



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: April 8, 2021 REPORT NO. HRB-21-022

HEARING DATE: April 22, 2021

SUBJECT: **ITEM #4 – The Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Jeffrey Goldberg and Susan Dellio represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

LOCATION: 3406 Olive Street, North Park Community, Council District 3
APN 453-833-16-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3 located at 3406 Olive Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3 located at 3406 Olive Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource features varied massing; asymmetrical front façade; Mission red clay tile fronted roof; hand-troweled stucco wall surfacing; and one-over-one wood double-hung windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. This 1929 Spanish Eclectic house is a one-story, single-family residence located in the Carmel Heights Extension subdivision of the North Park Community Plan Area.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey but was not identified in the survey because it was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Paul and Nellie McCoy, who constructed the house as a speculation house in 1929.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was constructed in 1929 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The house was constructed primarily with a flat roof and joined by a cross-gabled roof towards the front clad with hand-troweled stucco. Both the south-facing gable roof and the decorative false side-gabled roof are lined with red Mission clay tiles. The south-facing, primary elevation features a covered, partial-width raised front porch. Two square wood columns occupy the porch, supporting the wooden beams and corbels, thus bearing the false side-facing gable. Below the south-facing gable, a large focal window with an arched top adorns the façade. To the right of the arched-top window, three one-over-one wood double-hung windows occupy the porch wall. The original wooden east-facing front door is positioned between the large arched window and the three wooden double-hung windows.

The same-style double-hung windows are repeated on the side (east) façade in various sizes for a total of seven windows. The east elevation also features a deep, simple recessed entry doorway; the doorway's design imitates and suggests the thickness of adobe. The west façade features a protruding chimney clad with stucco, flanked by the wood double-hung one-over-one windows totaling five windows along this elevation. The north-facing rear façade contains a pair of French doors and a single double-hung window. The double doors open to a raised deck. A detached garage clad with stucco with a square footprint and modern door and is situated to the northeast of the property.

Modifications to the property include the in kind replacement of the original roofing at an unknown date; the removal of all the original double-hung wooden one-over-one windows with vinyl replacements in 2016; a modern, rear composite deck completed at an unknown date; and new vinyl double doors replacing the original French doors on the rear elevation. In 2019, the property underwent restoration efforts which included the removal of nine vinyl windows on the south, west, and east facades with period-correct wood windows that replicated the original windows. Overall, these modifications do not significantly impair the integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of

Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including the asymmetrical front façade, hand-troweled stucco, low-pitched Mission clay tile roof, arched focal window, and recessed partial-width porch. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3 located at 3406 Olive Street be designated with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style.



Alvin Lin
Junior Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

AL/eh/ss

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 4/22/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 4/22/2021, to consider the historical designation of the Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3 (owned by Jeffrey Goldberg & Susan Dellio, 3406 Olive Street, San Diego, CA 92104) located at **3406 Olive Street, San Diego, CA 92104**, APN: **453-833-16-00**, further described as BLK D LOT 14 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Paul and Nellie McCoy Speculation House #3 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics: varied massing, asymmetrical front façade; Mission red clay tile fronted roof; hand-troweled stucco wall surfacing; and one-over-one wood double-hung windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney