

THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED:	November 2, 2017	REPORT NO. HRB-17-075
HEARING DATE:	November 16, 2017	
SUBJECT:	ITEM #7 – Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1	
RESOURCE INFO:	California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link	
APPLICANT:	David Thomas; represented by Scott A. Moon Associates	njian and Brian F. Smith and
LOCATION:	3623-3627 31 st Street, North Park Community APN 452-263-0200	γ, Council District 3
DESCRIPTION:	Consider the designation of the Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1 located at 3623-3627 31 st Street as a historical resource.	

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1 located at 3623-3627 31st Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the garage and the rear dwelling, 3623 31st Street, constructed in 1940. This recommendation is based on the following finding:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of characterdefining features of the Tudor Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched roof with parapeted gables; massive entry porch with castellated parapet and rounded arch openings; stucco exterior; and tall, narrow, multi-lite wood windows.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with a proposed building modification or demolition of a structure of 45 years or more, consistent with San Diego Municipal Code Section <u>143.0212</u>. The property contains two dwelling structures and a garage located on an interior lot.

The property was located within the boundary of the 2016 North Park Survey Report but was not identified in the survey because the property was not evaluated.

The historic name of the resource, the Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the Klicka Mortgage Company, who constructed the house as a speculation house.

<u>ANALYSIS</u>

A Historical Resource Research Report (HRRR) was prepared by Brian F. Smith and Associates, which concludes that the resource is not significant under any HRB Criteria. Staff disagrees and has found that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the <u>Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria</u>, as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

Research into the history of the property at 3623-3627 31st Street did not reveal any information to indicate that the property exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's or North Park's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION B - Is identified with persons or events significant in local, state or national history.

Research into the owners and tenants of the property at 3623-3627 31st Street did not reveal any individuals who could be considered historically significant in local, state or national history. Furthermore, no events of local, state or national significance are known to have occurred at the subject property. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion B.

CRITERION C - *Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.*

The subject property consists of a dwelling structure constructed in 1922 with a garage and a secondary dwelling unit constructed in 1940 at the rear of the property. The rear structure, 3623 31st Street, was constructed in the Minimal Traditional style and features a stucco exterior, hipped roof, a small concrete covered front porch and original wood windows. This structure is excluded from this designation because it cannot be determined a good example of the Minimal Traditional style. The current garage appears to be similar to a 1922 photo of the original garage but visual inspection and documentation indicate that the structure may have been modified at the time the rear unit was constructed. The notice of completion for 3623 31st Street indicates construction at this time included a "residence and garage as per certain agreed plans and specifications." Additionally, a seam is visible beneath the stucco to the left of the garage door indicating that the structure was modified or added to. Because the date of construction of the current garage and date of any modifications are uncertain, the garage is also not included in this designation.

The front structure, 3627 31st Street, was constructed in the Tudor Revival style and features a steeply pitched, side gable roof and a stucco exterior. The building is generally rectangular in shape with a small, wood siding clad addition at the rear and stucco chimney on the south façade. The roof also features parapeted gables. The street façade features a distinctive front porch with a

castellated parapet and serrated wing walls that extend from the corners at a forty-five degree angle. Rounded arch openings as well as narrow rectangular openings that are reminiscent of Medieval arrow slits perforate the thick porch walls. The original wood front door is flanked by two sets of tall, narrow, multi-lite wood casement windows. A featured group of three multi-lite wood windows is also present on the front façade. Other original windows on the structure are wood, single lite and double hung.

Several modifications have been made to 3627 31st Street since its construction in 1922. These modifications include the reshingling of the roof, a small rear addition constructed in 1950 and the addition of a garden window on the south façade. On the rear façade, window and door openings appear to have been modified at an unknown date. Based on a review of Google Street View, an original wood window on the south façade was removed post-2015. These modifications do not significantly impair integrity of design, materials, workmanship or feeling.

Popular in the 1920s and 1930s, Tudor Revival architecture is loosely based on a variety of late Medieval English styles and influences, but unlike some English prototypes, Tudor Revival style houses exhibit steeply pitched gable roofs that dominate the facades. Other character defining features include decorative half-timbering; tall, narrow windows, usually appearing in multiple groups and with multi-pane glazing; massive chimneys, sometimes with decorative chimney pots; entry porches with round or Tudor arches; and gable dormers. Relatively uncommon before World War I, widespread adoption of masonry veneering techniques in the 1920s accompanied a dramatic rise in the style's popularity as even the most modest examples began to closely mimic the brick and stone veneers of their English prototypes. Tudor Revival style houses usually include the use of stucco as well as wood cladding and brick or stone veneer, depending upon the subtype.

The HRRR identifies the subject property as an example of the Gothic Revival style, however this style was popular from 1840-1880, a period which ended over forty years before 3627 31st Street was constructed. The property more appropriately falls into the Tudor Revival style of the Eclectic House movement which was popular from 1890-1940. The structure most closely reflects the parapeted gable subtype of Tudor Revival architecture. The parapeted gables, castellated parapets of the porch and a lack of half-timbering are common features of this subtype. According to Virginia McAlester, this subtype was generally used in architect-designed high style buildings but after World War I less formal models, such as the subject property, were common.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The house continues to convey the historic significance of the Tudor Revival style and retains integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched roof with parapeted gables; massive entry porch with castellated parapet and rounded arch openings; stucco exterior; and tall, narrow, multi-lite wood windows. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the subject property under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

The subject property at 3623-3627 31st Street was built by the Klicka Brothers. The Klicka Brothers have not been established by the Historical Resources Board as Master Architects, Designers or Builders, and there is insufficient information to designate them as such at this time. Therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The property at 3623-3627 31st Street has not been listed on or determined eligible for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 3623-3627 31st Street is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit which allows flexibility of use; and other programs which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1 located at 3623-3627 31st Street be designated with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C as an example of the Tudor Revival style. The designation excludes the garage and the rear dwelling, 3623 31st Street, constructed in 1940.

Suzanne Segur Associate Planner

SS/el

Attachment(s):

Euge W. Lowe

Elyse W. Lowe Deputy Director Development Services Department

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 11/16/2017

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 11/16/2017, to consider the historical designation of the **Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1** (owned by David Thomas, 1815 Kinglet Court, Costa Mesa, CA 92626) located at **3623-3627 31st Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92104**, APN: **453-263-02-00**, further described as BLK 33 LOT 19 S 5 FT LOT 17 & ALL LOT 18 & N 15 FT in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1 on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Tudor Revival style and retains integrity from its 1922 period of significance. Specifically, the resource exhibits a steeply pitched roof with parapeted gables; massive entry porch with castellated parapet and rounded arch openings; stucco exterior; and tall, narrow, multi-lite wood windows. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the garage and the rear dwelling, 3623 31st Street, constructed in 1940.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY:

DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT, CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____ CORRINE NEUFFER, Deputy City Attorney