

CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD

DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Wednesday, March 2, 2016, at 4:00 PM
5th Floor Large Conference Room
City Operations Building, Development Services Department
1222 First Avenue, San Diego, CA

MEETING NOTES

1. ATTENDANCE 4.04pm

Subcommittee Members Gail Garbini; Ann Woods

City Staff

HRB Kelley Stanco; Jodie Brown; Jane Kang
Park & Rec Charlie Daniels, Casey Smith

Guests

Item 3A Richard Walker, Casey Molda
Item 3B Pat, Caughey, John Bolthouse, Jim Hughes,
Item 3C Todd Engstrand, Iris Engstrand
Other Bruce Coons, Amie Hayes, SOHO

2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)

3. Project Reviews

▪ **ITEM 3A:**

Listings: Non-Contributor

Address: 415 20th Street

Historic Name: Sherman Heights Historic District

Significance:

Mills Act Status: No

PTS #: 466305

Project Contact: Richard Walker

Treatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: Renovate this non contributor property. Modified existing openings. Add decks and sliding glass doors to the front façade of the multifamily.

Existing Square Feet: 2204

Additional Square Feet: 0

Total Proposed Square Feet: 2204

Prior DAS Review: None

Staff Presentation: This property is located in the Sherman Heights Historic District and it is a non contributor to the district. The property owner is proposing a complete remodel of the multi-family building which would include adding a wall of sliding glass doors to the front and the rear of the building for access to a new deck. Staff has concerns about the sliding glass doors and believes that they are not consistent with the surrounding neighborhood. Staff has previously recommended a pair of French doors for a more consistent look.

Applicant Presentation: Staff had made a suggestion that we introduce two pairs of French doors, but we would like to create a more open feel with the introduction of sliding glass doors.

Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Bruce Coons	I agree with staff. The two sets of French doors would be more appropriate. They could be sliders so you could have screen doors, but as proposed they are too modern for the district. The French doors would be more in keeping with the district. The railing could be a little more historic but that is not a major issue.
Amiee Hayes	The amount of glass is concerning. I think that the French doors would be more appropriate.

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
Isn't there some way to come up with a door that has more lights?	
I can see what is trying to do. I am struck by the fact that the sides and the rear have smaller and more delicate windows.	

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Garbini	I think that if you could have French doors or smaller doors would be more consistent. Reduce the scale and narrow the opening. Down into scale to the more consistent with the neighborhood.
Woods	I would suggest breaking up the façade and being doing three or two doors. The scale will be more consistent with the neighborhood.

Staff Comment:

None

Recommended Modifications: Recommended that the applicant use French doors which are more consistent with the surrounding neighborhood.

Consensus:

- ☐ Consistent with the Standards
- ☐ Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- ☒ Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards

▪ **ITEM 3B:**

Listings: HRB Site #1, NR

Address: 2125 Park Blvd.

Historic Name: El Prado Historic District

Significance:

Mills Act Status: No

PTS #:

Project Contact: Casey Smith, Friends of Balboa Park

Treatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: Installation of a water capturing system adjacent to the Casa de Balboa which will provide irrigation for plants in Zoro Garden. Water will be captured from the Casa de Balboa HVAC system and rain gutter system.

Existing Square Feet: 0

Additional Square Feet: 0

Total Proposed Square Feet: 0

Prior DAS Review: None

Staff Presentation: This project is a water capture system that would involve there tanks behind the Casa de Balboa and would provide water to Zoro Gardens. The tanks will be slightly sunken down from the grade and would have a wall around it which would provide informational signage. Staff had some questions about the infrastructure of the system. How are they capturing the water, how are they transporting the water to the gardens.

Applicant Presentation: This is part of a much larger program. This particular project involves collecting water from the roof (AC and the rain) and we would be stopping the water prior to it going into the storm drain for reuse. There would be a collection point at the wall and there would an overflow potentially in the canyon and the water would not hit against the building. The wall would be about 36" in height and would not be a solid fence. All of the water captured happens at the roof through existing drains.

Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Coons	I think it is a great project. I would like to see the

Name	Comments
	interpretive signage limited to one panel so it does not look like a billboard and limited to the colors approved in the Precis Plan. If there is any way to set them down further it would be great.
Amiee	I am also in agreement with the signage. I would like to see the signage come back through staff for review.

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
There is always been a record of the water draining into the canyon. I do have an objection to fencing the tanks. I wonder if there are other ways to screen other than a fence. Otherwise it creates hiding areas. This would be an opportunity to clean the area up and not hide it.	The fence to us was optional. We would be fine without it.
You will have a lot over flow. Is there a capture basin below?	We will create a swale area and put it away from the building and in the canyon to the east. There is a storm water conveyance in the canyon.

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Garbini	The project appears to be consistent with the Standards.

Staff Comment:

Staff Member	Comments
Stanco	Will the educational signage conform to the existing signage in the park? (applicant) We will try to cater the new signage to the interpretive signage of this nature.

Recommended Modifications:

None

Consensus:

- ☒ Consistent with the Standards
- ☐ Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards

▪ **ITEM 3C:**

Listings: HRB Site #1, NR

Address: 1800 El Prado

Historic Name: El Prado Historic District

Significance:

Mills Act Status: No

PTS #:

Project Contact: Casey Smith, Todd Engstrand

Treatment: Rehabilitation

Project Scope: Installation of a 8.5'-9' tall bronze statue at the existing raised planter in front of the Museum of Art-adjacent to the stairs leading to the Bea Evanson Fountain.

Existing Square Feet: 0

Additional Square Feet: 0

Total Proposed Square Feet: 0

Prior DAS Review: None

Staff Presentation: This is a proposal to install a statue of Balboa in the east Prado near the Natural History Museum. It will have visibility, but in an area that does not currently have much traffic. Staff is unsure of the project; we are always concerned when it comes to adding elements to the park.

Applicant Presentation: We looked with the House of Spain throughout the park to find a location in the park. This area of the park was rebuilt in late 1970s. There is a planter area which is currently located by a fountain. They are requesting an 8'x8' space and the statute would be lit, with one or two up-lights. A plaque would be adjacent to the statue and provide information on the statute. This area is not historic to the 1915 Exposition and it has been altered which is why this site was recommended.

Public Comment:

Name	Comments
Bruce Coons	We have reviewed this at length. We are supporting the placement of this statute in the park. The statute was originally intended for the park as noted in the 1930s article. We did not like the symmetry. The statute should be placed close to its original location. It should go on its axis on the east side of the fountain with him facing the west towards the water.
John Bolthouse	The Friends of Balboa Park also support the concept of the statute.
Charlie Daniels	I would recommend incorporating the statute in the steps just south of the proposed location. It would make it more visible and would not be obstructed by the Evans Fountain.
Casey Smith	The statute is not permanent. If the park plan is instituted it could be moved to accommodate.

Q&A:

Subcommittee-member Issue or Question	Applicant's Response
I agree with the central access to the statute. A lot of people approach from Park Blvd. If it is closer to the central axis/east end, would you have to lift it up?	Yes, it will need to be up on a pedestal. In the proposed location it is more protected and the planter helps lift it up.
Is the historic district the appropriate place in the park? I don't think so. If you have a new entrance off of park, then the statute could be designed into it. Now we are just trying to place it somewhere.	Plans for the new entrance and the Park Blvd. entrance is pie in the sky. The House of Spain has been working for four years to place the statute. I don't see any projects in the future that would allow for the introduction of the statute.
Typically, with cultural landscapes and the Standards, there are guidelines in how to place objects, sculpture. I respect that SOHO has vetted the statute, but they have concerns.	If placed in the proposed location, the statute would be temporary. We could then move it to a more permanent location when and if the plans come forward for the Precis Plans revisions.

Subcommittee Discussion and Comment:

Subcommittee-member	Comments
Garbini	I am troubled; it has always been the policy to keep new statutes out of the historic district. When the trolley is expanded it presents the opportunity to install something new. If we start to introduce monuments and public art to the park that are not original you are introducing a precedent.

Staff Comment:

Staff Member	Comments
Stanco	Staff shares the subcommittee's concern as it relates to statute. There have been a number of new elements introduced to the park –new informational kiosks, new international cottages. The Standards are case by case, however in this instance this is the name sake of the park and does relate to the history of the park. I think that is long as the justification is strong and consistency with the Standards then it is fine.
Stanco	How tall is the informational kiosk? (applicant) The kiosk is 8' and if the statue was placed across from it, at the same height, it would introduce the symmetry.

Recommended Modifications:

Consensus:

- ☐ Consistent with the Standards
- ☐ Consistent with the Standards if modified as noted
- ☒ Inconsistent with the Standards and needs revision and additional review
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards but is the best feasible alternative
- ☐ Inconsistent with the Standards

4. Adjourned at 5.19 PM

The next regularly-scheduled Subcommittee Meeting will be on April 6, 2016 at 4:00 PM.

For more information, please contact Jodie Brown at JDBrown@sanidiego.gov or 619.533.6300