



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: May 13, 2021 REPORT NO. HRB-21-031

HEARING DATE: May 27, 2021

SUBJECT: **ITEM #07 – 3714 Nimitz Boulevard**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Daniel Codd; represented by Daniel Codd

LOCATION: 3714 Nimitz Boulevard, Peninsula Community, Council District 2
APN 449-362-19-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 3714 Nimitz Boulevard as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Do not designate the property located at 3714 Nimitz Boulevard under any adopted HRB Criteria.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is a one-story Mission Revival style single family residence that was constructed in 1928

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Daniel Codd, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff disagrees and finds that the site is not significant under any HRB Criteria. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject resource is a one-story, single family residence constructed in 1928. The house consists of an irregular massing that is topped by a flat roof with a parapet and is covered in a worm stucco exterior. The resource features both rectangular and arched wood casement windows on three of the four facades, rectangular single doors ways on the front and back facades, a front porch which consists of a rounded entry, a concrete base, a gable roof covered in variegated red tiled and a stucco covered wing wall on both sides. The wing walls act as a break between the street and the front facade's two tripart arched windows, which consist of a fixed center and casements on either side. Gutters are inset to the stuccoed fascia of the sides of the front porch's roof, and drain spouts are routed internally through the wing walls to exit at ground level. Both wings have one round light fixture attached to the walls' highest point, arched openings with metal grills over them, square niches with cantilevered platforms, and metal rails connect the wings to the house while encircling the porch's floor. From both side facades a stucco cover short wall extends out to property line. On the southern side of the front façade the wall breaks for a wood gated entry to the back yard. To each side of the gate is stucco cover posts topped with decorative light caps. Behind the wall is simple stucco cover chimney. Behind the house is a detached two car garage with a modern rolling garage door, a single rectangle door, and two double hung vinyl windows.

The property has undergone a several alterations to the exterior of the house and detached garage since it was first constructed in 1928. Both the house in 2019 and detached garage at an unknown date had an asphalt composite roof added to their flat roofs, in 2019 a solar thermal collection system was installed on top of the roof of the house, and in 2016 the down spouts were modified in an unknown manner to be replaced with rain collection cisterns. The garage originally had carriage doors, as evidenced by the hinge mortises, that were replaced at an unknown date with its current two car width rolling garage door. These alterations do not significantly impair the resource's integrity.

Prior to 1951 stucco covered brick walls were added to either side of the house. The majority of the windows on the resource's back and side facades were replaced with vinyl casement and double hung windows prior to 2008. In 2017 the wood arched tripartite windows on the front façade were replaced in kind, and in 2020 the vinyl windows on the side facades were replaced with wood multi-lite windows based off of neighboring residences constructed by the same builder. Both window replacements were done without guidance from historic documentation or input from Historical Resources staff. The replacement of the vinyl windows without evidence of the original lite pattern does not meet Standard Tree of the Secretary of the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation where under standard three "changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken." While most of these changes do not have an impact on the resource's integrity, the inappropriate replacement of the vinyl windows significantly impairs integrity of design as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

The front facade shows several examples of undated alterations, including the replacement of the porch roofing material with variegated tiles, globe light fixtures on top of the wing walls and the stuccoing of the underside of the porch's roof. The worm stucco texture itself, and it's location on the underside of the porch's roof, is not common for the Mission Revival style. The Historical Resources Research Report uses neighboring properties, one of which has been significantly altered, that were constructed by the same builder, Thomas H. Thornton, to argue the originality of the variegated roof tiles and the worm stucco. Currently Thornton is not a Master Builder and his work

has not fully been evaluated. It is not concluded that variegated tile roofs and worm stucco texture identifying features of his work, and using neighboring properties as reference does not meet the Interior Standards for Rehabilitation where under standard three "changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken."

These modifications and the lack of information about them negatively impacts the resource's the architectural integrity of the house by creating a false sense of history through a lack of differentiation between the original and the new, therefore staff does not recommend designation of the property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The applicant's request for designation for the property located at 3714 Nimitz Boulevard did not include information to support a determination under HRB Criterion D; therefore, staff has not made a determination regarding eligibility under Criterion D at this time. Eligibility under this criterion may can be reevaluated at a future date pending submittal of additional information and analysis.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the property located at 3714 Nimitz Boulevard not be designated under any HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.



Megan Bacik
Junior Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

MB/SS

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover