

**CITY OF SAN DIEGO  
HISTORICAL RESOURCES BOARD  
MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF NOVEMBER 16, 2017  
NORTH TERRACE ROOMS, SAN DIEGO CONCOURSE  
202 C STREET, SAN DIEGO, CA 92101**

---

**CHRONOLOGY OF THE MEETING**

The meeting was called to order by Chair McCullough at 1:04 PM

Chairperson	David McCullough	Present
Vice-Chairperson	Tim Hutter	Present
2 <sup>nd</sup> Vice-Chairperson	Courtney Ann Coyle	Present
Boardmember	Andrew Bowen	Absent
Boardmember	Charlie Colvin	Absent
Boardmember	Diana Cordileone	Present
Boardmember	Amy Harleman	Absent
Boardmember	Todd Pitman	Absent
Boardmember	Cindy Stankowski	Present
Boardmember	Mathew Winter	Present
Boardmember	Ann Woods	Present

Staff to the Board in Attendance

Alyssa Muto, Deputy Director, Planning Department  
Sonnier Francisco, Senior Planner, Board Liaison  
Kelley Stanco, Senior Planner  
Shannon Anthony, Board Secretary  
Jodie Brown, Senior Planner  
Bernie Turgeon, Senior Planner  
Camille Pekarek, Associate Planner  
Suzanne Segur, Associate Planner  
Nicole Purvis, Assistant Planner  
Cathy Dominguez, Clerical Assistant II

Legal Counsel in Attendance: Corrine Neuffer, Deputy City Attorney

**ITEM 1 - APPROVAL OF MINUTES FOR October 26, 2017**

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO APPROVE THE MINUTES FOR OCTOBER 26, 2017 AS WRITTEN.

Seconded by Boardmember Winter

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 2 - PUBLIC COMMENT**

None

**ITEM 3 - ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS**

**A. BOARD ADMINISTRATIVE MATTERS AND GENERAL INFORMATION**

• **GENERAL INFORMATION**

- ✓ Correspondence for Items 5, 6, 7, 11 and 13
- ✓ Historical Resources Board and Subcommittee Meeting Dates Memo for 2018
- ✓ Designation Handout for 2018 with Submittal Guidelines
- ✓ HRB Criteria Guidelines
- ✓ Motion and Findings Form for Historical Designation

• **GENERAL BOARD MEMBER COMMENTS**

None

**B. CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS**

• **CONFLICTS OF INTEREST**

Boardmember Winter has a conflict of interest for Item 9- Coliseum Athletic Club and will recuse himself from any discussion and vote.

Boardmember Coyle knows the owners of Item 9 Coliseum Athletic Club, but does not have a conflict on this item and it will not have any impact on her vote.

• **EX PARTE COMMUNICATIONS**

None

• **FAILURE TO VISIT DESIGNATION SITES (INCLUDING INTERIORS/PROPOSED FOR DESIGNATION)/INVOCATION OF WAIVER**

None

**C. STAFF REPORT**

• **HISTORICAL RESOURCES SECTION, DSD**

*Sonnier Francisco, HRB Liaison*

- The appeal of the Gordon B. Wells/Allen H. Hilton Bungalow Court Apartments located at 1525-1537 Union Street is tentatively scheduled to be heard by the City Council on Tuesday, December 5, 2017.
- The Historical Resources Board and Subcommittee Meeting Dates Memo for 2018 and the Designation Handout with Submittal Guidelines for 2018 have been prepared and copies are located on the side table

• **HISTORIC PRESERVATION PLANNING SECTION, PLANNING DEPARTMENT**

*Kelley Stanco, Planning Department Representative*

- Three appeals have been filed for the South Park Historic District, which was designated at last month's meeting. A date has not been set for it to be heard by the City Council; we will update you once we get more information.

**D. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT OUT**

• **POLICY**

*Report out by Sonnier Francisco*

The next regularly scheduled Policy Subcommittee meeting will be held Monday, December 11, 2017 at 3:00pm in Conference Room 4C on the 4th floor of Development Services.

• **DESIGN ASSISTANCE**

*Report out by Jodie Brown*

The Design Assistance Subcommittee last met on November 1, 2017 and the following two items were on the agenda:

- Property in Mission Hills (not designated) to discuss restoration of the front porch;
- HRB# 288-Coast Walk Trail in La Jolla; there has been some slope failure and they are looking to realign a portion of the trail.

The next regularly scheduled Design Assistance Subcommittee meeting will be held Wednesday, December 6, 2017 at 4:00pm in Conference Room 5C on the 5th floor of Development Services.

• **ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND TRIBAL CULTURAL RESOURCES**

*Report out by Suzanne Segur*

A meeting of the Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee was held on November 13<sup>th</sup>. The meeting was well attended by both members of the public and City staff. The subcommittee discussed three topics; the Native American Mortar in Cuvier Park, an update from staff on AB-52 procedures and the Presidio Archeological Collections. Planning Department staff member Myra Herrmann will discuss the following topics during her Tribal Liaison report out:

- Native American Bedrock Mortar
- AB-52
- Presidio Archeological Collections
- Other Tribal Liaison Updates

The next regularly scheduled Archaeological and Tribal Cultural Resources Subcommittee meetings will be held on Monday, February 12, 2018 at 4:00pm in the Training Room on the 4th floor of Development Services.

**E. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCES**

None

**ITEM 4 - REQUESTS FOR ITEMS TO BE PLACED ON CONSENT AGENDA**

ITEM 10 – HENRY SCHLINGER SPEC HOUSE #1

ITEM 12 – THE JUNIPER APARTMENTS

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO APPROVE ITEMS 10 AND 12 ON THE CONSENT AGENDA PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION

Seconded by Boardmember Coyle

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

---

**ACTION ITEMS**

---

**ITEM 5 – 3677-3677½ 3<sup>rd</sup> AVENUE**

Applicant: Phillip and Karen Gaitaud represented by Brian F. Smith and Associates

Location: 3673, 3675, and 3677-3677½ 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3677-3677½ 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 3677-3677½ 3<sup>rd</sup> Avenue under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-068

Staff Report by Camille Pekarek

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Phil Gaitaud

In Opposition: Dionné Carlson, Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 5–3677-3677½ 3<sup>rd</sup> AVENUE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Chair McCullough

Vote: 5-2-0

Motion Passes

*(Coyle, Woods)*

**ITEM 6 – 4025 EAGLE STREET**

Applicant: Leslie Sheppard Revocable Living Trust represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 4025 Eagle Street, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1268 5-J**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4025 Eagle Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Do not designate the property located at 4025 Eagle Street under any adopted HRB Criteria.

Report Number: HRB 17-069

Staff Report by Sonnier Francisco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Scott Moomjian, Lee Sheppard, Coleman Alguire, Kyle Sheppard Stegman, Doris Sheppard, Randy McWhorter, Sharon Gehl

In Opposition: Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons, Barry Hagar, Dionné Carlson, Deborah Pettry

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY VICE-CHAIR HUTTER TO NOT DESIGNATE ITEM 6–4025 EAGLE STREET PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Stankowski

Vote: 3-4-0

Motion Fails

*(Hutter, Winter Stankowski) - (Coyle, McCullough, Cordileone, Woods)*

**ITEM 7 – KLIKA MORTGAGE COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1**

Applicant: David Thomas represented by Scott A. Moomjian and Brian F. Smith and Associates

Location: 3623-3627 31<sup>st</sup> Street, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 (**1269 6-E**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3623-3627 31<sup>st</sup> Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Klicka Mortgage Company Spec House #1 located at 3623-3627 31<sup>st</sup> Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1922 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the garage and the rear dwelling, 3623 31<sup>st</sup> Street, constructed in 1940.

Report Number: HRB 17-075

Staff Report by Suzanne Segur

*This item was taken out of order as the fourth action item.*

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Bruce Coons, Dionné Carlson, Priscilla Ann Berge

In Opposition: Scott Moomjian, David Thomas, John Bale, Caitlin Foote, Jennifer Stropes

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO DESIGNATE ITEM 7 – KLIKA MORTGAGE COMPANY SPEC HOUSE #1 PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION WITH CLARIFICATION OF THE STYLE TYPE BY INCLUDING "TUDOR REVIVAL STYLE OF THE ECLECTIC HOUSE MOVEMENT"

Seconded by Boardmember Stankowski

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 8 – JOHN AND MARY WRIGHT HOUSE**

Applicant: NDD on 13th Street Lofts, LLC represented by Marie Burke Lia

Location: 454 13<sup>th</sup> Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 4-B**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 454 13<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the John and Mary Wright House located at 454 13<sup>th</sup> Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1881 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear addition completed in 1942.

Report Number: HRB 17-076

**Staff Report by Jodie Brown**

*This item was taken out of order as the sixth action item.*

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Amie Hayes, Soheil Nakhshab, Byron Wear, Michael Masi, Amie Hayes

In Opposition: None

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER STANKOWSKI TO DESIGNATE ITEM 8 – JOHN AND MARY WRIGHT HOUSE PER STAFF'S RECOMMENDATION.

Seconded by Boardmember Cordileone

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 9 –COLISEUM ATHLETIC CLUB**

Applicant: SD Coliseum MQ, LLC <LF> Navarra 1401-85 E Street-LP represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 1485 E Street, 92101, Downtown Community, Council District 3 **(1289 3-C)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 1485 E Street as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Coliseum Athletic Club located at 1485 E Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1924-1979 under HRB Criterion A.

Report Number: HRB 17-071

*This item was taken out of order as the third action item.*

ITEM WAS WITHDRAWN AT THE REQUEST OF THE APPLICANT

**ITEM 10 – HENRY SCHLINGER SPEC HOUSE #1**

Applicant: Charles and Emily Lough represented by Scott A. Moomjian

Location: 4301 Hilldale Road, 92116, Kensington-Talmadge Community, Council District 9 **(1269 2-H)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 4301 Hilldale Road as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the Henry Schlinger Spec House #1 located at 4301 Hilldale Road as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the rear patio enclosure at the south elevation, and the detached pool house/dressing room at the south end of the property.

Report Number: HRB 17-072

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 11 – DAVID O. DRYDEN SPEC HOUSE #3 [HRB# 1008-068]**

Applicant: William and Karen Strack

Location: 3543 Pershing Avenue, 92104, North Park Community, Council District 3 **(1269 6-D)**

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 3543 Pershing Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate the David O. Dryden Spec House #3 located at 3543 Pershing Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1917 under HRB Criteria C and D.

Report Number: Staff memo dated November 2, 2017 and HRB 17-018

*This item was taken out of order as the fifth action item.*

**BOARD ACTION:**

MOTION BY BOARDMEMBER COYLE TO CONTINUE ITEM 11 –3543 PERSHING AVENUE TO THE JANUARY 2018 HRB HEARING.

Seconded by Boardmember Woods

Vote: 7-0-0

Motion Passes

**ITEM 12 – THE JUNIPER APARTMENTS**

Applicant: Robert and Ivonne Webb Family Living Trust 08-21-92 represented by Johnson & Johnson

Location: 210-220 Juniper Street and 2321 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue, 92101, Uptown Community, Council District 3 (**1289 1-A**)

Description: Consider the designation of the property located at 210-220 Juniper Street and 2321 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue as a historical resource.

Today's Action: Designate the property as a historical resource under adopted designation criteria, or do not designate.

Staff Recommendation: Designate The Juniper Apartments located at 210-220 Juniper Street and 2321 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1913 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached two story stucco clad building located at the rear northeast corner of the property.

Report Number: HRB 17-074

ITEM PASSED ON CONSENT

**ITEM 13 – VALLE VISTA TERRACE HISTORIC DISTRICT (2<sup>nd</sup> HEARING)**

Applicant: City of San Diego, Planning Department

Location: Various addresses within the intensive survey area boundaries, which includes 89 parcels addressed on Panorama Drive, Cliff Street, and the north side of Adams Avenue between 2060 and 2320 Adams; North Park Community, Council District 3 (1269 3-C; 3-D)

Description: Second hearing in the process to designate the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District as a Historical Resource.

Today's Action: Review the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District nomination; consider the level of owner support for the establishment of the district; and designate the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District with identified contributing and non-contributing resources, or do not designate the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District.

Staff Recommendation: At this time, staff recommends that the Board:

1. Designate the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District under HRB Criterion A with a period of significance of 1907-1942 as a special element of University Heights' historical and architectural development.
2. Designate the Valle Vista Terrace Historic District under HRB Criterion C with a period of significance of 1907-1950 as a collection of architectural properties that are good examples of a variety of architectural styles dating to the first half of the 20<sup>th</sup> century, in both upper and working class expressions.
3. Designate the following 66 properties as Contributing Resources under HRB Criterion F, as detailed in the Draft Resolution (Attachment 1):

St #	Street Name	APN	HRB Site #	Date	Style	Status Code
2112	Adams Avenue	4381622700		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2120	Adams Avenue	4381622400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2128	Adams Avenue	4381622300		1916	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2206	Adams Avenue	4381621900		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
2220	Adams Avenue	4381621800		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2226	Adams Avenue	4381621700		1926	Craftsman	5D1
2230	Adams Avenue	4381621500		1914	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2242	Adams Avenue	4381621400	362	1914	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
2320	Adams Avenue	4381503700		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2203	Cliff Street	4381620300	581	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1
2204	Cliff Street	4381610200		1909	Craftsman Bungalow/Tudor Revival	5D1

St #	Street Name	APN	HRB Site #	Date	Style	Status Code
2209	Cliff Street	4381620400		1922	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2216	Cliff Street	4381610100		1909	Craftsman Bungalow/Tudor Revival	5D1
2219	Cliff Street	4381620500		1921	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2225	Cliff Street	4381620600		1921	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
2229	Cliff Street	4381620700		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
2230	Cliff Street	4381612000	524	1913	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
2232	Cliff Street	4381612200		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
2235	Cliff Street	4381620800		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
2252	Cliff Street	4381612400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4701	Panorama Drive	4381622800		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4704	Panorama Drive	4381500400		1909	Mission Revival	5D1
4705	Panorama Drive	4381622600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4709	Panorama Drive	4381622500		1927	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4711	Panorama Drive	4381622200		1926	Tudor Revival	5D1
4712	Panorama Drive	4381500600		1940	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4714	Panorama Drive	4381500700		1911	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4715	Panorama Drive	4381620100		1924	Tudor Revival	5D1
4716	Panorama Drive	4381500800		1926	Tudor Revival	5D1
4717	Panorama Drive	4381620200		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4718	Panorama Drive	4381500900		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4724	Panorama Drive	4381501100		1915	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4727	Panorama Drive	4381610300		1926	Craftsman/Colonial Revival	5D1
4731	Panorama Drive	4381610400		1925	Mission Revival	5D1
4734	Panorama Drive	4381501500		1920	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4735	Panorama Drive	4381610600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4737	Panorama Drive	4381610700		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4740	Panorama Drive	4381501800		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4741	Panorama Drive	4381610900	769	1926	Spanish Eclectic	5S1
4744	Panorama Drive	4381501900		1908	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1
4747	Panorama Drive	4381611000	1121	1926	Tudor Revival	5S1
4750	Panorama Drive	4381502100		1950	Custom Ranch	5D1
4751	Panorama Drive	4381611100		1935	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4756	Panorama Drive	4381502300		1942	Custom Ranch	5D1
4760	Panorama Drive	4381502400		1934	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4761	Panorama Drive	4381611300		1948	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4762	Panorama Drive	4381502500		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4769	Panorama Drive	4381611500	1107	1911	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
4770	Panorama Drive	4381502600		1940	Minimal Traditional	5D1
4773	Panorama Drive	4381611700	1016	1926	Spanish Colonial Revival	5S1
4774	Panorama Drive	4381502700	1230	1920	Dutch Colonial Revival	5S1
4775	Panorama Drive	4381611800		1927	Mission Revival	5D1
4776	Panorama Drive	4381502800		1923	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4778	Panorama Drive	4381502900		1914	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1
4780	Panorama Drive	4381503000	675	1914	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5S1
4781	Panorama Drive	4381612100		1921	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4784	Panorama Drive	4381503200		1926	Spanish Eclectic	5D1
4785	Panorama Drive	4381620900	538	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	5S1



St #	Street Name	APN	HRB Site #	Date	Style	Status Code
4788	Panorama Drive	4381503300		1947	Tract Ranch	5D1
4791	Panorama Drive	4381621100		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4792	Panorama Drive	4381503400		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4793	Panorama Drive	4381621200		1912	Craftsman Bungalow	5D1
4794-4796	Panorama Drive	4381504200		1924	Mission Revival	5D1
4795	Panorama Drive	4381621300		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4797	Panorama Drive	4381621600		1923	Mission Revival	5D1
4798	Panorama Drive	4381503800		1912	Craftsman (Arts & Crafts)	5D1

4. Classify the following 24 properties as Non-Contributing Resources, as detailed in the Draft Resolution (Attachment 1):

St #	Street Name	APN	Date	Style	Status Code
	Adams Avenue	4381504100	N/A	Vacant	6Z
2060	Adams Avenue	4381500200	N/A	Vacant	6Z
2138	Adams Avenue	4381622100	1980	No Style	6Z
2154	Adams Avenue	4381622000	c.1956	No Style	6Z
2224	Adams Avenue*	4381621700	1912	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
2242	Cliff Street	4381612300	1924	Mission Revival	6Z
4702	Panorama Drive	4381500300	N/A	Vacant	6Z
4706	Panorama Drive	4381500500	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4720	Panorama Drive	4381501000	1915	No Style	6Z
4726	Panorama Drive	4381501200	1966	Post and Beam	5S3
4730	Panorama Drive	4381501300	1927	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4732	Panorama Drive	4381501400	1949	Minimal Traditional	6Z
4733	Panorama Drive	4381610500	1923	Spanish Eclectic	6L
4736	Panorama Drive	4381501600	1920	No Style	6Z
4738	Panorama Drive	4381501700	2013	Neo-Craftsman	6Z
4739	Panorama Drive	4381610800	1926	Neo-Spanish Eclectic	6Z
4748	Panorama Drive	4381502000	1953	No Style	6Z
4752	Panorama Drive	4381502200	1948	Custom Ranch	6Z
4755	Panorama Drive	4381611200	1926	Neo-Contemporary	6Z
4767	Panorama Drive	4381611400	1926	Spanish Eclectic	6L
4771	Panorama Drive	4381611600	2004	Neo-Spanish Eclectic	6Z
4779	Panorama Drive	4381611900	1921	Custom Ranch	6Z
4782	Panorama Drive	4381503100	1922	Craftsman Bungalow	6L
4789	Panorama Drive	4381621000	1913	Craftsman Bungalow	6L

\*Shares a parcel with 2226 Adams Avenue, which is a contributing resource.

Report Number: HRB 17-073

Staff Report by Kelley Stanco

**Testimony Received:**

In Favor: Dionné Carlson, Bruce Glaser, Thomas Nelson, Ed Ruegg, Michael Keating, Van Effner, Karen Bacher, Amie Hayes, Ron Buckley, Ernestine Bonn, Priscilla Ann Berge

In Opposition: Sharon Gehl, Marcy Alyn, Kathy Hay

