# CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD REVISED MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 23, 2025 PUBLIC UTILITIES DEPARTMENT METROPOLITAN OPERATIONS COMPLEX II 9192 TOPAZ WAY SAN DIEGO, CA 92123 HYBRID HEARING

#### **CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

Chair Byers called the meeting to order at 1:08PM. Chair Byers adjourned the meeting at 5:30PM.

# ATTENDANCE DURING THE MEETING:

Chairperson Kristi Byers– present
Vice-Chairperson Michael Taylor – present
2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chairperson Rammy Cortez – present
Boardmember Lisa Cumper - present
Boardmember Carla Farley – present
Boardmember Eva Friedberg – present
Boardmember David McCullough – absent
Boardmember Joy Miller– present
Boardmember Michael Provence- present
Boardmember Melissa Sofia- present
Boardmember Melanie Woods- present

# City Staff

Jeanne MacKinnon, Deputy City Attorney – present Kelley Stanco, City Planning Department – present Suzanne Segur, City Planning Department – present Shannon Anthony, City Planning Department – present Alvin Lin, City Planning Department – present Megan Walker, City Planning Department – present Kelsey Kaline, City Planning Department – present Audrey Rains, City Planning Department – present

<u>Note:</u> All decision-makers attended the meeting in person. Staff and members of the public attended both in person and virtually.

#### **ANNOUNCEMENTS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

# **BOARDMEMBERS COMMENT**

None.

# **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None.

#### **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair Cortez disclosed that he had a meeting with Bruce and Alana Coons, Ione Stiegler, and Jennifer Ayala but it was unrelated to items on the agenda.

# FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

Boardmember Friedberg was only able to visit Item 4 during the evening when the lighting was dim, but was able to view the resource. No waiver was needed.

#### **REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED AND/OR WITHDRAWN**

Jenni Stropes, representing BFSA Environmental, the consultant for Item 2, requested a 30-day continuance for Item 2, 306 Sea Lane, due to the discovery of additional historic photos.

# **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR TAYLOR FOR ITEM 2- 306 SEA LANE TO BE CONTINUED TO A DATE CERTAIN OF NOVEMBER 20, 2025. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with all attending Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember McCullough absent.

Scott Moomjian, representing Item 3, requested a 30-day continuance for Item 3 in order to evaluate relevant archives and respond to letter submitted by the property owner.

#### **Testimony Received:**

Heather Riley, Land Use Attorney for the Property Owner requested that the item not be granted a continuance both in person and in a submitted letter.

Bruce Coons, representing Save Our Heritage Organisation, supported the continuance request.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY FOR ITEM 3: 2660-2666 FIRST AVENUE TO BE CONTINUED TO A DATE CERTAIN OF NOVEMBER 20, 2025. THE BOARD STRONGLY ENCOURAGES SUBMITTAL OF NEW FINDINGS NO LATER THAN OCTOBER 31, 2025. Seconded by Boardmember Miller. The motion passed by a vote of 8-2-0 with Chair Byers, Vice-Chair Taylor, 2nd Vice-Chair Cortez, Boardmember Cumper, Boardmember Farley, Boardmember Friedberg, Boardmember Miller, Boardmember Provence voting yes, Boardmembers Sofia and Woods voting no, and Boardmember McCullough absent.

# REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 4- FRED AND MARGARET VESPER HOUSE located at 6210 Camino de la Costa ITEM 5- LYLE AND EMILY CARRINGER/ LOCH CRANE HOUSE located at 825 Harbor View Place

#### **TESTIMONY RECEIEVED:**

None.

#### **BOARDMEMBER COMMENT:**

None.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR TAYLOR FOR ITEM 4- FRED AND MARGARET VESPER HOUSE LOCATED AT 6210 CAMINO DE LA COSTA AND ITEM 5- LYLE AND EMILY CARRINGER/LOCH CRANE HOUSE LOCATED AT 825 HARBOR VIEW PLACE TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with all attending Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember McCullough absent.

#### **APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA**

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY TO APPROVE THE BALANCE OF THE AGENDA IN NUMERICAL ORDER (ITEM 1, ITEM 6). Second by Vice-Chair Taylor. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0, all attending Boardmembers voting yes, and Boardmember McCullough being absent.

# **APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 25, 2025**

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FRIEDBERG TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR SEPTEMBER 25, 2025. Second by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0, all attending Boardmembers voting yes, and Boardmember McCullough being absent.

#### **STAFF REPORT**

Staff Report given by Deputy Director Kelley Stanco:

Good afternoon. I wanted to take a moment to just flag for the Board and the public an organizational change within the City Planning Department that includes the renaming of the Division that I head to the Climate, Preservation and Public Spaces Division, which will continue to house our Heritage Preservation team. There will be no change to how the section operates or who they report to, nor any changes to staff support to the Historical Resources Board, but I just wanted to make you all aware of the new Division name. Second, I will also go over this in my presentation on Preservation & Progress Package A, but wanted to highlight for the public's awareness that Preservation & Progress Package A is scheduled to be heard by the Planning Commission on November 6, the Land Use & Housing Commission of the City Council on December 11<sup>th</sup>, and the full City Council in late January 2026. The Preservation and Progress website is updated regularly with hearing materials and any date changes. Thank you.

#### **Subcommittee Report Out**

# **POLICY & ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND TRIBAL CULTURAL RESOURCES**

The next regularly scheduled meetings of the Policy Subcommittee and the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittees will be held on November 10<sup>th</sup> in the large conference room on the 5<sup>th</sup> floor of the City Administration Building.

#### **DESIGN ASSISTANCE**

The next meeting of the Design Assistance Subcommittee scheduled to be held on Wednesday November 5<sup>th</sup> at 4 p.m. in the large conference room on the 5<sup>th</sup> floor of the City Administration Building.

#### **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

# ITEM-1 Continued from September 25, 2025

**4128 IBIS STREET** 

**Applicant/Owner:** David and Sarah Potter

**Staff:** Shannon Anthony

Consider the designation of the property located at 4128 lbis Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: Staff Memo and HRB 25-042

#### PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 4128 lbis Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

# **Staff Report by Shannon Anthony**

### WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED:

In Opposition: Letters from Drew Hubbell, Mission Hills Heritage, Save our Heritage Organisation

#### **TESTIMONY RECEIVED:**

In Opposition: Drew Hubbell, David Potter, Ione Stiegler (ceded time by Peter Kempson, Gail Garbini, Shona McArthur), Scott Moomjiam (ceded time by Janet Widmer)

### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FRIEDBERG TO DESIGNATE THE JOHN SMAUEL GRAVES SPEC HOUSE LOCATED AT 4128 IBIS STREET AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1920 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING: THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF A STYLE, TYPE, PERIOD, AND METHOD OF CRAFTSMAN CONSTRUCTION AND RETAINS INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1920 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE EXHIBITS A ONE-STORY FORM; LOW-PITCHED, FRONT-GABLED AND REAR-HIPPED ROOF WITH WIDE EAVE OVERHANG, PROJECTING BEAMS, AND EXPOSED ROOF RAFTERS; CHIMNEY; STUCCO EXTERIOR OVER WOOD AND HOLLOW CLAY TILE FRAME; PARTIAL-PORCH SUPPORTED BY SQUARE WOOD COLUMNS AND SOLID WOOD BAULSTRADE; AND WOOD FIXED AND DOUBLE-HUNG WINDOWS. Seconded by 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair Cortez. The motion passed by a vote of 7-3-0 with Chair Byers, 2nd Vice-Chair Cortez, and Boardmembers Cumper, Farley, Friedberg, Miller, and Sofia voting yes, and Boardmembers Provence, Taylor, and Woods voting no; with Boardmember McCullough being absent.

#### **ITEM-2 306 SEA LANE** (CONTINUED TO NOVEMBER 20, 2025)

**Applicant:** 306 Sea Lane LLC

**Staff:** Suzanne Segur

Consider the designation of the property located at 306 Sea Lane, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-25-048

#### **PROPOSED ACTION**

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 306 Sea Lane under any adopted HRB Criteria.

# **Staff Report by Suzanne Segur**

#### WRITTEN TESTIMONY RECEIVED:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: La Jolla Historical Society

#### **TESTIMONY RECEIEVED:**

In Favor: None.

In Opposition: Jennifer Stropes

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR TAYLOR FOR ITEM 2- 306 SEA LANE TO BE CONTINUED TO A DATE CERTAIN OF NOVEMBER 20, 2025. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with all attending Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember McCullough absent.

# ITEM-3 2660-2666 FIRST AVENUE (CONTINUED TO NOVEMBER 20, 2025)

**Applicant:** Scott Moomjian

**Owner:** San Diego American Indian Health Center, Inc.

**Staff:** Alvin Lin

Consider the designation of the property located at 2660-2666 First Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-25-049

### PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 2660-2666 First Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria.

#### WRITTEN TESTIMONY:

In Support: Allen-Matkins (via Heather Riley), Chris Neighbors

In Opposition: Chaten-Brown Law Group (via Kathryn Pettit), Save our Heritage Organisation, Jennifer MacDonald, Todd Pitman, Ginger Weatherford, Roy McMakin, Ronald May

#### **PUBLIC COMMENT:**

In Favor: Jennifer Ayala, Meredith Rickers, Heather Riley, Don Blair, Jeff Benson, Alex Baracchini, Nicholas Bea, Daniel Bertao, Paula Brim, Rosemary McCartney, Chris Almeida, Brittany Hawkins, Leanne Edoria, Marian Mcintosh, Iridian Vazquez, Jay Vidal, Esteban Palencia, Sara Regina Smith, Steve Gardner, Johnny Vo, Aralisi Bibulegan, Alarialal Tulf

In Opposition: Ginger Weatherford

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FARLEY FOR ITEM 3: 2660-2666 FIRST AVENUE TO BE CONTINUED TO A DATE CERTAIN OF NOVEMBER 20, 2025. THE BOARD STRONGLY ENCOURAGES SUBMITTAL OF NEW FINDINGS NO LATER THAN OCTOBER 31, 2025. Seconded by Boardmember Miller. The motion passed by a vote of 8-2-0 with Chair Byers, Vice-Chair Taylor, 2nd Vice-Chair Cortez, and Boardmembers Cumper, Farley, Friedberg, Miller, Provence voting yes, and Boardmembers Sofia and Woods voting no, and Boardmember McCullough absent.

#### ITEM-4 FRED AND MARGARET VESPER HOUSE

Applicant/Owner: John M & Nancy J Cappetta Family Trust 12-21-06

**Staff:** Audrey Rains

Consider the designation of the property located at 6210 Camino de la Costa ,92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-25-050

#### PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Fred and Margaret Vesper House located at 6210 Camino de la Costa as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1940 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the detached cabana on the west elevation. The designation excludes the 1948 south upper deck and 1950 north upper deck enclosures, as well as the 1953 sunroom addition on the west elevation, all of which were constructed outside the period of significance

#### **Staff Report by Audrey Rains**

#### WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED:

None.

#### **TESTIMONY RECEIEVED:**

None.

# **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR TAYLOR FOR ITEM 4- FRED AND MARGARET VESPER HOUSE LOCATED AT 6210 CAMINO DE LA COSTA TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with all attending Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember McCullough absent.

## ITEM-5 LYLE AND EMILY CARRINGER/LOCH CRANE HOUSE

**Applicant/Owner:** Aldo & Jole Sciomachen 2013 Trust

**Staff:** Megan Walker

Consider the designation of the property located at 825 Harbor View Place, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2, as a historical resource. Report Number: HRB-25-051

# PROPOSED ACTION

Designate or not designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lyle and Emily Carringer/Loch Crane House located at 825 Harbor View Place as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1951 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 2017 porch enclosure.

# Staff Report by Megan Walker

#### WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED:

None.

#### **TESTIMONY RECEIEVED:**

In Favor: Ginger Weatherford

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR TAYLOR FOR ITEM 5- LYLE AND EMILY CARRINGER/LOCH CRANE HOUSE LOCATED AT 825 HARBOR VIEW PLACE TO BE PLACED ON THE CONSENT AGENDA AND TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION ON THE CONSENT AGENDA. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion passed by a vote of 10-0-0 with all attending Boardmembers voting yes and Boardmember McCullough absent.

#### ITEM-6 PRESERVATION AND PROGRESS PACKAGE A

**Applicant:** City Planning Department

**Staff:** Kelley Stanco

Review and consider, for the purpose of making a recommendation to the City Council, the documents that comprise Preservation and Progress Package A. Report Number: HRB-25-051

# **PROPOSED ACTION**

Review and consider for the purpose of making a recommendation to the City Council Preservation and Progress Package A, which includes amendments to the Land Development Code related to Historical Resources Board appointments, noticing of designation actions, the appeal of decisions by the Historical Resources Board to designate and not to designate historical resources, review of National Register Nominations, and clarifying amendments related to the application of Complete Communities Housing Solutions in Emerging and Thematic Historic Districts; amendments to the Historic Preservation Element and Appendix F of the General Plan; and amendments to the purpose and intended use of the City's Historic Preservation Fund.

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Recommend to the City Council adoption of Preservation and Progress Package A, which includes amendments to the Land Development Code related to Historical Resources Board appointments, noticing of designation actions, the appeal of decisions by the Historical Resources Board to designate and not to designate historical resources, review of National Register Nominations, and clarifying amendments related to the application of Complete Communities Housing Solutions in Emerging and Thematic Historic Districts; amendments to the Historic Preservation Element and Appendix F of the General Plan; and amendments to the purpose and intended use of the City's Historic Preservation Fund.

#### Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

# WRITTEN PUBLIC COMMENT RECEIVED:

In favor: None.

In Opposition: Priscilla Anne Berge, University Heights Historical Society, Neighborhood Historic Preservation Coalition, Mission Hills Heritage, Monica Villarreal, Whitney Markowitz, David Schmerler, Helen Hodges, Robin Greene, Gail Friedt, Aileen Teague, Jennifer Machian, Susan Dean, Jeana Preston, John DeSantis, Lauren Carter, Debbie Quillin, Ione Stiegler, Christie Dunning, Jennifer Wright, Shawn Dooley, Danna Givot

#### **TESTIMONY RECEIEVED:**

In Favor: Jennifer Ayala, Sharon Gehl

In Opposition: Barry Hager (Mission Hills Heritage ceded time by Deborah Quillin, Sharon Lieder), Bruce Coons (Save our Heritage Organisation ceded time by Shona McArthur, Ginger Weatherford, Gail Garbini) Alana Coons, Peter Kempson, Ione Stiegler, Geoff Hueter, David Swarens, Kristin Harms,

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION FOR ITEM 6. Seconded by 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair Cortez. The motion failed by a vote of 4-6-0 with Chair Byers, 2nd Vice-Chair Cortez, and Boardmembers Sofia and Woods voting yes, Vice-Chair Taylor, Boardmembers Cumper, Farley, Friedberg, Miller, and Provence voting no and Boardmember McCullough being absent.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY 2<sup>ND</sup> VICE CHAIR CORTEZ TO EXTEND THE MEETING TILL 5:15PM. Seconded by Boardmember Sofia. The motion failed by a vote of 5-4-1 with Chair Byers, 2nd Vice-Chair Cortez, and Boardmembers Friedberg, Sofia, and Woods voting yes; Boardmembers Farley, Provence, Taylor and Miller voting no, Boardmember Cumper abstaining, and Boardmember McCullough being absent.

The board proceeded with deliberations via general consent.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY 2<sup>nd</sup> VICE CHAIR CORTEZ TO MOVE STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION IN FULL WITH THE EXCEPTION OF THE ABILITY TO APPEAL A NON-DESIGNATION (PROPOSED SECTION 123.0203(b)), AND THE ADDITION OF RECOMMENDING A REVIEW OF THE SUPERMAJORITY VOTING REQUIRING AND VACANT BOARD SEATS AS AN ITEM FOR REVIEW IN PACKAGE B. Seconded by Boardmember Woods. The motion fails 5-4-1 with Chair Byers, Vice-Chair Taylor, 2<sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chair Cortez, and Boardmembers Sofia, Woods voting yes, Boardmembers Farley, Friedberg, Miller, and Provence voting no, Boardmember Cumper abstaining, and Boardmember McCullough being absent.

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER FRIEDBERG TO EXTEND THE MEETING TO 5:45PM. Seconded by Chair Byers. The motion fails 4-6-0 with Boardmembers Provence, Cumper, Miller, Farley and Taylor voting no and Boardmember McCullough being absent.

**ADJOURNMENT 5:30PM**