

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF JULY 27, 2017
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 1:00 PM

Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Tim Hutter	Present
2 nd Vice-Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Boardmember	Diana Cordileone	Present
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present
Boardmember	Cindy Stankowski	Present <i>arrived at 1:03PM</i>
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present <i>arrived at 1:01PM</i>
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Elyse Lowe, Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner, Board Liaison
Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner
Suzanne Segur, Assistant Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR June 22, 2017

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR JUNE 22, 2017 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Coyle

Vote: 8-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

None

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

• **GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence Item 5 - Spalding Place Historic District
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Pitman has a conflict of interest for Item 10-140 West Thorn Street and will recuse himself from any discussion and vote.

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

• **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- Item 10-140 W. Thorn has been withdrawn by the applicant.
- You may recall that the new development incentives for preservation of historic resources that are being processed with the 11th Update were reviewed by the Policy Subcommittee in June. The same amendments were heard as an information item by the City's Code Monitoring Team (CMT) and Technical Advisory Committee (TAC) on July 12th, and there were no recommended changes or edits. We expect that the proposed incentives will return to the full Board with the 11th Update in early fall before proceeding to Planning Commission and City Council.
- The Policy Subcommittee concluded its review of the South Park Historic District this month, recommending that the nomination proceed with a slightly expanded boundary that includes 18 additional properties. Staff is currently in the process of surveying these new properties and finalizing the survey forms for the district before the property owner workshop in August.
- The Policy Subcommittee also reviewed the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination in July and forwarded the nomination on for continued processing. There was some discussion regarding the end date for the period of significance, but no consensus or agreement on any changes to the date proposed. The property owner workshop will be held this Saturday, and the nomination is scheduled for its first hearing before the HRB in August.
- It is my pleasure to welcome Boardmember Diana Reynolds-Cordileone, who was appointed several months ago but was not able to join us due to prior commitments. Dr. Cordileone obtained her Masters degree and Doctorate in modern European History from UCSD, and just recently retired from her work as a Professor of History at Point Loma Nazarene University. She has a strong background in ongoing research, is a published author, and has presented papers at many major conferences. In recent years Boardmember Cordileone has been engaged in teaching and supervising research on San Diego history, and she is personally familiar with the processes and responsibilities of historic designation, as she lives in and is actively restoring a designated home in Uptown. Welcome Dr. Cordileone, we are so pleased to have you with us.

Deputy Director Update:

- On July 18th the City Council considered the appeal of historic designation of the May Somers Candee Spec House #1, located at 3616-3618 4th Avenue. The Council granted the appeal and overturned the designation based on factual errors and new information.

D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUT

- **Policy**

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

As previously noted, the Policy Subcommittee recently reviewed the South Park and Valle Vista Terrace Historic Districts.

The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held Monday, August 14, 2017 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

- **Design Assistance**

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek for Jodie Brown

The Design Assistance Subcommittee last met on July 7, 2017 with four items on the agenda. The first item reviewed related to color selection for the reconstruction of four murals above the entrance to the historically designated San Diego Automotive Museum. The subcommittee was generally in support of the revised color selection. The second item reviewed was a non-contributor to the Burlingame Historic District located at 2632 San Marcos Avenue and a proposed second story addition and remodel. The subcommittee was generally in agreement with staff's concerns on the proposed project. The third item reviewed was for a property within the Naval Training Station Historic District at 2885 Perry Road and proposed outdoor patio covers. The subcommittee acknowledged the concerns of staff with regard to the proposed design but ultimately did not have any recommended changes to the design. The fourth and final item reviewed was for a proposed driveway replacement at a designated historic site at 7728 Lookout Drive. The subcommittee indicated a general preference for one out four design options presented by the applicant.

The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting scheduled for Wednesday, August 2, 2017 has been cancelled.

- **Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources**

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

The next regularly scheduled Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meetings will be held on Monday, August 14, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

E. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

None

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 8 - 4021-4021½ IDAHO STREET

ITEM 9 - HENRY AND LAVINA NELSON/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE

ITEM 11 - COUNCILMAN FRED HEILBRON HOUSE

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE ITEMS 8, 9 AND 11 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH AN AMENDMENT TO ITEM 11.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – SPALDING PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT (2nd HEARING)

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning Department

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, which includes the 10 properties addressed on Spalding Place, as well as the two properties on Park Boulevard (4651 and 4665-4663) and two properties on Georgia Street (4646 and 4656) that flank the entrance to Spalding Place; North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-C)

Description: Second hearing in the process to designate the Spalding Place Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Spalding Place Historic District nomination; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; and designate the Spalding Place Historic District with identified contributing and non-contributing resources, or do not designate the Spalding Place Historic District.

Staff Recommendation: At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Designate the Spalding Place Historic District under HRB Criterion A as a special element of University Heights' historical and architectural development.
2. Designate the following 11 Contributing Resources under HRB Criterion F:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4646	Georgia Street	4450422300	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4655-4663	Park Boulevard	4450420300	1910	One Part Commercial Block	5D1
1808	Spalding Place	4450420400	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1810	Spalding Place	4450420500	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1814	Spalding Place	4450420600	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1815	Spalding Place	4450420700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1817	Spalding Place	4450422600	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1818	Spalding Place	4450422700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1831	Spalding Place	4450422500	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1832	Spalding Place	4450422800	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
1838	Spalding Place	4450422900	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1

3. Classify the following 3 properties as Non-Contributing Resources to the District:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4656	Georgia Street	4450423700	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
4651	Park Boulevard	4450420800	1910	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z
1837	Spalding Place	4450422400	1911	Craftsman Bungalow	6Z

Report Number: HRB 17-044

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Gina Molise, John O'Connor

Neutral: Jessica Mackaness

In Opposition: Sharon Gehl

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5- SPALDING PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION AND MOVE 1837 SPALDING PLACE FROM NON-CONTRIBUTING TO CONTRIBUTING

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 5-4-0

Motion Fails

(Pitman, Harleman, Woods, Hutter)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 5- SPALDING PLACE HISTORIC DISTRICT PER STAFFS RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 6 – 1704-1710 MARKET STREET AND 607-621 17th STREET

Applicant: Settineri Family LTD Partnership represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 1704-1710 Market Street and 607-621 17th Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (1289 3-C)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1704-1710 Market Street and 607-621 17th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 1704-1710 Market Street and 607-621 17th Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-046

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Marie Lia, Scott Moomjian, Jamie Settineri, Charity Settineri, Sharon Gehl

In Opposition: Bruce Coons

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 6-1704-1710 MARKET STREET AND 607-621 17TH STREET PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 6-3-0

Motion Passes

(Coyle, Pitman, Woods)

ITEM 7 – 842 MUIRLANDS VISTA WAY

Applicant: Debra R. Moncrieff represented by Scott A. Moomjian and Brian F. Smith and Associates

Location: 842 Muirlands Vista Way, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1247 2-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 842 Muirlands Vista Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 842 Muirlands Vista Way under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-045

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Debra Kaye, Brian Smith, Jenni Stropes. Tim Martin

In Opposition: None

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER WOODS TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 7-842 MUIRLANDS VISTA WAY PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Stankowski

Vote: 7-2-0

Motion Passes

(Coyle, Pitman)

ITEM 8 – 4021-4021½ IDAHO STREET

Applicant: John M. and Marianne R. Carson represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 4021-4021½ Idaho Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 5-D**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4021-4021½ Idaho Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4021-4021½ Idaho Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-040

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – HENRY AND LAVINA NELSON/MARTIN V. MELHORN HOUSE

Applicant: Fick-Nguyen Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 1965 Sunset Boulevard, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-G**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1965 Sunset Boulevard as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry and Lavina Nelson/Martin V. Melhorn House located at 1965 Sunset Boulevard as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1912 under HRB Criteria C and D. The designation excludes the rear addition constructed outside of the period of significance and the detached garage.

Report Number: HRB 17-041

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 10 – 140 WEST THORN STREET

Applicant: Edward C. Lenhart Revocable Living Trust represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

Location: 140 West Thorn Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 140 West Thorn Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 140 West Thorn Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: HRB 17-042

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN BY THE APPLICANT PRIOR TO HEARING

ITEM 11 – COUNCILMAN FRED HEILBRON HOUSE

Applicant: Paul H. and Carol S. Yong Family Trust represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4399 Hermosa Way, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-H**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4399 Hermosa Way as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Councilman Fred Heilbron House located at 4399 Hermosa Way as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924 under HRB Criteria B and C. The designation excludes the garage which is constructed outside of the period of significance.

Report Number: HRB 17-043

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT WITH AMENDMENT

ITEM 12 – 3430 ELLIOTT STREET

Applicant: Peter Lucca Jr. represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 3430 Elliott Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (**1268 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3430 Elliott Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3430 Elliott Street under any adopted HRB Criteria due to a lack of integrity.

Report Number: Staff memos dated July 13, 2017, September 8, 2016 and HRB 16-036

Staff Report by Jodie Brown

Testimony Received:

In Favor: None

In Opposition: Paul Johnson, Meredith Lucca, PJ Lucca

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12-3430 ELLIOTT STREET UNDER CRITERION C EMBODYING THE DISTINCTIVE CHARACTERISTICS OF THE SPANISH ECLECTIC STYLE WITH A PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE OF 1929. THESE ELEMENTS INCLUDE THE OVERALL ASYMMETRICAL SHAPE OF THE HOME; A FLAT ROOF WITH NO EAVE OVERHANG AND CIRCULAR, A PROJECTING, MODERATELY-PITCHED, FRONT-GABLED ROOF WITH RED, MISSION TILE; STUCCO EXTERIOR; HEAVY, CARVED WOOD FRONT-DOOR; AND DOUBLE-HUNG AND MULTI-PANED WOOD CASEMENT WINDOWS.

Seconded by Boardmember Stankowski

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 12- R. DOUGLAS & EUNICE MAW HOUSE UNDER CRITERION D AS IT WAS CONSTRUCTED BY MASTER BUILDER DENNSTEDT COMPANY IN 1929. IT IS A GOOD EXAMPLE OF THE DESIGNED AND BUILT QUALITY HOMES WITHIN THE LOMA PORTAL COMMUNITY FROM THE 1920S THROUGH THE 1940S. THE MAW HOUSE EXHIBITS THE QUALITY OF CONSTRUCTION EXPRESSED BY THE COMPANY DURING THE LATE 1920S AND THE HOME IS ONE OF THE EARLIEST SPANISH ECLECTIC DESIGNED STRUCTURES BUILT BY THE COMPANY THAT REFLECTS ITS SIMPLE AND RESTRAINED HALLMARK TRAIT OF QUALITY CONSTRUCTION.

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 9-0-0

Motion Passes

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, August 24, 2017

LOCATION:

City Concourse Building,
North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 3:36PM