

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 17, 2016  
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE  
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chair Coyle at 1:07PM

Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Ann Woods	Present
2 <sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Boardmember	Mike Baksh	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Tim Hutter	Absent
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present <i>left at 4:30PM</i>
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Absent

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner  
Suzanne Segur, Assistant Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

**\*\*\* SPECIAL ORDER OF BUSINESS\*\*\***

**We will say many thanks for a job well done and a fond farewell to long standing Boardmembers John Lemmo, Gail Garbini, Maria Curry and Abel Silvas.**

Typically, Boardmembers who have concluded their terms and service to the Historical Resources Board are recognized and thanked for their service at their last HRB meeting. However, our most recent appointments occurred between hearings, and did not allow us to bid a proper farewell to our outgoing Boardmembers John Lemmo, Gail Garbini, Maria Curry and Abel Silvas. The new Board has had a very busy past few months, but we didn't want the year to close without proper acknowledgement and thanks to John, Gail, Maria and Abel.

John was first appointed to the HRB in 2008 when he was also appointed as Chair. He served as Chair of the HRB throughout his 8.5 years on the Board, steadfastly guiding the Board through the designation of 362 new historic resources; the establishment of one new historic district and the amendment and expansion of three others; the adoption of 5 community plan updates with associated contexts and surveys; and the preparation and adoption of Board Guidelines and procedures, among other items. His leadership and guidance not only as Board Chairman, but also as Chair of the Policy Subcommittee, was greatly appreciated by his fellow Boardmembers and City staff as well. Thank you John, for your service!

Gail was also appointed to the HRB in 2008, after having served previously on the Historical Resources Board from 1996-2001. In addition to claiming many of the same accomplishments – 362 new designated resources, 1 new and 3 amended historic districts, 5 community plan updates, and so on – Gail served on both the Design Assistance and Archaeology Subcommittees of the Board, and served as Vice-Chair of the Historical Resources

Board for nearly 5 years. As a Landscape Architect and historic preservation advocate she brought a unique perspective and skill set to the Board, reminding everyone that historic resources are not limited to buildings and structures, but also to important landscape features and elements which complement and enhance the history of these resources. Thank you Gail, for your service!

Maria was appointed to the HRB in May of 2004, serving a total of 12 years on the Board, graciously continuing to serve beyond the end of her term limit. During that time she contributed to the designation of 547 new historic resources; the establishment of 4 new historic districts and the amendment and expansion of three others; the adoption of 5 community plan updates with associated contexts and surveys; and the preparation and adoption of Board Guidelines and procedures, among other items. In addition, Maria served on the Incentives Ad Hoc Subcommittee, the Design Assistance Subcommittee, and 7 years on the Policy Subcommittee. A passionate advocate of historic preservation, Maria was a consistent voice for preservation beyond architecture, advocating for the preservation of resources of social and cultural importance as well. Thank you Maria, for your many years of service!

Abel was appointed to the HRB – believe it or not – in March 2003, serving an endurance-testing total of 13 years and 3 months on the Board, again graciously serving well beyond the end of his term limit. During that time he contributed to the designation of **628** new historic resources (and I would point out that number accounts for **51.3%** - just over HALF - of all designated individual resources on our register). He also contributed to the establishment of 4 new historic districts and the amendment and expansion of three others; the adoption of 5 community plan updates with associated contexts and surveys; the preparation and adoption of Board Guidelines and procedures; and served on the Archaeology Subcommittee during his entire tenure. Throughout his time on the Board, Abel has provided a unique and valuable perspective, advocating for the identification and preservation of archaeological and tribal cultural resources. Thank you Abel for your many, *many* years of service!

And thank you once again to all of our outgoing Boardmembers – John Lemmo, Gail Garbini, Maria Curry and Abel Silvas – for your service to this Board, the City of San Diego and the preservation of its historic resources!! I would like to invite everyone to help themselves to some quick refreshments as we say thank you and – for now – goodbye.

---

## **ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR October 27, 2016**

### **BOARD ACTION:**

THE MINUTES FOR October 27, 2016 WERE APPROVED AS WRITTEN BY UNANIMOUS CONSENT, WITH BOARDMEMBERS LARIMER AND MCCULLOUGH ABSTAINING.

## **ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

## **ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

### **A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

#### **• ABSENCES**

Boardmembers Baksh, Hutter and Winter notified Staff they would not be present at this month's meeting. Boardmember Larimer has to leave at 3:45pm.

#### **• OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

✓ Correspondence for Item 6

- ✓ Request for Continuance for Item 8
- ✓ HRB Meeting Dates Memo for 2017
- ✓ Designation Handout for 2017 with Submittal Guidelines
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Chair Coyle attended the City Council Meeting for Plaza de Panama and noted that the naming rights were added to the project since it was last brought to the HRB and thinks it would be good for the HRB to have input in the naming for the project as well as for the new Citywide naming policy.

**B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

• **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

**C. STAFF REPORT**

- I have a few more updates for the Board related to the Community Plan Update efforts. The Uptown CPU was heard by the full City Council on Monday, November 14<sup>th</sup> between the Smart Growth and Land Use Committee meeting and the full Council meeting, property owners within the Presidio Hills Potential Historic District in the northwest corner of Mission Hills provided information to staff that some of the properties were more altered than previously known at the time of the reconnaissance survey, and should be classified as non-contributing. Because the Presidio Hills PHD has both a lower than average number of total properties and percentage of contributing resources, staff re-evaluated the PHD using Sanborn Maps, historic photos, water and sewer records, and field work, and found that a minimum of seven properties that had been classified as contributing were in fact non-contributing, due primarily to highly prominent, seamless additions. This resulted in the percentage of contributing resources in Presidio Hills falling to just 56%, and therefore staff recommended to the City Council that the Presidio Hills PHD be removed from the HPE and the Survey. The City Council ultimately voted to adopt the CPU – including the HPE and the Survey – with the removal of the Presidio Hills HPE as the only modification.
- The San Ysidro CPU was heard by the full City Council on Tuesday, November 15<sup>th</sup>, and was adopted without any changes to the Historic Preservation Element or the Survey.
- The HRB Meeting Dates Memo and the Designation Handout with Submittal Guidelines for 2017 has been prepared and copies are located on the side table.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, December 7, 2016 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, December 12, 2016 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeology Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, February 13, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

**D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

The Applicant for Item 8 – 5805 Camino De La Costa is requesting a continuance to the April 2017 agenda

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER LARIMER TO CONTINUE ITEM 8 - 5805 CAMINO DE LA COSTA TO THE APRIL 2017 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 10 – HARLAN AND CHARLOTTE PERRILL HOUSE

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY CHAIR COYLE TO APPROVE ITEM 10 – HARLAN AND CHARLOTTE PERRILL HOUSE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 – 3430 ELLIOTT STREET**

**Continued from September 2016**

Applicant: Peter Lucca Jr. represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3430 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3430 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3430 Elliott Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff memo dated September 8, 2016 and HRB 16-036

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, PJ Lucca, William Jones, AC Price, Tom Gibbing

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 - THE R. DOUGLAS MAW AND EUNICE MAW HOUSE, LOCATED AT 3430 ELLIOTT STREET, AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929 UNDER CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING: THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE AND RETAINS ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1929 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE FEATURES: AN OVERALL ASYMMETRICAL SHAPE; FLAT ROOF WITH NO EAVE OVERHANG AND CIRCULAR, CLAY TILE VENTS; CENTRAL CLAY TILE VENTS ARRANGED IN A TRIANGULAR CONFIGURATION; A PROJECTING, MODERATELY-PITCHED, FRONT-GABLED ROOF WITH RED, MISSION TILE; SMOOTH STUCCO EXTERIOR;

STUCCO CHIMNEY; HEAVY, CARVED WOOD FRONT-DOOR; HISTORICALLY ACCURATE AND SENSITIVE REPLACEMENT, DOUBLE-HUNG AND MULTI-PANED WOOD CASEMENT WINDOWS (SOME WITH HEAVY WOOD HEADERS ABOVE); AND LOW-LYING STUCCO WALLS. AND UNDER CRITERION D, AS REPRESENTATIVE OF THE NOTABLE WORK OF THE DENNESTEDT CONSTRUCTION COMPANY AS MASTER BUILDER, BASED UPON THE FOLLOWING FINDINGS: (1) THE HOME EXHIBITS THE "SIGNATURE" QUALITY OF CONSTRUCTION EXPRESSED BY THE DENNESTEDT CONSTRUCTION COMPANY DURING THE LATE 1920S; (2) THE HOME IS ONE OF THE EARLIEST SPANISH ECLECTIC DESIGNED STRUCTURES BUILT BY THE DENNESTEDT CONSTRUCTION COMPANY, REFLECTING THE FIRM'S SIMPLE AND RESTRAINED HALLMARK TRAIT OF QUALITY CONSTRUCTION; AND (3) THE HOME RETAINS ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1929 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE.

Seconded by Boardmember McCullough

*Motion was Withdrawn*

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO CONTINUE ITEM 5 – 3430 ELLIOTT STREET TO THE JANUARY 2017 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Harleman

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 6 – 2535 MIDWAY DRIVE**

Applicant: Steelwave, LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Owner: Rexford Industrial Realty LP

Location: 2535 Midway Drive, 92110, Midway-Pacific Highway Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-E; 6-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2535 Midway Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2535 Midway Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 16-077

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Cathy Kenton, Brian Smith, Jennifer Stropes, Seth Hiromura, Melody Liao

In Opposition: None

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 6 – MIDWAY POST OFFICE LOCATED AT 2535 MIDWAY DRIVE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1972 UNDER HRB CRITERION C. THE DESIGNATION EXCLUDES THE POST OFFICE BOX ROOM ADDITION AT THE NORTHEAST ELEVATION (BUILT 1985-1994), THE SOUTHWEST WAREHOUSE ADDITION (1985), AND TWO GARAGE ADDITIONS AT THE NORTHEAST AND SOUTHWEST ENDS OF THE VEHICLE MAINTENANCE BUILDING (BUILT 1972-1981).

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 3-3-1

Motion Fails

*(Harleman, Larimer, McCullough) (Pitman)*

*Item 7 was heard out of order; after Item 9 had concluded:*

**ITEM 7 – 1425 AND 1431 C STREET (HRB 1211 – W.G. REINHARDT APARTMENTS) – CENTRE CITY  
PLANNED DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 2016-19**

Applicant: Wakeland Beacon Apartments LP represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1425 and 1431 C Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 3-B**)

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the permit findings and mitigation measures associated with the Site Development Permit for the demolition of the designated historical resource located at 1425 and 1431 C Street (HRB Site #1211, the W. G. Reinhardt Apartments) as presented.

Report Number: HRB 16-071

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Marie Lia, Diego Velasco, Jonathan Taylor

In Opposition: Amie Hayes, Ron May, Kiley Wallace

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION MADE BY CHAIR COYLE THAT THE HRB DOES NOT CONCUR THAT THE 3 SDP FINDINGS HAVE BEEN SUBSTANTIATED FOR THE FOLLOWING REASONS:

- THE CALIFORNIA AND NATIONAL REGISTER REPORT CONCLUDING THE RESOURCE IS NOT ELIGIBLE FOR LISTING HAS NOT BEEN PROVIDED TO THE HRB.
- CURRENT USE OF THE BUILDINGS APPEARS TO MEET THE TERMS FOR AFFORDABLE HOUSING IN THE CC&R.
- LACK OF EVIDENCE PROVIDED THAT PROPERTY CURRENTLY PROVIDES NO REASONABLE BENEFICIAL USE.
- DOCUMENTATION PROGRAM AS SOLE MITIGATION MAY NOT MEET LEAGUE FOR PROTECTION OF OAKLAND'S ARCHITECTURAL AND HISTORICAL RESOURCES CASE.
- NO INFORMATION REGARDING LACK OF STRUCTURAL INTEGRITY OF PROPERTIES FOR RELOCATION AND INSUFFICIENT INFORMATION REGARDING FEASIBILITY OF DIFFERENT RELOCATION SCENARIOS.

THE HRB RECOMMENDS TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION THAT ALTERNATIVE METHODS OF RELOCATING ONE OR MORE STRUCTURES BE PURSUED OR THAT ALTERNATIVE 2 WHICH RETAINS THE FRONT PROPERTY BE RECONSIDERED BY THE APPLICANT. THE BOARD DOES NOT CONCUR THAT THE PROPOSED MITIGATION MEASURES AND PERMIT CONDITIONS PROVIDED TO IT ARE SUFFICIENT TO REDUCE THE EFFECT OF DEMOLISHING THE W.G. REINHARDT APARTMENTS, HRB DESIGNATED HISTORICAL RESOURCES.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION MADE BY CHAIR COYLE FOR THE BOARD TO RECOMMEND STAFF AND THE HRB POLICY SUBCOMMITTEE TO EXPLORE MECHANISMS OF FUNDING TO THE CITY'S HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND FOR MITIGATION TO INCLUDE FUNDING TO THE CITY'S HISTORIC PRESERVATION FUND, WITH NEXUS AND PROPORTIONALITY TO THE EFFECTS OF DEMOLITION OR OTHER SUBSTANTIAL ALTERATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 8 – 5805 CAMINO DE LA COSTA**

Applicant: Raul and Lisa Albanez 2004 Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 5805 Camino De La Costa, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 3-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5805 Camino De La Costa as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 5805 Camino De La Costa under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 16-072

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE APRIL 2017 AGENDA AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

*Item 9 was heard out of order; after Item 6 had concluded:*

**ITEM 9 – HORACE AND KATE ILIFF HOUSE**

Applicant: Louise A. Rehling Revocable Trust represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

Location: 3510 Park Boulevard, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3510 Park Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Horace and Kate Iliff House as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1923 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 16-073

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Allen Hazard, Louise Rehling

In Opposition: None

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE THE HORACE AND KATE ILIFF HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH CHANGES TO THE RESOLUTION TO INCLUDE THE FOLLOWING CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES: TRIPLE GABLED ROOFS WITH WIDE, UNENCLOSED EAVE OVERHANG, EXPOSED ROOF RAFTERS, L SHAPED PORCH WITH TAPERED WOODEN COLUMNS, WOOD HORIZONTAL SIDING WITH WOODEN SHINGLES BENEATH, WOOD FRAME WINDOWS AS WELL AS DECORATIVE BEAMS AND ATTIC VENTS; AND INSERT "THE INFORMATION" AFTER "BY" IN THE SENTENCE "THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY..."

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 10 – HARLAN AND CHARLOTTE PERRILL HOUSE**

Applicant: Donald and Maribeth Shanahan represented by IS Architecture

Location: 3211 Trumbull Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1288 2-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3211 Trumbull Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Harlan and Charlotte Perrill House located at 3211 Trumbull Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1932 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 16-074

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

#### **ITEM 11 – L. MADELINE GUNN HOUSE**

Applicant: Desiree L. Gomez Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 3045 Browning Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 7-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3045 Browning Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the L. Madeline Gunn House located at 3045 Browning Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 16-075

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

#### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Scott Moomjian

In Opposition: None

#### **BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RETURN THE REPORT TO THE APPLICANT TO REVISE THE REPORT TO ADDRESS THE FOLLOWING ISSUES: HISTORIC PHOTO AND THE INTEGRITY OF THE STUCCO, THE GARAGE EXTENSION, PILLARED GATE AND WHETHER OR NOT IT IS A SPEC HOUSE. THIS ITEM WILL BE RESCHEDULED FOR THE FEBRUARY 2017 AGENDA.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 4-2-0

Motion Passes

*(McCullough, Pitman)*

#### **ITEM 12 – CHARLES AND ANNA STARK HOUSE**

Applicant: Sparks Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4641 Vista Street, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4641 Vista Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Charles and Anna Stark House located at 4641 Vista Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion C. An interior element included in the designation is the original living room split-face brick fireplace. The designation excludes the rear addition to the detached garage.

Report Number: HRB 16-076

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

#### **Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Kiley Wallace, Alexandra Wallace, Ron May, TJ Sparks

In Opposition: None

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12 – CHARLES AND ANNA STARK HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Chair Coyle

Vote: 6-0-0

Motion Passes

**REMINDER:**

**NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:**

Thursday, January, 26, 2017

**LOCATION:**

City Concourse Building,  
North Terrace Rooms

**MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:05PM**