

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND TRIBAL CULTURAL RESOURCES SUBCOMMITTEE AGENDA**

Monday, February 11, 2019, 4:00 to 5:00 PM

Fourth Floor Training Room
Development Services Building
1222 First Avenue, 4th Floor, San Diego, CA 92101

The Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee is a subcommittee of the City of San Diego's Historical Resources Board. It is primarily composed of Historical Resources Board members who have expertise or are interested in pre-contact and historic archeology and cultural landscapes. The Subcommittee is not a voting entity, but rather a forum for discussing issues and solutions related to historic resources and their preservation. Comments at the meeting do not predispose future positions on any matter or project by the Historical Resources Board.

Members of the public will be allowed an opportunity to speak, for up to one minute each, at the end of the Subcommittee's discussion on an agenda item. Each member of the public is required to state their name and the organization (if any) that they represent prior to their one minute presentation.

MEETING AGENDA

1. Introductions
2. Public Comment (on matters not on the agenda)
3. Subcommittee Comment (on matters not on the agenda)
4. Site Development Permits and Archeological Sites: Staff will provide a briefing regarding the Site Development Permit Process for projects on designated archeological sites.
5. Native American Bedrock Mortar: Staff will provide an update on the status of the Native American bedrock mortar in La Jolla's Cuvier Park.
6. Adjourn

Next Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee Meeting will be on Monday, May 13, 2019 at 4:00 PM.

For more information, please contact Suzanne Segur by phone at (619) 236-6139 or email at ssegur@san Diego.gov

February 5, 2019

Jamul Indian Village of Kumeyaay Nation
Jesse Pinto, Tribal Councilmember
Lisa Cumper, Tribal Historic Preservation Officer
P.O. Box 612
Jamul, CA 91935

Sent via E-mail

lipay Nation of Santa Ysabel
Clint Linton, Director of Cultural Resources
P.O. Box 130
Santa Ysabel, CA 92070

Sent via E-mail

SUBJECT: Follow-up Information Regarding the Cuvier Park Bedrock Mortar

Dear Mr. Pinto, Ms. Cumper, and Mr. Linton,

This letter provides an update to concerns raised in July 2017 regarding the removal of a Native American bedrock mortar from Cuvier Park in La Jolla, California. After the initial inquiry, I contacted staff from both the Transportation and Storm Water Department (TSW), and the Parks and Recreation Department (P&R) for any additional information. Based on those initial inquiries, it was confirmed that staff from the P&R Department removed the bedrock mortar to facilitate the upcoming construction project to replace and widen existing sidewalks along Coast Boulevard adjacent to Cuvier Park. Further research identified two projects along Coast Boulevard which included the Cuvier Park area where the bedrock mortar was located: Coast Boulevard (Cuvier Street to Coast Boulevard South) Sidewalk, CIP No. B-15193.02.06, for which an environmental exemption determination was made on January 11, 2017, and an older project, Coast Boulevard Park for which a Mitigated Negative Declaration (MND) No. 94-0472, was prepared in August 14, 1996. Background information on each project is provided below.

According to the MND for the 1996 Coast Boulevard Park improvements project, the scope included the replacement of asphalt walkways with concrete, the replacement or renovation of railings along the walkways; the construction of fencing, a wooden stairway, retaining walls, seat walls, and viewing areas; the installation of new irrigation systems, and the addition of new landscaping for the park areas located on the coastal terraces adjacent to the shoreline in the community of La Jolla, between Nicholson Point Park on the southwest and the La Jolla Caves area on the northeast. The project was designed to be completed in two phases: Phase 1 included all improvements outside and south of Ellen Browning Scripps Park at La Jolla Cove, and Phase 2 focused on Ellen Browning Scripps Park improvements. Because the project had the potential for impacting coastal cultural resources, an Archaeological Survey and Evaluation of Cultural Resources for the Coast Boulevard Park Improvements Project was conducted by Brian F. Smith and Associates (1994-1996) to identify presence or absence of resources within the project footprint, significance of each resource and

identify measure to mitigate and reduce impacts to below a level of significance. The technical report covered cultural resource studies for Phase 1 of the project; Phase 2 of the improvements project required subsequent archaeological study and resource evaluations and is not further discussed in this study. The bedrock mortar was located within Cuvier Park, near the Wipeout Beach area included in Phase 1 of the project.

According to the BFSa report, six archaeological resources identified within areas to be impacted by Phase 1 of the park improvements project were tested and evaluated for significance. Two additional sites recorded during the 1994 survey within Ellen Browning Scripps Park were to be evaluated during Phase 2 of the park improvements. Although the records search conducted in 1994 indicated that no previously recorded sites were located within the project area, the subsequent survey resulted in the identification of eight previously unrecorded archaeological sites.

The report further indicates that six of the sites located within the Phase 1 project scope were subsequently registered, tested, and evaluated for significance. These sites were registered and assigned the site numbers SDI-14,277 through SDI-14,282 (W-6699 through W-6704 at the San Diego Museum of Man). Testing of these sites was conducted in two phases—a shovel test series was excavated in July of 1995 and on May 7, 1996, and a qualitative sample was excavated at the six sites in March, April, and May of 1996. It should be noted, that the report included the following information associated with site SDI-14,278/H:

“Existing features within the site include concrete slabs for seating, picnic tables, a retaining wall, irrigation pipes, concrete walkways, and “prehistoric bedrock milling feature that was imported to this site (personal communication, Mr. Tony Ciani, La Jolla Town Council, Park and Beach Subcommittee). The exposed portion of the resource is located partially within the project's APE.”

While the general location of the bedrock milling feature was described as within the boundaries of SDI-14,278/H and noted on project map attached to the site form, it was not included as a resource attribute of the site on the Primary Record form recorded in 1996.

The report concluded that none of the six cultural resources tested and evaluated for significance in 1996 were found to be important primarily because of a loss of integrity due to impacts sustained over many decades of public use and facilities improvements, and due to a lack of research potential beyond that realized by the testing effort that has been completed. Only the deeply buried historic component of SDI-14,278/H was considered important. However, monitoring of all construction by an archaeologist was required, because the potential exists anywhere within the park to encounter elements of the archaeological sites which may be important.

Archaeological monitoring for the Coast Boulevard Park Improvements Project along the ocean bluff at Wipeout Beach was conducted by BFSa in 1997 based upon the presence of a known multi-component archaeological site, SDI-14,278(H). The bedrock mortar was located in the vicinity of this site during the course of project construction monitoring. No new archaeological deposits were discovered; however, some shell fragments and historic artifacts observed were identical to the materials recovered during the 1996 evaluation program for the project. Although the archaeological monitoring performed for this segment of the project resulted in the determination

that no significant deposits associated with Site SDI-14,278(H) were impacted by the irrigation trenches, which presumably would have included the area surrounding the bedrock milling feature, monitoring of future demolition, grading, or trenching procedures for the immediate vicinity of the Coast Boulevard Park Improvements Project was recommended because of the possible presence of buried or otherwise masked cultural deposits in this area.

According to the categorical exemption prepared for the Coast Boulevard (Cuvier Street to Coast Boulevard South) Sidewalk project by the Public Works Department in January 2017, the scope of work involved the repair and upgrade of approximately 1,150 linear feet (LF) of existing Asphalt Concrete (AC) walkway and dirt pathway with new Portland Cement Concrete (PCC) sidewalk in order to create a contiguous pedestrian path, up to six (6) feet wide, along the west side of Coast Boulevard from Cuvier Street to Coast Boulevard South. The project also included curb ramp upgrades and installation of new curb ramps to bring the walkway up to current standards. Benches, signs, and other appurtenant items will be protected in place or relocated as necessary to accommodate the project. Excavation required a maximum depth of 8-9 inches to accommodate the path upgrade.

The above description, which includes the statement that "other appurtenant items will be protected in place or relocated as necessary to accommodate the project" is especially important when considering the prior recommendations in the BFA report for "monitoring in the immediate vicinity of the Coast Boulevard Park Improvements Project...because of the possible presence of buried or otherwise masked cultural deposits." However, based on the scope of work described above which involved only "...a maximum depth of 8-9 inches to accommodate the path upgrade", there was no specific information in the record of the exemption to indicate that the Public Works Department did not consult with their as-needed archaeologist regarding the need for monitoring in this area of La Jolla, because the project did not include trenching or grading, and as such would not impact deeply buried resources within SDI-14,278/H. The project did consider however, the bedrock milling feature in the park - while not explicitly described as - "other appurtenant items to be protected in place or relocated as necessary" resulting in its removal and temporary relocation to the City's Rose Canyon Operations Facility by City staff from the Shoreline Park Division of the P&R Department.

Based on the information and research obtained for this follow-up letter, City staff agrees that there should have been more oversight regarding the removal and relocation of the bedrock mortar to facilitate project implementation. While we cannot place blame on this oversight with one individual or department, we regret that there was not a clear line of communication regarding this specific incident to avoid conflict and/or concern. We do believe however, that the quick action by Shoreline Parks staff resulted in ultimate protection and safe keeping of the bedrock mortar, despite not consulting with qualified archaeological staff, or members of the local Kumeyaay community.

The City is committed to conduct staff training regarding the importance and sensitivity of archaeological and tribal cultural resources, and to provide staff contact information when questions arise about such resources. We will also be working with our IT staff to provide more access to sensitivity mapping to assist staff during project design/review to avoid resources earlier in the process.

Mr. Pinto, Ms. Cumper and Mr. Linton

Page 4

We look forward to working with the Kumeyaay community to identify an appropriate location in Cuvier Park or another coastal park location where it can be reinstalled or replicated and appropriately interpreted; or, if agreed to by all interested parties, repatriate the bedrock mortar to the Kumeyaay community as previously discussed. These options are still on the table, and we are available to bring closure and resolution to this important issue.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Myra Herrmann".

Myra Herrmann, Senior Planner/Archaeologist/Tribal Liaison

Planning Department

ATTACHMENTS: CONFIDENTIAL REPORTS AND ATTACHMENTS PROVIDED ONLY TO ADDRESSEES
UNDER SEPARATE COVER

cc: Without Confidential Attachments

Historical Resources Board – Archaeology and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee

Anna McPherson, Program Manager, Development Services Department

Jeff Szymanski, Senior Planner/Archaeologist/Tribal Liaison, Development Services Department

Daniel Daneri, District Manager, Shoreline Parks, Parks & Recreation Department