

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

### Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	October 14, 2021	REPORT NO. HRB-21-058
HEARING DATE:	October 28, 2021	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #05 – Edgar Ullrich House #2	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Database	<u>(CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	Edwards Family Trust 05-01-82 represented by Von	n Marie May
LOCATION:	6001 Bellevue Avenue, La Jolla Community, Council APN 357-184-05-00	District 01
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Edgar Ullrich Hous Bellevue Avenue as a historical resource.	e # 2 located at 6001

### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Edgar Ullrich House # 2 located at 6001 Bellevue Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion D This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect, Edgar Ullrich and retains integrity as it relates to the original design. The house is significant as an example of Ullrich's work as the tract architect in the La Jolla Hermosa subdivision in which he designed large, luxury homes. Specifically, the resource is notable as a rare example of Ullrich's work outside of the strict confines of early twentieth century Revival styles in which he combined several different architectural styles to design a custom home for his clients, the Kenyons.

### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resources is a one story, single family residence with an interior courtyard and attached two car garage. It is located on a raise lot at the northeast corner of Bellevue Avenue and La Canada in the Lower Hermosa neighborhood of the La Jolla Community.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Edgar Ullrich House # 2, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Edgar Ullrich, a Master Architect.

### <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Vonn Marie May, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria B, C, and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion D, but not HRB Criteria B and C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

### CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

The subject property was constructed by Karl L. Kenyon and his wife Marian Brown Kenyon in 1927. It was their place of residence from 1927 till 1935. The applicant's historic report concludes that both Karl L. Kenyon and wife Marian Brown Kenyon would be considered historically significant individuals for their efforts help develop and preserve the La Jolla neighborhood. However, at this time the report does not show that their work is significant, nor that the subject property is the best resource associated with the work argued to be significant in the report.

Karl Kenyon worked in the banking industry, and the institutions he presided over as President and Vice President provided funding that aided in La Jolla's development. In his personal life he was active member of La Jolla society life, including helping to found the La Jolla Country Club in 1927, and later be one of its Presidents. While Kenyon was Vice President and Treasurer and Director of La Jolla Properties, Inc, the company helped to develop the La Jolla Hermosa neighborhood in the late 1920s. Kenyon's work with La Jolla Properties was part of a collaborative effort and there is no evidence to show that he rose above his colleagues in significance. Furthermore, the resource itself was also built in the La Jolla Hermosa Unit #2 during the development of the neighborhoods that La Jolla Properties was helping to fund. This makes 6001 Bellevue Avenue unlikely to be the property best resource associated with Karl Kenyon's professional accomplishments, as he would have been living and working at other properties during his most productive years. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B for an association with Karl Kenyon.

The report did not show Marian Brown Kenyon to hold any professional positions, but she was an active volunteer with various groups within the La Jolla Community. In 1977, several decades after she had moved out from and sold the subject resource, she contributed her extensive knowledge of Old La Jolla Village, its early residents, and the bungalow homes to the La Jolla Historical Survey. No evidence has been provided to show that she did anything that would qualify for significance during the time she is associated with 6001 Bellevue Avenue. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B for an association with Marion Brown Kenyon.

Karl L. Kenyon and Marian Brown Kenyon had a son, Karl Walton Kenyon, who grow up in the subject resource. As an adult he left La Jolla to study at Pomona College and Cornel University. Afterwards, he became an expert zoologist, working in both the academic and public field. His work included developing proper handling techniques for the re-establishment of sea otter community in places where they were being destroyed, coauthoring seminal works on breeding, distribution, and

the life history of Laysan and Black-footed albatrosses and the Hawaiian Monk Seal, and being one of the first to document the ingestion of plastic by seabirds. Within the ecology and environmental preservation community Karl Walton Kenyon may be potentially significant, however, his most productive work was done after he had moved away from La Jolla.

Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion B for an association with Karl Walton Kenyon.

## CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

6001 Bellevue Avenue is a one-story, single-family home constructed in a square-like shaped floorplan with an enclosed central courtyard and an attached garage. The roof consists of interlocking end gable, side gable, hipped and ½ hipped roofs with exposed rafter tails and is covered in composition shake. The resource contains two chimneys. Along the north façade is a stucco covered square chimney at courtyard side of the gable. On the top of the gable roof of the south façade is a brick chimney with double chimney pots. The exterior walls consist of asymmetrical elevations covered in cedar shake. The south, east and north exterior facades feature both large and medium sized double hung and casement wooden windows with leaded glass and square and diamond pattern lite patterns. Along the south façade is an attached two car garage.

The front façade faces west and features a large bow window, brick covered walkway and stairs, recessed entry way with wood corbels accenting the porch entry, a door way with side lite windows to each side and a elliptical fan lite window above, a large wood framed double set of arched wood windows with diamond-shaped, leaded-glass panes, and a small set of wood, diamond-shaped, leaded-glass vertical windows. The resources open-air central courtyard features a paved basket weave style brick flooring, a vertical arched brick fountain and brick apron on the east internal façade, three sets of wood double doors and four single doors, of which two have operable wickets to look out from the interior. Along the exterior east and north facades is paved basket weave style brick flooring and raised cobble stone wall.

Modifications include the widening of the two-door garage door opening to accommodate a contemporary garage door after 1963. The resource was also reroofed twice in 1976 and 2000. A basket weave style flooring was added to the grounds of the interior courtyard and behind the resources exterior north and east facades between 1952-1963. Most of the landscaping has been replaced throughout the years, including the removal of the ivy and several trees and the addition of several bushes along the exterior south and west facades. The weeping fig tree in the interior courtyard shows as mature in the 1951 one photograph and was likely planted not long after the resource was constructed.

The Shingle style was an American architectural style popular on the East Coast in the late nineteenth century. The plain shingle exteriors were a response to the highly ornamental Eastlake and Queen Anne styles of the era. The style was influenced by medieval English precedents as well as a renewed interest in American Colonial architecture after the 1876 Centennial Exposition in Philadelphia. Many of the period's most influential architects adopted the style and it became popular for residences in seaside resort towns. Character defining features of the style include wood shingle exteriors, two or three stories in height with a horizontal emphasis, asymmetrical facades, steep roofs with intersecting gables, towers, expansive porches and Colonial Revival influenced windows and doors.

Bungalows were a popular building type in the early twentieth century. The term originated in India where it referred to any single-family dwelling. In the United States during the early twentieth century, a "bungalow" could refer to any small, one or one-and-a-half story residential structure and was not associated with any particular style. As streetcar transportation supported the expansion of cities into a first ring of suburbs, bungalows were attractive because they allowed families the ability to move outside of the crowded urban core and into a relatively easily constructed single family house. It was common to see bungalows in the Revival styles that were popular at this time such as Spanish Colonial, Mission, Colonial or Tudor. Craftsman examples were often called "California" bungalows and were popular in suburban areas throughout the United States.

The Historical Resources Research Report asserts that the property is a good example of the Shingle and California Bungalow styles with Colonial Revival accents. Staff disagrees and finds that the subject resource is not a good example of any style. While the resource displays some characteristics of the Shingle style such as a wood shingle exterior, asymmetrical façade, horizontal emphasis and a Colonial Revival influenced front door surround; it lacks the elements that bring the design cohesively together to make it recognizable as an example of the style. Good examples of the Shingle style are generally two to three stories in height with steep roofs, intersecting gables and prominent porches. Additionally, the design incorporates elements of other styles including Tudor, as seen in the arched and leaded glass windows, and Craftsman which is evident in the low-pitched roof and exposed rafter tails. The resource does not appear to be a good example of any style, but rather an amalgamation of the styles popular during the period of construction. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Shingle style.

A bungalow is a building type, not a style, that is common in San Diego. The threshold for determining a bungalow as individually eligible for designation is high and this building type is more likely appropriate for designation in the context of a historical district. Additionally, the subject resource cannot be determined to be a good example of a bungalow because it is not compact and sprawls around a central courtyard. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the bungalow building type.

### CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Edgar Vaughn Ullrich was born in Colorado Springs, Colorado, in 1893 and attended Colorado College. By 1923, he was a practicing architect. He relocated to San Diego in 1924 to take a commission from Isabel Hopkins to design the Casa de Manana resort hotel (HRB #213), which won an AIA award.

After this project, Ullrich became the tract architect for the La Jolla Hermosa subdivision, designing its earliest houses, landscaping much of the tract, and reviewing proposed house designs. He ultimately designed more than 15 houses in the tract. His style for this subdivision emphasized color coordination, random tile roofing with noticeable mortar, distinctive chimneys, window grilles, and wood shutters with pegs.

Ullrich primarily worked in the Spanish Eclectic and Monterey styles, but also used the Tudor Revival and French Norman styles. He designed his own house (HRB #740) in the Tudor Revival style. Over the course of his career, Ullrich designed more than 25 major buildings in La Jolla, including public buildings, churches and academic buildings. He also designed buildings for the University of San Diego, such as the Immaculate Heart Seminary and More Hall.

Ullrich was established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Architect in 1987 with the designation of the Casa de Manana. Since that time, 10 of Ullrich's buildings have been designated by the HRB.

- HRB #212– Casa de Manana Casa Madre (849 Coast Boulevard), 1924
- HRB #213– Casa de Manana (722, 809 & 825 Coast Boulevard), 1924 (809 & 825 demolished)
- HRB #226– Morgan-Larkins-Marrone Residence (7148–7150 Monte Vista Avenue), 1935
- HRB #693– George and Ruth Glendon/Edgar Ullrich House (1006 Muirlands Drive), 1928
- HRB #740– Edgar Ullrich House (1745 Kearsarge Road), 1925
- HRB #827– Harold and Charlotte Muir House (1205 Muirlands Drive), 1928
- HRB #882– James J. Podesta House (6123 Avenida Cresta), 1927
- HRB #956– Edward and Eleanor Mastin House (1891 Viking Way), 1930
- HRB #965– Norman Kennedy House (716 La Canada Street), 1928
- HRB #1140– George and Virginia Hayes/Edgar Ullrich House (5905 Camino De La Costa), 1934
- HRB #1170– William and Wilma Garth/Edgar Ullrich House (1825 Castellana Road), 1928

The subject resource is one of at least fifteen La Jolla Hermosa subdivision homes designed by Ullrich. Though Ullrich is not known to use cedar shingles as an exterior material choice, the original owners, Karl L. and Marian Brown Kenyon, lived in a traditional beach bungalow, at 454 Raivna both before and after they resided at the subject resource. As the resource was built for them, the cedar shingle exterior could be contributed to their tastes and Ullrich's ability to collaborate. The resource displays character defining features for four different architectural styles, including Spanish Colonial Revival, Tudor Revival, Colonial Revival, and Craftsman. By bring these four styles together the resource show cases Ullrich's ability to design a building that is so unique that it cannot be labeled under one or two architectural styles.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource retains excellent integrity and continues to reflect Ullrich's original design intent and aesthetic. The house is significant as an example of Ullrich's work as the tract architect in the La Jolla Hermosa subdivision in which he designed large, luxury homes. Specifically, the resource is notable as a rare example of Ullrich's work outside of the strict confines of early twentieth century Revival styles in which he combined several different architectural styles to design a custom home for his clients, the Kenyons. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Edgar Ullrich.

### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Edgar Ullrich House # 2 located at 6001 Bellevue Avenue be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criterion D as a resource that reflects the notable work of Master Architect Edgar Ullrich.

an Boreix

Megan Bacik Assistant Planner

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

MB/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 10/28/2021

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 10/28/2021, to consider the historical designation of the **Edgar Ullrich House #2** (owned by Edwards Family Trust 05-01-82, 6001 Bellevue Avenue, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **6001 Bellevue Avenue**, **San Diego**, **CA 92037**, APN: **357-184-05-00**, further described as BLK 39 LOT 7 S 3 FT LOT 8 & ALL in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Edgar V. Ullrich #2 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect Edgar Ullrich. resource is notable as a rare example of Ullrich's work outside of the strict confines of early twentieth century Revival styles in which he combined several different architectural styles to design a custom home for his clients, the Kenyons. finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_ LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney RECORDING REQUESTED BY CITY OF SAN DIEGO DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT

### WHEN RECORDED MAIL TO

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD ATTN: HRB SECRETARY 1222 FIRST AVENUE, MS 501 SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

SPACE ABOVE THIS LINE FOR RECORDER'S USE

### RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A

HISTORICAL DESIGNATION OF PROPERTY ON

6001 Bellevue Avenue, San Diego, CA 92037

ASSESSOR PARCEL NUMBER 357-184-05-00

HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NUMBER 0

THIS PAGE ADDED TO PROVIDE ADEQUATE SPACE FOR RECORDING INFORMATION (Additional recording fee applies)