



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 10, 2021 REPORT NO. HRB-21-038

HEARING DATE: June 24, 2021

SUBJECT: **ITEM #2 –Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Stephane & Megan Beauvais represented by Landmark Historic Preservation

LOCATION: 3226 Brant Street, Uptown Community, Council District 3, APN 452-494-26-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House located at 3226 Brant Street as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House located at 3226 Brant Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C and D. The designation excludes the modified detached garage. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Prairie Style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features widely overhanging eaves; horizontal emphasis using long fascia boards; broad horizontal chimney; covered entry porch with large square columns; rectangular building footprint with geometric massing; eight-over-one and eighteen-over-one wooden windows; tall triple rectangular fixed and casement window sets; and a general lack of applied embellishments.
2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, this resource exhibits Schreiber's complex fenestration design, including a variety of window sizes, window-boxes, a decorative stained-glass dining room window along with the decorative front porch design, featuring capped-top columns continued above the porch roof, recessed column details, and arched porched headers.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject property is a two-story, single-family residence with a modified detached garage located in the Banker's Hill neighborhood of the Uptown Community Plan Area.

The property was identified in the [2016 Community Plan Update Historic Resource Survey](#) and given a Status Code of 5D3, "Appears to be a contributor to a district that appears eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House, has been identified as consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt, who constructed the house as their personal residence, and Alexander Schreiber, an established Master Builder.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research was prepared by Landmark Historic Preservation, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB C and D, and staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows:

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject property was the personal residence of Master Designer, Ralph Hurlburt from 1920-1922. Personal residences associated with Master Architects, Builders, Designers are typically not significant under HRB Criterion B, as there are usually properties, such as their office or studio, that better reflect their significance under HRB Criterion B. No evidence indicated that the property was designed by Hurlburt, nor was it used as his personal office; therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B at this time.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

The subject property was constructed in 1920 in the Prairie Style. The house exhibits a two-story rectangular massing with an extending one-story front porch. The building is clad with the original sandy stucco and displays a hipped roof with projecting overhanging eaves. An original but altered detached garage is located behind the residence.

The one-story front covered porch is supported by two large square columns and displays a slight arch on its porch headers. The square columns continue above the flat porch roof and form capped tops. The primary façade is symmetrical in design. Its ground floor contains two sets of tall, triple fixed and casement window groupings; above, eight-over-one and eighteen-over-one wooden double-hung windows occupy the second-story facade. The double-hung windows are accentuated by planter-like window box details supported by classical decorative brackets. The window box details are further adorned with faux iron railings. The footprint and overall architecture suggest a simple geometric design and an emphasis on horizontal lines.

The south-facing side façade is relatively unaltered and contains an original capped stucco chimney; fenestration consists of eighteen-over-one double-hung windows.

The resource has had several modifications since its 1920 date of construction. The rearmost portion of the north façade was altered at an unknown date; the previous owners modified four door and window openings and installed in their place two circa 1950s louvered windows and a three-part casement window. In 1956, an addition was constructed at the location of a rear uncovered porch. This addition features a flat roof with wide eave overhangs and rectangular windows. A sliding glass door was also installed along the rear elevation at an unknown date. The original detached garage was extensively modified, nearly doubling in size and gaining an attached carport. The previous owners partook in restoration work in 1982, reinstalling 1920s wooden double-hung windows, installing the original front entry door, and refurbishing the topmost portion of the porch columns. The restoration work followed the original design according to historical photographs from the 1920s and 1940s, but the project was not reviewed by Historical Resources staff. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

The Prairie style was popular between 1900 and 1920 and was primarily used for domestic architecture. The style originated in Chicago and is closely associated with Frank Lloyd Wright. It spread nationwide due to being featured in magazines and pattern books. Its primary character defining features are a low-pitched roof, deep eaves, two-story construction with one-story wings or porches, and detailing that emphasizes horizontal lines. Examples of features used to create a horizontal emphasis include the deep eaves at both the main roof and lower roofs, contrasting trim between stories, contrasting colors on cornices and eaves, horizontal siding, and horizontal rows of windows. Roofs are typically hipped. Massive porch piers are also common, especially on high-style examples. High-style examples also typically have a one-story wing, porch or carport on one side of the house. Windows typically have multi-paned upper sections and are either casements or double-hung.

Significance Statement: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Prairie Style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including widely overhanging eaves; horizontal emphasis using long fascia boards; broad horizontal chimney; covered entry porch with large square columns; rectangular building footprint with geometric massing; eight-over-one and eighteen-over-one wooden windows; tall triple rectangular fixed and casement window sets; and a general lack of applied embellishments. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was constructed in 1920 by Alexander Schreiber. Schreiber was a prolific builder and contractor in San Diego, and he constructed residential and commercial buildings in various styles, including Spanish Eclectic, Craftsman, and Prairie Style in the North Park, South Park, University Heights, Loma Portal, Encanto, and Mission Hills communities. Schreiber has been credited with building over 45 houses in Mission Hills, and among these houses, two were Prairie Style homes which were designated by the Historic Resources Board (HRB #730 and HRB #618). Schreiber was also an early experimenter in the use of electricity in houses; his obituary credits him with building the first

house in San Diego completely wired for electrical appliances. In 2003, the Historic Resources Board established Schreiber as a Master Builder with the nomination of Alexander Schreiber Spec House #1.

The subject property is the first identified two-story Prairie Style residence constructed by Alexander Schreiber with fire-resistant hollow clay tile. Additional exterior details on the property that exemplify Schreiber's unique style include complex fenestration design, including a variety of window sizes, window-boxes, a decorative stained-glass dining room window along with the decorative front porch design, featuring capped-top columns continued above the porch roof, recessed column details, and arched porch headers.

The consultant's report identifies that Master Designer Ralph Hurlburt designed the subject property. Although Hurlburt and Schreiber worked together on residential construction projects in San Diego as previously noted in the designation of Ralph Hurlburt/Alexander Schreiber Spec House #1 (HRB #929) and the Ralph Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber Spec House #2 (HRB #948), no evidence was provided to confirm that Hurlburt was involved in the design of the subject property. While the deed of the subject property indicates Hurlburt was the owner at the time of construction, no documentation was provided which showed Hurlburt's involvement in the design or the construction of the house. Therefore, staff cannot recommend the designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of established Master Designer Ralph Hurlburt at this time.

Significance Statement: The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, this resource exhibits Schreiber's complex fenestration design, including a variety of window sizes, window-boxes, a decorative stained-glass dining room window along with the decorative front porch design, featuring capped-top columns continued above the porch roof, recessed column details, and arched porch headers. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of established Master Builder Alexander Schreiber.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House located at 3226 Brant Street be designated with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Prairie Style and HRB Criterion D as a resource that is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber. The designation excludes the modified detached garage.



Alvin Lin
Junior Planner



Suzanne Segur
Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison
Development Services Department

AL/SS/eh

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 6/24/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/24/2021, to consider the historical designation of the **Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House** (owned by Stephane & Megan Beauvais, 3226 Brant Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3226 Brant Street, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-494-26-00**, further described as BLK 378 LOT I N 1/2 LOT H & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Ralph and Nettie Hurlburt/ Alexander Schreiber House on the following findings:

(1) The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Prairie Style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1920 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features widely overhanging eaves; horizontal emphasis using long fascia boards; broad horizontal chimney; covered entry porch with large square columns; rectangular building footprint with geometric massing; eight-over-one and eighteen-over-one wooden windows; tall triple rectangular fixed and casement window sets; and a general lack of applied embellishments.

(2) The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Builder Alexander Schreiber and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, this resource exhibits Schreiber's complex fenestration design, including a variety of window sizes, window-boxes, a decorative stained-glass dining room window along with the decorative front porch design, featuring capped-top columns continued above the porch roof, recessed column details, and arched porched headers.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the original modified detached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
LINDSEY SEBASTIAN,
Deputy City Attorney