

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	October 15, 2020	REPORT NO. HRB-20-053
HEARING DATE:	October 29, 2020	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 –Jennie Haas House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>base (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Coder Living Trust; represented by Scott Moor	njian
LOCATION:	4374 Georgia Street, North Park Community, (APN 445-321-08-00	Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Jennie Haas H Street as a historical resource.	louse located at 4374 Georgia

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Jennie Haas House located at 4374 Georgia Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the non-original shed and garage which were built outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a covered full width front porch supported by columns, wood siding, double hung and fixed wooden windows, exposed rafter ends along the roof line as well as decorative beams and knee braces in the gable ends.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section 143.0212. The subject property is located mid-block on Georgia Street in the North Park community near El Cajon Boulevard.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historical Resources Survey but was not identified in the survey because the resource was not individually evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Jennie Haas House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Jennie Haas who constructed the house as her personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees and finds that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 4374 Georgia Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or North Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 4374 Georgia Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is a one-story Craftsman style bungalow built in 1913 of wood frame construction on a concrete foundation. The property's primary elevation faces towards the east and features a moderately pitched forward facing gabled roof with overhanging eaves and exposed rafter ends. The primary facade features wood sliding, a full width, recessed entry porch with a centralized front door surrounded by two tripartite wooden windows. The open gable features three decorative beams along with a centralized wooden vent and window. The north, side yard elevation features varied roof planes with visibility to the exposed rafter ends underneath and the continuation of the wood siding, wooden double hung windows. The south elevation features an extension with an open gable with decorative knee braces. This extension goes into the side yard and was previously identified as a "wood enclosed porch" on the Assessor's Building Record. Sanborn Maps however show no porch present and an inspection of current photographs find this information inconclusive. The south elevation also features a modern deck that surrounds the extension. The rear, west elevation features limited details but has a continuation of the wood siding, wooden windows as well as a portion of the deck from the south elevation. The parcel also features two auxiliary structures, a shed and a garage, which were built outside the period of significance.

Modifications to the site are minimal and include the removal of the original garage, the addition of a detached garage and shed, a modern replacement wooden window on the north elevation, hardscape modifications including a concrete ramp, steps, and block walls added to the front yard, and the addition of a deck at the side and rear of the structure. The consultant asserts additional modifications including the potential replacement of some wooden window trim and porch columns, but these changes were inconclusive and do not detract from the resource's integrity. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story, vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a covered full width front porch supported by columns, wood siding, double hung and fixed wooden windows, exposed rafter ends along the roof line as well as decorative beams and brackets in the gable ends. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 4374 Georgia Street failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 4374 Georgia Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 4374 Georgia Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F. <u>OTHER CONSIDERATIONS</u>

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Jennie Haas House located at 4374 Georgia Street be designated with a 1913 period of significance under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Craftsman style. The designation excludes the non-original shed and garage which were built outside the period of significance.

Emma Haggerty Associate Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner Development Services Department

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 10/29/2020

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/29/2020, to consider the historical designation of the Alfred and Jennie Haas House (owned by Coder Living Trust, 3321 32nd Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **4374 Georgia Street**, **San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **445-321-08-00**, further described as BLK 98 LOTS 42 & 43 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Alfred and Jennie Haas House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a covered full width front porch supported by square columns, wood siding, double hung and fixed wooden windows, exposed rafter ends along the roof line as well as decorative beams and brackets in the gable ends. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the non-original shed and garage which were both built outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: ___

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney