

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	June 9, 2022	REPORT NO. HRB-22-020
HEARING DATE:	June 23, 2022	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #02 – Ellis and Nancy Barron House	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Invent	ory Database (CHRID) Link
APPLICANT:	Robin Family Beaumont Trust 08-08-1	1; represented by IS Architecture
LOCATION:	6632 Avenida Manana, La Jolla Comm APN 351-661-0200	unity, Council District 1
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of Ellis and Avenida Manana as a historical resou	3

# STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Ellis and Nancy Barron House located at 6632 Avenida Manana as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1956-1959 under HRB Criterion C. This designation includes the attached garage. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Contemporary style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956-1959 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a partially encloused court, large aluminum-framed windows and louvered glazing, floor-to-ceiling glass, vertical wood siding, board-and-batten siding, exposed ceiling joists, and the strong interior/exterior connections demonstrated by the courtyard pergola-like shade structure with horizontal slats.

# BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The subject resource is a one-story residential building with an attached garage.

The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Ellis and Nancy Barron House, has been identified as consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Ellis Barron and Nancy W. Barron, who constructed the house as their personal residence.

# <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by IS Architecture, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C but not under HRB Criterion D. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property is a single-family home and garage constructed in 1956 with a 1959 addition. Its Contemporary design features a U-shaped residential floor plan with an attached garage towards the rear of the lot. A partially enclosed court is present. The exterior elevation features board-andbatten wood siding along the street-facing east elevation and portions of the south elevation. Otherwise, the exterior elevations are generally clad in white stucco. The low-pitched hipped roof exhibits a moderate eave overhang. The garage is finished in stucco and includes a wooden garage door with vertical slats.

The east elevation contains two original louvered vertical windows. The north elevation includes an earthen brick perimeter wall enclosing a recessed bay. This recessed bay is sided in a slender tongue-and-groove pattern with fixed and louvered glass fenestration. This tongue-and-groove pattern is repeated on the enclosed soffits. This elevation also includes an unelaborated, unpainted brick chimney. The west (rear) elevation is outfitted with sliding aluminum glass doors and a single paneled door. The south elevation features aluminum casement windows and sliding windows in various sizes. An original wooden gate with fixed louvers is also present along this elevation. Postend projection details resembling ceiling joists are present along the north elevation and parts of the south elevation.

The south-facing courtyard fenestration consists of large floor-to-ceiling glass and floor-to-ceiling sliding aluminum glass doors. Exposed ceiling joists extend from the interior space out into the courtyard, forming a pergola-like shade structure with horizontal slats. The west and east-facing courtyard elevation feature large windows and glass sliding doors. These two elevations are finished in stucco. The large aggregate concrete pavers with pebble grout are original. The transparency of the floor-to-ceiling glass and the exposed ceiling joists contributes to a strong indoor-outdoor connection.

Modifications to the resource include a 1959 addition along the building's south elevation, the 1950s era original front entry conversion to a window, the undated roof remodel, the undated east elevation window addition (removed in 2021), and a 2021 in-kind garage door replacement. These modifications do not impair the integrity of design, materials, workmanship, or feeling as it relates to HRB Criterion C.

Unlike earlier styles which are generally defined by exterior decorative details, the Contemporary style focused on interior spaces and their relation to the outdoors. Emphasis was placed on integrating the indoors with the outdoors by utilizing windows and exterior living areas such as balconies and courtyards. The style was popular in San Diego in the 1950's and 1960's largely because it could be easily adapted to hillside lots. Character defining features include strong roof forms with deep overhangs and exposed beams; large, aluminum framed windows; non-traditional exterior finishes including vertical wood siding, concrete block, stucco and flagstone; sun shades, screen or shadow block accents; broad masonry chimneys; and distinctive triangular, parabolic or arched forms. Contemporary houses often incorporate angular massing; attached carports or garages; courtyards or balconies; obscured or recessed entries; and split-level designs.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Contemporary style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a partially enclosed court, large aluminum-framed windows and louvered glazing, floor-to-ceiling glass, vertical wood siding, board-and-batten siding, exposed ceiling joists, and the strong interior/exterior connections demonstrated by the courtyard pergola-like shade structure with horizontal slats. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

# CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

Established Master Architect Henry Hester constructed the Ellis and Nancy Barron House in 1956. Hester was born in Oklahoma in 1928 and attended high school in San Diego after moving here with his family. He served in the Coast Guard during WWII, and later earned a bachelor's degree in architecture from the University of Southern California. After moving to La Jolla, Hester was mentored by William F. Cody and Master Architect Lloyd Ruocco.

Hester designed various structures, such as single-family homes, apartments, and commercial buildings. His designs earned him local and national AIA Awards. Notably, his 1958 design of 3200 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue (HRB #801) features floor-to-ceiling doors and windows, block-like balconies, and rectangular cutouts that bring light into the interior. Henry Hester's work spans California, Arizona, Colorado, Florida, and New Mexico. During his career, Hester has partnered with architects William F. Cody, Ronald K. Davis, Robert E. Jones, and even other established Master Architects like Frederick Liebhardt. Hester semi-retired in the 1970s and limited his work to custom residential projects.

Henry Hester designed the subject resource at an earlier part of his career in 1956. One of Henry Hester's more notable works was the luxury apartment near Balboa Park at 3200 6<sup>th</sup> Avenue (mentioned earlier). In 1957, Hester designed the Martin and Enid Gleich/Henry Hester House (HRB #1143), located at 5120 Norris St. This home was designed in the Post and Beam style and was documented in the *Life Magazine* in 1958, and famous architectural photographer Julius Schulman even photographed it. The American Institute of Architects San Diego later recognized Hester's work at 5120 Norris St. with the Award of Excellence. In contrast, the subject property at 6632 Avenida Manana was not documented in any publications, trade journals, or scholarly articles, nor acknowledged by design peers through formal awards and citations. Compared to his overall body of work, the subject property located at 6632 Avenida Manana does not represent a notable example of Hester's craftsmanship or design.

In 1959, an addition was constructed along the southern portion of the existing structure, which significantly increased the habitable space of this building. It is currently unknown what the house's original features were along the south façade where the addition was added; these features were likely lost during the construction of the 1959 addition. Research into the 1959 addition was inconclusive in determining its designer and builder. Therefore, without further information, staff cannot attribute the design of the addition to Henry Hester. Thus, the 1959 addition has negatively impacted the massing, spatial relationships, and proportion of the original Hester-designed structure to the extent that it no longer qualifies under Criterion D as representative of a notable work of a Master Architect. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under Criterion D.

# **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

# **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Ellis and Nancy Barron House located at 6632 Avenida Manana be designated with a period of significance of 1956-1959 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Contemporary style. The designation includes the attached garage.

Alvin Lin Junior Planner

Suzanne Segur Senior Planner/ HRB Liaison Development Services Department

al/SS

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER ADOPTED ON 6/23/2022

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 6/23/2022, to consider the historical designation of the **Ellis and Nancy Barron House** (owned by Robin Family Beaumont Trust 08-08-11, 6632 Avenida Manana, San Diego, CA 92037) located at **6632 Avenida Manana**, **San Diego, CA 92037**, APN: **351-661-02-00**, further described as Lot 65 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as  $\ensuremath{\textbf{Site}}$  No. , and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

#### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the **Ellis and Nancy Barron House** on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character-defining features of the Contemporary style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1956-1959 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a partially enclosed court, large aluminum-framed windows and louvered glazing, floor-to-ceiling glass, vertical wood siding, board-and-batten siding, exposed ceiling joists, and the strong interior/exterior connections demonstrated by the courtyard pergola. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No.**.

### BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall include the attached garage.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote:

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_\_ LINDSEY SEBASTIAN, Deputy City Attorney