

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	April 14, 2016	REPORT NO. HRB-16-022
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of April 28, 2016	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 – The Grady and Nora Norris House	
APPLICANT:	Edward and Karen KoiJane represented by Scott A. Moomjian	
LOCATION:	4204 Maryland Street, 92103, U	lptown Community, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of th 4204 Maryland Street as a hist	e Grady and Nora Norris House located at orical resource.

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Grady and Nora Norris House located at 4204 Maryland Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear addition constructed in 1958. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its gable roof with clay tile, single light and multi-light wood windows, stucco exterior with decorative wing walls, decorative window surround on the focal window and arched porch openings.

## BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a preliminary review application to determine whether or not the building is historically significant as part of a constraints analysis for future development. The property is located in the University Height's community in a single and multi-family neighborhood.

The building is located on APN 445-281-17-00. The property was identified in the 2007 Draft Uptown Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Grady and Nora Norris House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the people who constructed the house as their personal residence.

# <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff does not concur and believes that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4204 Maryland Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or University Height's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

# CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4204 Maryland Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1927 in the Spanish Eclectic style, the subject house is one story with a stucco exterior and wood frame and sash windows. The front façade steps out with a gable roof sheathed with clay tile. Flanking the gable are decorative wing walls with the south side featuring an arched opening to access the small covered porch and front door. Adjacent to the front porch is an uncovered porch area surrounding by a low stucco wall. The focal point of the porch is a large single light window with a decorative surround. The north side features a stuccoed chimney flanked by 1/1 double hung windows. Recessed on the wall plane and located behind the chimney portion is a pair of French doors and a small uncovered porch. The remaining windows on this façade are paired and evenly spaced on the wall plane. The rear of the house features a shed roof addition constructed in 1958. Access to the one car garage is located on the south side of the house. The garage has similar but simplified styling of the house. On the north side of the house a number of windows are evenly spaced on the wall plane.

Modifications to the house are limited to a 1958 rear shed roof addition, replacement of French doors on the south side of the house, removal of the decorative wrought iron at the front focal

window, and replacement of the hardscape at the front yard. The modifications are considered minor and do not significantly impair the building's integrity.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including its gable roof with clay tile, single light and multi-light wood windows, stucco exterior with decorative wing walls, decorative window surround on the focal window and arched porch openings. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. The 1958 rear addition shall be excluded from the designation.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 4204 Maryland Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4204 Maryland Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4204 Maryland Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

# **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

# **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Grady and Nora Norris House located at 4204 Maryland Street be designated with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of a Spanish Eclectic style house. The designation excludes the rear addition constructed in 1958. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

JB/ks

Attachment(s):

Kelley Stanco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 4/28/2016

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/28/2016, to consider the historical designation of the **Grady and Nora Norris House** (owned by Edward A.and Karen M. KoiJane, 3099 Sorrel Street, Las Vegas, NV, CA 89146) located at **4204 Maryland Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **445-281-17-00**, further described as VL 344 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

## NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Grady and Nora Norris House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1927 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its gable roof with clay tile, single light and multi-light wood windows, stucco exterior with decorative wing walls, decorative window surround on the focal window and arched porch openings. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear addition constructed in 1958.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

APPROVED: JAN I. GOLDSMITH, CITY ATTORNEY JOHN LEMMO, Chair Historical Resources Board

BY:

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney