

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF OCTOBER 22, 2015
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Lemmo at 1:13PM

Chairperson	John Lemmo	Present
Vice Chairperson	Gail Garbini	Present <i>arrived @ 1:14pm</i>
2 nd Vice Chairperson	Linda Marrone	Absent
Boardmember	Michael Baksh	Present <i>left @ 4:46pm</i>
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Maria Curry	Present <i>arrived @ 1:39pm, left @ 3:40pm</i>
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present
Boardmember	Abel Silvas	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES for August 27, 2015 and September 24, 2015

Minutes were not available

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Dan Soderberg: Historic neon Wonder Weavers sign should be saved.

Ian Eply: Potential Historic Districts in Uptown/Hillcrest

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Marrone notified Staff she would not be in attendance.

• **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Item 14
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 15
- ✓ Corrected Draft Resolution for Item-12
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- We are pleased to announce that Jeff Murphy has been appointed as Director of the Planning Department. He was Director for the City of Encinitas for roughly 3 years; and has started with the City about 3 weeks ago. We are very excited to have him on board. He has been thrown into a number of historic preservation issues, so he has been able to get to know us and the Board very quickly. We are looking forward to working with him.
- The Board and the public may recall that the Deputy Director position for the Environmental Resource and Analysis Division, in which we are a part of, has been vacant since Cathy retired last December. An Interim Deputy Director has been appointed until a permanent replacement can be found and that is Martha Blake, who is sitting next to Jodie. Martha was a Senior Planner in the Environmental Analysis Section in Development Services and brings a wealth of CEQA knowledge to the division. We are very excited to have her onboard as well.
- We have begun work on our CLG Grant project to complete a City-wide LGBTQ Historic Context Statement. The Planning Department has contract with our as-needed planning consultant RRM and their sub-consultant GPA Consulting. We are thrilled to have GPA Consulting on board for this project. They bring a wealth of expertise and experience to the project, including the City's historic context statements for Old Town and Midway, as well as the LGBT Context Statement completed for the City of Los Angeles. GPA has just started the research phase of the project, and they will be reaching out to the community, along with the Planning Department, in the coming months to seek additional information regarding the City's LGBTQ history and the built-environment resources significant to that history.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, November 2, 2015 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 9, 2015 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 9, 2015 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 – AMMEN AND HENRIETTA FARENHOLT/CLIFF MAY HOUSE

ITEM 12– ADOLPHUS HATCHER HOUSE

ITEM 13– ROBERT AND LAURA FORD HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO APPROVE ITEMS 8, 12 AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – 3136 JAMES STREET

Trailed from September 2015

Applicant: Aaron and Laura Schneir represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3136 James Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3136 James Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3136 James Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-0411

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Aaron Schneir, Laura Schneir, Sasha Snyder, Megan Guyott, June Daspit, Paul Daspit, Amy Ives, Marsha Dolkas

In Opposition: David Goldberg, Ron May, A. Hayes, Kiley Wallace, Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 – HENRY AND HELEN CHANDLER HOUSE AS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE. WITH STYLISTIC FEATURES THAT VISUALLY ECHO IRVING GILL’S WORK AND FORESHADOW MODERNISM. THE PROPERTY RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1922 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. IN PARTICULAR, THE RESOURCE RETAINS THE ASYMMETRICAL FAÇADE, FLAT ROOF, STEP PARAPETS, SMOOTH STUCCO EXTERIOR WALLS AND CHIMNEY, WOOD FRAME MULTI-LITE CASEMENT WINDOWS AND DOUBLE HUNG WINDOWS WITH STYLISTIC GEOMETRIC WOOD CASING AROUND THE FRONT DOOR AND WINDOWS, A RAISED STAMP CONCRETE STOOP HEIGHTENED BY THE STYLISTIC FEATURES OF SIMPLE

MASSING AND FORM. THIS FINDING IS SUPPORTED BY THE INFORMATION IN THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, STAFF REPORT, AND ORAL AND WRITTEN EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Fails

(Baksh, Lemmo, Woods)

ITEM 6 – 335 DUNEMERE DRIVE

Trailed from September 2015

Applicant: Edward and Linda Serros Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 335 Dunemere Drive, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 **(1247 1-E)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 335 Dunemere Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 335 Dunemere Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-040

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Sue Skala, Edward Serros, Linda Serros

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – 335 DUNEMERE DRIVE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Passes

(Garbini, Curry, Berge)

ITEM 7 – 1845 29th STREET

Continued from March 2014

Applicant: James and Johannah Valentine represented by IS Architecture

Location: 1845 29th Street, 92101, Greater Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 **(1289 1-E)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1845 29th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1845 29th Street under any adopted HRB Criteria, due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff memo dated October 15, 2015 and HRB 14-023

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ione Stiegler, James Valentine

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – MIGUEL AND ERNESTINA PLATT LOPEZ HOUSE AS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE. THE PROPERTY RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1929 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. IN PARTICULAR, THE RESOURCE RETAINS ITS ASYMMETRICAL FAÇADE, RED TILE ROOF, STUCCO EXTERIOR WALLS AND CHIMNEY, WOOD WINDOWS, BALCONY, ARCHES, MOORISH FRONT DOOR, AIR VENTED CORBELS AND WOODEN CORBELS. THIS FINDING IS SUPPORTED BY THE INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND ORAL AND WRITTEN EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 8 – AMMEN AND HENRIETTA FARENHOLT/CLIFF MAY HOUSE

Continued from July 2015

Applicant: Terence M. Choate represented by Archaeos

Location: 3626 Hyacinth Drive, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3626 Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Ammen and Henrietta Farenholt/Cliff May House located at 3626 Hyacinth Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the 1966 two story addition to the northeast wing of the property.

Report Number: Staff memo dated October 8, 2015 and HRB 15-032

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – JOE KRUGER SPEC HOUSE #1

Continued from September 2015

Applicant: Ferraro Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4366 North Talmadge Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4366 North Talmadge Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Joe Kruger Spec House #1 located at 4366 North Talmadge Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criterion C. The designation includes the interior plaster fireplace and tile hearth.

Report Number: Memos dated September 10, 2015 and July 9, 2015 and HRB 15-018

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Kiley Wallace, Alexandra Wallace, Ron May, Dan Soderberg, Katie Ferraro, Bruce Coons, Paul Johnson

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – JOE KRUGER SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF’S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Curry

Vote: 7-1-0
(Larimer)

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – 575 ALBION STREET

Continued from September 2015

Applicant: Maureen E Feary Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 575 Albion Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 3-A)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 575 Albion Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 575 Albion Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-036

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Ron May, Alexandra Wallace, Maureen Feary, Kiley Wallace

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – HARRY AND LOUDELLE BENBOUGH HOUSE AS HISTORICALLY SIGNIFICANT UNDER CRITERION C FOR ITS DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE CUSTOM RANCH STYLE. THE PROPERTY RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1950-1968 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. IN PARTICULAR, AS OUTLINED IN THE STAFF REPORT, THE HOME REMAINS AN IRREGULAR, “L”-SHAPED FLOOR PLAN; A GENEROUS FRONT YARD SETBACK AND A PRIVATE REAR YARD; LOW-PITCHED, GABLED ROOF IS SHEATHED IN WOOD SHAKE AND EXHIBITS MODERATE EAVE OVERHANG WITH EXPOSED RAFTERS; CLADDING CONSISTS OF A MIXTURE OF BOARD AND BATTEN, WIDE HORIZONTAL CLAPBOARD, AND RUSTIC BRICK VENEER; A BRICK WALKWAY AT THE PRIMARY ELEVATION LEADS TO A MODEST ENTRY PORCH COVERED BY THE PRINCIPAL ROOF WITH A WOODEN DUTCH FRONT DOOR; FENESTRATION CONSISTS PRIMARILY OF WOOD DIVIDED LIGHT DOUBLE HUNG WINDOWS OF VARYING SIZES WITH LOUVERED DECORATIVE WOOD SHUTTERS FOR THE TWO PRESENTATION FAÇADES ALONG ALBION STREET AND DUPONT STREET. THIS FINDING IS SUPPORTED BY THE INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND ORAL AND WRITTEN EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 5-2-0
(Woods, Baksh)

Motion Fails

ITEM 11 – 1311 SUTTER STREET

Applicant: Mary Perry represented by Brian F. Smith & Associates, Inc. and Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1311 Sutter Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 6-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1311 Sutter Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1311 Sutter Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 15-051

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Mary Perry, Scott Moomjian, Brian Smith, Kent Smith

In Opposition: Ron May, Barry Hagar, Laura Largey, Hugh Largey, Kiley Wallace

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE UNDER CRITERION D WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1924-1925. THE RESOURCE IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF MARTIN V. MELHORN, A MASTER BUILDER, AND RETAINS INTEGRITY AS IT RELATES TO THE ORIGINAL DESIGN. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE DEMONSTRATES THE MASTER BUILDER’S CRAFTSMANSHIP AND DESIGN AS APPLIED TO A SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE BUNGALOW. INCLUDING THE WOODEN BRACKETS, WOODEN ATTIC VENTS, WOOD FRAME WINDOWS AND STUCCO WING WALLS. AND IS AN EXAMPLE OF MELHORN’S WORK PRIOR TO HIS DEATH. THIS MOTION IS FULLY SUPPORTED BY THE INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, PAGES 9 AND 10 OF THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Silvas

Vote: 3-4-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Larimer, Woods, Baksh)

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER LARIMER TO DESIGNATE ITEM 11 UNDER CRITERION C. THE BUILDING EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1924-1925. HIGHLIGHTING THE EXACT SAME ITEMS THAT WERE OUTLINED IN TERMS OF SUPPORTING EVIDENCE FROM THE PREVIOUS MOTION, EXCLUDING THE NAME.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 4-3-0

Motion Fails

(Lemmo, Woods, Baksh)

ITEM 12 – ADOLPHUS HATCHER HOUSE

Applicant: Hill-Sachs Family Trust represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 4407 Georgia Street, 92116, Greater North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 4-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4407 Georgia Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Adolphus Hatcher House located at 4407 Georgia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1910 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 170 square foot rear bedroom addition.

Report Number: HRB 15-045

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – ROBERT AND LAURA FORD HOUSE

Applicant: Shapiro/Calahorro Family Revocable Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 1237 Cypress Court, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-B)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1237 Cypress Court as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Robert and Laura Ford House located at 1237 Cypress Court as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB C. The designation excludes the rear second story balcony enclosure.

Report Number: HRB 15-046

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 14 – GEORGE AND IRIS GOODMAN HOUSE

Applicant: Costa Family Trust represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

Location: 5330 Le Barron Road, 92115, College Area Community, Council District 9 (1269 2-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5330 Le Barron Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the George and Iris Goodman House located at 5330 Le Barron Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1968 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 15-047

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Allen Hazard, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR GARBINI TO DESIGNATE ITEM 15 – GEORGE AND IRIS GOODMAN HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND INCLUDING THE FOLLOWING MODIFICATION: THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE MID CENTURY MODERNISM'S INTEGRATION OF INDOOR AND OUTDOOR SPACES. THE RESIDENCE APPEARS TO BE SET WITHIN A NATURAL PARK-LIKE SETTING. CHARACTER

DEFINING FEATURES INCLUDE THE "NATURAL LAND FORM" AND USE OF LARGE TREES INCLUDING A SPECIMEN OLIVE TREE AND GROVE OF 3 CALIFORNIA SYCAMORE TREES.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 15 – JOHN AND JOAN LIGHTNER/ROY DREW HOUSE

Applicant: Dennis and Jennette Shay Living Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 420 Silvergate Avenue, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1287 4-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 420 Silvergate Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Joan Lightner/Roy Drew House located at 420 Silvergate Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1965-1969 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 15-048

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO DESIGNATE ITEM 15 – JOHN AND JOAN LIGHTNER/ROY DREW HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Garbini

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 16 – SOUTHEASTERN SAN DIEGO AND ENCANTO NEIGHBORHOODS COMMUNITY PLAN UPDATES

Applicant: City of San Diego

Location: Southeastern San Diego and Encanto Neighborhoods, Council Districts 4, 8 and 9

Description: Review and consider the Southeastern San Diego and Encanto Neighborhoods Historic Survey (Survey), the Historic Preservation Element of the Southeastern San Diego and Encanto Neighborhoods Community Plan update (HPE), and the Final Environmental Impact Report (FEIR) related to Cultural/Historical Resources for the purposes of making a Recommendation on the adoption of the Survey, HPE and FEIR to the City Council.

Today's Action: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Survey, HPE, and FEIR or do not recommend adoption.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the City Council adoption of the Southeastern San Diego Historic Context Statement; the Historic Preservation Element of the Southeastern San Diego and Encanto Neighborhoods Community Plan updates; the Sherman Heights and Grant Hill Park Historic District CPIOZ; and the Final Environmental Impact Report related to Historical Resources.

Report Number: HRB 15-049

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: David Swarens, Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR LEMMO TO RECOMMEND TO THE CITY COUNCIL ADOPTION OF THE SOUTHEASTERN SAN DIEGO HISTORIC CONTEXT STATEMENT; THE HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT OF THE SOUTHEASTERN SAN DIEGO AND ENCANTO NEIGHBORHOODS COMMUNITY PLAN UPDATES; THE SHERMAN HEIGHTS AND GRANT HILL PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT CPIOZ; AND THE FINAL ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT REPORT RELATED TO HISTORICAL RESOURCES ACCORDING TO STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER: NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Friday, November 20, 2015
LOCATION: City Administration Building,
12th Floor, Council Committee Room

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 6:00PM