

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: March 11, 2021 REPORT NO. HRB-21-015

HEARING DATE: March 25, 2021

SUBJECT: ITEM #2 - Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #2

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Robert and Carmen Miceli; represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

LOCATION: 2225 Hickory Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3

APN 443-211-3900

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec

House #2 located at 2225 Hickory Street as a historical resource

### **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Designate the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #2 located at 2225 Hickory Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the carport and detached garage modified outside of the period of significance. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style with Italian Renaissance Influence and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a boxy two-story form; smooth stucco exterior; front entrance elaborated with quoins; prominent stucco chimney; low pitched, hipped tile roof with boxed eaves; wing walls; and multi-lite wood casement windows.

#### **BACKGROUND**

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a two-story, single-family residence and detached garage located in the Mission Hills neighborhood of the Uptown Community.

The property was identified in the 2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey and given a Status Code of 5D3, "appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the Union Trust Company of San Diego who constructed the house as a speculation house.

#### **ANALYSIS**

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a two-story, single family house constructed in 1926 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style with Italian Renaissance Revival influences. The residence sits close to the street and the main entrance is accessed by a short, scored concrete path. A rounded door elaborated by quoins leads to the one-story entry porch. A low pitched, hipped tile roof with boxed eaves covers the resource's two-story form. The house is covered in a smooth stucco and prominently features a stucco chimney on the front façade. Fenestration primarily consists of multi-lite wood casement windows. Other details include wing walls, shutters on the second story and decorative plasterwork. A two-car garage is located behind the residence and is accessed by a scored concrete driveway.

Several modifications have been made to the property since its 1926 date of construction. At an unknown date a "Cadillac extension" was added to the front of the garage. Additionally, the garage was again modified in 1975 with a rear addition and reroof. These modifications impair the historic integrity of the garage and staff is recommending that it be excluded from the designation. At an unknown date the original tile roof was removed and replaced with composite shingle. In 1999 a carport and covered patio were added at the rear of the garage. The foundation was repaired in 2012 and in 2019 the current owner restored the tile roof. These modifications do not impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling as it relates to Criterion C.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. Its vocabulary is influenced by Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic or Renaissance precedents. The style became popular after the Panama-California Exposition of 1915 and reached its height in the 1920's and early 1930's before rapidly declining in the 1940's. Identifying features include a low-pitched roof with little or no eave overhang, red tile roof covering, stucco exterior wall finishes, an asymmetrical façade and arches above doors and principle windows. Common decorative details are patterned tiles, carved stonework, large focal windows, wooden or iron window grilles, decorative vents and balconies.

The Italian Renaissance style developed in the 1880s and flourished through the 1920s. In *A Field Guide to American Houses*, Virginia Savage McAlester states that although the style was used in

houses throughout the United States, it was much less commonly used than the contemporaneous styles of the time, and steadily declined in popularity by the 1930s and 1940s, with examples from the 1940s noted as being particularly rare. The style was more commonly used in the design of upscale residences and public buildings. Common character-defining features of the style include low-pitched hipped and flat roofs; widely overhanging eaves supported by decorative brackets; ceramic roof tiles; symmetrical façade; stone, brick, or stucco cladding; round arches above doors, windows, and porches; and recessed entryways usually accented by small columns or pilasters. Other common decorative details of the style are molded cornices, belt courses, roofline balustrades, and pedimented windows.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style with Italian Renaissance Influences by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a boxy two-story form; smooth stucco exterior; front entrance elaborated with quoins; prominent stucco chimney; low pitched, hipped tile roof with boxed eaves; wing walls; and multi-lite wood casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

# **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

# **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #2 located at 2225 Hickory Street be designated with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Colonial Revival style with Italian Renaissance influences. The designation excludes the carport and detached garage modified outside of the period of significance.

Suzanne Segur

Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison

**Development Services Department** 

SS/ss

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 3/25/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/25/2021, to consider the historical designation of the **Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #2** (owned by Miceli Family Trust 03-06-15, 2225 Hickory Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **2225 Hickory Street**, **San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **443-211-39-00**, further described as BLK 2 LOT 15 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as  $\bf Site$   $\bf No.$ , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Union Trust Company of San Diego Spec House #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style with Italian Renaissance influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1926 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a boxy two-story form; smooth stucco exterior; front entrance elaborated with quoins; prominent stucco chimney; low pitched, hipped tile roof with boxed eaves; wing walls; and multilite wood casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the carport and detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:	
	BY:
	DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
	Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,	
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:
	LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
	Deputy City Attorney