

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	August 12, 2021	REPORT NO. HRB-21-047
HEARING DATE:	August 26, 2021	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #02 –GEORGE E. HARRISON HOUSE	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link	
APPLICANT:	Stephen M. Spinella and Brian L. Daly; represented by Landmark Historic Preservation	
LOCATION:	5012 Westminster Terrace, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 APN 440-341-40-00	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the George E. Harrison House located at 5012 Westminster Terrace as a historical resource.	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the George E. Harrison House located at 5012 Westminster Terrace as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 2003 rear addition and the detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a medium sand stucco texture; an asymmetrical front façade; a parapet roof on the rear and a cross gable roof on the front; red mission tiles; flared eaves with no overhang; a rectangular tower with a hipped roof; a large arched focal window; wrought iron grill decoration; stucco decoration; clay and wooden attic vents; and wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is one-story single-family residence with a detached garage located in the Kensington neighborhood of the Mid-City Communities Plan.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the George E. Harrison, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of George E. Harrison, who had the house as their personal residence.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The resource was built as a single-family residence in 1926 in the Spanish Eclectic style. Featuring wooden windows of varying shapes and covered in a medium sand stucco texture the resource is topped with three different roof forms. The front half of the resource features a cross gable, and the back a flat roof with a parapet. In the center of the primary facade is a tower with a hipped roof and three small arched windows diagonally placed facing the street. The front façade faces northeast and is centered around an elevated covered porch. At the rear of the porch is a large tripart window with a fixed center flanked by double hung windows, on the right is a large double hung window, and to the left is the rectangular front entry with a wood door. The concrete covered porch is accessed by a scored concrete path and three rounded steps. Above the porch entrance are three applied stucco decorations. The entrance is to the porch is flanked by half walls that are attached to the resource. A modern, multi-colored tile is in the corner of both walls. To the right of the porch is an arching eight over one double hung window with a three-part stucco detailing above it. To the right of the porch is the gable cover front wing which stretches out to the street. An arched wooden vent is placed in the gable. Below is a large arched focal tri-part window. The center is a single lite fixed window with four over one double hung windows on either side. A rectangular iron grill is placed at the bottom of the window.

The southeast façade faces the drive that leads to the detached garage behind the resource. A stucco covered tapered chimney is centered in the gable end. It has a circular attic vent and two tall grouped double hung windows on each side. On the back half are two sets of two grouped double hung windows and a small single double hung window and two rectangular attic vents. The rear faces southwest and a stucco covered wall connects the 2003 addition to the detached garage with a wood door allowing entry into the backyard. The addition features a metal scupper, two small vinyl single hung windows and a twelve lite French door. The resource's original rear wall features a medium sized vinyl single hung window and a twelve lite French door. Both back entries open on to the lifted wood porch with a pergola. The northwest façade contains an in-filled side entry. Over the former side door is a shed roof with mission red tiles and a stucco covered brackets above a small double hung window. To the right of the in-filled entry way is a wood framed stained glass window

with a rectangular pattern, and to the left is a small double hung window. A rectangular vent is placed below the parapet and three circular vents are in the gable end.

Behind the resource is a pool and detached garage. The garage features an irregular floorplan, a flat roof with a parapet, a medium sand stucco texture, and rectangular vents along the roof line. The northwest façade faces the pool and has and two single door entries, and a large decorative wood bracket which is placed above an off-center jalousie window. The northeast façade contains a wooden two car garage door and an infilled attic vent. The southwest and southeast façades both face neighboring properties, with the southeast façade being an uninterrupted stucco wall, and the southwest façade features two wooden double hung windows and a set of dual wood doors.

Several modifications have taken place since the resource's 1926 period of significance, including the 2003 addition to the rear facade, the installation of the backyard pool in 1957, replacement of the original wood windows in the 1960s with aluminum jalousie windows, and the northeast entry was infilled sometime between the 1940s to the 1970s. All of the clay vents have been stuccoed over and the windowsills are almost flush with the stucco. The exterior of both the house and detached garage were likely re-stuccoed with a medium sand stucco texture sometime before the northeast side entry was infilled, which is noticeable outline in the stucco. In2019 the property owner worked with historical resources staff to restore the one over one wooden double hung windows on the front facade. Later that year 13 more of the altered windows were replaced with one over one wooden double hung windows all around the resource without staff input. The detached garage has had one rectangular attic vent removed, a jalousie window replacement window and non-original large wooden bracket. Based on the 1937 aerial photo there is a door or window were the current off-center jalousie window exists, but there is no decorative large wooden bracket. The alterations to the detached garage, which only minimally reflects the Spanish Eclectic style, exclude it from inclusion in the proposed designation. Overall, these limited modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a medium sand stucco texture; an asymmetrical front façade; a parapet roof on the rear and a cross gable roof on the front; red mission tiles; flared eaves with no overhang; a rectangular tower with a hipped roof; a large arched focal window; wrought iron grill decoration; stucco decoration; clay and wooden attic vents; and wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C. CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 5012 Westminster Terrace did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may can be reevaluated at a future date pending submittal of additional information and analysis.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the George E. Harrison House located at 5012 Westminster Terrace be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 2003 rear addition and the detached garage.

legar Breik

Megan Bacik Junior Planner Development Services Department

MB/SS

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 8/26/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 8/26/2021, to consider the historical designation of the George E. Harrison House (owned by Spinella Stephen M Living Trust 07-19-07, Daly Brian L Living Trust 07-19-07, 5012 Westminster Terrace, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **5012** Westminster Terrace, San Diego, CA 92116, APN: 440-341-40-00, further described as BLK 15 LOT 26-A LOT 26 IN BLK 15 MAP 1848& in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the George E. Harrison House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a medium sand stucco texture, an asymmetrical front façade, a parapet roof on the rear and a cross gable roof on the front, red mission tiles, flared eaves with no overhang, a rectangular tower with a hipped roof, a large arched focal window, wrought iron grill decoration, stucco decoration, clay and wooden attic vents, and wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude excludes the 2003 rear addition and the detached garage

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney

RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

5012 Westminster Terrace, San Diego, CA 92116

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 440-341-40-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)