

CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JUNE 22, 2017
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 1:00 PM

Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Tim Hutter	Present
2 nd Vice-Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Boardmember	Diana Cordileone	Absent
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present
Boardmember	Cindy Stankowski	Present
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present <i>arrived at 1:01PM</i>
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Elyse Lowe, Deputy Director
 Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner, Board Liaison
 Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
 Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
 Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner
 Suzanne Segur, Assistant Planner
 Haley Bergam, Intern

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR May 25, 2017

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR MAY 25, 2017 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Items 6 and 8
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

None

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- New development incentives to encourage the undisturbed preservation of important archaeological sites and traditional cultural properties and the preservation of historic resources and districts consistent with the Standards are being proposed as part of the 11th Update to the Land Development Code. These incentives include the exclusion of historic square footage from FAR limitations and parking requirements, and new allowances for deviations from requirements such as setbacks. The new incentives were presented to the Policy Subcommittee this past Monday, and will be presented to the City's Code Monitoring Team this summer before proceeding to adoption hearings with the 11th Update, likely later this fall. You can review the proposed incentives on the Planning Department's website at www.sandiego.gov/historicplanning

Deputy Director Update:

- I am pleased to announce that Development Services has hired a new Senior Planner who will be starting with us in August, Mr. Sonnier Francisco, he is currently with Caltrans and will be moving from Los Angeles to San Diego. After he joins us we will slowly begin to transition him into the role of HRB liaison.

D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUT

- **Policy**

Staff Report by Jodie Brown for Camille Pekarek

The Policy Subcommittee last met on June 19th. The Subcommittee reviewed and provided feedback on amendments proposed for the 11th Code Update. Also, the Subcommittee reviewed and discussed the South Park Historic District, its draft historic context statement, statement of significance, period of significance, and in particular, the boundary description and its justification.

The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held Monday, July 10, 2017 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

- **Design Assistance**

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

The Design Assistance Subcommittee (DAS) met on June 7 and had three items on the agenda:

1. 4357 Argos Drive: restoration of a property, they had discussions about on the stucco, window and roofing materials and hopefully in the near future they will be preparing a designation report.

2. 7727 Lookout Drive (HRB# 1125): They are proposing new construction on a designated vacant parcel (Parcel 4). Redesign of proposed new house, had been reviewed by DAS the previous year, and maintains visibility from the Cliff May House as required by the designation of Parcel 4.
3. 701 5th Avenue (Gaslamp Non-Contributor): redesign of the exterior of the theatre and feedback on design features from DAS

The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, July 5, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services.

- **Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources**

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

The next regularly scheduled Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meetings will be held on Monday, August 14, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

E. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – WILLIAM STRAW HOUSE

ITEM 9 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #7

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE ITEMS 7 AND 9 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH THE ADDITION OF PRAIRIE INFLUENCES IN THE RESOLUTION FOR ITEM 7.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – JEANNETTE AND W.P. CARY/RICHARD REQUA AND HERBERT JACKSON HOUSE

Continued from February 2017

Applicant: Christopher and Cheryl Lee represented by IS Architecture

Location: 350 San Fernando Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1288 4-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 350 San Fernando Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Jeannette and W.P. Cary/Richard Requa and Herbert Jackson House located at 350 San Fernando Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1927 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes additions completed after the 1927 period of significance.

Report Number: Staff memo dated June 8, 2017 and HRB 17-012

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ione Stiegler, Katie DeBiase, Rebecca McManus, Bruce Coons, Amie Hayes

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO MOVE THE ORIGINAL STAFF RECOMMENDATION FROM THE FEBRUARY 9, 2017 STAFF REPORT WITH THE ADDITION TO THE FIRST LINE "DESIGNATE THE JEANNETTE AND W.P. CARY/RICHARD REQUA AND HERBERT JACKSON HOUSE..." TO CORRECT THE NAME; AND THEN UNDER ITEM TWO: ADD TO THE FIRST LINE "THE RESOURCE IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE WORK OF MASTER ARCHITECT RICHARD REQUA AND HERBERT JACKSON, A STRUCTURAL ENGINEER, AND RETAINS INTEGRITY AS IT RELATES TO THE ORIGINAL DESIGN."

Seconded by Boardmember Harleman

Vote: 7-1-0

Motion Passes

(Pitman)

ITEM 6 – 5805 CAMINO DE LA COSTA

Continued from April 2017

Applicant: Raul and Lisa Albanez 2004 Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 5805 Camino De La Costa, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 **(1247 3-F)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 5805 Camino De La Costa as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 5805 Camino De La Costa under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: Staff memo dated April 13, 2017 and HRB 16-072

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, Lisa Albanez, Raul Albanez, Amie Hayes, Heath Fox, Seonaid McArthur, Barry Bielinski, Bruce Coons, Priscilla Ann Berge

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 5805 CAMINO DE LA COSTA AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1927 UNDER HRB CRITERION A. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING: THE RESOURCE IS A SPECIAL ELEMENT OF THE LA JOLLA'S CULTURAL, SOCIAL AND HISTORIC LIFE AS A DISTINCTIVE COMMUNITY LANDMARK MARKING THE SOUTH ENTRANCE TO THE LA JOLLA LOWER HERMOSA SUBDIVISION DEVELOPMENT AND LA JOLLA'S TRANSITION FROM A SUMMER BEACH COLONY TO AN UPSCALE SUBURB WITH YEAR-ROUND AMENITIES. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 6-2-0

Motion Passes

(Pitman, Woods)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE THE PROPERTY LOCATED AT 5805 CAMINO DE LA COSTA AS A HISTORICAL RESOURCE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1927 UNDER HRB CRITERION D. THIS RECOMMENDATION IS BASED ON THE FOLLOWING FINDING: THE RESOURCE IS REPRESENTATIVE OF A NOTABLE DESIGN AND CUSTOM BUILD WORK OF THE A.M. SOUTHARD COMPANY, A MASTER BUILDER, AND RETAINS SUFFICIENT INTEGRITY TO CONVEY THE TIME AND PLACE OF ITS DATE OF CONSTRUCTION AND PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1927, AND REPRESENTS SUPERIOR WORKMANSHIP OF CUSTOM HIGH-END RESIDENTIAL DESIGN. THIS FINDING IS FURTHER SUPPORTED BY INFORMATION IN THE STAFF REPORT, THE HISTORICAL RESEARCH REPORT, AND WRITTEN AND ORAL EVIDENCE PRESENTED AT THE DESIGNATION HEARING. DESIGNATION EXCLUDES ADDITIONS SINCE 1927.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 5-3-0

Motion Fails

(Hutter, Pitman, Woods)

ITEM 7 – WILLIAM STRAW HOUSE

Applicant: Daniel and Radha Canepa represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1306 Torrance Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 **(1168 6-J)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1306 Torrance Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William Straw House located at 1306 Torrance Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes additions completed after the 1912 period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 17-035

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT WITH THE ADDITION OF PRAIRIE INFLUENCES IN THE RESOLUTION

ITEM 8 – 4639 VISTA STREET

Applicant: Karen E. Rogers-Cook Revocable Trust represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 4639 Vista Street, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 **(1269 3-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4639 Vista Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4639 Vista Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-036

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Paul Johnson, Sarai Johnson, Priscilla Ann Berge

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO SEND THE REPORT BACK TO THE APPLICANT FOR THE FOLLOWING THREE POINTS:

1. CLARIFY THE TYPE RELATIVE TO TUDOR REVIVAL / FRENCH ECLECTIC
2. TO ADDRESS ON THE ISSUE WE HEARD TODAY ON THE POSSIBILITY OF THE STUCCO BEING THE ORIGINAL MATERIAL ON THE DORMERS; AND
3. PROVIDE ADDITIONAL RESEARCH UNDER CRITERION A; ARCHITECTURAL DEVELOPMENT IN SAN DIEGO, THE ROLE OF WOMEN IN BUILDING IN THE 1920S. IN PARTICULAR, PLACING THE RESOURCE IN HISTORIC CONTEXT OF HOMES BEING BUILT IN IN SAN DIEGO IN THE 1920S. FOCUS UPON THE ROLE OF WOMEN AS BUILDING CONTRACTORS, ARCHITECTS AND DESIGNERS BY COMPARING MASTER BUILDER LOUISE SEVERIN AND ARCHITECT/ DESIGNER FLORENCE PALMER AND THE FAIRYTALE HOUSES WITH LUCILLE HELEN LAINSON.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 7-1-0

Motion Passes

(McCullough)

ITEM 9 – ALBERTA SECURITY COMPANY/MARTIN V. MELHORN SPEC HOUSE #7

Applicant: Brian Sanders and Montinee J. Pongsiri represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

Location: 3851 Hawk Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1268 5-J)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3851 Hawk Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Alberta Security Company/Martin V. Melhorn Spec House #7 located at 3851 Hawk Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1920 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the garage and guest house constructed outside of the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 17-037

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – 2438 33rd STREET

Applicant: Craig and Clara Behnke represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 2438 33rd Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (1289 1-F)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2438 33rd Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 2438 33rd Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-038

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Paul Johnson, Sarai Johnson

After a brief discussion by the Board, the applicant choose to withdraw the item and bring back at a later date.

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT

ITEM 11 – SPALDING PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT (1ST HEARING)

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning Department

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, which includes the 10 properties addressed on Spalding Place, as well as the two properties on Park Boulevard (4651 and 4665-4663) and two properties on Georgia Street (4646 and 4656) that flank the entrance to Spalding Place; North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-C**)

Description: First hearing to consider the designation of the Spalding Place Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Spalding Place Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; provide direction to staff regarding the content of the nomination, including the district boundary, historical context, statement of significance, period of significance, and classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the district nomination is complete based upon this direction; and forward to a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Staff Recommendation: At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;
2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance of 1909-1912, with or without further direction;
5. Consider the classification of the following 10 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4646	Georgia Street	4450422300	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4655-4663	Park Boulevard	4450420300	1910	One Part Commercial Block	5D1
1808	Spalding Place	4450420400	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1810	Spalding Place	4450420500	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1814	Spalding Place	4450420600	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1815	Spalding Place	4450420700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1818	Spalding Place	4450422700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1831	Spalding Place	4450422500	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1832	Spalding Place	4450422800	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1838	Spalding Place	4450422900	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1

6. Consider the classification of the following 4 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4656	Georgia Street	4450423700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
4651	Park Boulevard	4450420800	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
1817	Spalding Place	4450422600	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
1837	Spalding Place	4450422400	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z

7. Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Spalding Place Historic District nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Report Number: HRB 17-039

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Dionné Carlson, Priscilla Ann Berge

In Opposition: Sharon Gehl

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO ACCEPT ALL ITEMS OF STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION AND MOVE 1817 SPALDING PLACE FROM NON-CONTRIBUTING TO CONTRIBUTING.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 7-1-0
(Hutter)

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, July 27, 2017

LOCATION:

City Concourse Building,
North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 4:37PM