CITY OF SAN DIEGO HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF MARCH 23, 2017 NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE 202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 2:03 PM

	Chairperson	David McCullough	Present	
	Vice-Chairperson	Ann Woods	Present	
	Boardmember	Mike Baksh	Absent	
	Boardmember	Priscilla Berge	Present	
	Boardmember	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present	
	Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Absent	
	Boardmember	Tim Hutter	Absent	
	Boardmember	Tom Larimer	Absent	
	Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present	
	Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present	
Staff to the Board in Attendance		Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner Jodie Brown, Senior Planner Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner Suzanne Segur, Assistant Planner Elyse Lowe, Deputy Director		
Legal Counsel in Attendance:		Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney		

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR February 23, 2017

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR FEBRUARY 23, 2017 WITH CHANGES Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

ABSENCES

Boardmembers Baksh, Larimer, Harleman and Hutter notified Staff they would not be present at this month's meeting.

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 23, 2017 Page 2 of 7

OTHER GENERAL INFORMATION

- ✓ Additional Information for Item 9
- ✓ Correspondence for Item 5 and Info Item A
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS

- Chair McCullough gave a brief explanation of the New Boardmember Appointments Memo and thanked Boardmember Berge for her service, as this may be her last meeting.
- Vice-Chair Woods thinks the Annual Awards are an important means of acknowledging historic preservation efforts in San Diego.
- Boardmember Coyle gave a brief report on the Planning Commission's decision to approve the SDP for the California Theatre.

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• CONFLICTS OF INTEREST

Chair McCullough had a conflict of interest for Item 7- Rees-Stealy Medical Clinic and would have had to recuse himself from any discussion and vote if the item had been heard.

• EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS

None

• FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Item 7 Rees-Stealy Medical Clinic will not be heard this month due to a lack of a quorum, it is anticipated to be heard at the April 27, 2017 meeting.
- The Site Development Permit for the California Theatre was heard by the Planning Commission on March 16th and was approved; It is scheduled to be heard at the April 4th City Council meeting.
- The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, April 5, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, April 10, 2017 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, May 8, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

Design Assistance Subcommittee Report:

• DAS met on March 1st and reviewed a Site Development Permit for in its early stages, consistent with the recommendations form the HRB, to discuss alternatives. Subcommittee members provided good feedback and suggestions for the project applicant. DAS also provided recommendations for a new commercial project proposed on a non-contributor in the Sherman Heights District that was consistent with the Districts Design Guidelines.

Deputy Director Update:

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 23, 2017 Page 3 of 7

- Thanked Boardmember Berge for her service to the City's Historical Resources Board and acknowledged Boardmember Coyle for her service as Chair these past few months.
- The City Will be co-sponsoring a local preservation conference with the California Preservation Foundation in San Diego on September 14 and 15 in Balboa Park. More information to come.

D. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

Staff requested a 30-day continuance for Item 11- David O. Dryden Spec House #3 to evaluate additional information provided by the applicant for Criterion B.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO CONTINUE ITEM 11- DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC HOUSE #3 TO THE APRIL 2017 AGENDA

Seconded by Boardmember Coyle Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 12 – CHARLES AND ELIZABETH HENDERSON HOUSE ITEM 13 – JUDGE WILLIAM AND ANNIE SLOANE HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE ITEMS 12 AND 13 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 - HRB VOTE OF CONFIDENCE AND SUPPORT FOR CHAIR COYLE

Location: Citywide

Description: Consider a vote of confidence in the leadership of Courtney Ann Coyle as HRB Chair.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Take a vote of confidence in the leadership of Courtney Ann Coyle as HRB Chair, or do not take a vote of confidence.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Staff does not have a recommendation related to this item. <u>Report Number</u>: N/A

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Abel Silvas, David Swarens

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR WOODS TO EXPRESS APPRECIATION TO MS. COYLE AS THE ELECTED CHAIR FOR THE HRB.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman	Vote:	5-0-1	Motion Passes
		(Coyle)	

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 23, 2017 Page 4 of 7

<u>Description</u>: Consider electing a Board Vice-Chair and 2nd Vice-Chair from among the siting Boardmembers, consistent with the Board's adopted Procedures.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Elect a Vice-Chair and 2nd Vice-Chair, consistent with the Board's adopted Procedures. <u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Elect a Vice-Chair and 2nd Vice-Chair. <u>Report Number</u>: N/A

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR MCCULLOUGH TO ELECT BOARDMEMBER HUTTER AS VICE-CHAIR AND BOARDMEMBER COYLE AS 2nd VICE-CHAIR

Seconded by Boardmember Berge Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 7 – REES-STEALY MEDICAL CLINIC

Item was not be heard this month due to a lack of a quorum, it is anticipated to be heard at the April 27, 2017 meeting.

ITEM 8 – 1329 W. SPRUCE STREET

Applicant: Petya and Davin McLaughlin represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1329 W. Spruce Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 7-J)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1329 W. Spruce Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Do not designate the property at 1329 West Spruce Street under any HRB Criterion due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 17-016

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Davin McLaughlin

In Opposition: Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY CHAIR MCCULLOUGH TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – 1329 W. SPRUCE STREET PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 2-4-0

Motion Fails

(Berge, Coyle, Pitman, Woods)

THERE WERE NO FURTHER MOTIONS AND THE ITEM CONCLUDED

ITEM 9 – ADA TENNEY SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Alliance Real Estate Investments LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 23, 2017 Page 5 of 7

Location: 3104 33rd Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3104 33rd Street as a historical resource. <u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not

designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Ada Tenney Spec House #1 located at 3104 33rd Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-021

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Russell Strom, Megan Strom, Carlos Hurtado

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO DESIGNATE ITEM 9 – ADA TENNEY SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Vice-Chair Woods Vote: 5-1-0 Motion Fails (Winter)

ITEM 10 – MICHAEL AND CLARA BROWN HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Trudeau Family 2002 Trust represented by Vonn Marie May

Location: 5645 Taft Avenue, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (1247 3-G)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5645 Taft Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designated the Michael and Clara Brown House located at 5645 Taft Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance 1968 under HRB Criterion C. The designation shall exclude the 2016 rear two story addition.

Report Number: HRB 17-017

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Vonn May, Pauly DeBartolo

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER BERGE TO DESIGNATE THE MICHAEL AND CLARA BROWN HOUSE LOCATED AT 5645 TAFT AVENUE AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1968 UNDER HRB CRITERIA C. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING: THE RESOURCE EMBODIES THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS THROUGH THE RETENTION OF CHARACTER DEFINING FEATURES OF POST AND BEAM WITH ORGANIC GEOMETRIC INFLUENCES AND RETAINS A GOOD LEVEL OF ARCHITECTURAL INTEGRITY FROM ITS 1968 PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE. SPECIFICALLY, THE RESOURCE RETAINS ITS DIRECT EXPRESSION OF THE POST AND BEAM STRUCTURAL SYSTEM, HORIZONTAL BOXY MASSING, SHALLOW PITCHED ROOF WITH DEEP OVERHANGS, FLOOR TO CEILING GLASS WITH AN EXPANSE OF FIXED WOOD WINDOWS, WOOD PLANKS OR BOARD AND BATTEN SIDING FOR THE EXTERIOR FINISH WITH AN ABSENCE OF APPLIED DECORATION, STRONG INTERIOR/EXTERIOR CONNECTIONS ESPECIALLY FROM THE LIVING ROOM Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 23, 2017 Page 6 of 7

> WALL OF GLASS AT THE PATIO, WHILE THE WIDE CONCRETE BLOCK CHIMNEY EXPRESSES A DESIGN INDIVIDUALIZATION. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY THE STAFF REPORT, THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING. THE DESIGNATION SHALL EXCLUDE THE 2016 REAR TWO STORY ADDITION.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter Vote: 6-0-0 Motion Passes

ITEM 11 - DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC HOUSE #3 [HRB# 1008-068]

Applicant: William and Karen Strack

Location: 3543 Pershing Avenue, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-D)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3543 Pershing Avenue as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the David O. Dryden Spec House #3 located at 3543 Pershing Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1917 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 17-018

ITEM WAS CONTINUED TO THE APRIL 2017 AGENDA AT THE REQUEST OF STAFF

ITEM 12 – CHARLES AND ELIZABETH HENDERSON HOUSE

<u>Applicant</u>: Michael and Robin Taylor represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4554 Norma Drive, 92115, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (**1269 3-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4554 Norma Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Charles and Elizabeth Henderson House located at 4554 Norma Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1936 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-019

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 13 – JUDGE WILLIAM AND ANNIE SLOANE HOUSE

Applicant: Deyan Spridonov represented by IS Architecture

Location: 4310 Avalon Drive, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 4-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4310 Avalon Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Judge William and Annie Sloane House located at 4310 Avalon Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1906 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-020

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

INFORMATION ITEMS

ITEM A – DRAFT OLD TOWN COMMUNITY PLAN AREA HISTORIC RESOURCES RECONNAISSANCE SURVEY, PREHISTORIC CULTURAL RESOURCES STUDY AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION ELEMENT Historical Resources Board Minutes of March 23, 2017 Page 7 of 7

Review the Draft Old Town Community Plan Area Historic Resources Reconnaissance Survey, the Prehistoric Cultural Resources Study and the Historic Preservation Element from the Draft Old Town Community Plan Update. *No formal action will be taken by the Historical Resources Board.* <u>Report Number</u>: HRB 17-022

Public Comment: David Swarens, Bruce Coons, Geoffrey Mogilner, Abel Silvas

Following Public Comment the Board had a brief discussion on the item.

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: LOCATION: Thursday April 27, 2017 City Concourse Building, North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:10PM