

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 13, 2021

REPORT NO. HRB-21-033

HEARING DATE: May 27, 2021

SUBJECT: ITEM #3 – Frances Zeluff House

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Pint-Greenlee Family Trust; represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

- LOCATION: 3238 Goldsmith Street, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 APN 450-142-10-00
- DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Frances Zeluff House located at 3238 Goldsmith Street as a historical resource.

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Frances Zeluff House located at 3238 Goldsmith Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1954-1974 under HRB Criterion B and a 1913 period of significance of under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage completed in 2014 and the rear addition completed in 2016. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

- 1. The resource is identified with Frances Zeluff, a historically significant individual and retains integrity for her association. Specifically, the resource was her primary residence from 1954-1974 when she became an early, outspoken advocate for the local tuna fishing industry, its workers and their families during a time when the local tuna fishing industry was declining due to global competition.
- 2. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched, hipped roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves, two-story massing with an off centered single-story entrance porch, and divided lite wood windows.

# BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is in the Loma Portal neighborhood, facing towards the southwest and the parcel features a two-story single-family residence and a modern, detached garage.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Frances Zeluff House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Frances Zeluff, who is a historically significant individual who resided in the property.

#### <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B and C and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject property is significant for its association with Frances Zeluff who is a historically significant individual who resided in the subject property from 1954 until her passing in 2012. George Zeluf, her husband, was a pioneer in the tuna fishing industry as well as boat owner and capitan until his retirement in 1978 and when the industry began to suffer Frances Zeluff became an early, outspoken advocate for the local tuna fishing industry.

Soon after the Zeluff's purchased the subject property, the local tuna fishing industry began to suffer due to local canneries purchasing cheaper, imported tuna from Japanese fishermen which caused local fisherman to be out of work for an extended period causing financial crises for families throughout San Diego. The lack of work for the Zeluff family and countless others in the area resulted in Frances Zeluff becoming the chairman of the Tuna Fisherman's Wives Emergency Committee to find a solution to get local fishermen back to work. In 1955, Frances went to Washington, D.C. with four other women from San Diego from different segments of the tuna industry to meet with representatives and Congressmen to secure a quota on the amount of imported frozen tuna that could be brought into the United States. Although this meeting was unsuccessful, some changes did occur such as the Small Business Administration established a credit relief program for tuna fishermen, and a request was sent by the U.S. government to the Japanese government to increase the wage standards and practices in the Japanese tuna fishing industry. Frances continued her fight for local fishermen and testified at several hearings before the Senate Interstate and Foreign Commerce Committee as well as the Tariff Commission to push for the passing of the Tuna Import Act of 1958. She also went to Washington, D.C again in 1959 on behalf of the Tuna Fisherman's Wives Emergency Committee and attempted to meet with President Eisenhower to push the need for the Japanese and United States governments to meet and discuss the impacts the lack of global regulations and trade had on the local economy. The United States and Japanese governments ultimately ended up meeting later in 1959 and as a result of this meeting and technological advances in fishing nets, there was a slight incline in work in San Diego. Nonetheless, Frances continued her activism efforts on behalf of the local tuna fishing industry in the 1960s and 1970s while being an active member of the local Women's Propeller Club of the United States which promoted and advocated for the maritime and commercial fishing industry. She ultimately served as the San Diego chapter president twice and fought for improved safety standards for vessels formerly registered in the U.S. In 1974 Frances represented the San Diego chapter of the Women's Propeller Club of the United States and spoke on U.S. Senate Bill 1988 before the U.S. Senate Committee on Commerce's Subcommittee on Oceans and Atmosphere. During the hearing, Frances advocated for the Interim Fisheries Zone Extension and Management Act, which sought to extend the jurisdiction of the United States from a 12-mile zone of jurisdiction up to a 200-mile zone. While the entire act was not approved, portions of the legislation were included in 1975 and 1976. Although her husband retired from commercial fishing in 1978, Frances remained active in the community. As noted in Frances's obituary, "Being a member and leader of local/national organizations, she was a woman ahead of her time. During the 1950s, she was a state and national lobbyist for the commercial fishing industry. Her collaboration with key leaders and the Tuna industry proved to be instrumental making San Diego the "Tuna capitol of the world"."

As discussed in the Consultant's Report, George Zeluff was a local boat owner, fisherman, and capitan in San Diego. However, staff was unable to identify his specific contributions to local history that would allow him to qualify under HRB Criterion B. His eligibility under this criterion may be reevaluated at a future date pending the submittal of additional information and analysis.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource was the primary residence of Frances Zeluff from 1954-1974 when she was an early, outspoken advocate for the local tuna fishing industry, its workers and their families during a time when the local tuna fishing industry was declining due to global competition. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the resource located at 3238 Goldsmith under HRB Criterion B.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is a two-story single-family residence constructed in 1913 in the Prairie style. The building is clad in stucco and features a low pitched, hipped roof with deep, overhanging eaves. The primary elevation features an off centered covered front porch with a shallow hipped roof support by large stucco clad columns. The modern entrance door is accessed by the front covered porch along with an uncovered porch. Fenestration on the primary elevation features a divided lite, wooden casement windows along with a large, fixed single lite window. The second story features an irregular shaped floor plan, with a square balcony that faces towards the street along with a sunroom surrounded by divided lite casement windows. The side elevations offer limited details but include the continuation of textured stucco, divided lite casement windows and horizontal emphasis using deep, overhanging eaves. The rear elevation features the same stucco and windows as the side and primary elevations, but also includes a modern addition with a differentiated stucco texture that was approved by Historic Resources staff.

Modifications to the property are minimal and include a seismic retrofit in 1995; the in-kind replacement of the original single pane wooden windows with wooden dual pane replacements in 2002 as part of the Quieter Homes Program; the removal of a cloth awning and a new walkway completed at unknown dates; a new detached garage which replaced in the original garage in 2014 and a rear addition completed in 2016 which were both deemed consistent with the Secretary of Interior's Standards by Historical Resources staff. After conducting a site visit, staff determined that the house was likely restucced; however, the new stucco appears to be consistent with the original texture. Overall these modifications do not significantly impact the integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

The Prairie style originated in Chicago and was popular primarily in the Midwest for the early part of the 20th century. An indigenous American style, the Prairie School shared the ideals of the British Arts and Crafts movement and was popularized by architects including Frank Lloyd Wright, George Maher and others. Character-defining features of Prairie style architecture include low-pitched, usually hipped roofs, wide overhanging eaves, cornices and façade detailing emphasizing horizontal lines. Prairie style houses are typically two stories and often feature casement windows, one-story wings, porches, porte cocheres and inconspicuous entries. Pattern books and popular magazines spread vernacular examples widely to suburbs throughout the country, with most being built between 1905 and 1915.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Prairie style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a low pitched, hipped roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves, two-story massing with an off centered single-story entrance porch, and divided lite wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 3238 Goldsmith Street did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may be reevaluated at a future date pending the submittal of additional information and analysis.

# OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

# **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Frances Zeluff House located at 3238 Goldsmith Street be designated with a period of significance of 1954-1974 under HRB Criterion B and a 1913 period of significance of under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage completed in 2014 and the rear addition completed in 2016.

Emma Haggerty Senior Planner

EH/SS

Attachment(s):

hule

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 5/27/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/27/2021, to consider the historical designation of the Frances Zeluff House (owned by Pint-Greenlee Family Trust 03-17-17, 3238 Goldsmith Street, San Diego, CA 92106) located at **3238 Goldsmith Street**, **San Diego, CA 92106**, APN: **450-142-10-00**, further described as BLK 21 LOT 11 /EXC PART IN OVERLAP / LOT 1 BLK 284 MAP 275 & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Frances Zeluff House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION B for its association with Frances Zeluff, a historically significant individual and retains integrity for her association. Specifically, the resource was her primary residence from 1954-1974 when she became an early, outspoken advocate for the local tuna fishing industry, its workers and their families during a time when the local tuna fishing industry was declining due to global competition. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Prairie style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1913 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a low pitched, hipped roof with wide overhanging boxed eaves, two-story massing with an off centered single-story entrance porch, and divided lite wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the detached garage completed in 2014 and the rear addition completed in 2016.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

SUZANNE SEGUR, Senior Planner, HRB Liaison

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_

LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney