

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

| DATE ISSUED:   | February 11, 2021  | REPORT NO. HRB-21-016                          |
|----------------|--|--|
| HEARING DATE:  | February 25, 2021  |  |
| SUBJECT:       | ITEM #11 – Gabriel and Marie Berg House                                      |  |
| RESOURCE INFO: | California Historical Resources Invento                                      | ory Database (CHRID) link                      |
| APPLICANT:     | Pamela and Bradley Kirschbaum; represented by Legacy 106, Inc.               |  |
| LOCATION:      | 4825 Adams Avenue, Kensington/Taln<br>571-12-00                              | nadge Community, Council District 9 APN 465-   |
| DESCRIPTION:   | Consider the designation of the Gabr<br>Adams Avenue as a historical resourc | iel and Marie Berg House located at 4825<br>e. |

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Gabriel and Marie Berg House located at 4825 Adams Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1942 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear porch extension. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Minimal Traditional style with Colonial Revival elements and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a single story with a simple floor plan; gabled roof forms with shallow overhang; wood cladding; metal windows; small front porch; and simplified details reflecting Colonial Revival influences such as a divided lite bay window supported by red brick and a recessed paneled entryway.

### **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The house is located on a corner parcel in the Kensington community and features a one-story single-family home with a detached garage.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed. The historic name of the resource, the Gabriel and Marie Berg House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Gabriel and Marie Berg, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

## <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Legacy 106, Inc. which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C, but not HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is located on a corner parcel in the Kensington neighborhood and was constructed in 1942 in the Minimal Traditional style with Colonial Revival elements. The property features an "L" shaped floor plan, a low-pitched hipped roof, wood shingle cladding, divided lite windows and red brick detailing throughout. The primary elevation faces towards Adams Avenue and features an off centered, recessed paneled entrance door surrounded by red bricks. To the right of the entrance door lies a decorative divided lite bay window supported by a brick support wall and to the left of the entrance lies a divided lite casement window under a pedimented gable. Additional details along this elevation include a 15 lite window flanked by wooden paneled shutters and a decorative cornice band with an evenly space diamond detailing. Colonial Revival details are present throughout the property through the recessed, paneled entryway along with the divided lite and brick supported bay window.

Minimal modifications have occurred to the subject property and include the addition of solar panels in 2014 which are not visible to the public right of way, a rear covered porch extension completed at an unknown date, and the replacement of the original garage door with a modern garage door at unknown date. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling

Buildings constructed in the Minimal Traditional style generally reflect traditional architectural forms and eclectic types, but with simpler and less extensive decorative detailing to keep costs lower, particularly during the Depression and War years. The style is characterized primarily by its compact size, usually single story; low-pitched gabled or hipped roofs with shallow overhangs; simplified details of limited extent, reflecting traditional or modern themes; and traditional building materials emphasizing the street façade. Additional stylistic details include small front porches; modestly sized wood framed windows, occasionally one large picture window; and detached or attached front-facing garages, frequently set back from the house. While the San Diego Modernism Historic Context Statement states that it is not anticipated that many examples of Minimal Traditional architecture will be eligible for individual listing, it may be possible for some unique or distinguished examples of the style to be found significant as individual resources.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject property is a good example of the Minimal Traditional style with Colonial Revival elements which retains character defining features of the style with its single story with a simple floor plan; gabled roof forms with shallow overhang; wood cladding; metal windows; small front porch; and simplified details reflecting Colonial Revival influences such as a divided lite bay window supported by red brick and a recessed paneled entryway. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

# CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 4825 Adams Avenue was constructed by the Jenkins Construction Company, which at the time of construction was headed by established Master Builder, Chris Cosgrove. Cosgrove was established as a Master Builder by the Historical Resources Board with the 2017 designation of 3202 Curtis

Street, HRB #1272 which was constructed in 1928 in the Spanish Eclectic style. Cosgrove was known as an accomplished builder in the Post-War era having many significant developments during this time period, including large Federal Housing Administration (FHA) projects. The largest of his FHA projects include 49 units in Escondido, 585 units in Lomita Village, and a 116-unit rental property at 43rd Street and Ocean View Boulevard. The breadth of Cosgrove's career as a builder spanned from the 1920s with the construction of Spanish Eclectic style homes to the 1950s with the construction of Mid Century Modern and Contemporary style homes and multi-unit buildings.

The subject property was constructed by the Jenkins Construction Company as noted on the Notice of Completion however, the Jenkins Construction Company has not yet been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect, Designer, or Builder company and there is insufficient information to designate them as such at this time. Since Cosgrove is an established Master Builder and not the entirety of the Jenkins Construction Company, it is difficult to identify how much input Cosgrove had on the final design of the subject property. Since it is unclear how much input Cosgrove had on the final construction, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D at this time.

# OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

# **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Gabriel and Marie Berg House located at 4825 Adams Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1942 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Minimal Traditional style with Colonial Revival elements. The designation excludes the rear porch extension.

Emma Haggerty Senior Planner

EH/ss

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

1. Draft Resolution

2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 2/25/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/25/2021, to consider the historical designation of the Gabriel and Marie Berg House (owned by Bradley and Pamela Kirschbaum, 4825 Adams Avenue, San Diego, CA 92115) located at **4825 Adams Avenue**, **San Diego**, **CA 92115**, APN: **466-571-12-00**, further described as LOT 975 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as  $\ensuremath{\textbf{Site}}$  No. , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Gabriel and Marie Berg House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Minimal Traditional style with Colonial Revival elements and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a single story with a simple floor plan; gabled roof forms with shallow overhang; wood cladding; metal windows; small front porch; and simplified details reflecting Colonial Revival influences such as a divided lite bay window supported by red brick and a recessed paneled entryway. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear porch extension.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: \_\_\_\_\_

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney