

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE
CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSION**

Thursday, March 3, 2022, at 1:00 p.m.
Online Meeting

- A. The regular business meeting of the Civil Service Commission was called to order by President Lori Thacker at 1:19 p.m. Also present were Vice-President Jacquelyn R. Atkinson, Commissioner Sunday Gover, Commissioner Aaron Olsen, and Commissioner Nicolaz Portillo.

- B. The staff was represented by Personnel Director Douglas Edwards, Assistant Personnel Director Anne Lamén Aban, and Assistant to the Director Saba Berenji. Serving as legal advisor to the Commission was Senior Deputy City Attorney David Karlin.



City of San Diego
Civil Service Commission

MINUTES

Lori Thacker, President
Jacquelyn R. Atkinson, Vice-President
Sunday Gover, Commissioner
Aaron Olsen, Commissioner
Nicolaz Portillo, Commissioner

Thursday, March 3, 2022, at 1:00 p.m.
Online Meeting

Click [here](#) to view meeting on Zoom Webinar at the scheduled time

Until further notice, Civil Service Commission meetings will be conducted pursuant to the provisions of [California Executive Order 29-20](#), which suspends certain requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act.

During the current State of Emergency and in the interest of public health and safety, all members of the Civil Service Commission will be participating in meetings by teleconference. In accordance with the Executive Order, there will be no members of the public in attendance at the meetings. We are providing alternatives to in-person attendance for viewing and participating in meetings.

In lieu of in-person attendance, members of the public may participate and provide comment via telephone, using the City Clerk webform, email submission, or via U.S. Mail of written materials, as follows:

Public Comment Testimony During Civil Service Commission Meetings:

To offer public comment testimony during a Civil Service Commission meeting, you need to first join the Zoom Webinar meeting online from your desktop computer, laptop, tablet, or Smartphone, or by calling in to the meeting from your cellular phone or land line. If applicable, the Civil Service Commission will meet in Closed Session at 12:00 p.m. or shortly thereafter. Public Comment on Closed Session items will occur at the start of the 12:00 p.m. session before the Commission adjourns into Closed Session. The Commission will reconvene for Open Session at 1:00 p.m. or shortly thereafter.

The link to join the Zoom Webinar by computer, tablet, or Smartphone is:

Closed Session: <https://sandiego.zoomgov.com/j/1601441297> (PUBLIC COMMENT ONLY)

Open Session: <https://sandiego.zoomgov.com/j/1602402238>

To Join By Telephone:

Closed Session: Dial 1-669-254-5252. When prompted, input Webinar ID: 160 144 1297# (PUBLIC COMMENT ONLY)

Open Session: Dial 1-669-254-5252. When prompted, input Webinar ID: 160 240 2238#

How To Speak To A Particular Item Or During Non-Agenda Public Comment:

When the Commission President introduces the item you would like to comment on (or indicates it is time for Non-Agenda Public Comment), raise your hand by either tapping the "Raise your Hand" button on your computer, tablet, or Smartphone, or by dialing *9 on your phone. You will be taken in the order in which you raise your hand. You may only speak once on a particular item.

When the Commission President indicates it is your turn to speak, unmute your phone by tapping the Unmute button on your computer, tablet or Smartphone, or dial *6 on your phone.

Written Comment Through Webform:

Comment On Agenda Items may be submitted using the City Clerk [webform](#) indicating the agenda item number for which you wish to submit your comment. Comments received by the start of the meeting will be provided to the Civil Service Commission and posted online with the meeting materials. All webform comments are limited to 200 words. Comments received after the start of the meeting but before the item is called will be submitted into the written record for the relevant item.

Non-Agenda Public Comment may be submitted using the City Clerk [webform](#) checking the appropriate box. Comments received by the start of the meeting will be provided to the Civil Service Commission and posted online with the meeting materials. All webform comments are limited to 200 words. Comments received after the start of the meeting but before Non-agenda comment is called will be submitted into the written record for the meeting.

Closed Session Public Comment may be submitted using the City Clerk [webform](#). Comments received by the start of the meeting will be provided to the Civil Service Commission and posted online with the meeting materials. All webform comments are limited to 200 words. Comments received after the start of the meeting but before the item is called will be submitted into the written record for the relevant item.

Written Materials. If you wish to submit written materials for submission into the record or have an attachment to your comment, you may email it to AArevalo@sandiego.gov or submit via U.S. Mail to 1200 Third Avenue, Suite 300, San Diego, CA 92101. Materials submitted via email will be distributed to the Civil Service Commission in accordance with the deadlines described above. Materials submitted via U.S. Mail will need to be received the business day prior in order to be distributed to the Civil Service Commission.

The public may view the meetings on Zoom Webinar. Click [here](#) to view this meeting at its scheduled time.

Requests For Accessibility Modifications Or Accommodations:

As required by the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA), requests for agenda information to be made available in alternative formats, and any requests for disability-related modifications or accommodations required to facilitate meeting participation, including requests for alternatives to observing meetings and offering public comment as noted above, may be made by contacting the Personnel Department Services Supervisor at 619-236-6402 or AArevalo@saniego.gov. Requests should be made as early as possible prior to the meeting. Every attempt will be made to accommodate all reasonable requests. The City is committed to resolving accessibility requests swiftly in order to maximize accessibility.

This agenda and the supplemental information for each agenda item, if any, can be made available in alternative formats to assist persons with disabilities. Special assistance at the meeting is also available. To request such assistance, please call the Personnel Department Services Supervisor at 619-236-6402. Requests should be made as early as possible prior to the meeting. Every attempt will be made to accommodate all reasonable requests.

ITEMS FOR ACTION

NOTE: The Commission will convene at 12:00 p.m. to hear public comment and discussion of the content of the Closed Session Agenda. At the close of public comment and discussion, the Commission will adjourn the public session and go into closed session. The regular business meeting will begin at 1:00 p.m.

INTRODUCTION

1. Roll Call.

ACTION TAKEN/PENDING

Present were President Lori Thacker, Vice-President Jacquelyn R. Atkinson, Commissioner Sunday Gover, Commissioner Aaron Olsen, and Commissioner Nicolaz Portillo.

NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

This portion of the agenda provides an opportunity for members of the public to address the Commission on items of interest within the jurisdiction of the Commission. (Comments relating to items on today’s docket are to be taken at the time the item is heard.)

Time allotted to each speaker is determined by the Chair. Comments are limited to no more than five (5) minutes **total per subject** regardless of the number of those wishing to speak. Pursuant to the Brown Act, no discussion or action, other than a referral, shall be taken by the Commission on any issue brought forth under “Non-Agenda Public Comment.”

CONSENT AGENDA (Items 2 through 6 can be approved with one motion.)

- | | | |
|----|---|---|
| 2. | Approval of the minutes for the regular business meeting of February 3, 2022. | Approved items 2 through 6 with one motion. |
| 3. | Leaves of Absence Without Pay - In Order. Items 16 through 21. | |
| 4. | Approval of Exceptional Merit Increase for Feauini S. Hafoka, Associate Management Analyst. | |
| 5. | Approval of Exceptional Merit Increase for Jackie K. Hopper, Payroll Specialist II. | |
| 6. | Approval of Exceptional Merit Increase for Luis H. Figueroa, Disposal Site Supervisor. | |

LEAVES OF ABSENCE WITHOUT PAY – DISCUSSION

- | | | |
|----|--|---|
| 7. | Anthony J. Fiorillo, Police Officer II, Police Department, for a one-year special leave without pay ending March 4, 2023, with his job to be saved.
Hire Date: May 2, 2014
Reason: Childcare.
Department Recommendation: Modification to name on eligible list. | Continued.
Speaking for staff was Carissa Rosemore.
Speaking for the department was Silvia Satrom.
Speaking was Anthony J. Fiorillo. |
| 8. | Jacqua N. Horne, Cashier, Public Utilities Department, for a one-year (second extension) special leave without pay ending October 2, 2022, with her name to be placed on the eligible lists for Cashier and Clerical Assistant II.
Hire Date: February 24, 2012
Reason: Medical.
Department Recommendation: Approval. | Approved.
Speaking for staff was Carissa Rosemore. |
| 9. | Alfonso F. Martinez Gonzales, Laborer, Storm Water Department, for a two-week (first extension) special leave without pay ending February 14, 2022, with his job to be saved.
Hire Date: May 2, 2020
Reason: Need additional time to comply with the COVID-19 vaccine mandate.
Department Recommendation: Approval. | Approved.
Speaking for staff was Carissa Rosemore. |

POLICY ITEMS - DISCUSSION

10. Request from the Development Services Department to exempt a Program Coordinator position from the Classified Service.

Approved.
Speaking for staff was Anne Lamén Aban.

11. Request from the General Services Department to exempt a Program Manager position from the Classified Service.

Approved.
Speaking for staff was Anne Lamén Aban.

12. Staff recommendations on special salary adjustments, new classifications, and title changes for the Fiscal Year 2023 Salary Ordinance.

Recommended for Approval:

- 1) Arts Management Analyst Series
- 2) Homeland Security Coordinator Series
- 3) Literacy Analyst Series
- 4) Records Management Analyst
- 5) Retirement Financial Analyst Series
- 6) Senior Victim Services Coordinator

Not Recommended for Approval:

- 7) Boat Operator Series
- 8) Communications Technician Series
- 9) Crime Analyst Series
- 10) Equipment Systems Operator III and Equipment Systems Operator II
- 11) Heavy Truck Driver I
- 12) Patch Truck Operator
- 13) Sanitation Driver Series
- 14) Sign Painter

Alternative Recommendation:

- 15) Claims Representative (Liability) Series
- 16) Grounds Maintenance Worker II
- 17) Water Utility Equipment Operator Series

1. Arts Management Analyst Series - Request for New Classification Series

Approved the creation of the Arts Management Associate and Arts Management Assistant classifications.

2. Homeland Security Coordinator Series - Request for New Classification Series and Title Change

Approved the creation of the Supervising Emergency Services Coordinator and Emergency Services Coordinator classifications.

3. Literacy Analyst Series - Request for New Classification Series

Approved the creation of the Literacy Analyst and Literacy Tutor/Learner Coordinator classifications.

4. Records Management Analyst - Request for New Classification Series

Approved the creation of the Senior Records Management Analyst and Records Management Analyst classifications.

Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.

Speaking for MEA was Nick Wright. Speaking were Sabrina Tatum and Elena Mendoza.

5. **Retirement Financial Analyst Series - Request for New Classification Series**

Approved the creation of the Retirement Financial Specialist III, Retirement Financial Specialist II, Retirement Financial Specialist I and Retirement Financial Specialist Trainee classifications.

6. **Senior Victim Services Coordinator - Request for New Classification**

Approved the creation of the Senior Victim Services Coordinator classification.

Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.

Speaking for MEA was Nick Wright. Speaking was Diane Doherty.

7. **Boat Operator Series - Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 20%**

Approved 10% special salary adjustment for the Senior Boat Operator and Boat Operator classifications.

Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.

Speaking for Local 127 was Tim Douglass.

8. **Communications Technician Series - Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 25%**

Denied request for special salary adjustment.

Speaking for staff was Darren Keenaghan.

9. **Crime Analyst Series - Request for New Classification Series**

Denied request for the creation of the Crime Analyst classification series.

Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.

10. Equipment Systems Operator III and Equipment Systems Operator II - Request for New Classification Series

Approved 10% special salary adjustment for the Equipment Operator III, Equipment Operator II, and Equipment Operator I classifications.

Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.

Speaking for Local 127 were Andres Alva-Cardenas, Rodney Fowler, and Tim Douglass.

Speaking for MEA was Nick Wright. Speaking was Darren Gray.

11. Heavy Truck Driver I - Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 5%

Denied request for special salary adjustment.

Speaking for staff was Carissa Rosemore.

Speaking for Local 127 were Andres Alva-Cardenas and Tim Douglass.

Speaking was Louis Merlin.

12. Patch Truck Operator - Request for New Classification

Approved the creation of the Patch Truck Operator classification at a salary 10% above the Heavy Truck Driver I classification.

Speaking for staff was Carissa Rosemore.

Speaking for Local 127 were Andres Alva-Cardenas, Rodney Fowler, and Tim Douglass.

Speaking was Mario Escalera.

13. Sanitation Driver Series - Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 25-30%

Approved 25% special salary adjustment for the Sanitation Driver III, Sanitation Driver II, Sanitation Driver I, and Sanitation Driver Trainee classifications.

Approved 30% special salary adjustment for the District Refuse Collection Supervisor and Area Refuse Collection Supervisor classifications.

Commissioner Thacker dissenting. Approved the deletion of the Refuse Collection Manager classification.

Commissioner Thacker dissenting. Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.

Speaking for Local 127 were Tim Douglass and Rodney Fowler.

Speaking were Conrad Wear, Franklin Coopersmith, and Renee Robertson.

14. Sign Painter - Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 34-55% and Title Change

Denied request for special salary adjustment.

Approved title change from Sign Painter to Sign Shop Technician.

Speaking for staff was Darren Keenaghan.

Speaking for Local 127 were Tim Douglass and Andres Alva-Cardenas.

Speaking was Jose Lopez.

15. Claims Representative (Liability) Series - Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 20%

Denied request for special salary adjustment.

Approved the creation of the Supervising Liability Claims Representative, Senior Liability Claims Representative, Liability Claims Representative II, Liability Claims Representative I, and Liability Claims Aide classifications.

Speaking for staff was Dylan Cooper.

16. Grounds Maintenance Worker II - Request for Special Salary Adjustment and Title Change

Denied request for special salary adjustment.
Denied title change from Grounds Maintenance Worker II to Utility Worker II-Cemetery.
Approved 9.2% special salary adjustment for the Lead Cemetery Groundskeeper classification.
Speaking for staff was Anne Lamén Aban.
Speaking for Local 127 were Andrés Alva-Cardenas, Tim Douglass, and Rodney Fowler.
Speaking was Louis Merlin.

17. Water Utility Equipment Operator Series - Request for New Classification Series and Title Change

Denied request for the creation of the Water Utility Equipment Operator classification series.
Approved the creation of the Sewer Maintenance Equipment Operator classification to be paid the same as Equipment Operator I.
Speaking for staff was Rachel McDonald-Hernandez.
Speaking for Local 127 was Rodney Fowler.
Speaking was David Dalager.

13. Albert J. Williams, appealing his conviction record disqualification for the position of Laborer.

Denied.
Speaking for staff was Edgar Portilla.
Speaking were Albert J. Williams and Marcela Escobar-Eck.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

14. Staff recommendations on special salary adjustment and new classifications for the Fiscal Year 2023 Salary Ordinance.

Not Recommended for Approval:

- 1) Carpenter
- 2) Development Services Technician Supervisor and Development Services Technician

1. Carpenter – Request for Special Salary Adjustment of 15%

Denied request for special salary adjustment.
Speaking for staff was Carissa Rosemore.
Speaking for Local 127 were Tim Douglass and Andrés Alva-Cardenas.
Speaking were Ty Cruz and Larry Blackman.

2. Development Services Technician Supervisor and Development Services Technician – Request for New Classification Series

Approved the creation of the Development Services Technician classification at a salary 10% below the Plan Review Specialist I classification. Denied request for the creation of the Development Services Technician Supervisor classification. Speaking for staff was Darren Keenaghan. Speaking for MEA was Nick Wright. Speaking was Rimah Khouri-Velez.

15. Kevin M. Allen-Chambers, appealing his conviction record disqualification for the position of Laborer.

Approved.
Speaking for staff was Edgar Portilla.
Speaking was Kevin M. Allen-Chambers.

LEAVES OF ABSENCE WITHOUT PAY - IN ORDER

16. Ashley N. Alcantara, Police Officer II, Police Department, for a nine-month special leave without pay ending December 31, 2022, with her job to be saved.
Hire Date: September 1, 2016
Reason: Childcare and personal.
Department Recommendation: Approval.
17. Hersy J. Enriquez, Associate Engineer - Civil, Engineering and Capital Projects Department, for a four-month special leave without pay ending April 1, 2022, with her job to be saved.
Hire Date: October 4, 2021
Reason: Medical.
Department Recommendation: Approval.
18. Beverly R. Fruto, Assistant Management Analyst (Option Class: Literacy Tutor/Learner Coordinator), Library Department, for a one-year special leave without pay ending January 11, 2023, with her name to be placed on the eligible list for Assistant Management Analyst (Option Class: Literacy Tutor/Learner Coordinator).
Hire Date: December 3, 2014
Reason: Medical.
Department Recommendation: Approval.

LEAVES OF ABSENCE WITHOUT PAY - UNCLASSIFIED

- 19. Kelley M. Stanco, Development Project Manager III, Planning Department, for a leave of absence from the Classified Service effective January 24, 2022, while temporarily filling an unclassified position with her job to be saved. If selected for permanent appointment, this leave will be modified from job saved to name on eligible list.

- 20. Virgilio G. Afan Jr., Finance Analyst III, Department of Finance, for a leave of absence from the Classified Service effective February 10, 2022, while temporarily filling an unclassified position with his job to be saved. If selected for permanent appointment, this leave will be modified from job saved to name on eligible list.

- 21. Sameera C. Rao, Development Project Manager III, Planning Department, for a leave of absence from the Classified Service effective January 24, 2022, while temporarily filling an unclassified position with her job to be saved. If selected for permanent appointment, this leave will be modified from job saved to name on eligible list.

LEAVES OF ABSENCE WITHOUT PAY - TOTAL

Total Leave Requests	09	Family/Childcare/Maternity	02
Leave requests with job saved	04	Education/Training	00
Leave requests with name on list	02	Medical	03
Unclassified	03	Relocation	00
		Outside Employment	00
		Unclassified	03
		Other	01

CLOSED SESSION

At 12:04 p.m., the Commission met in Closed Session with the following agenda:

- 1. Conference with Labor Negotiators, pursuant to California Government Code Section 54957.6:

City Designated Management Team Representatives:

Timothy Davis, Burke, Williams, & Sorensen LLP, Labor Negotiation Consultant
Jay Goldstone, Chief Operating Officer
Jessica Lawrence, Director of Policy and Council Affairs, Office of the Mayor
Julie Rasco, Director, Human Resources Department
Erik Hanson, Supervising Human Resources Officer, Human Resources Department
Andrea Szabo, Senior Human Resources Officer, Human Resources Department
Jim McNeill, Assistant City Attorney, Office of the City Attorney

Designated as representatives within the meaning of California Government Code Section 54957.6(a):

Joan Dawson, Deputy City Attorney, Office of the City Attorney
Miguel Merrell, Deputy City Attorney, Office of the City Attorney

Employee Organization: San Diego Police Officers Association (SDPOA)

DCA Assigned: J. Dawson

The purpose of this Closed Session meeting is to review the City of San Diego's position as to meet and confer related to implementation of administrative appeals of sustained findings of police officer misconduct by the Commission on Police Practices, under San Diego City Charter sections 41.2 and 115, and instruct the City's labor negotiators. – No action taken.

2. Deliberation on disciplinary appeals pursuant to Government Code Section 54957:
 - a. 2021-1 – Continued.
 - b. Ahmed Aburahmah – Suspension upheld.

ADJOURNMENT

At 1:19 p.m., the Commission convened into open session.

At 3:45 p.m., President Thacker called for a break.

At 4:01 p.m., the meeting continued.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:47 p.m.

Lori Thacker, President