

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	January 12, 2017	REPORT NO. HRB-17-007
ATTENTION:	Historical Resources Board Agenda of January 26, 2017	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #11— The Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House	
APPLICANT:	Judith A Simmons Separate Property Trust re	presented by Vonn Marie May
LOCATION:	5308 East Palisades Road, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9	
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House located at 5308 East Palisades Road as a historical resource.	

#### STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House located at 5308 East Palisades Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB C and D. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

- 1. The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource maintains its exterior stucco, wood divided light windows, a corner entrance and tile roof.
- 2. The resource is representative of a notable work of Master Architect Charles H. Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company. The Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource features the one and two-story, Tshaped design with a corner rounded entrance.

#### BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the Kensington

Heights Unit 3 subdivision of Kensington-Talmadge. The house is located in a predominately single family neighborhood.

The building is located on APN 440-022-06-00. The property was identified in the1996 Mid-City Survey and given a Status Code of 5D2, "Contributor to a district that is eligible for local listing or designation."

The historic name of the resource, the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Lewis and Annie Dodge who constructed the house as a speculation house and the name of Charles H. Salyers, a Master Architect and Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company, a Master Builder.

## <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Vonn Marie May which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria C and D and Staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.* 

Constructed in 1928, the one and two story house features a gable roof with clay tile and shallow eaves. The exterior of the house is sheathed with stucco in a light sand finish. Fenestration on the house consists primarily of divided light wood casement windows and fixed windows.

The southern portion of the house is one story and is perpendicular to the two story section. The one story portion features a large fixed window flanked by casement windows. This window is replicated on the south side which overlooks the driveway. The front façade window features decorative wrought iron. The intersection of the one story and the two story portion features a small hipped roof that houses the main entrance to the residence. The main entrance features a quoin detail around the door which is flanked by two faux windows with decorative wrought iron. The two story portion stands proud of the main entrance. Fenestration on the east and north facades is evenly spaced on the wall plane. The south side of the property features a concrete driveway that accesses the detached two car garage. The garage features a flat roof with a parapet and is stuccoed to match the main house.

Overall, there have been very few alterations to the exterior of the house. Shutters have been added to the windows, the window on the second floor just above the main entrance has been replaced with a fixed window, the clay tile was replaced and bird blockers were added and a covered patio was added to the rear of the house.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including exterior stucco, wood divided light windows, a corner entrance and tile roof. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

# CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property was designed by Charles Salyers and constructed by Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company in 1928. The house is representative of the collaboration between the two partners.

Born in 1900, Charles Salyers first arrived in San Diego at the age of nine. As a young man, he actively engaged in the local building industry, at which time he became skilled in the design and construction of private homes. In 1927, Salyers was hired as the development architectural designer for Gibson City, prior to becoming a licensed architect. This important commission provides insight into the early phase of his career, and demonstrates that he was already viewed as a skilled architectural designer. Seeking to advance his profession, he was granted an architect's license in 1932, and was thereafter recognized as a prolific residential designer. In 1935, he was selected to design the home of businessman Paul E. Stake which, to this day, serves as a rare and intriguing domestic interpretation of the Streamline Moderne style. It is for this home, HRB Site #356, that Salyers was established as a Master Architect.

Already an accomplished builder and architect, Salyers further expanded his repertoire through the pursuit of a career in public administration. In 1941, he was recruited by officials at the newly-founded County Surveyor's Office to serve as their first Chief Building Inspector. He relinquished his position in 1948, though, when Governor Earl Warren appointed him Chief of the State Division of Housing. After serving in this capacity for two years, he returned to his home in San Diego, where he proceeded to design and construct single-family homes.

Salyers retired from practice in 1966 – after a career that spanned nearly forty years – and spent his later years discreetly managing apartment complexes throughout the city. While he was no longer at the forefront of public affairs, he did earn a considerable degree of notoriety when, in an unprecedented move, he successfully relocated an entire apartment building from Point Loma to Golden Hill. He remained in San Diego until his death in 1974.

Master Builder Lewis Henry Dodge was a third generation learned carpenter and builder, first apprenticing with his father then later working as a professional builder from 1891 until his death in 1934. Arriving in San Diego in 1923 with his son Edward Lewis Dodge, they established their construction company that later produced over 42 residences in the Tudor, Dutch Colonial, English, Mission, and Spanish Colonial Revival styles. The designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge /Dodge Construction Company House (HRB Site #1192) established Lewis Dodge/Dodge Construction Company as a Master Builder.

Dodge Construction Company was recognized as a building company of high quality and craftsmanship in the San Diego Union and Evening Tribune newspapers as well as by developer John P. Mills Organization. His company was chosen to represent the newly developed Sunset Cliffs subdivision, by building a showcase home for W.S. Mills, the sales manager for the John P. Mills Organization. Lewis's showcase home was featured in the 1926 celebration of "Better Homes" week in the newspapers. The "Better Homes" section of the newspaper was inspired by the Better Homes Movement, a national drive to build better quality affordable homes with progressive design features. It was driven by the ideology of providing good design and quality construction for all social and economic levels. On May 10, 1925, Kensington Park put an advertisement of the newly designed homes to be expected within the neighborhood. Three of the five homes within the article were built by the Dodge Construction Company; two Spanish styled and one Dutch Colonial home, all located on Biona Drive. Dodge Construction Company was cited many times in the "Better Homes" section of the newspaper for his work in Kensington and Sunset Cliffs.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The subject resource showcases the collaboration between Master Architect Charles Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company. The house also retains a good level of integrity of design. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion D as a notable work of Master Architect Charles Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company.

## OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

## **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House located at 5308 East Palisades Road be designated with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D. Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

|B/ks/el

Elype N. Love

Deputy Director

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 1/26/2017

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/26/2017, to consider the historical designation of the **Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House** (owned by Judith A Simmons Separate Property Trust 03-19-14, 5308 East Palisades Road, San Diego, CA 92116) located at **5308 East Palisades Road**, **San Diego, CA 92116**, APN: **440-022-06-00**, further described as LOT 360 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/ Dodge Construction Company Spec House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1928 period of significance. Specifically, the resource maintains its exterior stucco, wood divided light windows, a corner entrance and tile roof. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

(2) The property is historically significant under CRITERION D as a notable work of Master Architect Charles H. Salyers and Master Builder Lewis H. Dodge of the Dodge Construction Company. The Lewis and Annie Dodge/Charles Salyers/Lewis Dodge/Dodge Construction Company Spec House retains integrity as it relates to the original design. Specifically, the resource features the one and two-story, T-shaped design with a corner rounded entrance. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: \_

COURTNEY ANN COYLE, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney