

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	January 14, 2021	REPORT NO. HRB-21-009
HEARING DATE:	January 28, 2021	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #12 – Julia Goodell House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link	
APPLICANT:	David N. Rinehart Intervivos Trust; represented by Seonaid McArthur, La Jolla Landmark Group	
LOCATION:	7112 Monte Vista Avenue, La Jolla Community APN 351-132-10-00	y, Council District 1
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Julia Goodell Avenue as a historical resource.	House located at 7112 Monte Vista

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Julia Goodell House located at 7112 Monte Vista Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 300 square foot "L" shaped addition on the southwest elevation completed outside the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1924 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a stucco exterior, a flat roof with simple parapet, red clay tile roofing, decorative iron work, and fenestration including multi lite wooden windows.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is located in the Barber Tract of the La Jolla community and faces towards the east in a U-shaped formation.

The subject area has not been previously surveyed; therefore the property has not been identified in any historic surveys. The historic name of the resource, the Julia Goodell House, has been identified consistent with the Board's

adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Julia Goodell, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

# <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by the La Jolla Landmark Group, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion B and C. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C but not HRB Criterion B. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 7112 Monte Vista Avenue revealed that the subject property was the first property built in the Fern Glen subdivision, presently known as the Barber Tract. However, additional information to indicate whether the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or La Jolla's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development was not included within the report. Therefore, staff cannot recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

# CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject property has an association with David Rinehart, FAIA; architect, teacher, and Fellow of the American Institute of Architects, who owned and resided in the subject property from 1971 until his passing in 2016. Rinehart was academically trained at the School of Architecture at the University of Pennsylvania where he studied under and was mentored by Louis Kahn. After graduation, Rinehart went on to work under Kahn with the design of the Salk Institute in La Jolla as well as Habitat 67 under Moshe Safdie for the Montreal World's Fair in 1967. By 1970 Rinehart had returned to La Jolla to work with his friend and fellow architect John "Jack" MacAllister at his office located at 836 Prospect Street in downtown La Jolla. The firm then relocated to 6014-6016 La Granada in Rancho Santa Fe where the partnership worked on the master plan for the Telluride Ski Resort in Telluride, Colorado. Rinehart worked at this office until the firm dissolved in 1975. During this time, Rinehart not only was an architect but was also a professor at the University of Oregon from 1967-1970, University of California Los Angeles in 1972, and at the University of Southern California from 1975-1988. While teaching, Rinehart also worked at Bobrow/Thomas in the Westwood neighborhood of Los Angeles from 1980 until 1986. In 1986 Rinehart then went on to help establish the Los Angeles branch of the Anshen + Allen Architects firm that had been solely based out of San Francisco.

As noted in Attachment E, *Nomination as Fellow of the American Institute of Architects*, Rinehart was the Principal of Design and Design Architect at Anshen + Allen and was largely responsible for the outcome of the following projects:

- Shiley Eye Institute (currently known as the Sharp-Grossmont Hospital) University of California, San Diego Campus
  - o Constructed in 1991
- Keck Joint Science Teaching and Research Facility Claremont, CA
  - Constructed in 1991

- Bourns Hall University of California, Riverside Campus
  - Constructed in 1995
- Molecular Sciences Building University of California, Los Angeles Campus
  - o Constructed in 1993
- High Desert Medical Center Lancaster, CA
  - o Constructed in 1995
- Mingei International Folk-Art Museum San Diego, CA
  - o constructed in 1996

While Rinehart's career in the subject property spanned from 1971 through 2012 and his accomplishments to institutional architecture are highly admirable throughout San Diego and Southern California, the majority of his best-known work occurred post 1990 and are considered to be too recent to evaluate objectively within their historical context as a whole. Given more time and understanding of his influence and design of institutional architecture of San Diego, Rinehart may well be found to be a historically significant individual, at which time the most appropriate representative resource can be identified; whether it is his former home, or the offices he worked in La Jolla, Rancho Santa Fe, or Los Angeles.

Research into the other owners and tenants of the property at 7112 Monte Vista Avenue did not reveal any additional individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, staff is not recommending designation under HRB Criterion B at this time.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property located at 7112 Monte Vista Avenue was erected in 1924 and is located midblock in the Barber Tract neighborhood within the La Jolla community of San Diego. The property features a U-shaped single-family residence with an attached garage clad in a smooth textured stucco finish with a connected stuccoed site wall with a decorative iron gate, a flat roof with a simple parapet and minimal red clay tile roof tiles, and multi-lite wooden windows protected by decorative iron bars. The primary elevation features an off centered entrance door underneath an arched covered porch clad in red clay tiles which is recessed from the street. The recessed entrance leads to a brick covered courtyard flanked by a single set of stairs that run parallel to the attached garage which lead to the parapet rooftop deck. Limited details exist along the north and south elevations; but they feature the same smooth textured stucco cladding, flat roof, and multilight wood windows. The rear elevation is partially two stories as the property is set on a slope which allows for additional square footage and features the same smooth stucco finish, divided lite wood windows along with rear access doors and a large set of stairs and small patio that lead down to a tiled rear patio and garden space.

Modifications to the property are minimal and include a 300 sq. ft. addition completed in 1946 that creates a "L" shape along the south west elevation, a single French door added between 1979-1980, a front yard fountain added in 1998, the replacement of the rear yard facing living room window in kind in 2015, and an added wooden railing along the roof deck. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the

entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, an unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a stucco exterior, a flat roof with simple parapet, red clay tile roofing, decorative iron work, and fenestration including multi lite wooden windows.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Research into the construction of the property at 7112 Monte Vista Avenue failed to conclusively identify a builder, designer or architect. David Rinehart is not an established Master Architect or Designer and since he did not design the subject property, his association with the property makes it ineligible for designation under HRB Criterion D. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

# OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Julia Goodell House located at 7112 Monte Vista Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the 300 square foot "L" shaped addition on the southwest elevation completed outside the period of significance.

Emma Haggerty Senior Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

hyle

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER ADOPTED ON 1/28/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/28/2021, to consider the historical designation of the Julia Goodell House (owned by David N Rinehart Intervivos Trust 11-20-92, 115 Wavecrest Avenue, Venice, CA 92091) located at **7112 Monte Vista Avenue**, **La Jolla, CA 92037**, APN: **351-132-11-00**, further described as FERN GLEN DOC4930REC69 IN in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as  ${\bf Site}$   ${\bf No.}$  , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Julia Goodell House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1924 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a stucco exterior, a flat roof with simple parapet, red clay tile roofing, decorative iron work, and fenestration including multi lite wooden windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the 300 square foot "L" shaped addition on the southwest elevation that was constructed outside the period of significance.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney