



COMMUNITY REVIEW BOARD ON POLICE PRACTICES

MINUTES

**Tuesday, August 27, 2019
Valencia Park/Malcolm X Branch Library
5148 Market Street
San Diego, CA 92114**

Members Present:

Joe Craver, Chair
Brandon Hilpert, 1st Vice Chair
Taura Gentry, 2nd Vice Chair
Doug Case
Gregory Daunoras
Diana Dent
Poppy Fitch
Kevin Herington
Sheila Holtrop

Steve Hsieh
Ramon Montano
Mary O'Tousa
Maria Nieto-Senour
Ernestine Smith
Pauline Theodore
Nancy Vaughn
Patrick Anderson
Maxine Clark

Members Absent:

Marty Workman
Bonnie Kenk
Alex Hu

CRB Staff Present:

Sharmaine Moseley, Executive Director, CRB on Police Practices

SDPD Staff Present:

Todd Jarvis, Executive Assistant Chief, San Diego Police Department
Wes Morris, Captain, San Diego Police Department
Mark Bennett, Lt., San Diego Police Department
Charles Lara, Lt., San Diego Police Department

-
- I. **CALL TO ORDER/WELCOME:** Chair Joe Craver called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.
 - II. **PURPOSE OF THE COMMUNITY REVIEW BOARD ON POLICE PRACTICES:** Chair Joe Craver explained the purpose of the Community Review Board on Police Practices (CRB) to those in attendance.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES: CRB Open Meeting Minutes of July 23, 2019

The Board reviewed the minutes. Member Mary O'Tousa requested a correction on page 3, item VI, titled Educational Topic. "Segway" should be changed to "segue." Chair Joe Craver moved for the Board's approval of its July 23, 2019 meeting minutes with the amendment. Nancy Vaughn seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 17-0-1. Chair Joe Craver abstained from voting.

Yays: 1st Vice Chair Hilpert, 2nd Vice Chair Gentry, Members- Anderson, Case, Clark, Daunoras, Dent, Fitch, Herington, Holtrop, Hsieh, Montano, Nieto-Senour, O'Tousa, Smith, Theodore, and Vaughn

Nays: None

Abstain: Chair Craver

Members Absent: Hu, Kenk, Workman

IV. NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT: None

V. EDUCATIONAL TOPIC: "Implicit Bias Training for Law Enforcement"

Guest Speaker: Matthew Wagner – (Associate Director for Law Enforcement Initiatives & Community Security, Anti-Defamation League)

Matthew Wagner provided the Board with an overview of the Anti-Defamation League (ADL). The Anti-Defamation League educates, advocates, and investigates around issues of bias, inclusivity, diversity, anti-Semitism, racism, and any issues of prejudice. The Anti-Defamation League is a non-profit organization founded in 1913 in response to the growing climate of anti-Semitism and bigotry. Their mission statement is to "stop the defamation of the Jewish people and to secure justice and fair treatment for all." Mr. Wagner explained the focus of the ADL's Implicit Bias Training Program. The ADL is a subject matter expert on hate crimes. They provide training on extremist signs and symbols. The ADL provides training to law enforcement annually on implicit bias at its Training Academy. ADL has an educational program that has been adopted by San Diego Unified School District and other districts. The training provided to law enforcement focuses on the different forms of bias. Implicit bias is the unconscious association that we all have between groups of people based on preconceived notion and uninformed stereotype about those groups. Implicit bias is different from explicit bias which is what is most frequently used interchangeably with overt racism in the context of race law. Bias can apply to any identity such as sex, age, gender, national origin, etc. It is unconscious and not done on purpose. Explicit bias is intentional, conscious,

and being acted upon for that bias. The ADL provides a managing implicit bias program. The ADL provided 10 sessions of this training to the San Diego Police Department personnel ranked Sergeants and above. The program is conducted through workshop sessions focused on self-awareness. The activities conducted are based around individuals such as where they come from, how they have grown up, and the associations individuals have on the world based on their perspective and schema. The training is an 8-hour course. At the end of the course, the ADL offers strategies and tools to reduce reliance on schemas and to help the trainees become more aware. The ADL has received positive feedback on the training.

Chair Craver opened up the discussion for questions from the CRB members and then the public.

VI. UNFINISHED BUSINESS (DISCUSSION/ACTION)

A. Proposed revision to CRB Administrative Standing Rule on Case Format & Presentation: Titles for Non-SDPD Individuals (Section 1b, Face Sheet)

Rules Committee Chair Doug Case explained that the Committee was proposing this revision to the Administrative Standing Rule on Case Format & Presentation because in the CRB's case reports the CRB use titles for SDPD officers. The Committee felt that it was appropriate to use titles for non-SDPD individuals. The titles for non-SDPD individuals would include: Mr., Miss., Ms., Mrs., Rev, Dr., Capt., etc. The question arose that what if the individual did not identify with one of the above titles. The Committee researched appropriated gender-neutral terms and agreed on the use of Mx which was included in the proposal before the Board.

Committee Chair Case read the following proposal. "Reference to every person should use a title followed by the person's last name in all CAPITAL LETTERS. In the case of multiple persons with the same last name, an initial can be inserted before the last name, or the first names can be used if appropriate. Titles for SDPD officers should reflect that officer's rank on the date of the incident (not the rank at the time of this investigation). Titles for non-SDPD persons should be appropriate for status and gender; use Mr. for men and Miss, Ms. or Mrs. for women and where appropriate gender-neutral term Mx. can be used. Examples of SDPD officer names would be "Officer SMITH" or Sgt. MILLER; examples of non-SDPD names would be "Mr. BROWN, Ms. GRANDE, Mrs. P. BROWN, Miss S. BROWN or Mx. JONES. Other titles, such as professional or military titles (e.g., Dr., Rev., Capt., etc.) are also appropriate."

ACTION ITEM: Doug Case moved for the Board to approve the CRB Administrative Standing Rule on Case Format & Presentation: Titles for

Non-SDPD Individuals. Taura Gentry seconded the motion. The motion passed with a vote of 17-0-1. Chair Joe Craver abstained from voting.

Yays: 1st Vice Chair Hilpert, 2nd Vice Chair Gentry, Members- Anderson, Case, Clark, Daunoras, Dent, Fitch, Herington, Holtrop, Hsieh, Montano, Nieto-Senour, O'Tousa, Smith, Theodore, and Vaughn

Nays: None

Abstain: Chair Craver

Members Absent: Hu, Kenk, Workman

VII. NEW BUSINESS (DISCUSSION/ACTION): None

VIII. COMMITTEE REPORTS (DISCUSSION/ACTION)

A. Continuing Education Committee (10 mins) (Taura Gentry)

- i. Upcoming Educational Topics – Committee Chair Gentry reported that tonight the Board learned about the training provided to law enforcement from the Anti-Defamation League. The Community has asked her to consider looking at Drug Addiction and Domestic Violence topics. She asked the Board for feedback on future educational topics.
- ii. Feedback on CRB Training & Police Perjury Panel (Discussion Item) Committee Chair Gentry reported that the Board held a Police Panel Discussion that was well-attended. She requested feedback from the Board. Ms. Gentry thanked the members who attended the discussion. Greg Daunoras stated that the panel was well-balanced organized. Chair Craver stated that the panel were top-notch. The Board want to do more of these discussions out in the community.
- iii. Ideas/Requests for Future Educational Topics, Field Trips, Trainings Committee Chair Gentry stated that she received feedback from the members to arrange for more fieldtrips.

1st Vice Chair Brandon Hilpert agreed to join this committee.

B. Outreach Committee (5 mins) (Mary O'Tousa)

- i. Summary of Past Events –Committee Chair Mary O'Tousa reported that members of the Board attended National Night Out in various locations on August 6; a CAST Meeting on August 8; Unity Games on August 10, and Mid-City Storefront Cultural Community Barbeque.
- ii. Feedback on Past Events (Discussion Item) – Committee Chair O'Tousa stated that she created a spreadsheet which was circulated to the full Board. The spreadsheet will consist of opportunities to do outreach. She referenced the Board's bylaws. She wants members

to use the spreadsheet to let her know what they are planning to attend. The Committee wants to make sure that members can attend the events that the Board committed to.

- iii. Upcoming Events/Outreach Opportunities – Committee Chair O'Tousa reported that she and CRB leadership will give a presentation about the CRB to the Past Grand Jury in September.

C. Rules Committee (10 mins) (Doug Case)

Items being Considered by Rules Committee

- i. Potential Elements for Public Case Summaries (Discussion Item) – Committee Chair Doug Case reported that the Committee was tasked with looking at providing more detail to the complainant regarding the outcome/finding of an investigation. The Committee also looked at can the Board provide information such as case summaries to the public. The Board can provide more information but must be careful and make sure that the information is legal and appropriate. The Committee agreed that brief summaries would be done in conjunction with the Board's semi-annual reports that are given to Council and added to the CRB's website. The Committee plan to develop a Standing Rule on how the summaries will be written. Committee Chair Case highlighted the elements that would be in the summaries such as the rationale of the findings, incident description, allegations, and comments. The Committee agreed to not add the list of items reviewed by the Teams to the summaries. There is no mention of meetings between the Teams and IA because the Committee agreed that the summaries would be based on the Board's decision.

The Committee hopes to finalize this at the Board's next meeting. Feedback from the Board regarding this document is encouraged. Member Anderson suggested adding the number of meetings between the Teams and IA as well as the list of items reviewed to the summaries. 1st Vice Chair Hilpert suggested adding a timeline regarding the amount of time it takes for SDPD and the Teams to finalize the summaries. Member Vaughn stated that the table used by the Teams should be included in the summaries. Member O'Tousa stated that supports 1st Vice Chair Hilpert's suggestion. She encourages the Committee to look at the review process and make sure that this follows the spirit of the law.

- ii. Schedule Next Rules Committee Meeting – The next meeting depends on if the Board keeps it Open Meeting in September.

D. CRB Handbook Committee – Status Update (2 mins) (Doug Case)
Committee Chair Doug Case reported that the Committee is waiting on some documents for the new handbook. We should have the handbook

ready for distribution next month. It will be a living handbook. There will always be updates to it.

- E. Policy Committee (5 mins) (Brandon Hilpert)
Items being Considered by Policy Committee
- i. Procedure & Guideline for SDPD Complaint Intake -Committee Chair Hilpert reported that he and 2nd Vice Chair Taura Gentry are working on a complaint process card for SDPD.
 - ii. Modify SDPD Procedure 1.49: Axon Body Worn Cameras -Section Q 7(N) – This was a community member generated recommendation. The Policy Committee agreed to have 2nd Vice Chair Taura Gentry sponsor this recommendation and reach out to the individual for clarification on this item.
 - iii. Development of Third-Party Mediation – Committee Chair Hilpert and member Nancy Vaughn are working on this item.
 - iv. Best Practices Research for Law Enforcement Investigations Involving Discrimination Allegations – Member Patrick Anderson is researching this item.
 - v. Complaint Process Guide Card Issued to All Sworn Personnel – Committee Chair Hilpert and 2nd Vice Chair Taura Gentry are working on a complaint process card for SDPD. They will try to get some of the information that is on the complaint form on to the card for Sergeants to use in the field.
 - vi. Require that SDPD officers provide and/or call for medical assistance in all situations where a person shows signs that they might be in medical distress – This is a community member generated recommendation. This item was assigned to 2nd Vice Chair Taura Gentry to follow-up on with the community member.
 - vii. Next Scheduled Meeting Date – The next Policy Committee Meeting is scheduled for September 10 at 4 p.m.
- F. Recruitment & Training Committee (5 mins) (Maria Nieto-Senour)
- i. Update on New CRB Training Academy -Implementation/Process, Marketing, Timeline – No Report Given
 - ii. 8/14 Informational Session Update -Committee Chair Nieto-Senour reported that the Committee held an Informational Session on August 14th. Ten attendees expressed interest and signed up to be on the Board and go through the training.
 - iii. Interview Panel Improvements – No Report Given
 - iv. Draft Process Flow Chart – No Report Given

- v. Next Scheduled Meeting Date (TBD) – Committee Chair Nieto-Senour asked Executive Director Moseley to schedule a meeting of the Committee.
- G. Citizens Advisory Board on Police Community Relations (CAB) (Taura Gentry)
- Next Meeting Scheduled for September 23 – 2nd Vice Chair Taura Gentry reported that this month was dark for CAB. The next meeting is scheduled for September.
- H. 30th Anniversary Celebration Date (October 2019) (Brandon Hilpert)
- Date and Location -Central Library – 1st Vice Chair Hilpert reported that members Nancy Vaughn and Poppy Fitch volunteered to be on this Committee. 2nd Vice Chair Taura Gentry and Chair Joe Craver were added to the Committee. The Board need to commit to a date soon because we are nearing the end of the year. Executive Director Moseley stated that she will make available the list used for a previous CRB Anniversary Event.
- IX. CHAIR’S REPORT (5 mins) (Chair Joe Craver)
- i. Reminder -1st Quarter (July 1-September 30) Volunteer Hours Report (**Due October 1, 2019**) – Chair Joe Craver reminded the Board to fill out their volunteer hours which is due of October 1, 2019.
 - ii. NACOLE Annual Conference -September 22-26, Detroit Michigan -2nd Vice Chair Gentry and Executive Director Moseley will attend the conference on behalf of the CRB.
 - iii. Reschedule September 24th CRB Open Meeting – This meeting will have to be rescheduled or cancelled due to CRB leadership being away at the NACOLE Conference.
 - iv. Work Plan -1st Vice Chair Hilpert is continuing revising the work plan.
- X. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR’S REPORT (5mins) (Sharmaine Moseley)
- i. Caseload Update & Status of Case Reports – Executive Director Moseley reported that today the Board started off with 17 active cases. At the Closed Meeting, the Board deliberated on and closed out one Category I case and the results of an audit of a Category II case by a Team was heard by the Board. The Teams now have a total of 15 active cases. The CRB has deliberated on and closed out a total of 9 cases for fiscal year 2020.

The breakdown of active cases are as follows:

Team 1 – 2 cases; Team 2 – 3 cases; Team 3 – 3 cases; Team 4 – 2 cases; Team 5- 3 cases; Team 6 –1 case; Team 7- 1 case

- ii. Status of Ride-Alongs for New Members – All new member ride-alongs have been completed. Members Maxine Clark and Patrick Anderson will give their ride-along reports at the end of tonight’s meeting.
 - iii. Drafting Annual Report for FY 19 – Executive Director Moseley reported we have a new student intern from SDSU which will allow her time to focus on the Annual Report. She will try to have a draft copy ready to circulate to the Board by next month. There are at least 3 members who have not logged their hours into the system.
 - iv. Status of Open Data Portal – Executive Director reported that she is working with the Communications Department resolving some issues with how the data was being pulled from the excel spreadsheet into the portal. We are working diligently to get resolved so we can go live with the Open Data Portal by next week.
 - v. Status on Board Member Re-Appointments & Appointments – Members who were up for consideration to be re-appointed should receive a response soon. This item will be docketed next month.
 - vi. Other Items/Reminders – N/A
- XI. SAN DIEGO POLICE DEPARTMENT REPORT (5mins)
- i. Executive Assistant Chief Todd Jarvis noted that the Board raised a concern regarding not receiving the entirety of case information. Chief Jarvis stated that investigators will make sure to double check that all necessary information is in the case file. We are making an effort to teach new investigators in the Internal Affairs division the process as it also allows them to understand the views of the community.
- XII. BOARD MEMBER RIDE-ALONG REPORTS (2 mins each)
- i. Member Patrick Anderson reported that he participated on a ride-along where he observed the use of force and a traffic collision. He learned that churches are very hospitable towards officers and responding patrol. He observed an officer being very professional and explaining what they were doing to the individual very well. Many people thought he was the officer’s supervisor.
 - ii. Member Maxine Clark reported that on her ride-along she witnessed a domestic dispute. The people involved were appreciative of the officer’s care. The officer and Mrs. Clark interacted with children during the ride-along. The children were given badge stickers and seemed eager to display the badges on their chest. It was a very positive experience.
- XIII. BOARD MEMBER ANNOUNCEMENTS/COMMENTS
- XIV. ADJOURNMENT: 7:25 p.m.