12, 2025



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: September 12, 2025 REPORT NO. HRB-25-042

HEARING DATE: September 25, 2025

SUBJECT: **ITEM #4 – 4128 IBIS STREET**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\)](#)

APPLICANT: David and Sarah Potter; represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 4128 Ibis Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3
APN: 444-382-12-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 4128 Ibis Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 4128 Ibis Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property was identified in the [2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey](#) and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The property at 4128 Ibis Street is a contributing resource to the Arnold and Choate's Addition-North Florence Heights National Register Historic District.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The [*Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*](#) provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property at 4128 Ibis Street is a single-story, Craftsman-style single-family residential building constructed in 1920 in the Uptown Community Planning Area. Other buildings and structures present on the site include a detached single-car garage. The property is located on the west side of Ibis Street in a primarily residential neighborhood in Mission Hills. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1920, the property has been modified as follows: at an unknown date, horizontal wood siding was added to the primary (east) elevation, including the front porch site wall; metal railings were added to the front steps, and the doors on the rear (west) elevation were removed and replaced with a vinyl sliding door. In 2013, windows on the north, south and west elevations were replaced with vinyl windows in their existing openings, and the vinyl sliding door on the rear (west) elevation was replaced again with a new vinyl sliding door. In 2025, the horizontal wood siding was removed from the primary (east) elevation and front porch site wall and restored to stucco. The project was reviewed and deemed consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards by Heritage Preservation staff.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and E. Staff disagrees and finds that the building is not eligible under any HRB Criteria. This determination is consistent with the [*Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject building is a one-story Craftsman-style residence built in 1920 of standard wood frame and hollow clay tile construction on a concrete foundation with a detached garage at the rear. The building's original plan form is rectangular and exhibits an asymmetrical primary elevation. The primarily gabled roof is sheathed in composition shingles and has a moderate eave overhang with exposed rafters. The front gable features horizontal wood siding, simple beams, and an attic vent. The building is clad in a medium sand stucco with a stucco chimney on the west (side) elevation. Fenestration consists of three-over-one fixed and double-hung wood windows on the primary elevation and vinyl window replacements on the remaining three façades. The main entry is accessed from a small, recessed porch at the front, northeast corner of the building, supported by a simple square column and stucco half wall. The home exhibits limited character defining features of the Craftsman style, with fenestration, porch elements, and cladding that are very basic and modestly executed.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, which was born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. Character-defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

The use of hollow clay tile was not particularly unique or uncommon in San Diego in the early part of the twentieth century. Hollow clay tiles were popular mainly because they were fire-resistant, but also because they were easy to install and readily available. The abundant use of these tiles on other properties in the subject resource's vicinity is illustrated on the 1921 Sanborn Map. The use of hollow clay tile as a building method is no more important or distinct than the use of wood frame construction; therefore, staff is not recommending the property as an example of a method of construction.

As noted previously, the building is a minimal expression of the Craftsman style, and that minimal expression has been further compromised through modifications. Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style. While the building does retain some of its basic Craftsman elements, the modifications as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report have negatively impacted the building's fenestration overall, which is a significant (and in this instance one of the few) character-defining feature. The replacement of most of the original windows (thirteen in total) and doors with historically inappropriate vinyl units at three of the four elevations has had a significant negative impact on the building's character-defining features, and accordingly, detracts from the integrity of materials, design, workmanship, and feeling. In addition, a property as modest and lacking in detail as the subject property is more greatly affected by this level of loss in integrity. In part because of this notable loss of integrity, the building does not embody the distinctive characteristics of the Craftsman style sufficient to appropriately convey the historic significance of that style, and it does not retain significant integrity to its 1920 period of significance; therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

In 2024, the Arnold and Choate's Addition-North Florence Heights Historic District, which included 270 Contributors and 82 Non-Contributors, was listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The property at 4128 Ibis Street is one of the 270 contributing resources to the Arnold and Choate's Addition-North Florence Heights Historic District. It is not listed nor has it been determined eligible for listing on the State or National Register as an individually significant resource. It is the Arnold and Choate's Addition-North Florence Heights Historic District as a whole that would be eligible for listing under HRB Criterion E when processed consistent with the City's historical district procedures. The subject property as a contributing resource to the district is not eligible for designation on its own under HRB Criterion E.

The property has not been listed on or determined individually eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, it is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E. As the property is not significant under Criterion E, an evaluation of integrity as it relates to Criterion E is not relevant or required.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 4128 Ibis Street not be designated under any HRB Criteria.


Shannon Anthony
Senior Planner
City Planning Department


Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
City Planning Department

SA/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover