

Historical Resources Board

AGENDA

PLEASE NOTE CHANGE OF MEETING TIME BELOW

THURSDAY, OCTOBER 26, 2017 AT 10:00 AM

NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CITY CONCOURSE 202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101

If a Sign Language Interpreter, aids for the visually impaired, or Alternative Listening Devices (ALD's) are required, please contact the Secretary for the Historical Resources Board at (619) 533-6301 at least five (5) working days prior to the meeting to insure availability.

Members of the Public are advised that Historical Resources Boardmembers may be unable to thoroughly review and consider materials delivered the day of the hearing.

If you would like to review agenda materials that are not available on our website, please contact the Secretary for the Historical Resources Board at (619) 533-6301 to make an appointment.

ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR September 28, 2017

ITEM 2 - NON-AGENDA PUBLIC COMMENT

ISSUES WITHIN THE JURISDICTION OF THE HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD NOT PREVIOUSLY HEARD OR ON THE AGENDA. A REQUEST TO SPEAK SHOULD BE SUBMITTED TO THE HEARING RECORDING SECRETARY AT THE TIME OF THE MEETING.

NOTE: 3.0 MINUTES TIME PER SPEAKER.

ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

- A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information
 - Absences
 - Other General Information
- B. Conflict of Interest Declarations
- C. Staff Report
- D. Subcommittee Report Out
 - Policy
 - Design Assistance
 - Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources
- E. Requests for Continuances or Withdrawals

ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA

The Chair may entertain a motion by any Boardmember to approve any agenda item as a consent item when no speaker slips have been submitted in favor or in opposition to the item. Items approved on consent are approved in accordance with the staff's recommendation as reflected on the agenda and described in the Staff Report to the Historical Resources Board, unless otherwise noted in the motion.

The following items are proposed to be placed on the consent agenda:

ITEM 5 - PARK GARDEN APARTMENTS/LLOYD RUOCCO AND HOMER DELAWIE BUILDING

ITEM 6 - JONES HOUSE RELOCATION

ITEM 7 - AUGUSTUS AND LOUISE COSGROVE/CHRIS COSGROVE HOUSE

ITEM 8 - FRANCES WADSWORTH HOUSE

ITEM 9 - ROBERT KELLY HOUSE

ITEM 10 - CASA DESCANSO

ACTION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – PARK GARDEN APARTMENTS/LLOYD RUOCCO AND HOMER DELAWIE BUILDING Continued from August 2017

Applicant: Upas Park HOA represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 1740 Upas Street, 92103, North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 6-C)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1740 Upas Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Park Garden Apartments/Lloyd Ruocco and Homer Delawie Building located at 1740 Upas Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1960 under HRB Criterion D.

Report Number: Staff memo dated October 12, 2017 and HRB 17-051

ITEM 6 - JONES HOUSE RELOCATION

Applicant: Scripps Health represented by Heritage Architecture & Planning

Location: 4040 5th Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 5-A)

<u>Description</u> Review and make a recommendation to the appropriate decision-making authority on those aspects of the development permit pertaining to designated historical resources.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Recommend to the Planning Commission adoption of the mitigation measures and findings associated with the site development permit as presented or recommend inclusion of additional permit conditions related to designated historical resources.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Recommend to the Planning Commission approval of the Site Development Permit findings and mitigation measures for the relocation of the designated historical resource located at 4040 Fifth Avenue (HRB Site #939, Henry B. Jones House) as presented.

Report Number: HRB 17-070

ITEM 7 - AUGUSTUS AND LOUISE COSGROVE/CHRIS COSGROVE HOUSE

Applicant: Thomas and Sandra Flinn represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 3202 Curtis Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2 (1268 7-C)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 3202 Curtis Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Augustus and Louise Cosgrove/Chris Cosgrove House located at 3202 Curtis Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1928 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: HRB 17-061

ITEM 8 - FRANCES WADSWORTH HOUSE

Applicant: Steven Kolbert represented by Legacy 106, Inc.

Location: 4435 New Jersey Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (1269 4-B)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 4435 New Jersey Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Frances Wadsworth House located at 4435 New Jersey Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1933 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-062

ITEM 9 - ROBERT KELLY HOUSE

Applicant: Robert and Melinda Murphy Trust represented by Allen Hazard & Janet O'Dea

<u>Location</u>: 1708 W. Montecito Way and 4154 Stephens Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-H**)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 1708 W. Montecito Way and 4154 Stephens Street as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Robert Kelly House located at 1708 W. Montecito Way and 4154 Stephens Street as a historical resource with a period of signficiance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C.

Report Number: HRB 17-063

ITEM 10 - CASA DESCANSO

Applicant Gregory and Shannon Knuth represented by IS Architecture

<u>Location</u>: 5201 Marlborough Drive, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 (1269 2-G)

<u>Description</u>: Consider the designation of the property located at 5201 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: Designate the Casa Descanso located at 5201 Marlborough Drive as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage that was later modified with a flat-roof second-story pre-1961 addition.

Report Number: HRB 17-064

ITEM 11 - SOUTH PARK HISTORIC DISTRICT (2nd HEARING)

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning Department

<u>Location</u>: Various addresses within the intensive survey area, which is bounded roughly by 28th Street to the west, Elm Street to the north, 31st Street to the East and A Street to the south (excluding 3017-3091 Elm Street, 1635 and 1639-1747 Fern Street, 1634-1729 Grove Street, 1670-1740 31st Street, and the Albert Einstein Charter Academy); Golden Hill Community, Council District 3

 $\underline{\text{Description}} : \textbf{Second hearing in the process to designate the South Park Historic District as a Historical Resource.}$

<u>Today's Action</u>: Review the South Park Historic District nomination; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; and designate the South Park Historic District with identified contributing and non-contributing resources, or do not designate the South Park Historic District.

Staff Recommendation: At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

- 1. Designate the South Park Historic District under HRB Criterion A as a special element of Golden Hill's historical and architectural development.
- 2. Designate the 295 Contributing Resources identified in the <u>Draft Resolution</u> (Attachment 1) under HRB Criterion F.
- 3. Classify the 112 properties identified in the <u>Draft Resolution</u> (Attachment 1) as Non-Contributing Resources to the District.

Report Number: HRB 17-065

ITEM 12 - VALLE VISTA TERRACE HISTORIC DISTRICT (SECOND 1st HEARING)

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning Department

<u>Location</u>: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, which includes 89 parcels addressed on Panorama Drive, Cliff Street, and the north side of Adams Avenue between 2060 and 2320 Adams; North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-C; 3-D)

<u>Description</u>: Second First hearing to consider the designation of the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District as a Historical Resource.

<u>Today's Action</u>: Review the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination; take public testimony; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; provide direction to staff regarding the content of the nomination, including the historical context, statement of significance, period of significance, and classification of all contributing and non-contributing resources; determine whether the district nomination is complete based upon this direction; and forward to a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

<u>Staff Recommendation</u>: At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

- 1. Accept the proposed Historical Context, with or without further direction;
- 2. Accept the proposed Statement of Significance in regard to HRB Criterion C and the associated Period of Significance of 1907-1950, with or without further direction;
- 3. Consider the classification of the following 65 properties as Contributing Resources:

			HRB			Status
St #	Street Name	APN	Site #	Date	Style	Code
2112	Adams Avenue	4381622700		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2120	Adams Avenue	4381622400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2128	Adams Avenue	4381622300		1916	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2220	Adams Avenue	4381621800		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2226	Adams Avenue	4381621700		1926	Craftsman	5D1
2230	Adams Avenue	4381621500		1914	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2242	Adams Avenue	4381621400	362	1914	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
2320	Adams Avenue	4381503700		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2203	Cliff Street	4381620300	581	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
2204	Cliff Street	4381610200		1909	Craftsman Bungalow/Tudor Revival	5D1
2209	Cliff Street	4381620400		1922	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2216	Cliff Street	4381610100		1909	Craftsman Bungalow/Tudor Revival	5D1
2219	Cliff Street	4381620500		1921	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2225	Cliff Street	4381620600		1921	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2229	Cliff Street	4381620700		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
2230	Cliff Street	4381612000	524	1913	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
2232	Cliff Street	4381612200		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2235	Cliff Street	4381620800		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
2242	Cliff Street	4381612300		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2252	Cliff Street	4381612400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4701	Panorama Drive	4381622800		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4704	Panorama Drive	4381500400		1909	Mission Revival	5D1
4705	Panorama Drive	4381622600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4709	Panorama Drive	4381622500		1927	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4711	Panorama Drive	4381622200		1926	Tudor Revival	5D1
4712	Panorama Drive	4381500600		1940	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4714	Panorama Drive	4381500700		1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4715	Panorama Drive	4381620100		1924	Tudor Revival	5D1
4716	Panorama Drive	4381500800		1926	Tudor Revival	5D1

			HRB			Status
St #	Street Name	APN	Site #		7	Code
4717	Panorama Drive				Mission Revival	5D1
4718	Panorama Drive				Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4724	Panorama Drive	1			Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4727	Panorama Drive				Craftsman/Colonial Revival	5D1
4731	Panorama Drive				Mission Revival	5D1
4734	Panorama Drive				Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4735	Panorama Drive				Mission Revival	5D1
4740	Panorama Drive	4381501800			Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4741	Panorama Drive	4381610900	769		Spanish Eclectic	5S1
4744	Panorama Drive			1908	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1
4747	Panorama Drive	4381611000	1121		Tudor Revival	5S1
4750	Panorama Drive	4381502100		1950	Custom Ranch	5D1
4751	Panorama Drive	4381611100		1935	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4756	Panorama Drive	4381502300		1942	Custom Ranch	5D1
4760	Panorama Drive	4381502400		1934	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4761	Panorama Drive	4381611300		1948	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4762	Panorama Drive	4381502500		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4769	Panorama Drive	4381611500	1107	1911	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
4770	Panorama Drive	4381502600		1940	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4773	Panorama Drive	4381611700	1016	1926	Spanish Colonial Revival	5S1
4774	Panorama Drive	4381502700	1230	1920	Dutch Colonial Revival	5S1
4775	Panorama Drive	4381611800		1927	Mission Revival	5D1
4776	Panorama Drive	4381502800		1923	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4778	Panorama Drive	4381502900		1914	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1
4780	Panorama Drive	4381503000	675	1914	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
4781	Panorama Drive	4381612100		1921	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4784	Panorama Drive	4381503200		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4785	Panorama Drive	4381620900	538	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
4788	Panorama Drive	4381503300		1947	Tract Ranch	5D1
4791	Panorama Drive	4381621100		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4792	Panorama Drive	4381503400			Mission Revival	5D1
4793	Panorama Drive	4381621200		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4794-4796	Panorama Drive	4381504200		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4795	Panorama Drive	4381621300		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4797	Panorama Drive			1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4798	Panorama Drive	4381503800		1912	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1

4. Consider the classification of the following 25 properties as Non-Contributing Resources:

					Status
St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Code
	Adams Avenue	4381504100	N/A	Vacant	6Z
2060	Adams Avenue	4381500200	N/A	Vacant	6Z
2138	Adams Avenue	4381622100	1980	No Style	6Z
2154	Adams Avenue	4381622000	c.1956	No Style	6Z
2206	Adams Avenue	4381621900	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L
2224	Adams Avenue*	4381621700	1912	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4702	Panorama Drive	4381500300	N/A	Vacant	6Z
4706	Panorama Drive	4381500500	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	6L

					Status	
St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Code	
4720	Panorama Drive	4381501000	1915	No Style	6Z	
4726	Panorama Drive	4381501200	1966	Post and Beam	5S3	
4730	Panorama Drive	4381501300	1927	Craftsman Bungalow	6L	
4732	Panorama Drive	4381501400	1949	Minimal Traditional	6Z	
4733	Panorama Drive	4381610500	1923	Spanish Eclectic	6L	
4736	Panorama Drive	4381501600	1920	No Style	6Z	
4737	Panorama Drive	4381610700	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L	
4738	Panorama Drive	4381501700	2013	Neo-Craftsman	6Z	
4739	Panorama Drive	4381610800	1926	Neo-Spanish Eclectic	6Z	
4748	Panorama Drive	4381502000	1953	No Style	6Z	
4752	Panorama Drive	4381502200	1948	Custom Ranch	6Z	
4755	Panorama Drive	4381611200	1926	Neo-Contemporary	6Z	
4767	Panorama Drive	4381611400	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L	
4771	Panorama Drive	4381611600	2004	Neo-Spanish Eclectic	6Z	
4779	Panorama Drive	4381611900	1921	Custom Ranch	6Z	
4782	Panorama Drive	4381503100	1922	Craftsman Bungalow	6L	
4789	Panorama Drive	4381621000	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	6L	
*Shares a parcel with 2226 Adams Avenue, which is a contributing resource.						

5. Find that the nomination is complete based upon this direction, and direct staff to docket the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination for a second HRB hearing for designation as a historic district. If the Board cannot find that the nomination is complete, it should be returned to staff with direction.

Report Number: HRB 17-066

ADJOURNMENT

ENCLOSURES (with printed copy only):

Staff Reports and/or supporting information for Items 5 through 12.

REMINDERS:

NEXT BOARD MEETING DATE: Thursday, November 16, 2017

LOCATION: City Concourse Building, North Terrace Rooms

NEXT SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING DATES (subject to change with appropriate notice)

Design Assistance Subcommittee meets the first Wednesday of the month at 4:00 PM in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held Wednesday, November 1, 2017.

Policy Subcommittee meets the second Monday of the month at 3:00 PM in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on Monday, November 13, 2017.

Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meets quarterly on the second Monday of the month at 4:00 PM in the Training Room on the 4th floor of Development Services. The next regularly scheduled meeting will be held on Monday, November 13, 2017.

All subcommittee meetings are held at Development Services (City Operations Building) located at 1222 First Avenue, San Diego.