



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

CITIZENS' EQUAL OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, September 2, 2020

Online Virtual Meeting

[CLICK HERE](#) TO VIEW LIVE RECORDING VIA YOUTUBE at its scheduled time.

CALL TO ORDER at: 6:12 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Kristine Custodio, Chair
Beth Kransberger, Vice Chair
Cinnamon Clark
Susan Jester

Dan Ortiz arrived at 6:18pm
Rafael Ortiz
Tony Teravainen

ABSENT: Gemma Blain

STAFF:

Christian Silva, Program Manager, Equal Opportunity Contracting
Cheryl Smoot, Supervising Management Analyst, Equal Opportunity Contracting
Damian Singleton, Senior Management Analyst, Equal Opportunity Contracting
Maria Aleman, Associate Management Analyst, Equal Opportunity Contracting

GUESTS:

Kevin William, Managing Director
BBC Research & Consulting

Lori Large, Director of Research
Action Research

Betsy Sava, Research Associate
BBC Research & Consulting

Perla Sandoval, Associate
Action Research

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT: None

APPROVAL OF: MEETING MINUTES OF [August 5, 2020](#): Passed unanimously

Motion made by Commissioner Cinnamon Clark, seconded by Commissioner Susan Jester

Commissioner Kransberger – Yay
Commissioner Clark – Yay
Commissioner Jester – Yay
Commissioner Perez – Yay

Chair Custodio-Suero – Yay
Commissioner Teravainen – Yay

NOT PRESENT FOR APPROVAL: Commissioner Dan Ortiz; arrived at 6:18 p.m.

Item 4: DISCUSSION ITEMS

A. Mr. Kevin Williams of BBC Research and Consulting provided a presentation to the commission regarding the City's ongoing disparity study.
Presentation Materials: [2020 Disparity Study PowerPoint Presentation](#) and [Disparity Study Flyer](#)

- BBC Research & Consulting Research's team for the study is comprised of:
 - Action Research-Anecdotal Expert
 - GCAP Services- Program Expert
 - Customer Research Int. -Survey Expert
 - Holland & Knight-Legal Expert

 - Disparity Analysis will consist of an examination of a disparity index: The percentage of contract dollars that the City spent with minority- and woman-owned businesses during the study period (utilization); and
 - The percentage of contract dollars that minority-, woman- and disabled veteran-owned businesses might be expected to receive based on their availability to perform specific types and sizes of City contracts (availability).
 - The Disparity Index will be composed of the calculation of dollars received over that of dollars available.
 - Substantial underutilization will be found to exist when there is a calculation of .80 or less.
- Community Engagement & Outreach
 - Draft results are expected to be completed in mid-November, however, there may be a delay to ensure proper outreach efforts are met given the current COVID-19 regulations, which has limited community engagement.
 - Vice-Chair Kransberger asked about which organizations have been contacted and stated any assistance that she can provide to facilitate coordination efforts she would be happy to do so.
 - Mr. Williams (BBC) stated if possible, they would return to provide feedback on the outreach efforts to ensure the efforts are satisfactory for all involved.
 - Mr. Silva has added the Disparity Study flyer for the Commissioners to utilize to facilitate outreach coordination efforts.
 - Commissioner Clark asked about the projects' timeline as there are differences from timeline posted on City's page and what has been presented.
 - Mr. Williams stated that the execution of the timeline presented depends on the anecdotal information (outreach efforts) obtained. Given the current state of COVID-19 regulations and the upcoming Holiday season, there may be a delay to ensure that the data is collected and inclusive.

- Commissioner Teravainen asked if there is a benchmark or threshold to indicate what would classify as “satisfactory” or show that this is the appropriate amount of data has been collected to ensure accuracy should the study’s results be challenged.
- Mr. Williams stated that the Courts’ have not stated what constitutes as enough, which has led them to go over and beyond what is expected for their research.
 - They will be conducting 40 in depth interviews with regional business owners’ and attending/facilitating public meetings which would satisfy the Court’s expectations.
 - By October, BBC will be aiming to present their data and ensure it has met the City’s expectations.
- Anecdotal Data
 - Mr. Williams indicated that their subcontractor, Action Research, is working to provide surveys to business’ and conduct recorded interviews.
 - Ms. Large & Ms. Sandoval stated a small sample was conducted in May with little feedback. Currently, there has been more feedback from businesses.
 - Commissioner Jester and Commissioner Teravainen requested a report in October/end of the year that can outline the organizations participating and the data collected.
 - Mr. Williams stated he would be working with the City and if possible, can provide an update and provide a sample from their current SANDAG study.
 - Commissioner Kransberger can the study address the potential issue within organizations in hiring minorities.
 - Commissioner Jester asked if the information can allow for the program to add a diversity officer.
 - Mr. Williams stated that in past studies, this has been discussed.

STAFF UPDATES

Mr. Singleton provided the EOC program update including information on SLBE applications, outreach events, and an upcoming bid list for the Engineering & Capital Projects department.

CHAIR ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Custodio Suero reminded the commissioners about current vacancies (Native American, African American, and Disabled) and the importance of succession planning as 3 commissioners will be terming out at the end of the calendar year (Perez – At-Large Member; Ortiz – Latino; Custodio – Filipino). Chair Custodio Suero inquired regarding the status of applications. Ms. Smoot indicated EOC staff has reached out to the Office of Boards & Commissions regarding the vacancies and upcoming term expirations of current members.

ADJOURNMENT at 7:21 p.m.

Accessibility: This information will be made available in alternative formats upon request as required by the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) by contacting Damian Singleton at 619-236-6048. Requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for auxiliary aids, services or interpreters, require different lead times, ranging from five business days to two weeks. Please provide as much advance notice as possible in order to ensure availability. Assistive Listening Devices are available upon request.