



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

CITIZENS' EQUAL OPPORTUNITY COMMISSION

MEETING MINUTES

Wednesday, October 7, 2020

Online Virtual Meeting

[CLICK HERE](#) TO VIEW LIVE RECORDING VIA YOUTUBE

CALL TO ORDER at: 6:04 p.m.

ROLL CALL:

Kristine Custodio Suero, Chair
Beth Kransberger, Vice Chair
Cinnamon Clark
Susan Jester

Dan Ortiz
Rafael Ortiz
Tony Teravainen
Gemma Blain

STAFF:

Christian Silva, Program Manager, Equal Opportunity Contracting
Cheryl Smoot, Supervising Management Analyst, Equal Opportunity Contracting
Damian Singleton, Senior Management Analyst, Equal Opportunity Contracting
Maria Aleman, Associate Management Analyst, Equal Opportunity Contracting

GUESTS:

Kevin William, Managing Director
BBC Research & Consulting

Lori Large, Director of Research
Action Research

Betsy Sava, Research Associate
BBC Research & Consulting

Perla Sandoval, Associate
Action Research

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT: None

APPROVAL OF: MEETING MINUTES OF [September 2, 2020](#) : Passed unanimously

Motion made by Commissioner Cinnamon Clark, seconded by Vice Chair Beth Kransberger

Commissioner Blain – Yay
Commissioner Clark – Yay
Commissioner Jester – Yay
Commissioner Perez – Yay

Commissioner Teravainen – Yay
Commissioner Cinnamon Clark – Yay
Vice Chair Beth Kransberger – Yay
Chair Custodio-Suero – Yay

Item 4: DISCUSSION ITEMS

- A. Mr. Kevin Williams of BBC Research and Consulting provided an update to the commission regarding the City's ongoing disparity study.

Presentation Materials: [2020 Disparity Study PowerPoint Presentation](#)

- BBC Research & Consulting Research's Community Engagement Efforts:
 - Informational Efforts: Utilized to provide ongoing Disparity Study Information
 - BBC utilizes Citizens Equal Opportunity Commission to provide ongoing assistance for the Disparity Study
 - BBC provides transparency by providing up to date information on their City page [Webpage](#) /email
 - Public Notices are utilized for public meeting/events to allow for adequate notice to interested organizations
 - Public Meetings are utilized to allow for transparency with the public and to facilitate community engagement
 - Engagement Efforts
 - Webinars/Public meetings
 - Ongoing efforts for either a public meeting for contractors or an opportunity to attend contractor's meeting to provide a presentation or discussion surrounding the Disparity Study
 - Business Surveys
 - Currently, over 400 surveys concerning marketplace issues in San Diego have been conducted
 - In-Depth Interviews
 - About 13 interviews with business owners concerning challenges/barriers have been conducted.
- BBC's Research Efforts: Anecdotal Evidence and Qualitative Evidence
 - Precedence:
 - Courts' have stated that anecdotal evidence concerning discrimination claims are not sufficient evidence.
 - 9th circuit Court of Appeals found BBC's previous research concerning disparity study for Caltrans DBE certification program's adequate.
 - Goals for City of San Diego Anecdotal Research
 - To continue to utilize anecdotal evidence to bolster qualitative evidence to ensure their efforts are found to be adequate.
 - To reach many different types of businesses
 - To document barriers that exist in the marketplace
 - Commissioner Clark: Disparity Study webpage does not seem to have an up to date timeline and requests the dates for the upcoming public meetings for Community meetings
 - Mr. Williams: Timeline is correct as the research is still ongoing and on track and a public meeting is currently scheduled for November 10th.
 - Mr. Silva: Currently working with the City of San Diego's IT department to provide an updated timeline to reflect COVID-19 impacts.
- Current Potential Barriers in Marketplace:
 - Financing & Bonding
 - Marketing
 - Bid process & Criteria
 - Size of contracts & Capacity
 - Prompt payments

- Outreach Efforts
 - Upcoming EOC meeting: Invitations sent to numerous organizations.
 - Solicitation for participation sent to potential engagement partners
 - Vice Chair Kransberger: Has there been a Delineation between groups who support the Study and those who do not?
 - Mr. Williams: Efforts are made to connect with all affected businesses.
 - Vice Chair Kransberger: Is BBC providing compensation, i.e., gift cards for their time, given that the responsibility for the current state of affairs is on the City
 - Mr. Williams: Currently BBC does not compensate but can look into possibility of compensation.
 - Commissioner Clark: For businesses that have not communicated – Is there anything else that can allow for further efforts to facilitate communication
 - Ms. Large: Followed up on all provided efforts to reach as many businesses as possible and is open to facilitate any further efforts.
 - Vice Chair Kransberger: It would be helpful to receive a list of businesses/organizations that have not been responsive to facilitate communication given the current state of affairs.
 - Mr. Williams: Can provide a list of organization that have communicated
- Public Meetings:
 - CEOC meeting – September 2, 2020
 - SLBE/ELBE industry meeting – August 19, 2020
 - Construction industry Meeting – November 19, 2020
 - EOC Hosted Meeting – TBD (November 10, 2020)
- Focus Groups:
 - CEOC- October 28, 2020
 - NAACP San Diego – October 30, 2020
 - Vice Chair Kransberger: Must work with Chicano Federation to provide equal accessibility. Can provide resources to facilitate communication.
 - Mr. Williams: All resources are welcomed
 - Commissioner Blane: Does timeline allow for additional focus groups?
 - Mr. Williams: More focus groups can be added if the City of San Diego indicates a need for additional focus groups.
 - Commissioner Blain: Were the previously discussed organizations solicited to form a focus group or to have informal conversation?
 - Mr. Williams: Organizations were contacted to have an informal conversation and to establish a line of communication concerning the Disparity Study.
 - Commissioner Clark: What was the criteria for the focus groups?
 - Mr. Williams and Ms. Large: The NAACP provided a lot of information, ideas and enthusiasm. CEOC is active in helping the City move forward with current policies and is more knowledgeable with barriers and City functions.
 - Vice Chair Kransberger: Mr. Williams are you communicating with City Council?
 - Mr. Williams: All communication is through CEOC staff
- Testimony:
 - Encourage continued efforts to obtain testimonial concerning:
 - Experiences with discrimination
 - Barriers to success
 - Payment issues
 - Private or public sector work
 - Prime contractor or subcontractor
 - Working with state agencies

STAFF UPDATES

Mr. Singleton provided the EOC program update including information on SLBE applications, outreach events, and an upcoming bid list for the Engineering & Capital Projects department.

CHAIR ANNOUNCEMENTS

Chair Custodio Suero:

- City Council amended municipal code on September 29, 2020 to include the Office of Race & Equity.
Requested to keep apprised on Office of Race & Equity staff, to allow for an invitation to the appointed director for future CEOC meeting.

ADJOURNMENT at 6:54 p.m.

Accessibility: This information will be made available in alternative formats upon request as required by the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) by contacting Damian Singleton at 619-236-6048. Requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for auxiliary aids, services or interpreters, require different lead times, ranging from five business days to two weeks. Please provide as much advance notice as possible in order to ensure availability. Assistive Listening Devices are available upon request.