

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: October 9, 2025 REPORT NO. HRB-25-051

HEARING DATE: October 23, 2025

SUBJECT: ITEM #5 - LYLE AND EMILY CARRINGER/LOCH CRANE HOUSE

RESOURCE INFO: <u>California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link</u>

APPLICANT: Aldo and Jole Sciomachen 2013 Trust represented by Ginger

Weatherford

LOCATION: 825 Harbor View Place, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2,

APN 531-661-09-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Lyle and Emily Carringer/Loch Crane House

located at 825 Harbor View Place as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lyle and Emily Carringer/Loch Crane House located at 825 Harbor View Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1951 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 2017 porch enclosure. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Organic Geometric style of architecture and retains integrity from its 1951 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched roof with varying forms and wide overhanging eaves, exposed rafters, cedar siding with brick accents, irregular form, recessed entry, attached garages and large porch with fenestration in a variety of styles, including fixed and casement metal sash, clerestory, jalousies, and picture windows.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Architect Loch Crane, a prominent and accomplished architect and a leader in San Diego's Modernist movement. Specifically, the resource is significant as an early example of Crane's custom residential work in the Organic Geometric style, a style in which he would continue to experiment with in later designs and retains integrity to its 1951 date of construction. The use of geometric forms, site specific design and a strong connection with exterior views are characteristic of

Crane's designs. Therefore, staff recommends establishment of Loch Crane as a Master Architect and the designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historical name of the resource, the Lyle and Emily Carringer/Loch Crane House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the names of Lyle and Emily Carringer, who constructed the house as their personal residence, and the name of Loch Crane, a Master Architect.

In order to be eligible for designation and listing on the City's Register, a resource must meet one or more of the City's designation criteria as specified in the Historical Resources Guidelines of the Land Development Manual and retain integrity as it relates to the significance of the resource. Integrity is the ability of a property to convey its significance, which requires an understanding of the physical features and characteristics that existed during the resource's period of significance. The National, California, and City of San Diego Registers recognize location, design, setting, materials, workmanship, feeling, and association as the seven aspects of historical integrity.

Although not all seven aspects of integrity need to be present for a property to be eligible for designation, the record must demonstrate that the property retains enough physical and design characteristics to reflect and convey the significance of the property. Each resource depends on certain aspects of integrity, more than others, to express its historic significance. Determining which of the aspects are most important to a particular property requires an understanding of the property's significance and its essential physical features. The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u> provide information regarding the City's designation criteria, as well as guidance on their application and how to evaluate the integrity of a resource.

ANALYSIS

The property located at 825 Harbor View Place is a one-story, Organic Geometric style, single-family residential building constructed in 1951 in the Peninsula Community Planning Area. The property is located at the intersection of Harbor View Place and Armada Terrace, in a residentially zoned neighborhood. The property is in its original location.

Since its construction in 1951, the property has been modified as follows: In 1977 a deck permit was filed for the rear deck. In 1979, damage to the attached garages from a cement truck was repaired(but not in-kind. An original sunshade/trellis over the southern garage door was not reconstructed and the original garage doors which featured 1"x8" vertical joint tongue and groove cedar boards over 1"x10" horizontal channel wood boards were replaced with 1"x8" vertical tongue and groove siding. The original wood panel door on the north-east elevation with a rectangular window for the top panel, was replaced with a Masonite door at an unknown date, prior to 2009. Heritage Preservation staff reviewed and approved a 2016 in-kind roof replacement and skylight addition project as well as the 2017

enclosure of a covered porch on the south elevation at the corner of Harbor View Place and Armada Terrace, which was converted to a bathroom. Both the 2016 and 2017 projects were determined by staff to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Ginger Weatherford, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criteria C and D. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines</u> <u>for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The resource is a one-story, single-family residence constructed in 1951 in the Organic Geometric Modern style of architecture. The resources sits on a prominent triangular site with the entry at street level. The house features a variety of roof forms, including hipped, shed, and gabled portions, all with overhanging eaves and exposed rafters. The house is clad in combination of horizontal cedar siding and redwood siding with brick accents. The front façade is an irregular L shape, with a pair of attached single-car garages to the left, staggered back to fit the odd shape of the lot. The front entry is recessed in the crook of the L, featuring brick detailing and a large internal brick chimney. To the right of the entry extends an arm of the L with multiple groupings of casement and clerestory windows. The house comes to a point echoing the shape of a lot. The rear elevation, visible from the street to the west, faces over a steep bank with a full-length porch and a mix of casement and picture windows.

Organic Geometric architecture is a philosophy of design which promotes a harmonious relationship between buildings and nature. Organic Geometric designers used natural building materials such as wood and stone. Like their Post and Beam Modern contemporaries, Organic Geometric architects also used glass to minimize the separation between the interior and the exterior and encourage indoor/outdoor living. Buildings were carefully sited to take advantage of views and other site features. Designs emphasize rectilinear geometry, asymmetrical facades, unusual rooflines, and angular shapes. Primary character-defining features of the Organic Geometric style are: exposed structure and materials; polygon design motifs including squares and diamonds; and natural materials. Secondary features are: sharp angular massing, asymmetrical facades, complex roof forms, and site-specific design.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion C as a resource that embodies the distinctive characteristics of the Organic Geometric style. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains overall integrity of design, materials, and workmanship despite the modifications. The addition of a deck did not impact any character-defining features. The repairs to the garage did not accurately restore the garage doors or the sunshade/trellis over the southern garage door; however, this modification does not significantly impair the property's overall integrity and eligibility under Criterion C. The enclosure of the porch at the southern end of the property did result in the modification of an original feature on a visible facade; however, the siting of the building on a triangular lot with two long frontages on a major street limit the ability to add to the resource in a minimally visible manner. The enclosure is differentiated from the north portion of the north-west elevation by a piece of vertical wood

moulding and a cladding change to horizontal 1" x 6" flush shiplap redwood siding, and a differentiated roof form. The enclosure, which did not impact a critical character defining feature, is differentiated from the historic house and was approved by Heritage Preservation staff as consistent with the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Therefore, the property retains its integrity to its 1951 period of significance under HRB Criterion C.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Organic Geometric style of architecture and retains integrity from its 1951 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched roof with varying forms and wide overhanging eaves, exposed rafters, cedar siding with brick accents, irregular form, recessed entry, attached garages and large porch with fenestration in a variety of styles, including fixed and casement metal sash, clerestory, jalousies, and picture windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject resource was designed for Lyle and Emily Carringer by Loch Crane. Loch Crane is not currently designated as a Master Architect within the City of San Diego; however, multiple buildings attributed to Loch Crane are on the San Diego Register of historic sites. The current nomination is proposing to establish Loch Crane as a Master Architect in the City of San Diego.

Loch Crane was born in Pennsylvania in 1922 prior to moving to San Diego in 1927 where he would work for Richard Requa and William Templeton Johnson before doing a fellowship with Frank Lloyd Wright. This fellowship was interrupted by America's entrance into WWII, where Crane served on the Eastern Front. During this time, he was married to his wife Claire. Crane would stay in Japan until 1946, teaching flight classes and overseeing construction efforts. Crane returned to San Diego in 1946 and began working as a designer again under Johnson and eventually began his own firm. In 1948, he tested his first "expandable house," which was intended to be added to as a family grew. He again served in the military during the Korean War and returned to San Diego after his service. He formally studied architecture at USC, completing the 5-year program between 1954 and 1957. After graduating from USC, Crane worked with Frederick Liebhardt for a time and then eventually established his own firm, Loch Crane and Associates. Through his career, he worked on a variety of buildings, including shopping centers, residential properties, and institutional buildings. At the time of this report, three buildings on the San Diego Register are attributed to Loch Crane:

- HRB # 943- Cecil Roper House (5147 Cape May Ave), 1964
- HRB # 897- Industrial Developers/ Loch Crane Office Building (3344 Industrial Court), 1965
- HRB # 1396 -Ray and Phyllis Dickson House (439 La Crescentia Dr), 1952

The <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, lays out the various ways in which a Master can be established, including the scope and excellence of their overall body of work and the quality of design and detailing excellence. The Historical Resource Research Report presents the extensive body of work of Loch Crane in San Diego and his role in helping to establish the tenets of modern design - including site-specific layouts, indoor-outdoor connections, flexible design, the use of geometric forms and angular shapes, and natural materials - in San Diego. Crane

studied under local modernist innovators Requa and Johnson during the time Johnson was experimenting with International and Modernist styles with the Downtown Post Office, and when Johnson and Requa were designing the County Administration Building, prior to starting his fellowship at Taliesin with Frank Lloyd Wright. Upon finishing his degree from USC, he would then work with fellow modernist architect Liebhardt, who designed primarily in Post and Beam and Organic Geometric styles.

Two of the three buildings on the San Diego Register currently attributed to Loch Crane are Organic Geometric and the third is a Contemporary style commercial building. The list of works included in the report categorizes most of his buildings as Post and Beam, Contemporary, and Organic Geometric styles of architecture. Crane's work in Modernist styles of architecture was part of the cutting edge of the mid-century architectural movement in Southern California. His training with Johnson and Requa during their experiments with International and Modern architecture, as well as his time with Wright, were influential in his work and can be seen in his design choices. His interpretation of the use of natural materials, focus on views, aligning buildings with sites, and the use of angular shapes, as well as his unique innovations with the concepts of flexible, evolving buildings, were influential in the development of modernist styles in San Diego. Crane's work in Organic Geometric architecture is notable as he is one of the few San Diego architects to work heavily in the style. The themes of Modernism, with his use of site-specific designs, natural materials, integration of nature, and the use of geometric forms and angular shapes are some of the key features Crane discussed within his own work. Crane's ideas around adaptable and expandable buildings in the 1940s are early innovations within the modernist movement, which would go on to focus on adaptable and modular design in the 1950s and 60s. The information included in the tables in the report and attachment E shows the prolific nature of Crane's work in San Diego as well as the longevity and innovation of his designs, many of which are still extant with minimal alterations.

The Historical Resource Research Report argues that the subject resource is a notable example of Crane's work in the Organic Geometric style. His skill with design using geometric forms to accommodate a difficult site and provide a strong connection to the views of the bay below are exemplified in this property. The majority of Crane's work is in various modernist styles, of which he was a key San Diego architect. The 825 West Harbor View property is representative of Crane's custom residential buildings.

Of the seven aspects of integrity, design, materials, location and workmanship are the most critical to the property's ability to convey significance under HRB Criterion D as a resource that represents the notable work of Master Architect, Loch Crane. The property, which has been modified as detailed in the beginning of the analysis section of this report, retains integrity as it relates to HRB Criterion D. The addition of a deck did not impact any character-defining features and the replacement garage doors and trellis do not significantly impair the property's overall integrity and eligibility under Criterion D. The enclosure of the porch at the southern end of the property resulted in the modification of an original feature on a visible facade; however, the enclosure is differentiated from the north portion of the north-west elevation and the site limits the ability to make changes which are not visible. The enclosure was approved by Heritage Preservation staff as consistent with the US Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. Therefore, the property does retain integrity to its 1951 period of significance under HRB Criterion D.

<u>Significance Statement:</u> The resource is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Architect Loch Crane, a prominent and accomplished architect and a leader in San Diego's

Modernist movement. Specifically, the resource is significant as an early example of Crane's custom residential work in the Organic Geometric style, a style in which he would continue to experiment with in later designs, and retains integrity to its 1951 date of construction. The use of geometric forms, site specific design and a strong connection with exterior views are characteristic of Crane's designs. Therefore, staff recommends establishment of Loch Crane as a Master Architect and the designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Organic Geometric, located at 825 Harbor View Place, be designated as a historical resource with a significance period of 1951 under HRB Criterion C as an example of Organic Geometric Modern style architecture and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of a notable work of proposed Master Architect Loch Crane. The designation excludes the 2017 porch enclosure.

Megan Walker Associate Planner

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison City Planning Department

MW/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 10/13/2025

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/13/2025, to consider the historical designation of the LYLE AND EMILY CARRINGER/LOCH CRANE HOUSE (owned by Aldo & Jole Sciomachen 2013 Trust, 825 Harbor View Place, San Diego, CA 92106) located at 825 Harbor View Place, San Diego, CA 92106, APN: 531-661-0900, further described as BLK 4 LOTS 14 & 15 /EXC ST OP/ ST CLSD ADJ & in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the BLANK on the following findings:

- (1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Organic Geometric style of architecture and retains integrity from its 1951 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a low-pitched roof with varying forms and wide overhanging eaves, exposed rafters, cedar siding with brick accents, irregular form, recessed entry, attached garages and large porch with fenestration in a variety of styles, including fixed and casement metal sash, clerestory, jalousies, and picture windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.
- (2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect Loch Crane, a prominent and accomplished architect and a leader in San Diego's Modernist movement. Specifically, the resource is significant as an early example of Crane's custom residential work in the Organic Geometric style, a style in which he would continue to experiment with in later designs and retains integrity to its 1951 date of construction. The use of geometric forms, site specific design and a strong connection with exterior views are characteristic of Crane's designs. Therefore, staff recommends establishment of Loch Crane as a Master Architect and the designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.**

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 2017 porch enclosure.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	DV.
	BY:
	KRISTI BYERS, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: HEATHER FERBERT,	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	Deputy City Attorney

