

COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
Wednesday, February 5, 2025
4:30pm-7:30pm

REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING
AGENDA

Southeast Live Well San Diego
5101 Market St,
San Diego, CA 92114

PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES

The purpose of the Commission on Police Practices (CPP or Commission) is to provide independent community oversight of SDPD, directed at increasing community trust in SDPD & increasing safety for community and officers. The purpose of the Commission is also to perform independent investigations of officer-involved shootings, in-custody deaths and other significant incidents, and an unbiased evaluation of all complaints against members of SDPD and its personnel in a process that will be transparent and accountable to the community. Lastly, the Commission also evaluates the review of all SDPD policies, practices, trainings, and protocols and represents the community in making recommendations for changes.

The Commission on Police Practices (Commission) meetings will be conducted pursuant to the provisions of California Government Code Section 54953 (a), as amended by Assembly Bill 2249.

The Commission business meetings will be in person and the meeting will be open for in-person testimony. Additionally, we are continuing to provide alternatives to in-person attendance for participating in our meetings. In lieu of in-person attendance, members of the public may also participate via telephone/Zoom.

The link to join the meeting by computer, tablet, or smartphone at 4:30pm is:

<https://sandiego.zoomgov.com/j/1610950576>

Meeting ID: 161 095 0576

In-Person Public Comment on an Agenda Item: If you wish to address the Commission on an item on today's agenda, please complete and submit a speaker slip before the Commission hears the agenda item. You will be called at the time the item is heard. Each speaker must file a speaker slip with the Executive Director at the meeting at which the speaker wishes to speak indicating which item they

wish to speak on. Speaker slips may not be turned in prior to the day of the meeting or after completion of in-person testimony. In-person public comment will conclude before virtual testimony begins. Each speaker who wishes to address the Commission must state who they are representing if they represent an organization or another person.

For discussion and information items each speaker may speak up to three (3) minutes, subject to the Chair's determination of the time available for meeting management purposes, in addition to any time ceded by other members of the public who are present at the meeting and have submitted a speaker slip ceding their time. These speaker slips should be submitted together at one time to the Executive Director. The Chair may also limit organized group presentations of five or more people to 15 minutes or less.

In-Person Public Comment on Matters Not on the Agenda: You may address the Commission on any matter not listed on today's agenda. Please complete and submit a speaker slip. However, California's open meeting laws do not permit the Commission to discuss or take any action on the matter at today's meeting. At its discretion, the Commission may add the item to a future meeting agenda or refer the matter to staff or committee. Public comments are limited to three minutes per speaker. At the discretion of the Chair, if a large number of people wish to speak on the same item, comments may be limited to a set period of time per item to appropriately manage the meeting and ensure the Commission has time to consider all the agenda items. A member of the public may only provide one comment per agenda item. In-person public comment on items not on the agenda will conclude before virtual testimony begins.

Virtual Platform Public Comment to a Particular Item or Matters Not on the Agenda: When the Chair introduces the item you would like to comment on (or indicates it is time for Non-Agenda Public Comment), raise your hand by either tapping the "Raise Your Hand" button on your computer, tablet, or Smartphone, or by dialing *9 on your phone. You will be taken in the order in which you raised your hand. You may only speak once on a particular item. When the Chair indicates it is your turn to speak, click the unmute prompt that will appear on your computer, tablet or Smartphone, or dial *6 on your phone. The virtual queue will close when the last virtual speaker finishes speaking or 5 minutes after in-person testimony ends, whichever happens first.

Written Comment through Webform: Comment on agenda items and non-agenda public comment may also be submitted using the [webform](#). If using the webform, indicate the agenda item number you wish to submit a comment for. All webform comments are limited to 200 words. On the [webform](#), members of the public should select Commission on Police Practices (even if the public comment is for a Commission on Police Practices Committee meeting).

The public may attend a meeting when scheduled by following the attendee meeting link provided above. To view a meeting archive video, click [here](#). Video footage of each Commission meeting is posted online [here](#) within 24-48 hours of the conclusion of the meeting.

Comments received no later than 11 am the day of the meeting will be distributed to the Commission on Police Practices. Comments received after the deadline described above but before the item is called will be submitted into the written record for the relevant item.

Written Materials: You may alternatively submit via U.S. Mail to Attn: Office of the Commission on Police Practices, 525 B Street, Suite 1725, San Diego, CA 92101. Materials submitted via U.S. Mail must be received the business day prior to the meeting to be distributed to the Commission on Police Practices.

If you attach any documents to your comment, they will be distributed to the Commission or Committee in accordance with the deadlines described above.

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME (Chair Doug Case)
- II. ROLL CALL (Executive Assistant Alina Conde)
- III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES - Action Item
 1. Regular Business Meeting – January 8, 2025
 2. Regular Business Meeting – January 22, 2025
 3. Special Meeting/Retreat – January 25, 2025
- IV. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT (Community Outreach Coordinator Yasmeen Obeid)
- V. CHAIR REPORT (Chair Doug Case) – Informational Item
- VI. STAFF REPORT – Informational Items
 1. Introduction of General Counsel, Bart Miesfeld
 2. Recent Outreach Activities (Yasmeen Obeid, Community Outreach Coordinator)
 3. Other Staff Announcements
- VII. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT (Chair Doug Case) Informational Item
 1. Update on Appointment of Interim Executive Director and Recruitment for New Executive Director
 2. Update on Filling Commission Vacancies
 3. Budget Update
 4. SDPD Response to Police Pursuit – Next Steps (February 19 Presentation)
 5. Proposal by City Councilmember Marni von Wilpert to amend the CPP implementation ordinance
 6. Update on Operating Procedures
 7. Update on Audio/Visual Contract
 8. Recognition of Departed Commissioners and Staff
- VIII. NEW BUSINESS - Action Items
 1. Motion to approve a six-month trial (through July 2025) of a case review process where staff investigators will take the lead on reviewing the IA case file, drafting the review report and presenting to the Commission.

2. Motion to request the City Council Public Safety Committee delay any action on proposed amendments to the CPP implementation ordinance until the Commission and the community have sufficient time to review the proposals and provide input.

IX. COMMITTEE REPORTS - Informational Item

1. Community Outreach Committee – Commissioner Alec Beyer (Committee Chair)

X. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

I. ADJOURNMENT

Materials Provided:

- CPP Regular Business Meeting Minutes (January 8, 2025)
- CPP Regular Business Meeting Minutes (January 22, 2025)
- CPP Special Meeting/Retreat Minutes (January 25, 2025)
- CPP Outside Counsel Bart Miesfeld Resume
- Community Engagement Coordinator Yasmeen Obeid Staff Report

Access for People with Disabilities: As required by the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), requests for agenda information to be made available in alternative formats, and any requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for alternatives to observing meetings and offering public comment as noted above, may be made by contacting the Commission at (619) 236-6296 or commissiononpolicepractices@sandiego.gov.

Requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for auxiliary aids, services, or interpreters, require different lead times, ranging from five business days to two weeks. Please keep this in mind and provide as much advance notice as possible to ensure availability. The city is committed to resolving accessibility requests swiftly.

**COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING**

Wednesday, January 8, 2024

4:30pm-7:30pm

**Procopio Towers
525 B St
San Diego, CA 92101**

Click <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=MpfubRTgw4k> to view this meeting on YouTube.

CPP Commissioners Present:

Chair Doug Case

1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez

2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré

John Armantrout

Bonnie Benitez

Alec Beyer

Stephen Chatzky

Lupe Diaz (arrived at 4:50pm)

Jessica Dockstader

Armando Flores (arrived at 5:01pm)

Dwayne Harvey (arrived at 4:47pm)

Christopher Kennison

Dan Lawton

Darlanne Mulmat

Excused:

Gonzalo Rocha-Vazquez

Absent:

Cheryl Canson

Imani Robinson

CPP Staff Present:

Olga Golub, Chief Investigator

Ching-Yun Li, Investigator

Ethan Waterman, Investigator

Aaron Burgess, Policy Manager

Alina Conde, Executive Assistant (Virtual)

Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement Coordinator

Jon'Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Doug Case called the meeting to order at 4:35 pm.
- II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call for the Commission and established quorum.
- III. PURPOSE OF THE COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES: The purpose of the Commission on Police Practices (CPP or Commission) is to provide independent community oversight of SDPD, directed at increasing community trust in SDPD & increasing safety for community and officers. The purpose of the Commission is also to perform independent investigations of officer-involved shootings, in-custody deaths and other significant incidents, and an unbiased evaluation of all complaints against members of SDPD and its personnel in a process that will be transparent and accountable to the community. Lastly, the Commission also evaluates the review of all SDPD policies, practices, trainings, and protocols and represents the community in making recommendations for changes.
- IV. APPROVAL OF MEETING MINUTES
 - A. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2024
 1. **Motion:** Chair Doug Case entertained the motion for approval of the amended CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 4, 2024. Commissioner Stephen Chatzky seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-0.
Yeas: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, Rodriguez
Nays: None
Abstained: None
 - B. CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 11, 2024
 1. **Motion:** Chair Doug Case entertained the motion for approval of the amended CPP Regular Meeting Minutes of December 11, 2024. Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 11-0-0.
Yeas: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Dockstader, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, Rodriguez
Nays: None
Abstained: None
- V. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 4:15*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the work of the commission and gave 10 suggestions for moving forward.

Virtual Public Comment: “Ilka Weston” (*Timestamp 7:53*) – Requested more information on how to apply to be a commissioner.

Virtual Public Comment: “Darwin Fishman” (*Timestamp 10:13*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding support of Andrea St. Julian’s comment. Darwin Fishman gave some suggestions for the commission to consider (i.e. meetings to be held around the city, have town halls, follow up on policy recommendations, and possibly later start time for community participation).

Virtual Public Comment: “Yusef Miller” (*Timestamp 13:29*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding support with the De Arman incident. Yusef Miller highlighted the SDPD presentation on canine use.

Virtual Public Comment: “Evie Kosower” (*Timestamp 15:16*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding minutes and audio-visual issues.

Written Public Comment: “Patricia De Arman” – Attached public comment to the meeting minutes.

VI. CHAIR REPORT

1. Commissioner Status:
 - Resignations of Gloria Tran, Brandon Hilpert and Viviana Ortega
 - There are currently 8 vacancies to be filled. There are (2) Low-to-moderate and (1) at-large to be filled January 13th. Districts 3, 5, 7, at-large, and youth seats are currently open.
 - Welcomed Commissioner Christopher Kennison who has replaced James Justus.
 - Exit Letters from Executive Director and Outside Counsel
2. Hiring:
 - Executive Director: There is a new applicant tracking system which will streamline the process.
 - Reconstitute the Ad Hoc Committee
 - Best case scenario is to recruit in January, screen candidates in February, interview process in March, and hire by the end of March.
3. General Counsel:
 - New General Counsel was selected, accepted, starts Jan. 15 or when background check is complete.
4. Interim Executive Director: Ad Hoc Personnel Committee will be making a recommendation to the City Council. A potential candidate has been identified, and it could be placed on the City Council agenda later this month. Chair Doug Case reached out to the Council President and the Chair of the Public Safety Committee, and they are prepared to move forward expeditiously.
5. Deputy Executive Director
 - Former Executive Director Paul Parker felt that the new ED should select their Deputy ED.
 - HR will get the top 5 candidates and keep them “warm” so that when the new ED is hired, the hiring of the Deputy could hopefully go quickly.
6. Performance Auditor: Currently pending. Departments are being asked to do a budget cut of 20% for this fiscal year. OCPP Senior Management Analysis Jaime Jacinto is currently negotiating with the mayor’s office.
7. Contract for Outside Counsel (Jerry Threet) – currently in process.
8. 12/18 Meeting with Chief Wahl (Former Chair Tran and Chair Case)
 - The response to the CPP Police Vehicle Pursuit Recommendations will be sent by January 18. The Chief will come to the February 5 CPP meeting to explain the decision and answer questions.
 - Responses will be sent soon to the CPP memos regarding the inadequacy of a case investigation and the memo regarding access to OIS homicide files.
 - The Chief will contact the Sheriff to discuss CPP access to Sheriff Office BWC’s. Chair Doug Case mentioned that this issue stems from the lack of consultation with the CPP before SDPD signing the MOU with San

Diego County law enforcement departments regarding investigations of officer-involved shootings.

- Regarding the OIS Case, timed out before it was reported to the CPP, IA has implemented an internal monitoring system to prevent this from happening again.
- Chair Doug Case discussed that all deviations from the discipline matrix should be explained in the discipline memos sent to the CPP.
- The Chief concurs with the recommendation to have IA conduct investigations of Category II complaints, rather the Division of the subject officer(s). This will require additional IA staff and must also go through a meet and confer with the POA.
- The Chief agreed to come to a future CPP meeting to present the SDPD complaint process.
- Chair Doug Case discussed ways to best facilitate police interactions with the community and the Commission during meetings or hearings on controversial issues.
- Chair Doug Case discussed upcoming CPP transitions.

9. Audio Visual Contract Status

GovTV contract renewal on hold – meet and confer with MEA. Funded by the Public, Educational and Government Communications Fund from cable company fees.

10. Operating Procedures:

Previous plan. Former Executive Director Paul Parker and Former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett met with Employee Relations negotiators, in consultation with Olga were going to present a revised version to the Ad Hoc Operating Procedures Committee, with CPP consideration in January then forwarding to City Council Public Safety Committee. Due to various circumstances, the preparation of the proposed revised version was delayed. Paul provided his working draft. He recommended that the new General Counsel and ED prepare the final recommendation since they are the ones who will be participating in the meet and confer. This will be one of the first tasks assigned to the General Counsel, in consultation with our Chief Investigator who was the staff liaison to the ad hoc committee.

VII. STAFF REPORT – Chief Investigator Olga Golub updated the new OCPP Investigators have completed their first phase of training and will be ready to assist in case review soon.

VIII. 1st & 2nd VICE CHAIR ELECTIONS

A. 1st Vice Chair

a. Nominations

- Commissioner Bonnie Benitez nominated Commissioner Ada Rodriguez (accepted)
- Commissioner Alec Beyer nominated Commissioner Bonnie Benitez (declined)

b. Public Comment – None

c. Discussion (*Timestamp 44:40*)

d. Action: Vote on 1st Vice Chair

MOTION: Commissioner Alec Beyer moved to defer the Chair Elections until legal presentation is present during a following CPP Regular Business Meeting.

Commissioner Stephen Chatzky seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 1-11-2.

Yeas: Beyer

Nays: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, and Rodriguez

Abstained: Chatzky and Diaz

MOTION: Chair Doug Case entertained the motion to elect of Commissioner Ada Rodriguez to be 1st Vice Chair. By a majority vote, Commissioner Ada Rodriguez was elected as 1st Vice Chair through June 30, 2025. The vote passed 13-0-1.

Yeas: Chair Case, Armantrout, Benitez, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Honoré, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat, Rodriguez

Nays: None

Abstentions: Beyer

B. 2nd Vice Chair

a. Nominations

- 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez nominated Commissioner Bonnie Benitez (accepted)
- Commissioner Dwayne Harvey nominated Commissioner Clovis Honoré (accepted)

b. Public Comment - None

c. Discussion (*Timestamp 47:42*)

d. Action: Vote on 2nd Vice Chair

MOTION: Chair Doug Case conducted roll call for Commissioners to cast their vote for 2nd Vice Chair. By a majority vote, Commissioner Clovis Honoré was elected as the Commission's 2nd Vice Chair through June 30, 2025.

Commissioner Bonnie Benitez (The vote failed 4-8-2)- Chair Case, Benitez, Diaz, Mulmat

Commissioner Clovis Honoré (The vote passed 8-4-2)- 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Chatzky, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Honoré, Kennison

Abstentions - Beyer, Lawton

IX. EXECUTIVE COMMITTEE REPORT

A. CPP Meetings Update – Executive Committee Votes

- a. CPP Business Meetings – (*Timestamp 57:52*) 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez stated that the CPP will continue to have meetings on the first and third Wednesday of the month. The **first** meeting will be a full agenda open meeting.
- b. CPP Case Review Meetings – (*Timestamp 57:52*) 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez stated that the CPP will continue to have meetings on the first and third Wednesday of the month. The **second** meeting will include a closed meeting primarily for case review.

B. Community Hearings Delay

a. Public Comment

In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 1:06:51*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding concerns about delaying community hearings.

Virtual Public Comment: “Ilka Weston” (*Timestamp 1:10:35*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding concerns about visual issues. Additionally, spoke regarding the need of CPP recommendations to the SDPD.

- Virtual Public Comment:** “Dave De Arman” (*Timestamp 1:13:40*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the case involving SDPD and his son.
- b. Discussion – (*Timestamp 1:02:23*)
 - c. Action – Vote to delay Community Hearings due to lack of staff.
MOTION: Chair Doug Case entertained the motion to delay the current Community Hearings schedule and have the Executive Committee come back with a proposed revised schedule and wait until the onboarding of new Commissioners and the Executive Director. Commissioner Darlann Mulmat seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 7-5-2.
 Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Benitez, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, and Lawton
 Nays: 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Beyer, Chatzky, Diaz, and Mulmat
 Abstentions: Ex officio Chair Doug Case, Kennison
- C. Standing Committee Updates
- a. Commissioner Darlann Mulmat shared that the Executive Committee voted to pause Standing Committee meetings, except Executive Committee, Outreach Committee, and Rules Committee until staff is hired.
 - b. Public Comment – None
 - c. Discussion (*Timestamp 1:31:29*)
MOTION: Chair Case entertained the motion to pause Standing Committee meetings, except Executive Committee, Rules Committee, and Outreach Committee until staff is hired. The motion passed 9-1-4.
 Yeas: 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, Armantrout, Benitez, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Lawton, and Mulmat
 Nays: Beyer
 Abstained: Ex officio Chair Case, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Chatzky, and Kennison
- D. CPP Meeting Calendar 2025
- a. Public Comment – None
 - b. Discussion (*Timestamp 1:33:29*)
 - c. Action – Vote to approve 2025 CPP Meeting Calendar – No action taken. Chair Doug Case requested to take the calendar back to the Executive Committee for full review of the year. The Executive Committee would further check current reservations and for meeting location availability out in the community while having audio visual needs in mind.
- E. Case Review Changes
- a. Investigators lead Case Review – (*Timestamp 1:44:47*) Commissioner Bonnie Benitez updates the Commission on the decision made in the Executive Committee Meeting regarding case review. It was decided to have new OCPP Investigators Ching-Yun Li and Ethan Waterman to conduct case review moving forward.
 - b. Public Comment
In Person Public Comment: “Andrea St. Julian” (*Timestamp 1:56:41*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding decision to let the investigators lead the case review.
Virtual Public Comment: “Dave De Arman” (*Timestamp 2:00:14*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding investigation of his son and SDPD.
Virtual Public Comment: “Yusef Miller” (*Timestamp 2:00:44*) – Spoke to the Commission regarding the decision to let the investigators lead the case review.

c. Discussion – Chief Investigator Olga Golub shared that the investigators would take the lead on case review and draft the reports for cases. They will then present the cases to the commission. Commissioners will not be doing case review during this time, but Commissioners will have access to the case files for review before the case is presented to them during closed session. There was consensus to try the new approach on a trial basis for six months, which will be formalized at the next business meeting. (*Timestamp 2:01:59*)

F. Policy Priority Proposal

a. Policy Manager Aaron Burgess will present at Retreat

b. Public Comment – None

c. Discussion (*Timestamp 2:10:13*) Commissioner Bonnie Benitez updates that Policy Manager Aaron Burgess will put together a strategic plan (for the next year or two) for policy review and will bring it to the commission.

X. RETREAT DATE(S) & AGENDA(S)

Presentation – Chair Doug Case breaks down the purpose of the retreat, which is primarily for relationship building, developing community agreements, strong and healthy communication. The second portion of the retreat will be for strategic planning for proposals. Chair Doug Case explains the options of postponing the retreat until (late spring) the position of Executive Director is filled, proceed as planned for January 25th, or do a mini retreat on January 25th and postpone the retreat later.

A. Public Comment – None

B. Discussion (*Timestamp 2:15:29*)

C. Action

MOTION: Commissioner Armantrout moved to proceed with a relationship building (mini) retreat on January 25, 2025, and host a more comprehensive later in the year after the Executive Director position is filled. Commissioner Bonnie Benitez seconded the motion. The motion passed unanimously with a vote of 14-0-0.

Yeas: Chair Case, 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout, Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Kennison, Lawton, Mulmat

Nays: None

Abstained: None

XI. APPOINTMENT OF AD HOC PERSONNEL COMMITTEE

A. Presentation – The members of the committee interview and make recommendations to the City Council for a permanent Executive Director. The committee would also make recommendations for an Interim Executive director. They would also do an annual evaluation of the Executive Director.

B. Public Comment – None

C. Discussion (*Timestamp 2:21:29*)

D. Action

MOTION: Chair Doug Case entertained the motion to reconstitute the Ad Hoc Personnel Committee with the three charges to interview and make recommendations to the City Council for permanent Executive Director and interim Executive Director, and to hold annual evaluation of the permanent Executive Director. The motion passed unanimously with a vote of 14-0-0.

Appointment: 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré,

Commissioner Bonnie Benitez, and Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat
Yeas: Chair Case, 1st Vice Chair Rodriguez, 2nd Vice Chair Honoré, Armantrout,
Benitez, Beyer, Chatzky, Diaz, Dockstader, Flores, Harvey, Kennison, Lawton,
Mulmat
Nays: None
Abstained: None

XII. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS

- Commissioner Alec Beyer requested memos shared by former Executive Director and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett to be added to an agenda for a future meeting. (*Timestamp 2:25:24*)
- Commissioner Darlanne Mulmat asked about how CPP can make A/V issues better. Also requested for more input and updates to be made regarding outreach that the CPP is doing to be added to the agenda. This includes more info on how to apply to be on the commission for people in the community to have more information. (*Timestamp 2:26:13*)
- Commissioner Stephen Chatzky seconded Commission Beyers comment regarding discussion more in depth the memos shared by former Executive Director and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett. (*Timestamp 2:27:37*)
- 2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré agrees with Commission Beyer and Commissioner Chatzky's comments regarding adding the memos shared by former Executive Director and former Outside Counsel Duane Bennett on the agenda. (*Timestamp 2:28:17*)
- 1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez brought up thoughts on having city provided laptops to help with A/V issues. (*Timestamp 2:28:56*)

XIII. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 7:12 pm.

From: [NoReply_sdgovweb_svc](#)
To: [Commissions Public Comment](#); [Parker, Paul](#); [Obeid, Yasmeen](#); [Conde, Alina](#)
Subject: Webform submission from: Meeting Agenda Public Comment
Date: Wednesday, January 8, 2025 3:39:58 PM

Submitted on Wed, 01/08/2025 - 15:39

NAME:
Patricia DeArman

EMAIL:
[REDACTED]

ADDRESS:
[REDACTED]

PHONE NUMBER:
[REDACTED]

BOARD OR COMMISSION:
Commission on Police Practices

MEETING DATE:
2025-01-08

COMMENT TYPE:
Non-Agenda Comment

AGENDA ITEM NUMBER:

COMMENTS:
Hello everyone,

I would like first and foremost thank the CPP in allowing community activists and impacted family members to speak during CPP meetings. I would also like to say that I read the opinion article Gloria Tran wrote. I just want to thank Gloria for writing that piece. It was beautifully written and very well done. I do hope my brother had some impact on that article. I want to also thank the members of the CPP for doing what they do, I'm sure it isn't easy and are probably given a lot of push back for trying to do their jobs or voicing an opinion. I know that you are limited in your case reviews and investigations, as well as being a collaborative voice altogether. After watching your meetings, I learned that not every commissioner is considered in the decision making process. I feel that is wrong. I believe the CPP's decisions should always be made as a collaborative vote. Everyone's voice should matter. I don't care if its 15 commissioners or 50, each one's opinion should matter in order to obtain a non-biased decision. I don't believe what's best for CPP is less meetings. By having less meetings, case reviews will be extended and solutions to problems will be delayed. Dealing with police brutality and injustices is already an extremely slow process. By delaying things further, impacted families and community activists are just becoming more frustrated and less trusting of the law. We get door after door slammed in our face and are left with no answers, no resources, and no

accountability. There are so many loops and holes in the criminal justice system that make it nearly impossible for impacted families to win. It's a never ending uphill battle for years on end! I think policy and procedure review boards should include impacted family members and community activists. Many people don't care about our losses or concerns. I hope the empty seats in the CPP are filled by people who actually care about the criminal justice system and police brutality. In a perfect world, every impacted family would obtain justice.

ATTACHMENTS:

[webform_submission:values:attachments_multiple_file]

**COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
REGULAR BUSINESS MEETING**

Wednesday, January 22, 2024

4:30pm-7:30pm

Balboa Park

**2144 Pan American W. Road
San Diego, CA 92101**

Click https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=fSK_1XKKXFE to view this meeting on YouTube.

CPP Commissioners Present:

Chair Doug Case

1st Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez

2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré

John Armantrout

Bonnie Benitez

Alec Beyer

Cheryl Canson (arrived at 5:03pm)

Stephen Chatzky

Lupe Diaz

Jessica Dockstader

Armando Flores (arrived at 4:50pm)

Dan Lawton

Darlanne Mulmat

Imani Robinson (arrived at 4:46pm)

Gonzalo Rocha-Vazquez

Excused:

Christopher Kennison

Absent:

Dwayne Harvey

CPP Staff Present:

Olga Golub, Chief Investigator

Ching-Yun Li, Investigator

Ethan Waterman, Investigator

Aaron Burgess, Policy Manager

Alina Conde, Executive Assistant

Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement
Coordinator

Jon'Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Doug Case called the meeting to order at 4:41 pm.
- II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call for the Commission and established quorum.
- III. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT
In Person Public Comment: “Mr. & Mrs. Robinson” (*Timestamp 1:50*) – Spoke regarding an SDPD police chase that involved a family member and bringing it to the Commissions attention.
- IV. CHAIR REPORT
 - Chair Doug Case spoke in regarding to the filling of the 3 vacancies that should have been filled by January 20th. Chair Case spoke to Councilmember Marni von Wilpert regarding the urgency to fill the openings. Chair Doug Case has a scheduled phone call with her on Friday, January 24th.
 - The General Counsel was supposed to start with the Commission on Police Practices on January 15th. The background check had been cleared but there is a two-week onboarding process is currently taking place. The General Counsel will start in February.
- V. STAFF REPORT - None
- VI. COMMISSIONER COMMENTS - None
- VII. CLOSED SESSION (NOT OPEN TO THE PUBLIC)
 - A. Chair Doug Case led CPP into Closed Session
 - B. Public Comment
Virtual Public Comment: “Yusef Miller” (*Timestamp 11:49*) – Spoke regarding police accountability and transparency. Also, supported the public comment of Mr. & Mrs. Robinson.
Virtual Public Comment: “Hakeem” (*Timestamp 13:18*) – Spoke regarding an incident he had with SDPD and has requested for the Commission on Police Practices to review it again.
 - C. PUBLIC EMPLOYEE DISCIPLINE/DISMISSAL/RELEASE
Discussion & Consideration of Complaints & Reports: Pursuant to Government Code Section 54957 to discuss complaints, charges, investigations, and discipline (unless the employee requests an open public session) involving San Diego Police Department employees, and information deemed confidential under Penal Code Sections 832.5-832.8 and Evidence Code Section 1040. Reportable actions for the Closed Session items on the agenda will be posted on the Commission’s website at www.sandiego.gov/cpp or stated at the beginning of the Open Session meeting if the meeting is held on the same day.

- I. San Diego Police Department Feedback on Case Specific Matters (0)
- II. Shooting Review Board Reports (0)
- III. Officer Involved Shooting (1)
- IV. Discipline Reports (0)
- V. In-Custody Death (0)
- VI. Case Review Group Reports (5)
- VII. Case-Specific Recommendations to the Mayor/Chief (1)
- VIII. Referrals to other governmental agencies authorized to investigate activities of a law enforcement agency (0)
- IX. Legal Opinion(s) Request & Response (0)
- X. Report on case-related issues discussed during IA meeting (4)

- II. REPORT OUT FROM CLOSED SESSION (6:53 pm): Chair Doug Case reported that there was no reportable action.
- III. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 6:53 pm.

**COMMISSION ON POLICE PRACTICES
SPECIAL MEETING**

Saturday, January 25, 2024

10:00am-1:30pm

**Procopio Towers
525 B St.
San Diego, CA 92101**

There was no virtual component for this meeting.

CPP Commissioners Present:

Chair Doug Case
2nd Vice Chair Clovis Honoré
John Armantrout
Bonnie Benitez
Alec Beyer

Cheryl Canson
Stephen Chatzky
Lupe Diaz
Dan Lawton
Darlanne Mulmat
Imani Robinson

Excused:

1ST Vice Chair Ada Rodriguez
Jessica Dockstader
Dwayne Harvey
Gonzalo Rocha-Vazquez

Absent:

Armando Flores
Christopher Kennison

CPP Staff Present:

Aaron Burgess, Policy Manager
Alina Conde, Executive Assistant
Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement
Coordinator
Jon'Nae McFarland, Administrative Assistant

- I. CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME: Chair Doug Case called the meeting to order at 10:22 am.
- II. ROLL CALL: Executive Assistant Alina Conde conducted the roll call for the Commission and established quorum.
- III. RELATIONSHIP BUILDING AMONG COMMISSIONERS
 - A. Public Comment – None
 - B. Exercises facilitated by the National Conflict Resolution Center – Daniel Orth and Essence Sanders M.A. worked with Commissioners by doing some training exercises on helping with community building, effective communication, shared values, and group agreements. Presentation provided by NCRC attached to the minutes.
- IV. COMMISSIONER DISCUSSION – Commissioners discussed the training tips provided by Daniel Orth and Essence Sanders M.A. Discussion was held regarding the underlying needs of community members who submits complains.
 - I. ADJOURNMENT: The meeting adjourned at 1:00 pm.



**NATIONAL
CONFLICT
RESOLUTION
CENTER™**



Commission on Police Practices

Daniel Orth & Essence Sanders
Saturday, January 25, 2025



**NATIONAL
CONFLICT
RESOLUTION
CENTER™**

If you're not familiar with the work of the National Conflict Resolution Center, we:

MEDIATE

FACILITATE

TRAIN

Community Building Circle

Complaints vs. Needs

CPP Communication Needs

The ART

Group Agreements

Opening Circle

Round #1


Your name and two facts about you, one person, one profession

Round #2

Why did you get involved with the CPP? What attracted you to this work?



**NATIONAL
CONFLICT
RESOLUTION
CENTER.**



The top of the tree is what
people say when they are in
conflict – **COMPLAINTS**

UNDERLYING NEEDS

Below the surface are the underlying
NEEDS that are important to them

Reflection

**What needs are important to you
with respect to your
communication and interaction
with one another on the
commission?**



**NATIONAL
CONFLICT
RESOLUTION
CENTER.**

Group Discussion

What needs are important to you with respect to your communication and interaction with one another on the commission?

- 1. Write down each of your needs on a sticky note. Use one note per need.**
- 2. Discuss in small groups.**
- 3. Share out.**



ACTIVE AWARENESS

- Recognize style differences
- Check your bias and your ego
- Process your perceptions

RESPOND RESPECTFULLY

- Demonstrate understanding,
- Acknowledge and identify needs
- Ask open ended questions
- Acknowledge your responsibility

TROUBLESHOOT TOGETHER

- Tell your perspective in a non-confrontational way
- Make sure everyone's needs are met
- End on a positive note



Reflection

What is one AGREEMENT that you would like to propose to govern the Commission's meetings and interactions with your fellow commissioners and CPP staff?



**NATIONAL
CONFLICT
RESOLUTION
CENTER.**

BART C. MIESFELD

cell (619) 215-3254

BMiesfeld@sandiego.gov

EDUCATION

- Postgraduate: **1998 HARVARD LAW SCHOOL**
Postgraduate Program of Instruction – Emphasis in
Jurisprudence Theory (Constitutional Interpretation;
Economic Paradigms in Tort Analysis; Doctrinal
Developments in Civil Procedure and Civil Litigation)
- Graduate: **1986 CALIFORNIA WESTERN SCHOOL OF LAW**
Juris Doctorate Degree – with Highest Honors
Graduation Honors – *MAGNA CUM LAUDE*
California Western International Law Journal
– Academically invited
- Undergraduate: **1982 BACHELOR OF SCIENCE IN ENGINEERING**
Structural/Civil Engineering – San Diego State University
Graduating Class Rank: Top 5% of midyear civil engineers
Core work in Structural Analysis/Design, Hydrology,
Thermodynamics, Fluid Mechanics, and Environmental
- UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA, SAN DIEGO**
Undergraduate work in physical and applied sciences,
extensive studies in physics, chemistry, and mathematics

EXPERIENCE

- 2020 – present **MIESFELD LAW FIRM**
As a former City Attorney, I provide municipal law
services to governmental and private clients throughout
Southern California, including quasi-judicial services,
litigation, mediation/arbitration, consulting on
governmental issues, Admin/Civil Service hearings,
employment law, contract/transactional, and law governing
public entities like Brown Act/Public Records Act/conflicts
of interest. Hearing officer on matters involving Public
Safety Officer Procedural Bill of Rights/ police office
conduct and discipline.

EXPERIENCE (cont.)

- 2008 – 12/2010 **CITY ATTORNEY**
OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY–CHULA VISTA
Responsible for providing all legal advice to Mayor and City Council, City departments, and City boards and commissions; represent the City before judicial and administrative agencies in civil litigation proceedings. Responsibilities revolve around seven specialized areas of practice (Contracts, Land Use, Redevelopment/Real Estate, Employment/Labor, Municipal Law, Torts, and Code Prosecution) in which attorneys provide legal counsel as well as representation in litigation at all levels of state/federal courts and administrative agencies. Worked closely with CV Police Department on all legal matters, including POBAR, conduct and discipline. Administer and manage a budget of \$3,400,000.00 and a staff of 14.
- 2008 – 12/2010 **GENERAL COUNSEL**
CHULA VISTA REDEVELOPMENT CORP.
Responsible for all legal advice to board members for this 501(c)3 nonprofit formed to support the planning and redevelopment activities of the Chula Vista Redevelopment Agency. Major issues include Brown Act, conflict of interest, redevelopment law, land use and planning. *(Also acted as General Counsel to the Redevelopment Agency.)*
- 12/2010 - 2019 **SENIOR ASSISTANT CITY ATTORNEY**
(1998 – 2008) **OFFICE OF THE CITY ATTORNEY–CHULA VISTA**
Head of Litigation Division – Responsible for all litigation related matters impacting the City and its Redevelopment Agency, prosecution and defense of all legal actions in both State/Federal Courts. Lead trial counsel on all litigation. Supervise all Litigation Division attorneys and staff. Manage outside counsel and consultants in complex or specialized litigation. Advise Mayor, Council members, Manager, Department Heads and Commissions on a variety of legal matters. Oversee all Government Claims. Develop,

manage and analyze Litigation Division budget. **(Deputy City Attorney 1998-2001; Asst. City Attorney 2001 - 2006; Senior Asst. City Attorney 2006-2008 and 2011 - 2019)**

1993 – 1997 **LIEBMAN, REINER & WALSH** – Senior Trial Attorney
Lead trial counsel in San Diego office of full-service 100+ attorney civil litigation firm based in San Francisco/Los Angeles. Complex litigation and trial practice. Emphasis in employment, catastrophic injury, law enforcement, and engineering/construction trial work for governmental, public and commercial entities. Lead trial attorney for cases with venues in all of San Diego County, Los Angeles, Riverside, San Bernardino, San Jose and San Francisco.

1989 – 1993 **BUTZ, LUCAS, DUNN & ENRIGHT** – Trial Associate
General civil litigation practice. Full case responsibility from pleading through trial and appeal on numerous personal injury, business, employment and construction matters. Representative clients included San Diego Unified Port District, Metropolitan Transit District, San Diego Harbor Police, San Diego International Airport and San Diego Stadium Authority.

PROFESSIONAL HONORS/AWARDS

VICE PRESIDENT, SAN DIEGO & IMPERIAL COUNTIES CITY ATTORNEY'S ASSOCIATION
Former attending member

JUDGE SAN DIEGO MUNICIPAL COURT (Pro Tempore)
San Diego Judicial District Small Claims Division

ARBITRATOR, SAN DIEGO SUPERIOR COURT
Court appointed judicial arbitrator

MEDIATOR, FEE DISPUTE PANEL
San Diego County Bar Association Panel

DELEGATE, AMERICAN BAR HOUSE OF DELEGATES
San Diego County Bar Representative to the American Bar Association House of Delegates (former)

MEMBER, CALIF. STATE BAR HOUSE OF DELEGATES
Representative San Diego Bar Assoc. Delegation (former)

ACADEMIC HONORS/AWARDS

GRADUATION HONORS

Law School Graduation with Highest Honors – *Magna Cum Laude*

ACADEMIC MERIT SCHOLARSHIP RECIPIENT

California Western School of Law Merit Scholarship based on Superior Academic Achievement in two consecutive years

ACADEMIC ACHEIVEMENT AWARDS

- Real Property Finance
- Interviewing and Counseling

DEAN’S LIST HONORS – LAW SCHOOL

Letters of Scholastic Achievement from Law School Dean
(Among Academic Top Tenth Percentile)

DEAN’S LIST HONORS – ENGINEERING SCHOOL

Letters of Scholastic Achievement from Engineering School Dean
(Among Academic Top Tenth Percentile)

NATIONAL ACADEMIC ENGINEERING SOCIETIES

Chi Epsilon (Top Tenth Percentile Civil Engineering Nationwide)
Tau Beta Pi (Top Tenth Percentile All Engineering Nationwide)

ACADEMIC POSITIONS

UNIVERSITY OF SAN DIEGO SCHOOL OF LAW

ADJUNCT PROFESSOR

Civil Procedure, Evidence and Trial Practice – Paralegal Evening Program (Through 2007)

CURRICULUM ADVISOR

Assisted in Design & Implementation of Civil Procedure Curriculum for Postgraduate Lawyer’s Assistant Program

INVITED FACULTY INSTRUCTOR

Alternative Dispute Resolution – “Negotiations Problems and Practical Solutions in Litigation”
Negotiations Course – “Negotiations Techniques”

CALIFORNIA WESTERN SCHOOL OF LAW

INVITED FACULTY INSTRUCTOR

Settlement Conference Techniques
Legal Skills Honor Instructor

STATE BAR OF CALIFORNIA ANNUAL CONFERENCE

INVITED LECTURER

“Effective Trial Tactics” (Litigation/Solo Practice)
“Litigation Strategies” (Presentation at Large)

SAN DIEGO INN OF COURT (A College of Advocacy)

FACULTY INSTRUCTOR

Evidence/Trial Workshop (1998- 2007)

INTERESTS/COMMUNITY ACTIVITIES

BOSTON MARATHON 2008

Completed 26.2 mile marathon as part of Team Hoyt,
Top fundraiser for the organization.

TECOLOTE YOUTH BASEBALL

Coach and assist in Pony League Youth Baseball

YWCA, SAN DIEGO COUNTY

“Walk a Mile in Her Shoes” campaign team member

USA CERTIFIED FOOTBALL COACH

La Jolla Pop Warner Football Coach Season

REFERENCES

Available upon request.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT UPDATES

Hello Commissioner and members of the public,

Thank you, Chair, for the opportunity to share this update. I would like to provide a mid-year update on community engagement and outreach efforts from July 1, 2024, to January 31, 2025, to ensure that both the commissioners and the community are aware of our activities.

For the sake of clarity in this report, I would like to explain the difference between one-on-ones, announcements, presentations, and tabling, as well as the goals of each:

- **One-on-ones:** These are private meetings with community groups or leaders to have in-depth discussions about the CPP. These meetings usually last about an hour.
 - **Announcements:** These occur when we attend public meetings, either as part of the meeting or as members of the public, to share key updates about the commission. Announcements typically take a few minutes.
 - **Presentations:** These involve reaching out to organizations or groups in advance, requesting to be added to their agenda, and being allotted time to give a presentation related to the CPP. Most presentations are between 10 to 20 minutes, though some can last up to an hour. The goal of these presentations is to provide a deeper understanding of the Commission, our work, our purpose, and how to utilize our services.
 - **Tabling:** This refers to when we request to participate in an organization's event by setting up a table or booth dedicated to the CPP. These events usually last 4 to 8 hours and involve engaging with a large number of community members, providing quick elevator pitches that introduce them to our work and encourage them to sign up for more information.
-

One-on-ones (12+):

Since July 1, the CPP has met one-on-one with at least twelve community groups and leaders, including the ACLU San Diego, Mid-City CAN (MCC), San Diegans for Justice (SDJ), Women Occupy (WO), Pillars of the Community, San Diego Organizing Project (SDOP), Community Advocates for Just and Moral Governance (MOGO), and Asian Solidarity Collective (ASC).

Presentations (6+):

We have compiled a list of 170 neighborhood associations and planning groups and have reached out to 85 of them to request a spot on their agendas for a presentation. So far, we have completed six presentations, including those at the La Jolla Town Council, City Heights Town Council, Southeastern Community Planning Group, Neal Petties Mountain View Community Recreation Group, and Chollas View Community Council. We've also requested to present to both college and high school student groups and presented at UCSD's Kappa Alpha Pi. Additionally, we have 10 more presentations scheduled, and approximately five more in the process of being finalized.

COMMUNITY ENGAGEMENT UPDATES

Announcements (6+)

We regularly attend meetings of the Commission on Gang Prevention and Intervention, C.A.S.T. San Diego, and some neighborhood associations that have requested regular updates from us. So far, we have made six announcements in total.

Tabling (6+)

We have tabled at six community events, including:

- Harvey Foundation Family Fun Day
- Community Wrap-Around Turkey Giveaway
- Mid-City CAN's Winter Wonderland
- City Heights Community Development Corporation Winter Extravaganza
- SDPD x Diamond Bar x Jacob's Center Winter Wonderland
- Alliance San Diego All People's Breakfast

We have also identified or signed up for five more events through the end of this fiscal year. Additionally, we have attended four other community events.

A special shout-out to the Community Engagement interns, Kelsey Gun and Jorge Uribe, who have made all this happen. Also shout-out to the Community Engagement Committee Commissioners who have been committed to strengthening our Community Engagement efforts.

This is not a comprehensive list and when it comes to community engagement, our efforts will always feel short. We have so many communities that we have yet to engage with. However, this is a step in the right directions with the available capacity.

Thank you for your time and dedication.

Yasmeen Obeid, Community Engagement Coordinator
