

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	March 11, 2021	REPORT NO. HRB-21-018	
HEARING DATE:	March 25,2021		
SUBJECT:	ITEM 3 – Martha and Joseph Hillard/Charles Salyers House		
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>abase (CHRID) link</u>	
APPLICANT:	Shawn and Erica Lyons; represented by Landmark Historic Preservation		
LOCATION:	4415 Long Branch Ave, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 APN 448-781-07-00		
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Martha and J located at 4415 Long Branch Ave as a historic		

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Martha and Joseph Hillard/Charles Salyers House located at 4415 Long Branch Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes both the front and rear detached garages, the 2018 deck, and the 2018 addition. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman style with Tudor Revival influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a sand stucco exterior with a brick wainscoting; an asymmetrical front façade; a cross gable roof; exposed decorative round cut rafter tails; wide unenclosed eaves; a turret; a red brick chimney with decorative brickwork and diagonal dual shafts; and arched wooden casement windows.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Charles H. Salyers and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource is a notable example of Charles Salyers' work as it is a unique example of his ability fuse two architecture styles he is not known to work with into a single design.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject parcel is located in the Point Loma Heights

neighborhood on the southwest side of Long Branch Avenue and contains a single-family residence with two detached garages.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Martha and Joseph Hillard/Charles Salyers House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Martha and Joseph Hillard constructed the house as their personal residence and the name of Charles H. Salyers, a Master Architect.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and Staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject resource at 4415 Long Branch Avenue is a one-story single-family home constructed in the Craftsman style with Tudor Revival influences. It features a Tudor Revival inspired sand stucco exterior with a brick wainscoting, topped with the Craftsman's cross gable roof with exposed decorative round cut rafter tails and wide unenclosed eaves. Wood casement and double hung windows are placed on all sides. On the asymmetrical front façade's left side is a turret with three large arched casement windows and a conical roof. The center consists of an inset raised brick porch entryway, a grouping of three tall rectangular windows with a large central fixed section flanked by rectangular single light casement windows with a side facing arching doorway. On the right ride is the street facing gable wing with three equal-sized large arched casement windows.

The north west façade features a red brick chimney with decorative brickwork and diagonal dual shafts, that is flanked by large arched casement windows. Further back located on the gable end are three different sized double hung windows. The southwest façade is long side gable wall, half of which extends out a couple feet, that feature four medium sized double hung windows, one very small double hung window, and a very small arched casement window. The southeast façade features a double gable roof with a lower secondary gable addition extending out. To the addition's right is a rectangular doorway with a small wood deck leading up to it. To the addition's left is a grouping of two rectangular wooden casement windows and the side of the turret.

The hardscaping on the front façade consists of a stucco wall capped with one layer of bricks and an angled brick paved pathway with stairs leading up the resource. Connected to the wall is the original detached one-car garage with a with flat roof surrounded on three sides with simple baluster fencing. Behind the resource is a detached tandem two-car garage that features a gable roof and a stucco exterior.

Several modifications have been made to the property since it's 1929 date of construction. In 1968 a 12' x 23' detached rear garage and an 8' x 11' porch above the front garage were built. Further alterations took place in 2018 with a side addition and wooden deck built on the southeastern side of the home behind the front facing detached garage. The 2018 addition is differentiated from the original home by its lack of brick wainscoting at the base and its lack of extending rounded wooden rafter tails and purlin ends below the eaves. A door was added to the original building behind the addition. This project was reviewed by historical resources staff and determined to be consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. These modifications do not detract from integrity of design, materials, workmanship and feeling as it relates to Criterion C

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and veneer, depending upon the subtype, and tall wood windows. Decorative half-timbering is present on only about half of the examples.

With origins in the British Arts and Crafts movement, born in response to the overly ornate Victorian aesthetic and the highly mechanized Industrial Revolution, Craftsman style architecture was popular in the United States largely between 1905 and 1930. Early examples by Greene and Greene were highly publicized in magazines, thus familiarizing the rest of the nation with the style. As a result, a flood of pattern books appeared, offering plans for Craftsman bungalows. One story vernacular examples are often called simply bungalows. Character defining features of Craftsman architecture include a low-pitched, gabled roof with wide, unenclosed eave overhang; exposed roof rafters; multiple roof planes; decorative beams or braces; full or partial-width porches supported by tapered square columns or pedestals; decorative attic vents; wood or stucco cladding; and wood frame and sash windows in fixed, double hung and casement varieties.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Craftsman style with Tudor Revival influences style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a sand stucco exterior with a brick wainscoting; an asymmetrical front façade; a cross gable roof; exposed decorative round cut rafter tails; wide unenclosed eaves; a turret; a red brick chimney with decorative brickwork and diagonal dual shafts; and arched wooden casement windows. Therefore, staff recommends designations under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was designed by Charles Salyers and constructed by Joseph L. Hilliard in 1929.

Born in 1900, Charles Salyers first arrived in San Diego at the age of nine. As a young man, he actively engaged in the local building industry, at which time he became skilled in the design and construction of private homes. In 1927, Salyers was hired as the development architectural designer for Gibson City, prior to becoming a licensed architect. This important commission provides insight into the early phase of his career, and demonstrates that he was already viewed as a skilled architectural designer. Seeking to advance his profession, he was granted an architect's license in 1932, and was thereafter recognized as a prolific residential designer.

Already an accomplished builder and architect, Salyers further expanded his repertoire through the pursuit of a career in public administration. In 1941, he was recruited by officials at the newly founded County Surveyor's Office to serve as their first Chief Building Inspector. He relinquished his position in 1948, though, when Governor Earl Warren appointed him Chief of the State Division of Housing. After serving in this capacity for two years, he returned to his home in San Diego, where he proceeded to design and construct single-family homes.

Salyers retired from practice in 1966. Although he never earned the renown of many of his contemporaries, Salyers was nonetheless a builder, architect and public administrator of note. Recognized in large part for his innovative approach to design, he helped shape the unique residential character of midcentury San Diego.

Salyers' earliest works were in the Spanish Eclectic style, but by the 1930s he began working in the Streamline Moderne style. As it stands, currently all the historical designations that were designated under Criterion D for Charles Salyers are either in the Spanish Eclectic style or the Streamline Moderne style. The subject resource, designed by Salyers for the Hilliard's, is unique example of his work. The subject resource is designed in neither of his usual architectural styles, but it is instead a fusion of two different styles, the Craftsman and the Tudor Revival.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource showcases the Master Architect' Charles Salyers' ability to both design outside of his normal architectural style choices, and his innovative interpretation of the fusion of the Craftsman and Tudor Revival styles. The house also retains a good level of integrity of design. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect Charles Salyers

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Martha and Joseph Hillard/Charles Slayers House located at 4415 Long Branch Ave be designated with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the both the front and rear detached garages, the 2018 deck, and the 2018 addition

a Boreix

Megan Bacik Junior Planner

MB/el

Attachment(s):

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 3/25/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 3/25/2021, to consider the historical designation of the **Martha and Joseph Hillard/Charles Salyers House** (owned by Shawn M and Erica R Lyons Living Trust 06-14-02, 920 Culebra Road, Hillsborough, CA 94010) located at **4415 Long Branch Avenue**, **San Diego**, **CA 92107**, APN: **448-781-07-00**, further described as BLK 1 LOT 6 NELY 115FT /EXC NWLY 15 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No.**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Martha and Joseph Hillard/Charles Salyers House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Craftsman Style with Tudor revival influences and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource maintains its sand stucco exterior with a brick wainscoting, cross gable roof with exposed decorative round cut rafter tails and wide unenclosed eaves, turret, a red brick chimney with decorative brickwork and diagonal dual shafts and arched wooden casement windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect Charles Slayers. Specifically, the resource is a notable example of Charles Salyers' work as it is a unique example of his ability fuse two architecture styles he is not known to work with into a single design. The property retains integrity as it relates to the original design. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude excludes both the front and rear detached garages, the 2018 deck, and the 2018 addition

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

	BY:	
		DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
		Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,		
CITY ATTORNEY	BY:	
		LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
		Deputy City Attorney