



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: June 8, 2017 REPORT NO. HRB-17-039

HEARING DATE: June 22, 2017

SUBJECT: **ITEM #11 – Spalding Place Historic District (1st Hearing)**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: City of San Diego Planning Department

LOCATION: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, which includes the 10 properties addressed on Spalding Place, as well as the two properties on Park Boulevard (4651 and 4665-4663) and two properties on Georgia Street (4646 and 4656) that flank the entrance to Spalding Place; North Park Community, Council District 3

DESCRIPTION: Review the Spalding Place Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; provide direction to staff regarding the content of the nomination, including the district boundary, historical context, statement of significance, period of significance, and classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the district nomination is complete based upon this direction; and forward to a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;
2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance of 1909-1912, with or without further direction;
5. Consider the classification of the following 10 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4646	Georgia Street	4450422300	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4655-4663	Park Boulevard	4450420300	1910	One Part Commercial Block	5D1
1808	Spalding Place	4450420400	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1810	Spalding Place	4450420500	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1814	Spalding Place	4450420600	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1815	Spalding Place	4450420700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1818	Spalding Place	4450422700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1831	Spalding Place	4450422500	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1832	Spalding Place	4450422800	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1838	Spalding Place	4450422900	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1

6. Consider the classification of the following 4 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4656	Georgia Street	4450423700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
4651	Park Boulevard	4450420800	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
1817	Spalding Place	4450422600	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
1837	Spalding Place	4450422400	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z

7. Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Spalding Place Historic District nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

BACKGROUND

This item to designate the Spalding Place Historic District is being brought before the Historical Resources Board by the City of San Diego Planning Department consistent with SDMC Section 123.0303 and HRB Policy 4.1 on Establishing Historical Districts, last amended on October 27, 2011 (District Policy). The Spalding Place Historic District is located in the University Heights neighborhood of North Park, and is comprised of 14 properties along Spalding Place, just southeast of the intersection of Park Boulevard and Adams Avenue. The Spalding Place Historic District was identified in the 2016 North Park Community Plan Area Historic Resources Survey, prepared in support of the comprehensive Community Plan Update (CPU) for North Park.

Historic District Processing

The HRB's District Policy guides the designation of historic districts. The Policy requires that a nomination for a Historic District provide the following: Geographic Boundaries; a Statement of Significance establishing the historical significance of the district under adopted Board criteria; Site Surveys of all properties within the district boundaries (DPR-523 forms); identification of Contributing Sites and Non-contributing Sites; and identification of District Features deemed essential to the maintenance of the district's architectural and/or historic integrity.

In early 2017, staff issued a task order to as-needed planning consultant AECOM to prepare a historic context statement, statement of significance, period of significance and boundary description and justification for the Spalding Place Historic District (Attachments 1 and 2). The district context statement builds on the context prepared for the 2016 North Park Survey. The district context first presents an overview of the City-wide development history, and then provides a detailed discussion of the development of University Heights and the Spalding Place district. The statement of significance then evaluates the district within that context against the City's designation criteria, and concludes that the Spalding Place Historic District is significance under HRB Criterion A as a resource that exemplifies and reflects special elements of University Heights' historical and architectural development. The period of significance identified for the district begins with the subdivision of lots and construction of the first bungalows on Spalding Place in 1909 and ends in 1912, the year that the last of the properties on Spalding Place was occupied. A complete summary and analysis of the District's significance under the City's designation Criteria is provided in the Analysis section of this report.

The District Policy requires review by the Policy Subcommittee and two hearings by the full HRB. On May 8, 2017 staff presented the Context, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance and Boundary Description and Justification for the Spalding Place Historic District to the Policy Subcommittee for comment and direction. The Subcommittee requested minor clarifications regarding the role of F.C. Spalding in the development of the district, but had no significant questions or concerns regarding the nomination. Following review by the Policy Subcommittee, staff hosted a workshop on Saturday, May 20th for property owners within the proposed historic district boundary. At the workshop staff presented information on the history of the District and why it is historically significant; the process of designating the District and associated timelines; and how being within a Historic District will affect their property, including the responsibilities and benefits. The workshop was well attended with half of the properties from the District represented. All property owners not in attendance were mailed copies of the materials presented at the workshop.

While property owner consent to historic designation is not required by the municipal code, the District Policy requires staff to solicit the level of support and opposition from property owners within the proposed district boundary and provide that information to the Board. Following the property owner workshop, self-addressed stamped polling cards were mailed to property owners, who were asked to respond by June 6th. As of the date of this report, staff has received responses from 6 of the 14 property owners within the district. Of the 6 responses, 4 were in support of the district designation (67% of respondents, 29% of total) and 2 were opposed (33% of respondents, 5% of total). Staff will be conducting further outreach to solicit additional responses prior to the second HRB hearing on this matter.

The first historic district designation hearing before the HRB is intended to allow the Board to "evaluate the completeness and adequacy of the information submitted establishing the significance of the proposed historical district at a regularly scheduled Board meeting. If the information submitted is found adequate, a second noticed public hearing shall be scheduled for the next available Board hearing". At the second hearing, the Board will "hear public testimony on the establishment of the historical district, and take appropriate action." While public noticing is required only for the second hearing when the designation action is taken, staff has notified all property owners 10 business days in advance of the first hearing.

ANALYSIS

The Spalding Place Historic District nomination provides an expansive discussion of the historic context, statement of significance, period of significance and boundary justification, which are summarized here, along with the methods used to develop the recommendations regarding contributing and non-contributing resources.

Historic Context

The Great Boom of 1885-1888 followed the arrival of transcontinental railroad and ended with a real estate crash. Most real estate transactions during this time involved vacant parcels at inflated prices, with little physical development occurring. It was in this environment that the College Hill Land Association formed in 1886 and purchased 1,600 acres north of Balboa Park with the intent to buy, sell, improve, mortgage and lease the property. It was also their intent to support the establishment of a college on the mesa, reserving land and money for the construction of the college. They named their new subdivision University Heights, formally filing map #558 with the County in August 1888. Improvements were installed, including water main pipes down every street and a steam-powered streetcar line to the college site. But the boom went bust, the streetcar line failed, and development halted. Without a reliable supply of water and transportation to the subdivision, development of University Heights stalled.

Several different streetcar companies came and went at the end of the 19th century, including horse-cars, electric streetcars and cable-cars, each installing their own infrastructure and extending to different parts of the City. The San Diego Railway Company's cable-car was the first to reach the intersection of Park Boulevard and Adams Avenue in 1891, one year before the company was declared insolvent and shut down. It passed through several hands before being acquired by John D. Spreckels San Diego Electric Railway Company in 1898. That same year, the University Heights stand pipe was opened, providing fresh potable water to University Heights. One year later, the Normal School, a teacher-training college opened. With a reliable source of water and transportation finally available, development in University Heights boomed in the early 1900s.

Promoters established attractions to bring visitors and hopefully buyers to University Heights. At the time the Spalding Place residences were constructed, the intersection of Park Boulevard and Adams Avenue was also home to attractions including the Mission Cliff Gardens, Bentley Ostrich Farm, and the San Diego Silk Mill. At the turn of the 20th century, the intersection of Adams Avenue and Park Boulevard was the epicenter of activity in University Heights, at the node of an important transit corridor serving the new subdivisions on the mesa.

It is in this climate of exciting, booming development in San Diego's emerging streetcar suburb of University Heights that a man by the name of Frank Carr (or F.C.) Spalding arrives on the scene. F.C. Spalding was born in Kansas City on November 2, 1869, and his family was established in real estate speculation and development by the time of Southern California's Great Boom in the mid-1880s. Many members of his family relocated to Los Angeles in the late 19th Century, but F.C. Spalding remained in Missouri until 1908, when he moved his family to San Diego and immediately became involved in speculative building and real estate sales.

In July of 1908 Spalding purchased the 12 lots that would become his Spalding Place development. Perhaps to maximize the commercial and residential potential, Spalding subdivided the lots to create 14 parcels along a new, narrow east-west street he fittingly dubbed Spalding Place. Spalding then constructed 14 buildings – 13 houses and 1 commercial building – along Spalding Place between 1909 and 1912. It is unclear in exactly what order the buildings were constructed, but City records and directory listings suggest that they were built from west to east, starting closest to the Park Boulevard and Adams Avenue intersection. Stylistically, the homes were all built in the Craftsman style at the height of their popularity, and reflect working-class housing of the period. The first residents of Spalding Place represented a mix of working- and middle-class occupations, including drivers, laborers, salesmen, hairdressers, dressmakers, and teachers. They included married couples, siblings, widows, boarders, and unmarried professionals. The commercial building in Park Boulevard was occupied by a grocer, Tolbert C. Shore, and his family. By 1912, all buildings within Spalding Place had been constructed, and F.C. Spalding had sold all of his speculative properties.

Statement of Significance and Period of Significance

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Based upon the historic context, the Spalding Place Historic District is significant under HRB Criterion A as a resource that exemplifies and reflects special elements of University Heights' historical and architectural development. In regard to historical development, the district is representative of the development of University Heights as a streetcar suburb in the early 1900s, reflecting the widespread growth of the community as a streetcar suburb, with Craftsman-style bungalows in easy distance to the streetcar and commercial center. In regard to architectural development, the district reflects compact, working-class Craftsman housing during the height of the style's popularity, supported by typical commercial development (1-part commercial block) of the day. The collection of modest bungalows represents typical dwellings constructed by a speculative real estate developer, F.C. Spalding, a local real estate developer/builder, in an important era of rapid development, exemplifying development designed and constructed by non-architects.

Within University Heights, there are only a few existing and potential historic districts in the entire community. The three other districts that have been identified within the community include the Shirley Ann Place Historic District (designated with an expansion area identified), Valle Vista Terrace Historic District, and Park Boulevard Apartment Historic District. These districts all vary in their historical development and architectural composition. Spalding Place is distinctive for the collective significance of its contributors as a commercial and residential development fashioned by F.C. Spalding out of typical subdivision lots to exploit the proximity of the important streetcar and commercial hub, and the particular presence of the Mission Cliff Gardens, Bentley Ostrich Farm, and the San Diego Silk Mill. Spalding Place Historic District is a unique example of the architectural development of University Heights, and the degree of integrity exhibited by the district contributors also makes it one of the best unified examples of modest bungalows in the community.

The period of significance identified for the district begins with the subdivision of lots and construction of the first bungalows on Spalding Place in 1909 and ends in 1912, the year that the last

of the properties on Spalding Place was occupied, marking the end of F.C. Spalding's involvement in the construction and development of the district.

Boundary Justification

The boundary of the Spalding Place Historic District remains essentially the same as the boundary identified in the 2016 North Park Survey. However, it appears that the boundary in the 2016 survey was not drawn accurately, encompassing a parcel at the southwest corner that was not developed by Spalding and was not identified by the survey as either contributing or non-contributing. The boundary identified in the current intensive-level survey encompasses the properties on Spalding Place that were built by developer Frank Carr Spalding between 1909 and 1912 and are representative of early 20th century real estate development and speculation in University Heights. While non-contributing resources were identified at the east and west ends of the district, these parcels were developed by Spalding and relate to the context; and their removal from the district boundary would not significantly impact the concentration of contributing resources or sense of place.

Classification of Contributing and Non-Contributing Resources

A historic district is comprised of contributing and non-contributing resources – those that convey and contribute to the significance of the district and those that do not. Contributing resources are those resources that were built within the period of significance for the district (the period of time that reflects and captures the district's historic significance) and retain integrity to convey that significance. Non-contributing resources were either built outside of the period of significance, or have been so modified that they no longer retain integrity to convey the significance of the district.

Any property built outside the period of significance is therefore classified by staff as non-contributing. Properties built within the period of significance are evaluated to determine whether or not they maintain the essential character defining features required to retain integrity and convey the significance of the district. The Spalding Place Historic District's significance lies in its development as a streetcar suburb comprised of modest, working class Craftsman bungalows supported by transit-oriented commercial development. Therefore, a resource cannot be so altered that it no longer exhibits the distinctive characteristics present during the 1909-1912 period of significance.

Because contributing resources within a district are part of a larger whole and do not need to stand alone as individually significant buildings, modifications (either singular or cumulative) that may not be acceptable on an individually significant resource may be acceptable on a contributing resource. For example, with contributing resources enclosing a porch with glazing and minimal framing and leaving the original framing and structure of the porch intact and evident; or applying Spanish Lace stucco to a building which was stuccoed originally; or replacing one or more windows in the original opening with non-historic aluminum or vinyl windows will typically not result in the inability of the resource to contribute to the overall significance of the district. On the other hand, resources that have undergone significant singular or cumulative minor to moderate modifications, such as a complete porch enclosure that does not leave the original framing intact; or application of stucco cladding to a building that was wood-clad historically; or replacing windows in altered openings, may no longer be eligible as a contributor to the district because the quality and character of the building is impaired to such an extent that the resource no longer conveys the significance of the district.

Staff is recommending that, of the 14 properties within the Spalding Place Historic District, 10 properties be classified as contributing and 4 properties as non-contributing, which results in 71% (percent) of the resources in the proposed district identified as contributing to the significance of the district (Attachments 3 and 4). Staff is requesting that the Board review all recommendations regarding classification of contributing and non-contributing resources and provide direction regarding any changes to those classifications at the first hearing. This will allow time to make changes to the document and notify property owners of the likely status of their property prior to the second hearing. The decision to designate the district and all identified contributors at the second hearing will require the vote of six Boardmembers, consistent with any designation action.

CONCLUSION

At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;
2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance of 1909-1912, with or without further direction;
5. Consider the classification of the 10 properties identified by staff as Contributing Resources;
6. Consider the classification of the 4 properties identified by staff as Non-Contributing Resources; and
7. Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Spalding Place Historic District nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.



Kelley Stanco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison
Planning Department

KS

Attachments:

1. [Spalding Place Historic District Record](#)¹ (Digital Only)
2. [Spalding Place Historic District Figures](#)² (Digital Only)
3. [Spalding Place Historic District Property Survey Forms](#)³ (Digital Only)
4. Spalding Place Historic District Resource Analysis Spreadsheet

¹http://sandiego.cfwebtools.com/toolkit/resourceSearch.cfm?display=districtrecords&dist_id=30&recordnum=5&dpr_id=23852&res_id=17593

² http://sandiego.cfwebtools.com/images/other/extra_17593_30_Spalding_Place_Historic_District_Figures.pdf

³ https://www.sandiego.gov/sites/default/files/spalding_place_historic_district_dprs.pdf

**SPALDING PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT
Resource Analysis Spreadsheet**

STREET NUMBER	STREET NAME	APN	STYLE	YEAR BUILT	CONTRIBUTING OR NON-CONTRIBUTING	STATUS CODE	Non-Historic Awnings	Landscape Features & Overgrowth	In-Kind Window Replacement	Inconsistent Roofing	Non-Historic Stucco Texture	Added Veneers	One or More Non-Historic Windows Replaced in Same Opening	Replacement of Porch Railings and/or Posts	Enclosure of Porch with Original Framing Intact and Evident	Highly Visible Aluminum Garage Door	Minor Additions and/or Remodeling	Windows Replaced in New or Altered Opening	Replacing One Siding Type with Another	Enclosure and/or Expansion of Porch with Original Framing or Structure Lost	Inconsistent Additions and/or Remodeling	NOTES/QUESTIONS
4646	Georgia Street	4450422300	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1											X					
4656	Georgia Street	4450423700	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Non-Contributing	6Z											X	X	X	X		
4651	Park Boulevard	4450420800	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Non-Contributing	6Z	X											X	X		X	
4655-4663	Park Boulevard	4450420300	One Part Commercial Block	1910	Contributing	5D1						X	X									
1808	Spalding Place	4450420400	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1																
1810	Spalding Place	4450420500	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1											X					
1814	Spalding Place	4450420600	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1												X				
1815	Spalding Place	4450420700	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1											X	X				
1817	Spalding Place	4450422600	Craftsman Bungalow	1911	Non-Contributing	6Z														X	X	
1818	Spalding Place	4450422700	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1		X					X									
1831	Spalding Place	4450422500	Craftsman Bungalow	1911	Contributing	5D1											X					

**SPALDING PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT
Resource Analysis Spreadsheet**

STREET NUMBER	STREET NAME	APN	STYLE	YEAR BUILT	CONTRIBUTING OR NON-CONTRIBUTING	STATUS CODE	Non-Historic Awnings	Landscape Features & Overgrowth	In-Kind Window Replacement	Inconsistent Roofing	Non-Historic Stucco Texture	Added Veneers	One or More Non-Historic Windows Replaced in Same Opening	Replacement of Porch Railings and/or Posts	Enclosure of Porch with Original Framing Intact and Evident	Highly Visible Aluminum Garage Door	Minor Additions and/or Remodeling	Windows Replaced in New or Altered Opening	Replacing One Siding Type with Another	Enclosure and/or Expansion of Porch with Original Framing or Structure Lost	Inconsistent Additions and/or Remodeling	NOTES/QUESTIONS	
1832	Spalding Place	4450422800	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1							X	X			X						
1837	Spalding Place	4450422400	Craftsman Bungalow	1911	Non-Contributing	6Z														X	X		
1838	Spalding Place	4450422900	Craftsman Bungalow	1910	Contributing	5D1											X						