



THE CITY OF SAN DIEGO

Report to the Historical Resources Board

DATE ISSUED: February 8, 2018 REPORT NO. HRB-18-011

HEARING DATE: February 22, 2018

SUBJECT: **ITEM 7 – Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House**

RESOURCE INFO: [California Historical Resources Inventory Database \(CHRID\) link](#)

APPLICANT: Aaron Cate and Sarah Dixon represented by Ginger Weatherford

LOCATION: 1050 Cypress Avenue, 92103, Uptown Community, Council District 3
APN 452-133-07-00

DESCRIPTION: Consider the designation of the Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House located at 1050 Cypress Avenue as a historical resource.

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Designate the Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House located at 1050 Cypress Avenue as a historical resource with a period of significance of 1930-1937 under HRB Criterion C. The designation excludes the garage, rear garage expansion and laundry room addition. This recommendation is based on the following findings:

The resource embodies the distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930-1937 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a one story compound plan with a low pitched cross-gable tiled roof and front facing gable, overhanging eaves and exposed rafters, two stucco clad chimneys, a smooth stucco exterior finish, recessed multi-light wood sash casement and double hung windows, a segmental arched focal window, a post and beam front porch covered by the principal roof, and decorative finishing details. The decorative finishing details include wrought iron hardware, adz textured wood posts, beams, and corbels, wood plank window shutters with ragged edges and wrought iron S-shaped wall anchors, a tiered chimney on the east elevation and an engaged chimney on the west elevation.

BACKGROUND

This item is being brought before the Historical Resources Board in conjunction with the owner's desire to have the site designated as a historical resource. The resource is a one story single-family

Spanish Colonial Revival style residence built in 1930 and added onto in 1937 with a one room rear addition commissioned by the original owners and constructed by the original builder, Reuben C. Haas. The house is located on the north side of Cypress Avenue in the Marston Hills neighborhood of the Uptown Community.

The property was identified in the *1996 Historical Greater Mid-City San Diego Preservation Strategy* and *2016 Uptown Community Plan Area Historic Context and Survey*. A Status Code of 5D3 was assigned to the property, identifying it as a contributor to the *Marston Hills Potential Historic District*.

The historic name of the resource, the Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House, has been identified consistent with the Board's adopted naming policy and reflects the name of Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. who had the house designed and constructed as their personal residence.

ANALYSIS

A Historical Resource Research Report was prepared by Ginger Weatherford, MPS, which concludes that the resource is significant under HRB Criteria A, C, and D. Staff concurs that the site is a significant historical resource under HRB Criterion C; however Staff does not concur that the site is significant under Criteria A or D. This determination is consistent with the [Guidelines for the Application of Historical Resources Board Designation Criteria](#), as follows.

CRITERION A - Exemplifies or reflects special elements of the City's, a community's or a neighborhood's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development.

The Historical Resource Research Report discusses the deposition of the property under Criterion A as a contributor to the *Marston Hills Potential Historic District*, rather than evaluate significance and provide an integrity analysis singularly for 1050 Cypress Avenue under Criterion A for exemplifying special elements of the City's or Marston Hill's historical, archaeological, cultural, social, economic, political, aesthetic, engineering, landscaping or architectural development. Therefore, staff is unable to recommend designation under HRB Criterion A.

CRITERION C - Embodies distinctive characteristics of a style, type, period or method of construction or is a valuable example of the use of natural materials or craftsmanship.

1050 Cypress Avenue is located on the north side of Cypress Avenue in the Marston Hills subdivision in the Uptown Community. The Santa Barbara architecture and engineering firm, Edwards and Plunkett, designed the house and garage in 1930 in the Spanish Colonial Revival style for the architect's brother and wife, Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. The house and garage were erected by San Diego home builder, Reuben C. Haas, who also erected a one room rear addition for the Edwards in 1937.

The one story asymmetrical house has a low pitched cross-gabled tile roof that extends over the front porch, creating a deeply inset front entryway and patio. The rafters in this section of the roof are exposed and feature decorative notched rafter tails. The porch supports are adz textured wood posts and beam with decorative notched corbels. A centralized set of steps with non-historic glazed tile provide access to the front patio and entry door. The entry door is planked wood with metal

hardware and decorative metal hinge straps. The door is recessed and located on the west section of the inset façade and left of the porch steps. On the east side of the inset façade and to the right side of the steps is a three-part focal window comprised of a nine-light fixed center section flanked by a three-light casement on each side. On the front facing gable wing is the primary focal window consisting of a segmental arched three-light wood sash casement flanked by non-functional wood plank shutters featuring wrought iron S-shaped wall anchors. The east wing features a three-light wood sash casement with similar wood shutters and S-shaped wall anchors. Windows on the east elevation also feature wood shutters and wall anchors, whereas the west elevation windows do not. The window fenestration at the rear of the house includes wood sash casements and multi-light double hung.

Two stucco chimneys are also present in this Spanish Colonial Revival style house. A tiered stucco clad chimney, located on the southwest side gable of the west elevation and an engaged stucco clad chimney located on the southeast side gable of the east elevation. In 1936, the owners retained the original builder, Reuben C. Haas, to build a one room addition at the rear northeast corner of the house, which was completed in 1937. This addition created the extant breezeway between the east side of the addition and the garage.

Post 1937, the garage was expanded northward and a laundry room was constructed, the date of these additions are unknown. At the front of the house, a row of glazed decorative tiles were added to the stair riser. Also at an unknown date, the original terra cotta tile roof was replaced with a similar style and color roofing tile, and laid in a similar irregular pattern. Hardscape modifications include rear yard patio pavers and a non-historic pergola erected in c. 1963 and removed in early 2017.

The Spanish Colonial Revival style in San Diego flourished after the close of the Panama-California Exposition that was held in San Diego, California between 1915 and 1917. The architectural master plan of the Exposition was designed by lead architect, Bertram Goodhue, who appropriated architectural design from the Spanish Baroque *Churrigueresque* and vernacular building forms from Spain, Mexico and Native Americans. After the Exposition closed in 1917 and throughout the 1930s, Spanish influenced architectural design became a leading domestic residential style and in some areas such as Santa Barbara, California, the Spanish Colonial Revival style became the choice for rebuilding its town and municipal buildings after a devastating earthquake in 1925. The architecture and engineering firm responsible for the design of 1050 Cypress Avenue, Edwards and Plunkett, designed many Spanish Colonial Revival style commercial buildings in Santa Barbara during the late 1920s and 1930s. The style employed a variety of floor plans and roof forms, such as, gabled, cross-gabled, gabled and hipped, hipped and flat roof forms with parapets. Other character defining features include stucco exterior wall surfaces, Mission and Spanish terra cotta clay tile; focal windows; arched windows and other openings; and accented entries.

Significance Statement: 1050 Cypress Avenue continues to convey the historic significance of the Spanish Colonial Revival style by embodying the historic characteristics associated with the style; including the one story compound plan with a low pitched cross-gable tiled roof and front facing gable with segmental arched focal window, overhanging eaves and exposed rafters, two stucco clad chimneys, a smooth stucco exterior finish, recessed multi-light wood sash casement and double hung windows, a post and beam front porch covered by the principal roof, and decorative finishing details. The decorative finishing details include wrought iron hardware, adz textured wood posts,

beams, and corbels, wood plank window shutters with ragged edges and wrought iron S-shaped wall anchors, a tiered stucco clad chimney on the east elevation and an engaged stucco clad chimney on the west elevation. Therefore, staff recommends designation of the house, and early 1937 addition under HRB Criterion C.

CRITERION D - Is representative of a notable work of a master builder, designer, architect, engineer, landscape architect, interior designer, artist or craftsman.

1050 Cypress Avenue was designed by Santa Barbara architect and engineer, Edwards and Plunkett (William A. Edwards and J. Joseph Plunkett), and built by San Diego home builder, Reuben C. Haas, in 1930. Edwards and Plunkett are well recognized architects for several historically significant properties in Santa Barbara, California; however this house is the only known property designed by them in San Diego, likely due to the kinship between the property owner, Charles A. Edwards, and the architect, William A. Edwards. Since other properties associated with Edwards and Plunkett have not been identified in San Diego, they have not been established by the Historical Resources Board as Master Architects, nor is the applicant or Staff proposing to do so.

The builder, Reuben C. Hass, has also not been established by the Historical Resources Board as a Master Builder, but is being proposed by the applicant. The Historical Resource Research Report provides a biography and a list of known properties erected by Reuben C. Hass, but it does not provide an evaluation or analysis of Haas' work to identify building attributes that distinguishes or elevates his work as a Master Builder, and is thereby unable to evaluate 1050 Cypress Avenue within the context of his overall body of work. Staff recognizes Rueben C. Haas' contribution to San Diego's built environment, but is unable to support designation to establish him as a Master Builder, therefore, staff does not recommend designation under HRB Criterion D.

CRITERION E - Is listed or has been determined eligible by the National Park Service for listing on the National Register of Historic Places or is listed or has been determined eligible by the State Historical Preservation Office for listing on the State Register of Historical Resources.

The *Marston Hills Potential Historic District* has not been listed on or determined eligible by the National Park Service or the State Historic Preservation Office for listing on the State or National Registers. Therefore, 1050 Cypress Avenue a proposed contributing building to the Proposed District is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion E.

CRITERION F - Is a finite group of resources related to one another in a clearly distinguishable way or is a geographically definable area or neighborhood containing improvements which have a special character, historical interest or aesthetic value or which represent one or more architectural periods or styles in the history and development of the City.

The property at 1050 Cypress Avenue is not located within a designated historic district. Therefore, the property is not eligible for designation under HRB Criterion F.

OTHER CONSIDERATIONS

Designation brings with it the responsibility of maintaining the building in accordance with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards. The benefits of designation include the availability of the Mills


Act Program for reduced property tax; the use of the more flexible Historical Building Code; flexibility in the application of other regulatory requirements; the use of the Historical Conditional Use Permit, which allows flexibility of use; and other programs, which vary depending on the specific site conditions and owner objectives. If the property is designated by the HRB, conditions related to restoration or rehabilitation of the resource may be identified by staff during the Mills Act application process, and included in any future Mills Act contract.

CONCLUSION

Based on the information submitted and staff's field check, it is recommended that the Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House located at 1050 Cypress Avenue be designated with a period of significance from 1930-1937 under HRB Criterion C as a good example of the Spanish Colonial Revival style. The designation excludes the detached garage, garage addition and laundry room addition located at the rear of the property.



Nicole J Purvis
Assistant Planner



Sonnier Francisco
Senior Planner/HRB Liaison

njp/sf

Attachment(s):

1. Draft Resolution
2. Applicant's Historical Report under separate cover

RESOLUTION NUMBER N/A
ADOPTED ON 2/22/2018

WHEREAS, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego held a noticed public hearing on 2/22/2018, to consider the historical designation of the **Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House** (owned by Aaron Cate and Sarah Dixon, 1050 Cypress Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103) located at **1050 Cypress Avenue, San Diego, CA 92103**, APN: **452-133-07-00**, further described as BLOCK 216 POR in the City of San Diego, County of San Diego, State of California; and

WHEREAS, in arriving at their decision, the Historical Resources Board considered the historical resources report prepared by the applicant, the staff report and recommendation, all other materials submitted prior to and at the public hearing, inspected the subject property and heard public testimony presented at the hearing; and

WHEREAS, the property would be added to the Register of Designated Historical Resources as **Site No. 0**, and

WHEREAS, designated historical resources located within the City of San Diego are regulated by the Municipal Code (Chapter 14, Article 3, Division 2) as such any exterior modifications (or interior if any interior is designated) shall be approved by the City, this includes but is not limited to modifications to any windows or doors, removal or replacement of any exterior surfaces (i.e. paint, stucco, wood siding, brick), any alterations to the roof or roofing material, alterations to any exterior ornamentation and any additions or significant changes to the landscape/ site.

NOW, THEREFORE,

BE IT RESOLVED, the Historical Resources Board based its designation of the Charles and Audala Edwards Jr. House on the following findings:

(1) The property is historically significant under CRITERION C for its distinctive characteristics through the retention of character defining features of the Spanish Colonial Revival style and retains a good level of architectural integrity from its 1930-1937 period of significance. Specifically, the resource features a one story compound plan with a low pitched cross-gable tiled roof and front facing gable, overhanging eaves and exposed rafters, two stucco clad chimneys, a smooth stucco exterior finish, recessed multi-light wood sash casement and double hung windows, a segmental arched focal window, a post and beam front porch covered by the principal roof, and decorative finishing details. The decorative finishing details include wrought iron hardware, adz textured wood posts, beams, and corbels, wood plank window shutters with ragged edges and wrought iron S-shaped wall anchors, a tiered chimney on the east elevation and an engaged chimney on the west elevation. This finding is further supported by the staff report, the historical research report, and written and oral evidence presented at the designation hearing.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, in light of the foregoing, the Historical Resources Board of the City of San Diego hereby approves the historical designation of the above named property. The designation includes the parcel and exterior of the building as Designated Historical Resource **Site No. 0**.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the designation shall exclude the detached garage, garage addition and laundry room addition located at the rear of the property.

BE IT FURTHER RESOLVED, the Secretary to the Historical Resources Board shall cause this resolution to be recorded in the office of the San Diego County Recorder at no fee, for the benefit of the City of San Diego, and with no documentary tax due.

Vote: N/A

BY: _____
DAVID MCCULLOUGH, Chair
Historical Resources Board

APPROVED: MARA W. ELLIOTT,
CITY ATTORNEY

BY: _____
JEREMY JUNG,
Deputy City Attorney