Planning Department

Valle Vista Terrace Historic District First Historical Resources Board Hearing

August 24, 2017





Presentation Overview

Overview of Historic Districts

The History and Significance of Valle Vista Terrace

Process to Date

Staff Recommendation





Understanding Historic Districts

A Geographically Defined Concentration Of Resources

- Collectively Convey Significance Under Designation Criteria.
- Individual Buildings May Not Be Significant In Their Own Right.

The Sum of Its Parts

- Contributing Resources that Convey the Significance of the District.
- Non-Contributing Resources that Do Not.

All Properties Regulated

• Contributors More, Non-Contributors Less.





Understanding Historic Districts

Components of a Historic District Nomination

- Historic Context Statement
- Statement of Significance
- Period of Significance
- Geographic Boundary Description and Justification
- Survey
- Classification of Contributing and Non-Contributing Resources





Understanding Historic Districts

Modifications that Likely <u>Will Not</u> Result in Non-Contributing Status

- Non-Historic Window Replacements in Original Openings
- Enclosing a Porch with Glazing and Leaving Framing Intact
- Replacing Historic Stucco with an Inappropriate Stucco Texture

Modifications that Likely <u>Will</u> Result in Non-Contributing Status

- Window Replacements in Altered Openings
- Enclosing a Porch with Solid Walls and/or Demolishing the Original Exterior Wall
- Replacing One Siding Type with Another (i.e. Stucco to Wood, Wood to Aluminum, etc.)
- Significant Cumulative Modifications



History and Significance of Valle Vista Terrace

Late 19th Century

- Marked by Boom and Bust Cycles
- Speculative Subdivisions and Development
 University Heights
- College Hill Land Association Formed 1886
- University Heights Subdivision Filed 1888
- Development Floundered Until the Early 1900s
 - Reliable Water Source
 - Reliable Transportation (Streetcar)





History and Significance of Valle Vista Terrace

MISSION CLIP

SAN DIEGO ELECTRIC RAILWAY CO ADMISSION FREE TO STREET CAR PATRONS.

University Heights Attractions



Mission Cliff Gardens (1890-1929)



Bentley Ostrich Farm (1904-1929)

San Diego Silk Mill (1918-1931)

Park Boulevard and Adams Avenue was the Place to Be! sandiego.gov



History and Significance of Spalding Place

Development of Valle Vista Terrace

- Purchased by George Hawley and Subdivided as Valle Vista Terrace in 1907.
- Outer "Villa Lots" with Sweeping Views for Upscale Single Family Homes, Inner Lots for Middle-Class Homes.
- Primarily Craftsman and Spanish/Mission Revival, with Other Revival Styles as Well.
- Largely Built-Out by World War I



























































History and Significance of Valle Vista Terrace Significant Under HRB Criterion A

- Historical Development
 - Development of University Heights as a Streetcar Suburb.
 - Location Chosen Due to Access to Water, Transit, Commercial Development and Popular Attractions.
 - Mixture of Lots for Different Housing Types.
- Architectural Development
 - Collection of Varied Early 20th Century Architectural Styles.





History and Significance of Valle Vista Terrace Significant Under HRB Criterion C

- Exhibits Varied Early 20th Century Architectural Styles in Both Upper and Working Class Expressions:
 - Craftsman
 - Mission/Spanish Revival
 - Tudor Revival
 - Dutch Colonial Revival
- One of Very Few Intact Districts in University Heights that Reflects These Historical Trends.
- Period of Significance 1907-1942





History and Significance of Valle Vista Terrace Period of Significance Discussion

- Proposed: 1907-1942
 - Based Upon Development Patterns and Build-Out
- Policy Subcommittee:
 - Discussed Extending the Period of Significance to 1950, No Consensus
 - Staff Does Not Recommend Extending
 - Would Impact 5 Properties Constructed Between 1943 and 1950:
 - 4732 Panorama Drive (Minimal Traditional, 1949)
 - 4750 Panorama Drive (Custom Ranch, 1950)
 - 4752 Panorama Drive (Custom Ranch, 1948)

- 4761 Panorama Drive (Minimal Traditional, 1948)
- 4788 Panorama Drive (Tract Ranch, 1947)



Public Requests to Reclassify to Contributing



2206 Adams Avenue Mission Revival Bungalow Court, 1926 Staff Recommendation: Non-Contributing Due to Window Replacements in Altered Openings



Public Requests to Reclassify to Contributing



2226 Adams Avenue (Behind 2224 Adams Avenue) Craftsman, 1926 Staff Recommendation: Open to Reclassification, Need to Evaluate in More Detail Prepare Survey Form



4737 Panorama Drive Spanish Eclectic, 1926 Staff Recommendation: Non-Contributing Due to Addition of Shed Roof Cover Over Historically Open Porch



Process to Date



HRB Policy Subcommittee	July 10, 2017	Reviewed Context, Statement of Significance, Period of Significance and Boundary and Forwarded the Nomination on for Processing
Property Owner Workshop	July 29, 2017	Informed Property Owners of the District Nomination, the Process, the Responsibilities and Benefits of Designation and Answered Questions
Property Owner Polling	July 30 th – August 15 th 2017	 Polled Property Owners to Determine Level of Support 47 of 86 Responded (55%) 34 Support (72% of Respondents, 40% of Total) 9 Oppose (19% of Respondents, 10% of Total) 4 Neutral (9% of Respondents, 5% of Total) Property Owners May Continue to Respond and Staff Will Provide an Update at the Next Hearing.



Staff Recommendation

- 1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;
- 2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
- 3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
- 4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance of 1907-1942, with or without further direction;
- 5. Consider the classification of 61 properties as Contributing Resources, as identified in the Staff Report
- 6. Consider the classification of 28 properties as Non-Contributing Resources, as identified in the Staff Report
- 7. Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.





Consider the classification of the following 61 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	St #	Street Name	APN	St #	Street Name	APN
2112	Adams Avenue	4381622700	4705	Panorama Drive	4381622600	4762	Panorama Drive	4381502500
2120	Adams Avenue	4381622400	4709	Panorama Drive	4381622500	4769	Panorama Drive	4381611500
2128	Adams Avenue	4381622300	4711	Panorama Drive	4381622200	4770	Panorama Drive	4381502600
2220	Adams Avenue	4381621800	4712	Panorama Drive	4381500600	4773	Panorama Drive	4381611700
2230	Adams Avenue	4381621500	4714	Panorama Drive	4381500700	4774	Panorama Drive	4381502700
2242	Adams Avenue	4381621400	4715	Panorama Drive	4381620100	4775	Panorama Drive	4381611800
2320	Adams Avenue	4381503700	4716	Panorama Drive	4381500800	4776	Panorama Drive	4381502800
2203	Cliff Street	4381620300	4717	Panorama Drive	4381620200	4778	Panorama Drive	4381502900
2204	Cliff Street	4381610200	4718	Panorama Drive	4381500900	4780	Panorama Drive	4381503000
2209	Cliff Street	4381620400	4724	Panorama Drive	4381501100	4781	Panorama Drive	4381612100
2216	Cliff Street	4381610100	4727	Panorama Drive	4381610300	4784	Panorama Drive	4381503200
2219	Cliff Street	4381620500	4731	Panorama Drive	4381610400	4785	Panorama Drive	4381620900
2225	Cliff Street	4381620600	4734	Panorama Drive	4381501500	4791	Panorama Drive	4381621100
2229	Cliff Street	4381620700	4735	Panorama Drive	4381610600	4792	Panorama Drive	4381503400
2230	Cliff Street	4381612000	4740	Panorama Drive	4381501800	4793	Panorama Drive	4381621200
2232	Cliff Street	4381612200	4741	Panorama Drive	4381610900	4794-4796	Panorama Drive	4381504200
2235	Cliff Street	4381620800	4744	Panorama Drive	4381501900	4795	Panorama Drive	4381621300
2242	Cliff Street	4381612300	4747	Panorama Drive	4381611000	4797	Panorama Drive	4381621600
2252	Cliff Street	4381612400	4751	Panorama Drive	4381611100	4798	Panorama Drive	4381503800
4701	Panorama Drive	4381622800	4756	Panorama Drive	4381502300			
4704	Panorama Drive	4381500400	4760	Panorama Drive	4381502400			



Consider the classification of the following 28 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	St #	Street Name	APN
	Adams Avenue	4381504100	4737	Panorama Drive	4381610700
2060	Adams Avenue	4381500200	4738	Panorama Drive	4381501700
2138	Adams Avenue	4381622100	4739	Panorama Drive	4381610800
2154	Adams Avenue	4381622000	4748	Panorama Drive	4381502000
2206	Adams Avenue	4381621900	4750	Panorama Drive	4381502100
2224	Adams Avenue	4381621700	4752	Panorama Drive	4381502200
4702	Panorama Drive	4381500300	4755	Panorama Drive	4381611200
4706	Panorama Drive	4381500500	4761	Panorama Drive	4381611300
4720	Panorama Drive	4381501000	4767	Panorama Drive	4381611400
4726	Panorama Drive	4381501200	4771	Panorama Drive	4381611600
4730	Panorama Drive	4381501300	4779	Panorama Drive	4381611900
4732	Panorama Drive	4381501400	4782	Panorama Drive	4381503100
4733	Panorama Drive	4381610500	4788	Panorama Drive	4381503300
4736	Panorama Drive	4381501600	4789	Panorama Drive	4381621000



Properties within Expanded Period of Significance



4732 Panorama Drive

Minimal Traditional, 1949 Property Owner Neutral Staff Recommendation: Non-Contributing (Enlarged Window on Front Façade)



4750 Panorama Drive

Custom Ranch, 1950 Property Owner Supports if Period of Significance Extended Staff Recommendation: Contributing



Properties within Expanded Period of Significance



4752 Panorama Drive

Custom Ranch, 1948 Property Owner Supports Staff Recommendation: Non-Contributing (Aluminum Siding)



4761 Panorama Drive Minimal Traditional, 1948 Property Owner Supports if Period of Significance Extended Staff Recommendation: Contributing



Properties within Expanded Period of Significance



4788 Panorama Drive

Tract Ranch, 1947 No Response from Property Owner Staff Recommendation: Contributing