

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF AUGUST 24, 2017
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 1:00 PM

Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Tim Hutter	Present
2 nd Vice-Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Boardmember	Andrew Bowen	Present
Boardmember	Charlie Colvin	Present
Boardmember	Diana Cordileone	Present
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Present
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Present
Boardmember	Cindy Stankowski	Present
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present <i>arrived at 1:01PM</i>
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Elyse Lowe, Deputy Director
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner, Board Liaison
Sonnier Francisco, Senior Planner
Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner
Suzanne Segur, Associate Planner

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR July 27, 2017

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR JULY 27, 2017 AS WRITTEN

Seconded by Boardmember Harleman

Vote: 11-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT

Dr. Paul Chance – Presidio’s 250th Birthday

Alijandra Mogilner, Ph.D. – Presidio International Tourism

Abel Silvas – Presidio Burials

Kiley Wallace –Book on “San Diego’s Kensington” (Images of America)

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION

- **GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Items 5, 6 7, 9 and 10
- ✓ Secretary of Interior Standards – 2017 Update
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

- **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

Boardmember Stankowski would like add the Presidio Archaeological Collections to the agenda for the next Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meeting,

B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

- **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Pitman has a conflict of interest for Item 6-1525-1537 Union Street and will recuse himself from any discussion and vote.

- **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

- **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

C. STAFF REPORT

- It is my pleasure to welcome New Boardmembers Andrew Bowen and Charlie Colvin

Andrew Bowen: Mr. Bowen is a principal architect with KPA Associates, Inc., where he markets the company's facility improvements work while providing forensic architecture services to a wide range of clients. He helps to resolve construction defect litigation by meticulous analysis of architecture, building codes, general construction, as well as by devising cost-effective methods of repair. Since he joined the firm in 1988, he has overseen more than 100 projects and has evaluated more than 7,000 residential units. His architectural experience in the public sector includes service in the Planning Department of Oakland, the San Francisco Redevelopment Agency, and the New York City Community Development Agency. A founding member of the AIA San Diego's Preservation Committee, Mr. Bowen has restored Craftsman-style homes in Mission Hills and Golden Hill. He received his bachelor's degree from Stanford University and his master of architecture degree from the University of California, Berkeley. Mr. Bowen serves as an Architect on the Historical Resources Board.

Charlie Colvin: Mr. Colvin is a principal at BWE where he oversees a variety of structural engineering projects in almost all code acceptable structural mediums from wood and masonry to structural steel and light-gage metal. He has provided expertise on design, construction administration and project management to many project types, including military, commercial, civic, and residential including projects with historical designation. He has investigated many structural failures and deficiencies, and implemented plans for retrofit or repair that meet both safety standards and cost objectives. Mr. Colvin as a member of the Structural Engineers

Association of San Diego and California, as well as the Earthquake Engineering Research Institute. He received his bachelor's degree in structural engineering from University of California, San Diego. Mr. Colvin serves as a public member on the Historical Resources Board.

Deputy Director Update:

- Introduced new Senior Planner, Sonnier Francisco.

D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUT

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, September 6, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held Monday, September 11, 2017 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Service. The next regularly scheduled Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meeting will be held on Monday, November 13, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

E. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES

The applicant for Item 9 – 1740 Upas Street is requesting a 60-day continuance.

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO CONTINUE ITEM 9-1740 UPAS STREET FOR 60-DAYS

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 11-0-0

Motion Passes

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

ITEM 7 – HERBERT AND ALEXINA CHILDS/THOMAS L. SHEPHERD HOUSE

ITEM 8 – HENRY CLYDE WALTERS SPEC HOUSE #1

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE ITEMS 7 AND 8 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 11-0-0

Motion Passes

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – WILLIAM AND CARRIE OLD BUNGALOW COURT

Applicant: Atlas at 30th Street LLC represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 2002-2010 30th Street, 92104, Golden Hill Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2002-2010 30th Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the William and Carrie Old Bungalow Court located at 2002-2010 30th Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1948 under HRB Criteria A and C.

Report Number: HRB 17-047

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

ITEM 7 – HERBERT AND ALEXINA CHILDS/THOMAS L. SHEPHERD HOUSE

Applicant: Laughlin/Sage Family Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian and Brian F. Smith and Associates

Location: 210 Westbourne Street, 92037, La Jolla Community, Council District 1 (**1247 1-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 210 Westbourne Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Herbert and Alexina Childs/Thomas L. Shepherd House located at 210 Westbourne Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1950 to 1971 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 17-049

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 8 – HENRY CLYDE WALTERS SPEC HOUSE #1

Applicant: Michael and Rebecca Roberts represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 2726 Gregory Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 7-F**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 2726 Gregory Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry Clyde Waters Spec House #1 located at 2726 Gregory Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-050

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

ITEM 9 – PARK GARDEN APARTMENTS/HOMER DELAWIE AND LLOYD RUOCCO BUILDING

Applicant: Upas Park HOA represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 1740 Upas Street, 92103, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-C**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1740 Upas Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Park Garden Apartments/Homer Delawie and Lloyd Ruocco Building located at 1740 Upas Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1960 under HRB Criterion D.

Report Number: HRB 17-051

ITEM WAS CONTINUED FOR 60-DAYS AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT.

ITEM 10 – VALLE VISTA TERRACE HISTORIC DISTRICT (1ST HEARING)

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning Department

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, which includes 89 parcels addressed on Panorama Drive, Cliff Street, and the north side of Adams Avenue between 2060 and 2320 Adams.; North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 3-C; 3-D**)

Description: First hearing to consider the designation of the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; provide direction to staff regarding the content of the nomination, including the district boundary, historical context, statement of significance, period of significance, and classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the district nomination is complete based upon this direction; and forward to a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Staff Recommendation: At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Accept the proposed District Boundary, with or without further direction;
2. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
3. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance, with or without further direction;
4. Accept the proposed Period of Significance of 1907-1942, with or without further direction;
5. Consider the classification of the following 61 properties as Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	HRB Site #	Date	Style	Status Code
2112	Adams Avenue	4381622700		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2120	Adams Avenue	4381622400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2128	Adams Avenue	4381622300		1916	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2220	Adams Avenue	4381621800		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2230	Adams Avenue	4381621500		1914	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2242	Adams Avenue	4381621400	362	1914	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
2320	Adams Avenue	4381503700		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2203	Cliff Street	4381620300	581	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
2204	Cliff Street	4381610200		1909	Craftsman Bungalow/Tudor Revival	5D1
2209	Cliff Street	4381620400		1922	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2216	Cliff Street	4381610100		1909	Craftsman Bungalow/Tudor Revival	5D1
2219	Cliff Street	4381620500		1921	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2225	Cliff Street	4381620600		1921	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2229	Cliff Street	4381620700		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
2230	Cliff Street	4381612000	524	1913	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
2232	Cliff Street	4381612200		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2235	Cliff Street	4381620800		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
2242	Cliff Street	4381612300		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2252	Cliff Street	4381612400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4701	Panorama Drive	4381622800		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4704	Panorama Drive	4381500400		1909	Mission Revival	5D1
4705	Panorama Drive	4381622600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4709	Panorama Drive	4381622500		1927	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4711	Panorama Drive	4381622200		1926	Tudor Revival	5D1
4712	Panorama Drive	4381500600		1940	Minimal Traditional	5D1

St #	Street Name	APN	HRB Site #	Date	Style	Status Code
4714	Panorama Drive	4381500700		1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4715	Panorama Drive	4381620100		1924	Tudor Revival	5D1
4716	Panorama Drive	4381500800		1926	Tudor Revival	5D1
4717	Panorama Drive	4381620200		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4718	Panorama Drive	4381500900		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4724	Panorama Drive	4381501100		1915	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4727	Panorama Drive	4381610300		1926	Craftsman/Colonial Revival	5D1
4731	Panorama Drive	4381610400		1925	Mission Revival	5D1
4734	Panorama Drive	4381501500		1920	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4735	Panorama Drive	4381610600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4740	Panorama Drive	4381501800		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4741	Panorama Drive	4381610900	769	1926	Spanish Eclectic	5S1
4744	Panorama Drive	4381501900		1908	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1
4747	Panorama Drive	4381611000	1121	1926	Tudor Revival	5S1
4751	Panorama Drive	4381611100		1935	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4756	Panorama Drive	4381502300		1942	Custom Ranch	5D1
4760	Panorama Drive	4381502400		1934	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4762	Panorama Drive	4381502500		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4769	Panorama Drive	4381611500	1107	1911	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
4770	Panorama Drive	4381502600		1940	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4773	Panorama Drive	4381611700	1016	1926	Spanish Colonial Revival	5S1
4774	Panorama Drive	4381502700	1230	1920	Dutch Colonial Revival	5S1
4775	Panorama Drive	4381611800		1927	Mission Revival	5D1
4776	Panorama Drive	4381502800		1923	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4778	Panorama Drive	4381502900		1914	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1
4780	Panorama Drive	4381503000	675	1914	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
4781	Panorama Drive	4381612100		1921	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4784	Panorama Drive	4381503200		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4785	Panorama Drive	4381620900	538	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
4791	Panorama Drive	4381621100		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4792	Panorama Drive	4381503400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4793	Panorama Drive	4381621200		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4794-4796	Panorama Drive	4381504200		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4795	Panorama Drive	4381621300		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4797	Panorama Drive	4381621600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4798	Panorama Drive	4381503800		1912	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1

6. Consider the classification of the following 28 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
	Adams Avenue	4381504100	N/A	Vacant	6Z
2060	Adams Avenue	4381500200	N/A	Vacant	6Z
2138	Adams Avenue	4381622100	1980	No Style	6Z
2154	Adams Avenue	4381622000	c.1956	No Style	6Z
2206	Adams Avenue	4381621900	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L
2224	Adams Avenue	4381621700	1912	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4702	Panorama Drive	4381500300	N/A	Vacant	6Z

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
4706	Panorama Drive	4381500500	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4720	Panorama Drive	4381501000	1915	No Style	6Z
4726	Panorama Drive	4381501200	1966	Post and Beam	5S3
4730	Panorama Drive	4381501300	1927	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4732	Panorama Drive	4381501400	1949	Minimal Traditional	6Z
4733	Panorama Drive	4381610500	1923	Spanish Eclectic	6L
4736	Panorama Drive	4381501600	1920	No Style	6Z
4737	Panorama Drive	4381610700	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L
4738	Panorama Drive	4381501700	2013	Neo-Craftsman	6Z
4739	Panorama Drive	4381610800	1926	Neo-Spanish Eclectic	6Z
4748	Panorama Drive	4381502000	1953	No Style	6Z
4750	Panorama Drive	4381502100	1950	Custom Ranch	6Z
4752	Panorama Drive	4381502200	1948	Custom Ranch	6Z
4755	Panorama Drive	4381611200	1926	Neo-Contemporary	6Z
4761	Panorama Drive	4381611300	1948	Minimal Traditional	6Z
4767	Panorama Drive	4381611400	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L
4771	Panorama Drive	4381611600	2004	Neo-Spanish Eclectic	6Z
4779	Panorama Drive	4381611900	1921	Custom Ranch	6Z
4782	Panorama Drive	4381503100	1922	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4788	Panorama Drive	4381503300	1947	Tract Ranch	6Z
4789	Panorama Drive	4381621000	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	6L

- Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Report Number: HRB 17-052

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

Testimony Received:

In Favor: Ron Buckley, Priscilla Ann Berge, Dionné Carlson, Aimee Hayes, Bruce Coons, Ernestine Bonn, Cynthia Thorsen

In Opposition: Kathleen Hay

STAFF RECOMMENDATION ITEM 1:

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO ACCEPT THE PROPOSED BOUNDARY PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Pitman

Vote: 11-0-0

Motion Passes

STAFF RECOMMENDATION ITEM 4

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER PITMAN TO ACCEPT THE PROPOSED PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION FOR CRITERION A

Seconded by Vice-Chair Hutter

Vote: 7-4-0

Motion Passes

(Coyle, Bowen, Stankowski, Cordileone)

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO CHANGE THE PERIOD OF SIGNIFICANCE FOR CRITERION C TO 1907-1966

Seconded by Boardmember Bowen

Vote: 6-5-0

Motion Passes

(Hutter, McCullough, Woods, Winter, Harleman)

STAFF RECOMMENDATION ITEMS 2 AND 3:

BOARD ACTION:

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO REQUEST ADDITIONAL INFORMATION FOR ITEMS 2 AND 3 RELATIVE TO CRITERION C AND LOOKING AT IT IN TERMS OF THE HISTORICAL CONTEXT, THE ESSENTIAL BUILDOUT OF THE VALLE VISTA TERRACE SUBDIVISION INCLUDING ITS GEOGRAPHICAL AND PHYSICAL CONTEXT, ITS STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE RELATING TO THE ARCHITECTURAL DIVERSITY THAT'S ALREADY DISCUSSED WITH MAYBE A LITTLE BIT MORE MEAT WHERE IT IS NEEDED ON THE MINIMAL TRADITIONAL, THE CUSTOM RANCH AND INTEGRATING THE POST AND BEAM DISCUSSION.

Seconded by Boardmember Bowen

Vote: 6-5-0

Motion Passes

(Hutter, Woods, Colvin, Winter, Harleman)

REMINDER:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE:

Thursday, September 28, 2017

LOCATION:

City Concourse Building,
North Terrace Rooms

MEETING ADJOURNED AT 5:09PM