

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JANUARY 26, 2017
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair Coyle at 9:50AM

Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Ann Woods	Present <i>arrived at 12:30PM</i>
2 nd Vice-Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Boardmember	Mike Baksh	Absent
Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Tim Hutter	Present
Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Present <i>left at 4:56PM</i>
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present <i>arrived at 10:07AM</i>
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner
Suzanne Segur, Assistant Planner
Elyse Lowe, Deputy Director

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Inga Lintvedt, Deputy City Attorney

Meeting was adjourned for lunch from 12:05PM to 1:04PM

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR November 17, 2016

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR COYLE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR NOVEMBER 17, 2016 WITH CHANGES

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 5-0-2 Motion Passes
(Hutter, Winter)

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **ABSENCES**

Boardmember Baksh notified Staff he would not be present at this month's meeting.
Boardmember Pitman will by 11:00AM and Boardmember Woods will arrive after 12:30PM.

- **OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Items 6, 7, 8 and 9
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmembers Hutter and McCullough had a conflict of interest for Item 6 and recused themselves from any discussion and vote. Boardmember Pitman had a conflict of interest for Item 7 and recused himself from any discussion and vote. Boardmember Winter had a conflict of interest for Item 5 and recused himself from any discussion and vote.

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- We are very excited to announce that Chicano Park, which has been listed on the City's Register since 1980 and the National Register since 2013 was listed by the US Secretary of the Interior as a National Historic Landmark just last month. As you all know, the National Historic Landmarks Program recognizes historic properties of exceptional value to the nation. Chicano Park is one of 24 new National Historic Landmarks across the Country announced by the US Department of the Interior just two weeks ago. In their announcement they note the following in regard to Chicano Park: "On April 20, 1970, community residents occupied Chicano Park in San Diego, California, in an ultimately successful effort to prevent the construction of a California Highway Patrol substation on land where the City of San Diego had promised the neighborhood a community park. Representative of the Chicano Civil Rights Movement, Chicano Park has become a cultural and recreational gathering place for the Chicano community and is the location of the Chicano Park Monumental Murals, an exceptional assemblage of master mural artwork painted on the freeway bridge supports." Chicano Park joins the ranks of just nine other National Historic Landmarks within the City of San Diego, which include Balboa Park, the San Diego Mission Church, the San Diego Presidio, the Mission Beach Roller Coaster and the Star of India. The City of San Diego is thrilled at this honor, and will be holding a press event to celebrate shortly. As soon as a date is confirmed, we will pass that information along. Our thanks to the Chicano Park Steering Committee and Representative Juan Vargas for spearheading this effort.
- As you all know, with the adoption of the North Park and Golden Hill Community Plan Updates last fall the Planning Department committed to processing the potential historic districts within those planning areas, starting with South Park, Spalding Place and Valle Vista Terrace in 2017. Each district requires review by the Policy Subcommittee, as well workshops with the property owners and two hearings before the HRB. Staff has tentatively scheduled South Park for HRB review in April and May, Spalding Place in June and July, and Valle Vista Terrace in September and October. These dates are subject to refinement as we move through the nomination process but please keep in mind that these districts will be heard by the Board through the spring, summer and fall.

- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, February 1, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy and Archaeology Subcommittee meetings will be held on Monday, February 13, 2017 at 3:00pm and 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

Deputy Director Update:

- Historic will be adding Staff this year. The positions are: One Senior Planner, One Associate Planner, One Clerical and One Management Intern. There are no additional staffing changes projected in the FY 2018 budget.
- Notes for the Policy Subcommittee meetings are now available online. The Policy Subcommittee has been working to develop a work program matrix and will work with staff to prioritize the projects outlined within the matrix.
- Due to staffing, volume and increased workload, the historical resources will not be holding the awards program this year and hope to bring it back in the future.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The Applicant for Item 12 – 2744 Azalea Drive is requesting a 30 day continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR COYLE TO CONTINUE 12 – 2744 AZALEA DRIVE TO THE FEBRUARY 2017 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember McCullough

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 11 – LEWIS AND ANNIE DODGE/CHARLES SALYERS/DODGE CONSTRUCTION COMPANY SPEC HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE ITEM 11 – LEWIS AND ANNIE DODGE/CHARLES SALYERS/DODGE CONSTRUCTION COMPANY SPEC HOUSE ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION OF #1 TO THE NAME.

Seconded by Boardmember Harleman

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – A.D. AND SARAH MARKS HOUSE

Applicant: Jeffrey and Victoria Penick represented by Nexus Planning Consultants

Location: 3350-3352 31st Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3352 31st Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the A.D. and Sarah Marks House located at 3350-3352 31st Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913-1916 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-002

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

This item was taken out of order as the fourth action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Amie Hayes

In Opposition: Tori Penick, Rachel Smith, Sharon Gehl

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR WOODS TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5 - A.D. AND SARAH MARKS HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Chair Coyle

Vote: 2-6-0

Motion Fails

(Hutter, Pitman, Harleman, Larimer, McCullough, Berge)

ITEM 6 – REES-STEALY MEDICAL CLINIC

Applicant: HG Fenton represented by Scott A. Moomjian and Brian F. Smith & Associates

Owner: Sharp Healthcare

Location: 2001 4th Avenue, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2001 4th Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Rees-Stealy Medical Clinic located at 2001 4th Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1926 under HRB Criterion A, 1926-1961 under HRB Criterion B, and 1926-28, 1938, and 1965 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 17-003

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

This item was taken out of order as the third action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Jessica McGee, Bruce Coons, Jaye MacAskill, Aime Hayes, Dan Soderberg, David Swarens, Kiley Wallace, Erik Hanson

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Jennifer Stropes, Brian Smith, Anna Burnett, Andrea Vinci, Erin Duxbury, Erik Luedtke, Julie Corrales, Brenton Kelly, John LaRaia, Michael LaBelle, Karen Macleod, Sara Steinhoffer, Michael Neal, Sharon Gehl

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO RETURN THE REPORT TO THE APPLICANT AND FOR STAFF TO ADDRESS THE FOLLOWING ISSUES: MORE CLARIFICATION ON HOMER DELAWIE'S ROLE AS WELL AS THE ISSUE OF MASTER ARCHITECT VERSUS THEIR FIRM; CLARIFICATION ON HOW THE BUILDING WAS ANALYZED I.E. ONE BUILDING VERSUS MULTIPLE BUILDINGS; INCLUDE A CHART CLARIFYING THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE FOR EACH CRITERIA; ADDRESS THE INFILL OF THE ARCHED OPENINGS AND WINDOW MODIFICATIONS; AND RECONCILE CRITERION B AS IT PERTAINS TO SECTION C. THIS ITEM IS CONTINUED TO THE MARCH 2017 AGENDA.

Seconded by Boardmember Harleman

Vote: 5-1-0

Motion Passes

(Larimer)

ITEM 7 – 1122 4th AVENUE (HRB 291 – CALIFORNIA THEATER) – CENTRE CITY PLANNED DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 2014-76

Applicant: Sloan Capital Partners LLC represented by Marie Lia

Location: 1122 4th Avenue, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 3-A)

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the permit findings and mitigation measures associated with the Site Development Permit for the demolition of the designated historical resource located at 1122 4th Avenue (HRB Site #291, the California Theater) as presented.

Report Number: HRB 17-004

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

This item was taken out of order as the fifth action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Marina Web, Bianca Martinez, Michelle Fehrensen, Jeremy Hollins, Jim Bartell, Cyrus Sanandaji, Gary London, Sharon Gehl, Kris Michell, Joseph Martinez

In Opposition: Jessica McGee, Bruce Coons, Carl Silva, Geri Lauriano, , Jaye MacAskill, Peter Janopaul, Aime Hayes, Dan Soderberg, David Swarens, Maureen Latour, Erik Hanson, Deirdre Lee, Ronald V. May, Kiley Wallace

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER HUTTER TO ADOPT STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE CAVEAT THAT IT PROCEED AS ALTERNATIVE 1 WITH THE ADDITION OF THE FOLLOWING TWO FRIENDLY AMENDMENTS TO THE MITIGATION MEASURES:

- 1) REQUEST THAT THE DESIGN FEATURE OF THE ART COMPONENT HAVE HISTORIC REFERENCE TO THE CALIFORNIA THEATRE; AND
- 2) FOR THE INTERPRETIVE DISPLAY TO COME BACK TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD, STARTING WITH DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

Seconded by Boardmember McCullough

Vote: 4-4-0

Motion Fails

(Berge, Coyle, Woods, Harleman)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR COYLE TO RECOMMEND TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION TO DENY APPROVAL OF THE PLANNED DEVELOPMENT PERMIT AND SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT FOR THE DEMOLITION OF HRB SITE #291, THE CALIFORNIA THEATRE, BECAUSE THE SUPPLEMENTAL FINDINGS--HISTORICAL RESOURCES DEVIATION FOR SUBSTANTIAL ALTERATION OF A DESIGNATED HISTORICAL RESOURCE IN THE SAN DIEGO MUNICIPAL CODE CANNOT BE MADE; AND TO INCORPORATE THE TWO MITIGATION MEASURES REVISIONS:

- 1) REQUEST THAT THE DESIGN FEATURE OF THE ART COMPONENT HAVE HISTORIC REFERENCE TO THE CALIFORNIA THEATRE; AND
- 2) FOR THE INTERPRETIVE DISPLAY TO COME BACK TO THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD, STARTING WITH DESIGN ASSISTANCE SUBCOMMITTEE

TO ELABORATE, THE REASONS FOR THE DENIAL ARE AS FOLLOWS:

- 1) KEISER MARSTON ASSOCIATES (KMA) PEER REVIEW CONCLUDED THAT THE PROJECT AND ALTERNATIVES WERE NOT FEASIBLE; AND
- 2) THE FEASIBILITY OF ADAPTIVE REUSE WAS NOT PRESENTED TO THE BOARD

Seconded by Boardmember Berge

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Passes

(Larimer, Hutter, McCullough)

ITEM 8 – 1610 UNION STREET AND 320 WEST CEDAR STREET (HRB 282 – OSCAR M. MILLARD RENTAL) – CENTRE CITY PLANNED DEVELOPMENT PERMIT/SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT NO. 2016-39

Applicant: JMan at KLofts LLC represented by Marie Lia

Location: 1610 Union Street and 320 West Cedar Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 2-A)

Description: Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

Today's Action: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the permit findings and mitigation measures associated with the Site Development Permit for the demolition of the designated historical resource located at 1610 Union Street and 320 West Cedar Street (HRB Site #282, the Oscar M. Millard Rental) as presented.

Report Number: HRB 17-005

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

This item was taken out of order as the sixth action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Jonathan Segal

In Opposition: Aime Hayes, Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH TO RECOMMEND TO THE PLANNING COMMISSION ADOPTION OF THE PERMIT FINDINGS AND MITIGATION MEASURES ASSOCIATED WITH THE SITE DEVELOPMENT PERMIT AS PRESENTED PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Larimer

Vote: 5-4-0

Motion Passes

(Berge, Pitman, Coyle, Woods)

ITEM 9 – PORTUGUESE CHAPEL OF SAN DIEGO

Applicant: United Portuguese S.E.S., Inc.

Location: 2822 Avenida de Portugal*, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1288 2-B)

(*Identified in the Nomination as 2818 Avenida de Portugal)

Description: National Register of Historic Resources listing recommendation

Today's Action: Review the National Register Nomination of the Portuguese Chapel of San Diego

Staff Recommendation: Recommended that the Historic Resources Board forward a positive recommendation for the Portuguese Chapel of San Diego to be listed on the National Register of Historical Places under Criterion C and Criterion Consideration A per the nomination, with the following amendments: revise the period of significance from 1922-1949 to simply 1922 consistent with the statement of significance; and revise the resource location information to include the correct address of 2822 Avenida de Portugal, and the Assessor's Parcel Number of 531-351-03-00.

Report Number: HRB 17-010

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

This item was taken out of order as the first action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Carl Silva, Geri Lauriano, Aime Hayes, Bruce Coons, Jaye MacAskill

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WINTER TO RECOMMEND THAT THE HISTORIC RESOURCES BOARD FORWARD A POSITIVE RECOMMENDATION FOR THE PORTUGUESE CHAPEL OF SAN DIEGO TO BE LISTED ON THE NATIONAL REGISTER OF HISTORICAL PLACES UNDER CRITERION C AND CRITERION CONSIDERATION A PER THE NOMINATION, WITH THE FOLLOWING AMENDMENT: TO INCLUDE THE ASSESSOR'S PARCEL NUMBER OF 531-351-03-00.

Seconded by Boardmember McCullough

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 10 – JOHN AND MAUD LOCKBURNER HOUSE

Applicant: Lisa Stangl Trust represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4820 Biona Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4820 Biona Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Maud Lockburner House located at 4820 Biona Drive as a historical resources with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-006

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

This item was taken out of order as the seventh and final action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Lisa Stangl, Ione Stiegler

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER MCCULLOUGH TO DESIGNATE ITEM 10 – JOHN AND MAUD LOCKBURNER HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 11 – LEWIS AND ANNIE DODGE/CHARLES SALYERS/DODGE CONSTRUCTION COMPANY SPEC HOUSE

Applicant: Judith A Simmons Separate Property Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 5308 East Palisades Road, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 2-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5308 East Palisades Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/Dodge Construction Company Spec House located at 5308 East Palisades Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 17-007

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT WITH THE ADDITION OF #1 TO THE NAME.

ITEM 12 – 2744 AZALEA DRIVE

Applicant: James Huck represented by IS Architecture

Location: 2744 Azalea Drive, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2744 Azalea Drive as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2744 Azalea Drive under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-008

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE FEBRUARY 2017 AGENDA AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

ITEM 13 –CERTIFIED LOCAL GOVERNMENT ANNUAL REPORT 2015-2016

Applicant: City of San Diego, Development Services and Planning Departments

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider the Draft Annual Report for transmittal to the State Office of Historic Preservation to meet the City's Certified Local Government (CLG) responsibilities and to the Mayor and City Council to meet the Municipal Code Section 111.0206 (d)(7) requirements.

Today's Action: Review, comment and approve the Annual Report.

Staff Recommendation: Direct staff to forward the Annual Report to the State Office of Historic Preservation and the San Diego Mayor and City Council, or revise the Annual Report and forward as appropriate.

Report Number: HRB 17-009

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

This item was taken out of order as the second action item.

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE APPROVE THE ANNUAL REPORT AND FORWARD AS APPROPRIATE WITH THE FOLLOWING REVISIONS: CORRECT THE OMISSION OF BOARDMEMBER HUTTER FROM THE ATTENDANCE MATRIX; REVISE GOAL #5 BY INSERTING "AND NEGLECT" AFTER "UNPERMITTED ALTERATION"; ADD AN EXPLANATION OF THE MOVE FROM THE PLANNING DEPARTMENT TO THE DEVELOPMENT SERVICES DEPARTMENT TO THE END OF THE REPORT; AND ADDING BACK LAST YEAR'S GOAL #3 AS THIS YEAR'S GOAL #8 REGARDING THE NATIONAL HISTORIC LANDMARK WORKSHOP.

Seconded by Chair Coyle

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, February 23, 2017

LOCATION:

City Concourse Building,
North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:11PM