

## **OFFICE OF THE INDEPENDENT BUDGET ANALYST REPORT**

Date Issued: May 27, 2020 City Council Meeting Date: June 2, 2020 Item Number: 332 **IBA Report Number:** 20-04 REV

# 2020 Appointment of Audit Committee Public Member

# **OVERVIEW**

This report describes the process to appoint a member of the public to the Audit Committee for the current public member vacancy. The report begins with background information on the Audit Committee. Then we present a brief summary of the process that was used to solicit and review public member applications. This process has produced two qualified candidates from which the City Council will choose the next public member.

# POLICY DISCUSSION

## Background

On June 3, 2008, voters approved Proposition C which changed the City Charter with respect to the composition of the Audit Committee. Prior to 2009, the Audit Committee was comprised of three City Councilmembers. Upon voter approval of Proposition C, City Charter section 39.1 was added requiring the City's Audit Committee be comprised of two appointed members of the City Council (one to serve as Chair of the Committee) and three public members with the "independence, experience and technical expertise necessary to carry out the duties of the Audit Committee."

For calendar year 2020, the two appointed City Council members on the Audit Committee are Councilmember Scott Sherman (Chair) and Councilmember Vivian Moreno. The public members include Ricardo Valdivia and Stewart Halpern. The third public member is Alan Spencer, whose term expired on January 5, 2020. However, Mr. Spencer has agreed to continue serving on the Audit Committee during the current appointment process. Charter section 39.1 provides that public members may serve until the subsequent appointment has been made.

**OFFICE OF THE INDEPENDENT BUDGET ANALYST** 202 C STREET MS 3A SAN DIEGO, CA 92101 TEL (619) 236-6555 FAX (619)-236-6556 Charter section 39.1 additionally specifies that public members of the Audit Committee serve fouryear terms, and are eligible to serve up to two full consecutive terms. Mr. Valdivia is presently in his second consecutive term (to expire January 2021); and Mr. Halpern is serving in his first (to expire January 2023).

The City Charter requires that public member candidates be reviewed and recommended for City Council appointment consideration by a majority vote of a screening committee comprised of a member of the City Council, the Chief Financial Officer, the Independent Budget Analyst, and two outside financial experts (who are appointed by the other three members of the screening committee and confirmed by the City Council). In accordance with City Charter section 39.1 and following City Council appointment actions (on July 28, 2008 and April 8, 2019), the screening committee is comprised of the following representatives:

- Scott Sherman (Audit Committee Chair, City Councilmember for District 7)
- Andrea Tevlin (Independent Budget Analyst, City of San Diego)
- Rolando Charvel (Chief Financial Officer, City of San Diego)
- Tracy M. Sandoval (Deputy Chief Administrative Officer/Chief Financial Officer, County of San Diego)
- Ed Kitrosser (CPA, Inactive, and Former Managing Partner of Moss Adams, LLP, San Diego Office)

The screening committee is charged with vetting the qualifications of Audit Committee public member applicants and recommending at least two qualified candidates for an open public member position. Once candidates have been reviewed and recommended by the screening committee during a publicly held meeting, the City Council may consider these candidates for appointment. Candidates are evaluated based on the criteria set forth in City Charter section 39.1 which provides:

Public members of the Audit Committee shall possess the independence, experience and technical expertise necessary to carry out the duties of the Audit Committee. This expertise includes but is not limited to knowledge of accounting, auditing and financial reporting. The minimum professional standards for public members shall include at least 10 years of experience as a certified public accountant or as a certified internal auditor, or 10 years of other professional financial or legal experience in audit management.

## Process for the 2020 Public Member Appointment

As stated previously, the City Charter requires each public member of the Audit Committee be appointed by the City Council from a pool of at least two qualified candidates. The IBA solicited candidate applications by various means, including:

- Posting on the City's website
- Outreach to associations such as The Institute of Internal Auditors (IIA), the Association of Local Government Auditors (ALGA), and the California Society of CPA's (CalCPA)
- Networking and requesting candidate identification assistance, including from City Councilmember offices and others in the City

The IBA conducted reference checks, reviewed the information provided by the applicants, and reported the results of such review to the screening committee. Two individuals' applications were submitted to the screening committee, which convened on February 13, 2020. The screening committee, with one member absent<sup>1</sup>, determined the two applicants are qualified candidates, as defined by City Charter section 39.1, and unanimously recommended the City Council consider them for appointment to the Audit Committee vacancy. The two candidates for the 2020 appointment are the following individuals:

- Anandha Subramanian
- Toufic Tabshouri

In accordance with state law, the Police Department (PD) background check will occur after the City Council selects the candidate it wants to appoint to the open position. Therefore, the Council's appointment of the selected candidate will be subject to the results of the PD background check. The IBA will notify the Council President if there is any negative information, as identified by PD, that impacts the appointment.

Candidate application forms and resumes are attached to this report (certain personal information has been redacted to protect candidate privacy).

## Council Process for Appointing a Public Member to the Audit Committee

City Council Policy 000-13 sets forth a procedure for Council appointments. If the number of nominees is greater than the number of vacancies (as is the case with this appointment), Council Policy 000-13 (Procedures, section C.4.) specifies an election to fill the vacancies shall be held as follows:

- a. Vacancies will be filled one at a time. The election shall be conducted by written ballot at a scheduled meeting of the City Council. The City Clerk will provide a ballot to each Councilmember, who shall vote for the candidate he or she feels to be most qualified and then return the ballot to the City Clerk. Each Councilmember will have one vote in a round of balloting. The City Clerk shall announce the votes for each candidate at the end of the round of balloting.
- b. If a single appointment is to be made [as is the case with this appointment] and more than one qualified candidate has been nominated for the position, the Council shall vote until one candidate receives at least five Councilmember votes. If no one receives at least five Councilmember votes in the first round of balloting, the nominee with the lowest number of votes shall be dropped from the next round of balloting, unless the lowest vote-getters are in a tie situation. This procedure includes nominees who have received zero votes. New ballots will be distributed and a new round of voting will be taken. Voting will continue in this manner until a candidate receives at least five Councilmember votes and is appointed, or the Council President declares an impasse (see "d" below).
- c. [This section of the policy pertains to multiple appointments and does not apply in this case.]

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Councilmember Scott Sherman was unable to attend the screening committee meeting.

d. The Council President will have the discretion to determine when an impasse should be declared, and may declare one, after multiple rounds of voting have occurred and no candidate has received at least five Councilmember votes.

In addition, under City Council Policy 000-13, it is the intent of the Council that appointees be residents of the City of San Diego. If, however, a candidate is a resident of San Diego County, but not the City of San Diego, and is uniquely qualified to serve, then the Council may make a conscious exception to this policy.

# CONCLUSION

In accordance with the City Charter, the screening committee has reviewed applications and recommended two qualified candidates who meet eligibility requirements for Council consideration. At the City Council meeting on June 2, 2020, the Council will receive a brief presentation from each of the candidates and have an opportunity to ask questions of the candidates prior to making an appointment decision.

The IBA recommends the City Council appoint one of the two qualified candidates at the Council meeting on June 2<sup>nd</sup>. The IBA's office will then ensure the PD background check process is completed, as well as work with the Audit Committee Consultant and the Office of the City Attorney to brief and orient the appointee, as appropriate.

Lisa Byrne

Fiscal & Policy Analyst

ÅPPROVED: Andrea Tevlin Independent Budget Analyst

Attachments:

- 1. Candidate Application Anandha Subramanian
- 2. Candidate Application Toufic Tabshouri



# Application for Audit Committee Public Member Appointment

(This is a fill-in PDF form.)

If you need additional space to answer any of the following questions, please provide the information in an attachment.

| Section A - General Information  |   |
|--|---|
| Title  |   |
| Mr. Ms. Other Title  | :   |
| Name (last, first, middle)   |   |
| Subramanian, Anandha Sund  | aresan  |
| List All Other Names You Have Used in th   | he Past   |
|  |   |
| Email Address  |   |
|  |   |
| Primary Telephone  |   |
|  |   |
| Number:<br>Alternate Telephone (optional)  | Specify Type:  Mobile Work Home   |
|  |   |
| Number:  | Specify Type: Mobile Work Home  |
| Current Address (number, street, city, state   |   |
|  | larcos, CA  |
| List All Previous Residences During the Pa   | st 5 Years (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)                              |
|  |   |
|  |   |
| 2  |   |
|  |   |
| ADDI ICATION SUDMISSION  |   |
| APPLICATION SUBMISSION   |   |
|  | nplete and transmit the following information to the office listed below.       |
| 1. All 11 pages of the completed a   | and signed application form,  |
| 2. A <u>copy of your resume</u> , and  | a believe relevant to your application.   |
| 5. Any additional mormation you  | r beneve relevant to your application.  |
| Office of the Independen   |   |
|  | Street, MS-3A, San Diego, CA 92101  |
| and the second | mail to sdiba@sandiego.gov (see NOTE below)                                     |
| If submitted by fax: fax to  | (619) 236-6556  |
| NOTE: To send your application   | a as a PDF by email, print the completed fill-in form and manually sign the     |
| signature areas (do not u  | use an electronic signature). Then scan the signed application, resume, and     |
|  | one PDF file. Last, attach the scanned PDF file to an email with a subject line |
| of "Confidential Audit Co  | ommittee Application".  |
| ***Your application is deemed  | d submitted when you receive an acknowledgement from the IBA.***                |



| Section B - Licenses or   | Certifications   | and the second second                          |                 |                  |
|---|--|--|-----------------|------------------|
| Туре  | Issuing State/Entity I   | icense #                                       | Date of Issue/E | xpiration Date   |
| Certified Internal Auditor  |  | 30553  | 10/6/08         | 12/31/20         |
| Certification in Risk Management Assurance                              |  | 11499  | 6/20/13         | 12/31/20         |
| Certified Information Security Auditor                                  |  | 13110086                                       | 8/9/13          | 12/31/20         |
| Section C - Education (   | College/University or Oth  | er Educational History)                        |                 |                  |
| School  | Degree   | Major  |                 | Year Earned      |
| University of Pittsburg   | h Masters in Business Administrati   | Accounting and Fin                             | ance            | 2003             |
| Section D – Civic/Com<br>Organization Name                              | nunity/Volunteer Experier<br>City/State A                                      | nce Over Past 5 Years<br>activity/Type of Work | Dates: F        | rom/To           |
| Section E – Professional<br>Organization Name                           | l/Other Relevant Organiza<br>City/State A                                      | tions Over Past 5 Years                        | Dates: F        | from/To          |
| Institute of Internal Auditors- San Diego Chapter                       |  | /olunteer/ Vice-Presiden                       |                 |                  |
| Section F – Three Refer<br>Reference Name<br>Ryan Buell<br>Dennis Klahn | rences Familiar With Your<br>Your Association With<br>CEO of my Orga<br>Client | Reference                                      |                 | t<br>hone Number |
| Andy Hall   | Client   |  |                 |                  |
|   | Short  |  |                 |                  |
|   |  |  |                 |                  |



| Section G - Employment I   | History Over Past 10 Years   |
|--|--|
| Employer Name  | Type of Business   |
| Sayva Solutions  | Consulting Firm  |
| Title/Position   |  |
| Managing Director of Ac  | lvisory Services   |
| Duties   |  |
| Conduct internal audits, provide Sarbane                           | s Oxley consulting, perform investigations, perform risk assessments, perform information security assessments |
| Employer Telephone Number  | Employer Website   |
| (858) 242-5676   | www.sayvasolutions.com   |
| Employer Address (number, street                                   |  |
| 3636 Nobel Drive, Suite  | 400, San Diego, CA-92122   |
| Start Date End Date  | Reason for Leaving   |
| 1/7/2019 Present   | Currently Working here   |
| Employer Name  | Type of Business   |
| <b>Resource Global Profess</b>                                     | onals Consulting   |
| Title/Position   |  |
| Partner- Governance, R   | isk and Compliance   |
|  | provide Sarbanes Oxley consulting  |
| Employer Telephone Number  | Employer Website   |
|  | www.RGP.com  |
| Employer Address <i>(number, street</i><br>4747 Executive Drive, S |  |
| Start Date End Date  | Reason for Leaving   |
| 7/1/2016 1/6/2019  | Change in management philosophy  |
| Employer Name  | Type of Business   |
| Illumina   | DNA Sequencing Machine Manufacturer  |
| Title/Position<br>Senior Manager of Inter                          | nal Audit  |
| Duties   |  |
| Conduct internal audits, provi                                     | de Sarbanes Oxley consulting, perform investigations, perform risk assessments                                 |
| Employer Telephone Number  | Employer Website   |
|  | www.Illumina.com   |
| Employer Address (number, street                                   | city, state, ZIP code)   |
| 4500 Illumina Way, San   | Diego, CA-92121  |
| Start Date End Date  | Reason for Leaving   |
| 6/1/15 6/30/16   | Entrepreneurial opportunity  |



| Section G - Employment History Over Past 10 Years  |
|--|
| Employer Name Type of Business   |
| PriceWaterhouseCoopers LLP Consulting  |
| Title/Position   |
| Manager of Ris Advisory Services   |
| Duties   |
| Conduct internal audits, provide Sarbanes Oxley consulting, Perform QAR  |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |
| www.pwc.com  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)   |
| 5375 Mira Sorrento Place, San Diego, CA-92121  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |
| 8/1/2014 5/31/2015 Too much Travel   |
| Employer Name Type of Business   |
| Century Bank Bank  |
| Title/Position   |
| Audit Manager  |
| Duties   |
| Perform internal audits, fraud investigations, process optimization, Sarbanes Oxley compliance   |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |
| www.centurybank.com  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)   |
| 102 Fellsway West, Somerville, MA-02145  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |
| 12/1/2014 7/15/2016 Relocate from east coast to San Diego to support wife's career   |
| Employer Name Type of Business   |
| Boston Private Bank and Trust Company Bank   |
| Title/Position   |
| Senior Internal Auditor  |
| Duties   |
| Perform internal audits, fraud investigations, process optimization, Sarbanes Oxley compliance   |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |
| and the second  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)   |
| 10 Post Office Square, Boston, MA-02109  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |
| 3/1/2012 11/30/2012 Visa situation   |
| of the the visual of the official offic |



| Employer Name     |  | History Over Past 10 Years (Continued)<br>Type of Business                                  |
|-------------------|--|---|
| RSM McGla         | adrey                                    | Consulting  |
| Title/Position    | Calle (Color)                            |   |
| Supervisor        | <b>Risk Adviso</b>                       | ry Services   |
| Duties            | 1. |   |
| Conduct inte      | ernal audits, p                          | rovide Sarbanes Oxley consulting, Perform QAR, Perform investigations                       |
| Employer Telep    | hone Number                              | Employer Website  |
|                   |  | www.rsmus.com   |
| Employer Addre    | ess (number, stree                       | t, city, state, ZIP code)   |
| 80 City Squ       | uare, Boston                             | , MA-02129  |
| Start Date        | End Date                                 | Reason for Leaving  |
| 7/1/2006          | 2/28/2012                                | Too much Travel   |
| Section H -       | Charter-Requ                             | ired Qualifications   |
| Please explain he | ow you meet the C                        | harter-required qualifications described below. Reference any relevant experience, licenses |

Please explain how you meet the Charter-required qualifications described below. Reference any relevant experience, licenses or certifications/credentials that support your candidacy to serve on the Audit Committee. You may alternatively attach a cover letter to respond to this question.

San Diego Charter Section 39.1 states, "Public members of the Audit Committee shall possess the independence, experience and technical expertise necessary to carry out the duties of the Audit Committee. This expertise includes but is not limited to knowledge of accounting, auditing and financial reporting. The minimum professional standards for public members shall include at least 10 years of experience as a certified public accountant or as a certified internal auditor, or 10 years of other professional financial or legal experience in audit management."

I have more than 15 years experience helping companies with their corporate governance needs including internal audits, risk assessments, fraud investigations, information technology control assessment. During these years I have successfully partnered with audit committees and management to enhance the control environment without impeding independence.

Over the years I have had the opportunity to perform all the tasks that have been identified in the charter from working with external audit firms, overseeing the work of internal auditors, performing quality assurance reviews, performing performance reviews, working with various stakeholders to resolve issues, setting up internal audit departments, overseeing internal audit departments.

Status quo is unacceptable and I constantly work with the various stakeholders to improve and optimize. I will bring a similar mind set to the Audit Committee and serve to the best of my abilities.



| Section I -Elected         | or Appointed Positions  |   |
|----------------------------|---|---|
|                            | e you ever served in any elected or appointed office or   | on any local, state, or federal government board, |
| commission, committee,     | or other elected or appointed position?   |   |
| Yes (If yes, pro           | vide information below.) 🗸 No   |   |
| Entity                     | Position  | Dates: From/To                                    |
|                            |   |   |
| Entity                     | Position  | Dates: From/To                                    |
| Entity                     | Position  | Dates: From/To                                    |
| Entity                     | Position  | Dates: From/To                                    |
| Section J - Relation       | nships/Relatives  |   |
| the City of San Diego?     | egistered domestic partner, or legal dependent who is convide information below.)   | urrently an employee or appointee of              |
| Name                       | Position With City  | Relationship to You                               |
| Name                       | Position With City  | Relationship to You                               |
| Name                       | Position With City  | Relationship to You                               |
| Name                       | Position With City  | Relationship to You                               |
| Section K - Affiliat       | tions   |   |
| entity or organization, in | ed (as a director, officer, partner, trustee, employee, ow<br>cluding a non-profit corporation, that presently does bu<br><i>ase explain below.)</i> No |   |
|                            |   |   |
|                            |   |   |
|                            |   |   |
|                            |   |   |
|                            |   |   |
|                            |   |   |



| ection L - Real Property   |  |
|--|--|
|  | or within two miles outside of the geographic boundaries of the City of<br>used by the City of San Diego, except real property used exclusively as |
| ur personal residence?   |  |
| Yes (If yes, please explain below.)  | No   |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
| - M P' 1 1 D 1   | 112  |
| ction M - Financial and Businesses H   |  |
|  | or investment in any business entity (including, but not limited to,<br>cated in, doing business in, planning to do business in, or that has       |
| ne business during the previous two years in or wi   |  |
| Yes (If yes, please explain below.)  | No   |
|  |  |
| ection N – Civil Litigation or Administ<br>re you presently a party to or involved in any civil<br>iego?<br>Yes <i>(If yes, please explain below.)</i> | rative Proceeding<br>litigation or contested administrative matter involving the City of San   |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |



| ection O - City Licenses, Permits, and | Entitlements<br>r legal entitlements issued or granted by the City of San Diego? |
|--|--|
| Yes (If yes, please explain below.)    | No   |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |
|  |  |

## Applicant Acknowledgment and Certification

By providing my signature below, I certify that all statements made in relation to my application to serve on the Audit Committee are true and complete to the best of my knowledge. I understand that I may be disqualified from serving on the Audit Committee if I knowingly make false statements or omit material information.

I understand that my application is a public record, subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and other applicable state law. I acknowledge that I may withdraw from the appointment process at any time, by written communication to the City of San Diego, Office of the Independent Budget Analyst.

I further understand that if I am appointed to serve on the Audit Committee for the City of San Diego, I will comply with all applicable laws and regulations related to conflicts of interest and governmental decisions, including the California Political Reform Act, California Government Code section 1090, and the City of San Diego's Ethics Ordinance. These laws include the requirement that appointees complete annual public statements disclosing certain financial holdings, personal income, property ownership, receipt of gifts, and other financial interests. Additionally, these laws may require recusal from participation in a governmental decision where a conflict of interest exists. I acknowledge and agree to comply with these laws.

| Applicant Name                 | Signature of Applicant  | Date                          |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|
| Anandha Sundaresan Subramanian | S. landing sinda        | 1/16/20                       |
| Date of Birth                  | Social Security Number  | CA Driver's License Number    |
|                                | bookar becarity reamber | CAT Driver's Electrise Humber |

PLEASE FEEL FREE TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION OR LETTERS OF ENDORSEMENT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR INTEREST IN SERVING OUR CITY GOVERNMENT.



# General California Law Disclosures for Audit Committee Applicants

Audit Committee members have oversight responsibility regarding the City of San Diego (City)'s auditing, internal controls, and other financial and business practices. They may have access to confidential and proprietary City information, in the performance of their duties.

I understand that any offer of appointment by the City to me to serve on the Audit Committee is conditioned upon satisfactory completion of all of the screening processes required for the Audit Committee. Upon a determination that I meet the minimum qualifications to serve on the Audit Committee, as established by the City Charter, ordinance of the City Council, or other controlling law, I may be asked to submit my fingerprints to the City Police Department for the purpose of obtaining a criminal conviction report from the Federal Bureau of Investigation, California Department of Justice, and local law enforcement records.

The City will not obtain an applicant's credit report from a credit reporting agency unless expressly authorized under California Labor Code section 1024.5.

You are entitled to receive from the City copies of any public record (as defined by California Civil Code section 1786.53) obtained or used by the City in reviewing your application to serve on the Audit Committee.

You may waive your right to receive a copy of any public record, in accordance with California Civil Code section 1786.53, by checking this box.

I acknowledge the receipt of this disclosure, by signing below.

| A I' AN                        | Characteristic F A and Easter | D       |
|--------------------------------|-------------------------------|---------|
| Applicant Name                 | Signature of Applicant        | Date    |
| Anandha Sundaresan Subramanian | S. landha Sonda               | 1/16/20 |



# Fair Credit Reporting Act Disclosure for Audit Committee Applicants

The City of San Diego (City), acting through the Office of Independent Budget Analyst and the Police Department, may conduct a background investigation related to your qualifications to serve on the Audit Committee. The City may obtain a consumer report or investigative consumer report, as defined by the federal Fair Credit Reporting Act, about you from a consumer reporting agency in connection with your application to serve on the Audit Committee. A consumer report is a compilation of information, including information about your character, general reputation, personal characteristics, and mode of living. The City may obtain information about you from personal interviews with sources, including your neighbors, friends, and associates. The City may also obtain information relating to your criminal conviction history, education, employment history, licenses, certifications, references, court records, and other background information.

You have the right, upon written request to the City made within a reasonable time after the receipt of this notice, to request disclosure of the nature and scope of any consumer report or investigative consumer report obtained by the City. If the City uses a third-party, consumer reporting agency to conduct any part of its background investigation, the City will provide to you the name of the consumer reporting agency and its address, telephone number, electronic mail address, and Internet website address, prior to the use of the third-party, consumer reporting agency. A summary of your rights under the Fair Credit Reporting Act may be found at: <u>https://files.consumerfinance.gov/f/201504\_cfpb\_summary\_your-rights-under-fcra.pdf</u>. Upon request, the City will provide you with a written copy of these rights.

I acknowledge the receipt of this disclosure, by signing below.

| Applicant Name                 | Signature of Applicant | Date    |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|---------|
| Anandha Sundaresan Subramanian | S. Landen Sunda        | 1/16/20 |

## Applicant Authorization to Conduct Background Investigation Fair Credit Reporting Act

I have carefully read and understand the Fair Credit Reporting Act Disclosure. By my signature below, I authorize the City of San Diego (City) to proceed with a background investigation of my qualifications to serve on the City's Audit Committee. I further authorize the release of my records to the City by law enforcement agencies, educational institutions (including public and private schools and universities), information service bureaus, courts (federal, state, and local), my past and present employers, and any other individuals, agencies, institutions, and other sources holding information pertinent to me.

| Applicant Name                 | Signature of Applicant | Date    |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|---------|
| Anandha Sundaresan Subramanian | Silandra Sanda         | 1/16/20 |

Please check this box to receive a free copy of any consumer report or investigative consumer report obtained by the City from a consumer reporting agency.



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

## California Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act Disclosure for Audit Committee Applicants

The City of San Diego (City) may request background information about you from an investigative consumer reporting agency in connection with your application to serve on the Audit Committee. The report ordered is defined by the Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act (ICRAA), under the California Civil Code, as an "investigative consumer report." This report may contain information about your character, general reputation, personal characteristics, and mode of living. It may also involve personal interviews with sources, including your neighbors, friends, or associates.

The City may also obtain information relating to your criminal conviction history, education, employment history, licenses, certifications, references, court records, and other background information.

If the City uses a third-party, investigative consumer reporting agency (ICRA), then the City will provide you with written notice of the ICRA's name, address, telephone number, electronic mail address, and Internet website address before the City obtains an investigative consumer report.

Under California Civil Code section 1786.22, you have the right to view your file that the ICRA holds. By providing proper identification and duplication cost, you may obtain a copy of this information in person during the ICRA's normal business hours and after providing reasonable notice of your request. Additionally, you may obtain a summary of all information contained in the ICRA's file on you over the telephone, if you make a written request with proper identification for telephone disclosure and pre-pay the toll charge, if any, for the telephone call. You may also request that a copy of the file be sent to a specified address by certified mail. An ICRA complying with requests for certified mailings is not liable for disclosures to third parties caused by mishandling of mail after it leaves the ICRA.

If the City uses an ICRA, then the ICRA will provide trained personnel to explain any information furnished to you and will provide a written explanation of any coded information contained in files maintained on you. This written explanation will be provided whenever a file is provided to you for visual inspection. You may be accompanied by one other person of your choosing, who must furnish reasonable identification. An ICRA may require you to furnish a written statement granting permission to the ICRA to discuss your file in such person's presence.

I acknowledge the receipt of this disclosure, by signing below.

| Applicant Name                 | Signature of Applicant | Date    |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|---------|
| Anandha Sundaresan Subramanian | S. landen Sondon       | 1/16/20 |
|                                |                        |         |

auditcommapp 11/2019



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Applicant Authorization to Conduct Background Investigation California Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act

I have carefully read and understand the California Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act Disclosure. By my signature below, I authorize the City of San Diego (City) to proceed with a background investigation of my qualifications to serve on the City's Audit Committee. I further authorize the release of my records to the City by law enforcement agencies, educational institutions (including public and private schools and universities), information service bureaus, courts (federal, state, and local), my past and present employers, and any other individuals, agencies, institutions, and other sources holding information pertinent to me.

| Applicant Name                 | Signature of Applicant | Date    |
|--------------------------------|------------------------|---------|
| Anandha Sundaresan Subramanian | S. Langers Sanda       | 1/16/20 |



Please check this box to receive a free copy of any investigative consumer report obtained by the City from an ICRA.

## Anandha S. Subramanian

## **OVERVIEW**

Highly driven internal audit leader with entrepreneurial spirit with over 15 years' experience with 7+ years in with Big 6 consulting firms. Self-motivated, able to set effective priorities to achieve immediate and long-term goals and meet operational deadlines. Solid credentials: CPA, CIA, CISA, CRMA, ACA, MBA. Experienced with IDEA and Tableau data analytics tools.

## **PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE**

### Sayva Solutions, San Diego

### Managing Director Advisory Services

- Responsible for managing and executing various internal control related projects across industries. Projects include performing internal audits, internal control assessment and rationalization, enterprise risk assessment, data governance.
- Perform enterprise risk assessments for clients and put a plan in place to address risks that will prevent them from achieving their goals and objectives.
- Assisting companies to get ready for compliance with 404(b) of the Sarbanes Oxley act by assisting companies with training employees, performing gap assessment, implementing internal controls to better the control environment, creating templates to document the evidence of execution of the controls.
- Assisting companies with data governance by inventorying data, creating data maps, and creating data governance programs.
- Overseeing the work of the team and helping them with development and career advancement. ٠

## **Resources Global Professionals (RGP), San Diego**

### **Director of Risk Advisory and Client Service**

- Responsible for managing Governance, Risk and Compliance engagements including internal audits, SOX engagements and ERM for clients in LA, OC and San Diego.
- Assisting clients with SOX compliance through control rationalization assessments, rationalization discussions with client's external auditors, socialize and implement remediation plans and oversee the testing to ensure quality work is provided to the client in agreed upon timeframe.
- Assisting clients transitioning from 404(a) to 404(b) to meet the requirements of IPE, documentation of controls with requirements stemming from PCAOB audit requirements.
- Piloted testing of controls from RGP's office's in India and Philippines to help companies reduce their cost of compliance. Created a model that ensures quality testing and increased reliance from the external auditors.
- Conducting SOX and IA round tables and training to educate on internal controls and evangelize RGP brand.

## Illumina, San Diego

### Consultant

### **Senior Manager of Internal Audit**

- Developed the 2016 internal audit plan by performing risk assessment. Revamped the risk assessment process to have management and stake holder involvement and buy-in.
- Improved the control environment in various departments (including customer support, Revenue, Fixed Assets) by working with management to implement controls that are effective and efficient.

June - August 2015

September 2015 – July 2016

## July 2016 - January 2019

January 2019 - Present

- Developed and trained employees and management on the importance of controls and its impact on the organization.
- Worked on creating partnership with various departments to enhance the control environment and be available as a resource to develop best practices.
- Developed and implemented methodologies to enhance the internal audit function to meet industry standards.

## PricewaterhouseCoopers LLP, San Diego

## Manager, Risk Assurance

- Assisted the internal audit department of a multi-billion dollar bank in validating management actions in response to Consent Orders and MRA's relating to their AML KYC programs.
- Planned and executed a control gap analysis and identified remediation controls for a fortune 500 client that implemented an ERP system. Helped management design controls to strengthen the control environment. Worked closely with management and built strong relationships.
- Completed the Quality Assessment Review of an internal audit department to assess compliance with the standards established by the Institute of Internal Auditors.
- Completed an assessment of the audit universe assessment process for the internal audit department of a major financial institution in the Bay area. Suggested changes to the process to ensure a risk based methodology.

## Century Bank, Medford MA

Audit Manager

- Created and implemented annual risk assessment to identify the internal audit universe and the internal audit plan.
- Spearheaded the Bank's compliance with the 2013 COSO framework. Completed the gap assessment
  and identified remediation controls. Trained management and process owners on the changes due to
  COSO 2013 and its impact on the control environment.
- Planned, executed, reviewed and reported on multiple risk based internal audits and special projects.
   Presented to the audit committee on the audit scope, observations, impact and recommendations.
- Spearheaded the institutions compliance with SOX. Oversaw the control rationalization, updates to the
  narratives and risk control matrices, creation and updation of the test plans, reviewed the testing and
  remediation plans, and assessed the deficiencies identified.

## Boston Private Bank and Trust Company, Boston MA

AVP/ Senior Internal Auditor

- Planned, executed and reported on risk based internal audits (both operational and financial) including Residential Mortgage Origination, Wire Transfer, Deposit Operations, Bank Investments and Treasury Management, Account and Payment Services and ATM Operations, Finance, Accounts Payable, Fixed Assets and Vendor Management. Process improvements suggested were well received by management.
- Evaluated design of new TDR process and conducted monthly testing of loan modifications.
- Piloted continuous auditing approach for key areas through the use of ACL.

## RSM McGladrey Inc, Boston MA

Supervisor, Risk Advisory Services

 SOX readiness & compliance: Experienced in all aspects of SOX engagements for organizations across multiple industries including manufacturing, bio-tech, retail and banking from preparing risk assessments, analyzing and documenting process work flows, control gap analysis, walkthroughs, test

#### August 2014 – June 2015

Dec 2012 to July 2014

Mar 2012 to Nov 2012

Jul 2006 to Feb 2012

## Anandha S. Subramanian

plan creation, testing for control effectiveness, evaluating deficiencies and root cause analysis and presenting to Audit Committee.

- Internal Audit Expertise: Managed the internal audits for a \$10 billion retailer for the past 5 years. Led all the internal audits of various functions in the company including Human Resources, Payroll, Accounts Payable, Treasury, Risk Management, Loss Prevention, Accounts Receivable, Retail Revenue, Travel and Entertainment, Inventory, Environmental Services department, Credit Card processing, Financial Close process, Construction and Real Estate department.
- Process Enhancements: Conducted a critical assessment of manufacturing client's controls around revenue recognition and inventory. Identified enhancements to controls that were implemented by management. Led to 99% accuracy in inventory reporting and accurate revenue recognition leading to better management reporting and analysis.
- Client relationships: Dedicated to building lasting and meaningful relationships with clients and ensuring that client expectations are met at all times.
- Project Management: Successfully and efficiently managed multiple SOX and Internal Audit engagements ensuring client is updated and satisfied throughout the relationship.
- Staff Development: Managed up to 4 seniors in various engagements and always ensured that staff on the job gets value from engagements and are contributing to the success of the job.
- IT General Controls (ITGC) and other IT projects: Experienced in performing design analysis and testing of IT general controls for SEC and non-SEC clients. Performed system implementation reviews and assisted clients in the development of Disaster Recovery and Business Continuity Plans.
- Quality Assessment Review (QAR): Performed the QAR of the internal audit department of one of leading discount retailers in USA.

## The Timberland Company, Stratham NH.

Jul 2005 to Jul 2006

Senior Internal Auditor

- Efficiency Enhancements: Conducted operational and process audit engagements based on management requirements and recommended control improvements which were successfully implemented.
- Financial Investigation: Successfully completed a financial investigation at the Distribution Center in Netherlands. Worked effectively on the project to expose all the allegations and reported to the management.

### PriceWaterhouseCoopers LLP, Boston MA.

Feb 2004 to Jul 2005

Audit Senior Associate- Consumer and Industrial Products group

- Efficient time management: Led teams of 2 to 3 individuals and supervised multiple audit engagements in the manufacturing and retail industry. Planned and performed all aspects of the audit from planning through completion, including reporting results to the management.
- **Financial Analysis:** Performed trend analysis, variance analysis, benchmarking analysis and ratio analysis as part of the risk assessment and planning process for audit engagements.
- Participated in teams involved in evaluating the controls relating to financial statement reporting for compliance under section 404 of the Sarbanes Oxley Act. Provided meaningful recommendations based on objective analysis and presented recommendations to senior management.

## EDUCATION

| Degree /Certificates | University / Institute | Year |
|----------------------|------------------------|------|
|                      |                        |      |

## Anandha S. Subramanian

| Certification in Risk Management<br>Assurance (CRMA) | IIA   | 2013          |
|--|---|---------------|
| Certified Information Systems Auditor<br>(CISA)      | ISACA   | 2010          |
| Certified Internal Auditor (CIA)                     | IIA   | 2008          |
| Certified Public Accountant (CPA) (In-<br>active)    | AICPA   | 2005          |
| Masters of Business Administration<br>(MBA)          | n University of Pittsburgh, Pittsburgh PA .<br>Joseph M. Katz Graduate School of Business |               |
| Chartered Accountant (ACA)                           | The Institute of Chartered Accountants of India (ICAI)                                    | November 1999 |
| Bachelor of Commerce [Honors]                        | Sri Sathya Sai Institute of Higher Learning, India  | May 1996      |



# Application for Audit Committee Public Member Appointment

(This is a fill-in PDF form.)

If you need additional space to answer any of the following questions, please provide the information in an attachment.

| Section A – General Information  |
|--|
| Title $Mr.$ Ms. Other Title:   |
| Name (last, first, middle)   |
| Tabshouri, Toufic  |
| List All Other Names You Have Used in the Past   |
| Email Address  |
| Primary Telephone  |
| Number: Specify Type: Mobile Work Home   |
| Alternate Telephone (optional)   |
| Number: Mobile V Work Home   |
| Current Address (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)  |
| San Diego, CA  |
| List All Previous Residences During the Past 5 Years (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)                   |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| APPLICATION SUBMISSION   |
| To submit your application, please complete and transmit the following information to the office listed below. |
| 1. All 11 pages of the completed and signed application form,  |
| 2. A <u>copy of your resume</u> , and  |
| 3. Any additional information you believe relevant to your application.  |
| Office of the Independent Budget Analyst (IBA)   |
| Attn: Lisa Byrne, 202 C Street, MS-3A, San Diego, CA 92101   |
| If submitted by e-mail: e-mail to sdiba@sandiego.gov (see NOTE below)  |
| If submitted by fax: fax to (619) 236-6556   |
| NOTE: To send your application as a PDF by email, print the completed fill-in form and manually sign the       |
| signature areas (do not use an electronic signature). Then scan the signed application, resume, and            |
| any other documents into one PDF file. Last, attach the scanned PDF file to an email with a subject line       |
| of "Confidential Audit Committee Application".   |
| ***Your application is deemed submitted when you receive an acknowledgement from the IBA.***                   |



| Section B - License               | s or Certifications                   |  |                  |               |
|-----------------------------------|---------------------------------------|--|------------------|---------------|
| Туре                              | Issuing State/Entity                  | License #                              | Date of Issue/Ex | piration Date |
| CIA                               | The IIA                               | 1450059                                |                  |               |
| CFE                               | ACFE                                  | 526750                                 |                  |               |
| СРА                               | California Board of Accountancy       | 140308                                 | 5/29/19          | 1/31/21       |
|                                   |                                       |  |                  |               |
| Section C - Education             | on (College/University or O           | ther Educational Hist                  |                  |               |
| School                            | Degree                                | Major                                  |                  | Year Earned   |
| California State University       | - Sacramento MBA                      | Information Tec                        | chnology focus   | 2003          |
| California State University       | - Sacramento BS                       | Business, Fina                         | nce conentration | 2001          |
|                                   |                                       |  |                  |               |
| Section D - Civic/C               | ommunity/Volunteer Exper              | ience Over Past 5 Yea                  | urs              |               |
| Organization Name                 | City/State                            | Activity/Type of Work                  | Dates: Fre       | om/To         |
|                                   |                                       |  |                  |               |
| Section E - Professi              | onal/Other Relevant Organi            | zations Over Past 5 Y                  | ears             |               |
| Organization Name                 | City/State                            | Activity/Type of Work                  | Dates: Fre       | om/To         |
| The IIA                           | San Diego, CA                         | Member                                 | 2010             | Present       |
| The ACFE                          | San Diego, CA                         | Member                                 | 2008             | Present       |
| CalCPA                            | San Diego, CA                         | Member                                 | 2015             | Present       |
| ISACA                             | San Diego, CA                         | Member                                 | 2012             | Present       |
|                                   | eferences Familiar With Yo            |  |                  | NT 1          |
| Reference Name<br>Jonnathon Kline | Your Association Wi<br>Worked togethe | th Reference<br>er at the California S |                  | one Number    |
| Kyle Elser                        | Supervisor at t                       | he City of San Dieg                    | 0                |               |
| Larry Marinesi                    | Work together                         | at MTS                                 |                  |               |
|                                   |                                       |  |                  |               |



| Section G - Employment History Over Past 10 Years  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|
| Employer Name Type of Business   |  |  |  |
| San Diego Metropolitan Transit System Local Government Agency                                |  |  |  |
| Title/Position   |  |  |  |
| Internal Auditor   |  |  |  |
| Duties   |  |  |  |
| Responsible for all internal audit work and communicating with the Audit Oversight Committee |  |  |  |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |  |  |  |
| (619) 238-0100 www.sdmts.com   |  |  |  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)                                     |  |  |  |
| 1255 Imperial Avenue, San Diego, CA 92101  |  |  |  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |  |  |  |
| 12/2013 Present  |  |  |  |
| Employer Name Type of Business   |  |  |  |
| City of San Diego Municipal Government   |  |  |  |
| Title/Position   |  |  |  |
| Senior Auditor   |  |  |  |
| Dutics   |  |  |  |
| Conduct performance audits   |  |  |  |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |  |  |  |
| (619) 533-3165 www.sandiego.gov/auditor  |  |  |  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city, state, ZIP code)                                     |  |  |  |
| 605 B Street, Thirteenth Floor, Suite 1350, MS 605B  |  |  |  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |  |  |  |
| 8/2009 12/2013 Promotional opportunity   |  |  |  |
| Employer Name Type of Business   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Title/Position   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Duties   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city; state, ZIP code)                                     |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |



| Section G - Employment History Over Past 10 Years (Continued)  |  |  |  |
|--|--|--|--|
| Employer Name Type of Business   |  |  |  |
| ranpioyer Name Type of Dusiness  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Title/Position   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Dutics   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Employer Telephone Number Employer Website   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Eventures A block (number street site state ZID and a)   |  |  |  |
| Employer Address (number, street, city; state, ZIP code)   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Start Date End Date Reason for Leaving   |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| Section H - Charter-Required Qualifications  |  |  |  |
| Please explain how you meet the Charter-required qualifications described below. Reference any relevant experience, licenses   |  |  |  |
| or certifications/credentials that support your candidacy to serve on the Audit Committee. You may alternatively attach a cover  |  |  |  |
| letter to respond to this question.  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |
| San Diego Charter Section 39.1 states, "Public members of the Audit Committee shall possess the independence, experience   |  |  |  |
| and technical expertise necessary to carry out the duties of the Audit Committee. This expertise includes but is not limited to knowledge of accounting, auditing and financial reporting. The minimum professional standards for public members shall |  |  |  |
| include at least 10 years of experience as a certified public accountant or as a certified internal auditor, or 10 years of other  |  |  |  |
| professional financial or legal experience in audit management."   |  |  |  |

I began my career in government auditing in 2004, after being recruited by the California State Auditor. I was fortunate to be trained in one of the premier public audit organizations in the United States. Afterwards, I worked briefly as a Senior Auditor for the University of California Davis Medical Center, and for more than four years at the Office of the City Auditor in San Diego. For nearly six years, I have held the position of Internal Auditor at MTS.

My audit experiences in diverse government entities have exposed me to a wide variety of government issues. Most of my work has involved performance audits, but I have conducted compliance, financial, information technology audits, as well as fraud investigations.

I possess a Certified Fraud Examiner and Certified Internal Auditor certifications, as well as a California CPA license.

My work experiences and qualifications are tailored for service on the Audit Committee.



| Section I -Elected or Appointed Positions  |   |  |  |
|--|---|--|--|
| Do you currently or have you ever served in any elected or appointed office or on any local, state, or federal government board,   |   |  |  |
| commission, committee, or other elected or appointed position?   |   |  |  |
| Yes (If yes, provide informa   | tion below.) 🗸 No                           |  |  |
| Entity   | Position                                    | Dates: From/To                                   |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Entity   | Position                                    | Dates: From/To                                   |  |
| Entity   | 1 OSMOIT                                    |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Entity   | Position                                    | Dates: From/To                                   |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Ențity   | Position                                    | Dates: From/To                                   |  |
| This is a second s |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Section J – Relationships/Rel  | latives                                     |  |  |
|  | nestic partner, or legal dependent who is   | currently an employee or appointee of            |  |
| the City of San Diego?   |   |  |  |
| Yes (If yes, provide informa   |   |  |  |
| Name   | Position With City                          | Relationship to You                              |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Name   | Position With City                          | Relationship to You                              |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Nama   | Position With City                          | Relationship to You                              |  |
| Name   | Tosition with City                          | Matonship to Tou                                 |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Name   | Position With City                          | Relationship to You                              |  |
|  |   |  |  |
| Section K - Affiliations   |   |  |  |
|  | tor, officer, partner, trustee, employee, c | owner, advisor, or consultant) with any business |  |
| entity or organization, including a nor  | i-profit corporation, that presently does   | business with the City of San Diego?             |  |
| Yes (If yes, please explain below.)  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |
|  |   |  |  |



| Section L - Real Property  |
|--|
| Do you own real property in the City of San Diego, or within two miles outside of the geographic boundaries of the City of   |
| San Diego or within two miles of any land owned or used by the City of San Diego, except real property used exclusively as your personal residence?  |
| Yes <i>(If yes, please explain below.)</i>   |
| Tes (II ) es, picase explain below.) ♥ No  |
|  |
|  |
| A  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| Section M – Financial and Businesses Holdings  |
| Do you own any direct or indirect financial interest or investment in any business entity (including, but not limited to,  |
| a sole proprietorship or limited liability company) located in, doing business in, planning to do business in, or that has done business during the previous two years in or with the City of San Diego? |
|  |
| Yes (If yes, please explain below.) Ves (If yes, please explain below.)  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
| Section N - Civil Litigation or Administrative Proceeding  |
| Are you presently a party to or involved in any civil litigation or contested administrative matter involving the City of San  |
| Diego?   |
| Yes (If yes, please explain below.)  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |
|  |



| Section O - City Licenses, Permits, and Entitlements  |    |  |  |
|---|----|--|--|
| Do you hold any business licenses, permits, or other legal entitlements issued or granted by the City of San Diego? |    |  |  |
| Yes (If ycs, please explain below.)   | No |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |
|   |    |  |  |

## Applicant Acknowledgment and Certification

By providing my signature below, I certify that all statements made in relation to my application to serve on the Audit Committee are true and complete to the best of my knowledge. I understand that I may be disqualified from serving on the Audit Committee if I knowingly make false statements or omit material information.

I understand that my application is a public record, subject to disclosure under the California Public Records Act and other applicable state law. I acknowledge that I may withdraw from the appointment process at any time, by written communication to the City of San Diego, Office of the Independent Budget Analyst.

I further understand that if I am appointed to serve on the Audit Committee for the City of San Diego, I will comply with all applicable laws and regulations related to conflicts of interest and governmental decisions, including the California Political Reform Act, California Government Code section 1090, and the City of San Diego's Ethics Ordinance. These laws include the requirement that appointees complete annual public statements disclosing certain financial holdings, personal income, property ownership, receipt of gifts, and other financial interests. Additionally, these laws may require recusal from participation in a governmental decision where a conflict of interest exists. I acknowledge and agree to comply with these laws.

| Applicant Name   | Signature of Applicant | Date                       |
|------------------|------------------------|----------------------------|
| Toufic Tabshouri | Toutic Tabshonn        | 12/27/19                   |
| Date of Birth    | Social Security Number | CA Driver's License Number |
|                  |                        |                            |

## PLEASE FEEL FREE TO PROVIDE ADDITIONAL INFORMATION OR LETTERS OF ENDORSEMENT. THANK YOU FOR YOUR INTEREST IN SERVING OUR CITY GOVERNMENT.



# General California Law Disclosures for Audit Committee Applicants

Audit Committee members have oversight responsibility regarding the City of San Diego (City)'s auditing, internal controls, and other financial and business practices. They may have access to confidential and proprietary City information, in the performance of their duties.

I understand that any offer of appointment by the City to me to serve on the Audit Committee is conditioned upon satisfactory completion of all of the screening processes required for the Audit Committee. Upon a determination that I meet the minimum qualifications to serve on the Audit Committee, as established by the City Charter, ordinance of the City Council, or other controlling law, I may be asked to submit my fingerprints to the City Police Department for the purpose of obtaining a criminal conviction report from the Federal Burcau of Investigation, California Department of Justice, and local law enforcement records.

The City will not obtain an applicant's credit report from a credit reporting agency unless expressly authorized under California Labor Code section 1024.5.

You are entitled to receive from the City copies of any public record (as defined by California Civil Code section 1786.53) obtained or used by the City in reviewing your application to serve on the Audit Committee.

You may waive your right to receive a copy of any public record, in accordance with California Civil Code section 1786.53, by checking this box.

I acknowledge the receipt of this disclosure, by signing below.







# Fair Credit Reporting Act Disclosure for Audit Committee Applicants

The City of San Diego (City), acting through the Office of Independent Budget Analyst and the Police Department, may conduct a background investigation related to your qualifications to serve on the Audit Committee. The City may obtain a consumer report or investigative consumer report, as defined by the federal Fair Credit Reporting Act, about you from a consumer reporting agency in connection with your application to serve on the Audit Committee. A consumer report is a compilation of information, including information about your character, general reputation, personal characteristics, and mode of living. The City may obtain information about you from personal interviews with sources, including your neighbors, friends, and associates. The City may also obtain information relating to your criminal conviction history, education, employment history, licenses, certifications, references, court records, and other background information.

You have the right, upon written request to the City made within a reasonable time after the receipt of this notice, to request disclosure of the nature and scope of any consumer report or investigative consumer report obtained by the City. If the City uses a third-party, consumer reporting agency to conduct any part of its background investigation, the City will provide to you the name of the consumer reporting agency and its address, telephone number, electronic mail address, and Internet website address, prior to the use of the third-party, consumer reporting agency. A summary of your rights under the Fair Credit Reporting Act may be found at: <a href="https://files.consumerfinance.gov/f/201504\_cfpb\_summary\_your-rights-under-fcra.pdf">https://files.consumerfinance.gov/f/201504\_cfpb\_summary\_your-rights-under-fcra.pdf</a>. Upon request, the City will provide you with a written copy of these rights.

I acknowledge the receipt of this disclosure, by signing below.

| Applicant Name   | Signature of Applicant | Date     |
|------------------|------------------------|----------|
| Toufic Tabshouri | Toutie Tabshoun        | 12/27/19 |

## Applicant Authorization to Conduct Background Investigation Fair Credit Reporting Act

I have carefully read and understand the Fair Credit Reporting Act Disclosure. By my signature below, I authorize the City of San Diego (City) to proceed with a background investigation of my qualifications to serve on the City's Audit Committee. I further authorize the release of my records to the City by law enforcement agencies, educational institutions (including public and private schools and universities), information service bureaus, courts (federal, state, and local), my past and present employers, and any other individuals, agencies, institutions, and other sources holding information pertinent to me.

| Applicant Name   | Signature of Applicant | Date     |
|------------------|------------------------|----------|
| Toufic Tabshouri | Tontic Tabshouri       | 12/27/19 |

Please check this box to receive a free copy of any consumer report or investigative consumer report obtained by the City from a consumer reporting agency.



## California Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act Disclosure for Audit Committee Applicants

The City of San Diego (City) may request background information about you from an investigative consumer reporting agency in connection with your application to serve on the Audit Committee. The report ordered is defined by the Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act (ICRAA), under the California Civil Code, as an "investigative consumer report." This report may contain information about your character, general reputation, personal characteristics, and mode of living. It may also involve personal interviews with sources, including your neighbors, friends, or associates.

The City may also obtain information relating to your criminal conviction history, education, employment history, licenses, certifications, references, court records, and other background information.

If the City uses a third-party, investigative consumer reporting agency (ICRA), then the City will provide you with written notice of the ICRA's name, address, telephone number, electronic mail address, and Internet website address before the City obtains an investigative consumer report.

Under California Civil Code section 1786.22, you have the right to view your file that the ICRA holds. By providing proper identification and duplication cost, you may obtain a copy of this information in person during the ICRA's normal business hours and after providing reasonable notice of your request. Additionally, you may obtain a summary of all information contained in the ICRA's file on you over the telephone, if you make a written request with proper identification for telephone disclosure and pre-pay the toll charge, if any, for the telephone call. You may also request that a copy of the file be sent to a specified address by certified mail. An ICRA complying with requests for certified mailings is not liable for disclosures to third parties caused by mishandling of mail after it leaves the ICRA.

If the City uses an ICRA, then the ICRA will provide trained personnel to explain any information furnished to you and will provide a written explanation of any coded information contained in files maintained on you. This written explanation will be provided whenever a file is provided to you for visual inspection. You may be accompanied by one other person of your choosing, who must furnish reasonable identification. An ICRA may require you to furnish a written statement granting permission to the ICRA to discuss your file in such person's presence.

I acknowledge the receipt of this disclosure, by signing below.

| Applicant N | Name      |
|-------------|-----------|
| Toufic      | Tabshouri |

Signature of Applicant Toutic Tabshound





# Applicant Authorization to Conduct Background Investigation California Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act

I have carefully read and understand the California Investigative Consumer Reporting Agencies Act Disclosure. By my signature below, I authorize the City of San Diego (City) to proceed with a background investigation of my qualifications to serve on the City's Audit Committee. I further authorize the release of my records to the City by law enforcement agencies, educational institutions (including public and private schools and universities), information service bureaus, courts (federal, state, and local), my past and present employers, and any other individuals, agencies, institutions, and other sources holding information pertinent to me.

| Applicaut Name   | Signature of Applicant | Date     |
|------------------|------------------------|----------|
| Toufic Tabshouri | Toutic Tabshown        | 12/27/19 |

Please check this box to receive a free copy of any investigative consumer report obtained by the City from an ICRA.

## Toufic Tabshouri

## **EDUCATION:**

MBA, Information Systems Focus – California State University, Sacramento8/2003BS Business, Finance Concentration – California State University, Sacramento1/2001

## **EMPLOYMENT:**

### Internal Auditor, San Diego Metropolitan Transit System (MTS) - San Diego, CA 12/2013-Present

- Responsible for all internal audit work, from preparing workpapers to delivering presentations before the Audit Oversight Committee.
- Conducted organizational risk assessments and developed annual internal audit plans.
- Performed audits in the following areas:
  - Information technology governance and planning, disaster recovery, payment card industry compliance, information security.
  - > Business continuity planning for the entire organization.
  - > Compliance with federal procurement regulations.
  - > Performance measurement and reporting for all departments.
  - > Inventory management practices for trolley and bus maintenance parts.
  - ▶ Public liability claims handling.
  - ≻ Taxicab regulation in San Diego.
  - ▶ Revenue collections and cash handling practices.
  - $\succ$  Employee overtime pay.
- Established excellent relationships with executive management other stakeholders.
- Provided advisory services in response to management requests.
- Operated the organization's fraud, waste and abuse hotline and investigated complaints.
- Coordinated with Human Resources on personnel matters.
- Monitored the implementation of an enterprise resource planning software system.

## Senior Performance Auditor, City of San Diego – San Diego, CA

- Conducted audits, supervised staff, and presented findings before the City's Audit Committee.
- Received a national award for the best audit report by a large local government audit office in 2011 and in 2012.
- Recommended improvements in the following areas:
  - > Capital improvement planning at the Public Utilities Department.
  - > The administration of an employee incentive program and a performance measurement system at the Public Utilities Department.
  - > The procurement and management of office space by the Real Estate Assets Department.
  - > The provision of emergency medical services and dispatch operations at the Fire-Rescue Department.
  - > The management of the City's liability exposure by the Risk Management Department.
  - > The deployment of police officers by the San Diego Department's Patrol Division.
  - > The accuracy of Melo-Roos tax computations.

## Consultant – Boston, MA

Started a small business offering internal audit and fraud prevention services.

## Senior Auditor, University of California Davis Health System – Sacramento, CA

Conducted various audits and reviews, including:

- Logical security and access controls for the main information technology systems.
- The Compliance Program's annual reporting activities.
- Cash handling procedures at the Cashier's Office.
- Employee expense reimbursement policies and tax issues for a healthcare program.

## 11/2008-7/2009

8/2007-2/2008

8/2009-12/2013

## **Toufic Tabshouri**

#### Auditor Evaluator I & II, California State Auditor – Sacramento, CA

- Transitioned the office from a paper documentation process to a software solution (TeamMate).
- Received several awards for audit work.
- Audited the expenditure of federal funds by state agencies (OMB A-133 audits).
- Served as the project coordinator for the statewide Single Audit for fiscal year 2006.
- Participated in performance audits that examined the:
  - > Management of the state vehicle fleet by the Department of General Services.
  - Assessment of the vehicle license fee by the Department of Motor Vehicle and the apportionment of funds to counties by the State Comptroller's Office.
  - > Administration of an educational program for Native Americans at the Department of Education.
  - > Licensing and monitoring of child care centers by the Department of Social Services.
  - > Contracting and advertising practices at the California Children and Families Commission (First 5).

#### Insurance Claims Adjuster, Allied Insurance - Sacramento

- Interviewed claimants, analyzed accident reports and personal statements to determine liability for accidents.
- Negotiated with claimants, automotive repair shops, insurance representatives, and attorneys.
- Provided customer service, processed claims, and issued payments to customers and other claimants.

#### Graduate Student Assistant, California State University – Sacramento

- Prepared lecture presentations for human resources management and organizational behavior classes.
- Edited research papers for submission to professional journals.
- Graded examinations and papers.

#### Signalman, United States Navy – Bremerton, WA

- Performed job duties as assigned in visual communications, navigation, operations planning and coordination, military police, and security.
- Managed a group of four personnel, and periodically supervised larger groups.

#### **CERTIFICATIONS:**

| Certified Public Accountant (CPA).   | 5/2019  |
|--|---------|
| Certified Internal Auditor (CIA) with the William S. Smith Certificate of Honor.           | 11/2010 |
| Certified Fraud Examiner (CFE).  | 11/2008 |
| Certified Information Systems Auditor (CISA): I passed the exam in 2013; retaking in 2020. |         |

#### **PROFESSSIONAL ACTIVITIES:**

Member, American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. Member, Institute of Internal Auditors. Member, Association of Certified Fraud Examiners. Member, ISACA. Member, California Society of CPAs. 7/2004-7/2007

5/1994-5/1998

2/2003-1/2004

1/2004-7/2004