

#### THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

# Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: January 11, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB 18-005

HEARING DATE: January 25, 2018

SUBJECT: ITEM #10— Anton Kettler House

RESOURCE INFO: California Historical Resources Inventory Database (CHRID) link

APPLICANT: Clifford and Frances Strahm Trust 04-29-09 represented by Scott A. Moomjian

LOCATION: 4584 Granger Street, 92106, Peninsula Community, Council District 2

APN 530-051-02-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the property located at 4584 Granger Street as a

historical resource.

# **STAFF RECOMMENDATION**

Designate the Anton Kettler House located at 4584 Granger Street as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the detached garage with the non-historic attached loggia and loggia roof deck. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a complex form with one and two story massing, a side gable chimney, low-to-moderately pitched hipped and mixed gable roofs clad in terra cotta tile, a minimal eave overhang, sculpted stucco finishing details including coping along the eave line, and arched and circular wall reliefs. An asymmetrical primary façade with entry arcade, front patio, and turret includes focal windows consisting of a set of oversized arched transoms over full-light doors on the two story wing, a segmental arched tripartite window with fanlight at the entryway patio, and a grouping of four-over-one casements windows on the turret.

# BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one and two story single-family residence built in 1929 in the Spanish Eclectic style. The house is located on Granger

Street in the Sunset Cliffs neighborhood of the Peninsula community. The property has not been identified in any historic surveys, as the subject area has not been previously surveyed.

The historic name of the resource, the Anton Kettler House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of the original owner who developed the lot as a speculation house.

#### **ANALYSIS**

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Scott A. Moomjian, Esq. in August 2016 and later withdrawn by the applicant to address a non-historic exterior stucco finish. At the time, staff could not support a positive recommendation. Since then, the applicant has replaced the non-historic stucco finish with n historically appropriate stucco texture. A letter from the applicant and new photographs from October 2017 are included and supplement the original report, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criterion C. Staff concurs that the property is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C. This determination is consistent with the *Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria*, as follows.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

Constructed in 1929, 4584 Granger Street is one of the early Spanish Eclectic style residences built in Sunset Cliffs. Prior to the Great Depression, Sunset Cliffs was a new subdivision that was envisioned by the developers, Pantages, Mills & Shreve Company, as becoming the "Mediterranean Riviera" of the Pacific.

The residence is in keeping with the vision of the original Sunset Cliff developers. It is a Spanish Eclectic style residence with a stucco exterior finish built in an irregular complex form consisting of one and two story massing with moderately pitched hipped and mixed gable roofs clad in terra cotta tile. There is a minimal eave overhang and sculpted stucco coping along the eave line. A detached garage with an attached non-historic loggia is located at the rear of the property that is accessed from the alley. The primary fenestration is asymmetrical with an arcaded front entry porch that is approached from a centralized concrete walkway off Granger Street. On the main facade of the two story wing is a set of arched transom windows over full-light doors. This arched window and door composition is recessed into a two story arched relief. The doors open onto a front veranda that features wrought iron decorative railing. On the east wall of the two story wing is the front entry arcade. The arcade is one story with a terra cotta tile shed roof and wrought iron railing. Adjacent to the front entry arcade is a front facing segmental arched patio opening that frames a focal window composed of a segmental arched fanlight over tripartite wood sash casement windows. The front entry arcade and front porch area contains two entry doors composed of wood with multiple panes of glass set in arched openings. Sculpted stucco coping is also strategically placed at the spring points of each arch. The east wing of the main facade consists of a one and one-half story turret. Sculpted stucco coping follows the turret's eave line and a recessed circular wall relief with a concave wrought iron grille furthers the visual interest. Windows on the turret include four-overone wood sash casements with canvas awnings and wrought iron braces.

In 2017, the non-historic stucco finish was removed and replaced with the existing exterior stucco finish. It is lightly sand-textured and is based on sample areas of the original stucco finish. Staff conducted on-site review of applied stucco samples and deemed the replacement stucco consistent with the *U.S. Secretary of the Interior's Standards for the Treatment of Historic Properties.* Other modifications to the property include a loggia attached to the east elevation of the detached garage. This addition was constructed at an unknown date. In 2007, a roof deck was added to the loggia. The garage modifications do not diminish the historic integrity of the residence or detract from the character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style. Furthermore, the residence retains the original design, form, massing, scale, and decorative elements, thereby remaining eligible for designation under HRB Criterion C.

Following the 1915-1916 Panama-California Exposition, the romantic ideal of Spanish and Latin American architecture was revived. What resulted was the Spanish Eclectic style, which was the predominant style in Southern California between 1915 and 1940, significantly altering the architectural landscape of the region. The style uses decorative details borrowed from the entire history of Spanish architecture. These may be of Moorish, Byzantine, Gothic, or Renaissance inspirations, and unusually rich and varied series of decorative precedents. The style employed a variety of floor plans and roof forms, such as, gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat with parapets. Other character defining features include stucco exterior wall surfaces, Mission and Spanish terra cotta clay tile, focal windows, arched windows and other openings, and accented entries.

<u>Significance Statement</u>: The residence continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Eclectic style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including a complex form with one and two story massing, a side gable chimney, low-to-moderately pitched hipped and mixed gable roofs clad in terra cotta tile, a minimal eave overhang, and sculpted stucco finishing details including coping, and arched and circular wall reliefs. The asymmetrical primary façade includes an entry arcade, front patio and turret with focal windows consisting of a set of oversized arched transoms over full-light doors on the two story wing, a segmental arched tripartite window with fanlight at the entryway patio, and a grouping of four-over-one casements windows on the turret.

The modifications to the garage with the construction of an attached loggia and loggia roof deck, does not affect the overall historical integrity of the residence. Therefore, staff recommends designation under HRB Criterion C.

### **OTHER CONSIDERATIONS**

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit, which allows flexibility of use; and other programs, which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

# **CONCLUSION**

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Anton Kettler House located at 4584 Granger Street be designated with a period of significance of 1929 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style. The designation excludes the detached garage with attached loggia and loggia roof deck that is located at the rear of the property.

Nicole J Purvis Assistant Planner

nusi J. Puni

Sonnier Francisco Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

njp/sf

Attachment(s):

- 1. Draft Resolution
- 2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

# RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A ADOPTED ON 1/25/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 1/25/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Anton Kettler House** (owned by Clifford and Frances Strahm Trust 04-29-09, 1979 Chambers Lane, Holtville, CA 92250) located at **4584 Granger Street**, **San Diego**, **CA 92106**, APN: **530-051-02-00**, further described as BLK 9 LOT 12 in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as Site No. 0, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Anton Kettler House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Eclectic style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1929 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a complex form with one and two story massing, a side gable chimney, low-to-moderately pitched hipped and mixed gable roofs clad in terra cotta tile, a minimal eave overhang, sculpted stucco finishing details including coping along the eave line, and arched and circular wall reliefs. An asymmetrical primary façade with entry arcade, front patio, and turret includes focal windows consisting of a set of oversized arched transoms over full-light doors on the two story wing, a segmental arched tripartite window with fanlight at the entryway patio, and a grouping of four-over-one casements windows on the turret.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0.** 

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the detached garage with the non-historic attached loggia and loggia roof deck.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A			
		BY:	
	¥		DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair Historical Resources Board
APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT			
CITY ATTORNEY		BY:	
			CORRINE NEUFFER,
			Deputy City Attorney