

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	May 11, 2017	REPORT NO. HRB-17-032
HEARING DATE:	May 25, 2017	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #8 – Dr. David and Margaret Higbee H	ouse
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Data	<u>base (CHRID) link</u>
APPLICANT:	CSJ Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian	
LOCATION:	3705 Pringle Street, 92103, Uptown Communi APN 451-111-09-00	ty, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Dr. David and located at 3705 Pringle Street as a historical r	0

## STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Dr. David and Margaret Higbee House located at 3705 Pringle Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear addition constructed in 1945. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

 The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its stucco exterior, flat roof and hipped roof sheathed with clay tile; wood and steel divided light windows, quoin rock veneer at the front entrance; ornamental window grills detailed in stucco and wrought iron; quatrefoil windows at the south and east facades; and cantilevering with decorative arches.

## BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The property is located in the Middletown/Mission Hills community in a predominantly single family neighborhood.

The property was identified in the Draft 2016 Uptown Historic Survey and given a Status Code of 5S3, "Appears to be individually eligible for local listing or designation through survey evaluation."

The historic name of the resource, the Dr. David and Margaret Higbee House has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the Higbees, who constructed the home as their personal residence.

### <u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott Moomjian which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C and Staff concurs. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

# CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

Constructed in 1925, the subject house was designed in the Spanish Eclectic style. It features an irregular floor plan and faces west on to Pringle Street. The exterior of the house is stuccoed with a smooth/sand finish and the hipped and gable roof features a two-piece clay tile roof in a variegated color. The windows are a mixture of wood double hung and casement, wood with leaded glass; steel casements and non-historic windows. The massing of the house features a raised central portion flanked by lower wings that protrude out in front of the central mass. The main entrance is centrally located in the taller mass. The entrance is accessed by an uncovered raised porch. The recessed entrance features a quoin rock veneer which is also present on the entrance flooring. Flanking the entrance are 1/1 double hung windows with decorative wrought iron bars.

To the left of the front recessed porch area is a pair of French doors under a small, tiled hipped roof surrounded by decorative wrought iron. To the left of the French doors, the wall plane steps back. This corner of the house features two sets of windows both of which are covered by wrought iron railing. Keeping left leads to the north façade of the house. This façade features multiple lead light casement windows on the main floor and a steel casement window on the lower level. The upper level cantilevers over the lower floor and features decorative arched supports. The lower level of the house is only half above ground as the ground slopes down to a two car attached garage. The garage features a small, tiled shed roof and a single tilt up garage door.

To the right of the front entrance is a window with wrought iron railing on the north wall face. Fronting on to Pringle Street and hidden by the vegetation is a non-historic sliding window in the original opening. To the right of the non-historic window and located at the corner is a decorative stucco grill over a window. At the south façade of the house, a historic wall partially blocks the visibility of area. The façade features a non-historic door and window with tiled shed roof before stepping back to the rear of the house. Both the south and east facades of the two story mass feature a quatrefoil window above the windows. The east façade has one located on either side of the chimney. The rear of the house features a deck at the main level and a full lower level with windows and doors are sporadically placed on the wall plans. This elevation also includes a main floor 1945 addition that cantilevers over the lower level which does not date to the 1925 period of significance.

Overall, there have been very few changes to the house. The bulk of the changes have been limited to non-historic replacement windows in existing openings. The other modification to the house was the 1945 addition at the rear of the house that does not date to the 1925 period of significance.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape until the Modernist movement took hold during and after WWII. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans, as well as gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include Mission and Spanish clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including its stucco exterior, flat roof and hipped roof sheathed with clay tile; wood and steel divided light windows, quoin rock veneer at the front entrance; ornamental window grills detailed in stucco and wrought iron; quatrefoil windows at the south and east facades; and cantilevering with decorative arches. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

## OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

### **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Dr. David and Margaret Higbee House located at 3705 Pringle Street be designated with a period of significance of 1925 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear addition constructed in 1945.

Jodie Brown, AICP Senior Planner

JB/ks/el

Attachment(s):

Elyse W. Lowe

Deputy Director Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 5/25/2017

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 5/25/2017, to consider the historical designation of the **Dr. David and Margaret Higbee House** (owned by CSJ Trust 11-04-14, 3705 Pringle Street, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **3705 Pringle Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92103**, APN: **451-111-09-00**, further described as BLK 63 LOTS 1 THRU 4 ST CLSD ADJ & in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

### NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Dr. David and Margaret Higbee House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1925 period of significance. Specifically, the resource retains its stucco exterior, flat roof and hipped roof sheathed with clay tile; wood and steel divided light windows, quoin rock veneer at the front entrance; ornamental window grills detailed in stucco and wrought iron; quatrefoil windows at the south and east facades; and cantilevering with decorative arches. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the rear addition constructed in 1945.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: \_\_\_\_

CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney